



Join the Global Conversation

The

G20 Research Group

at Trinity College at the Munk School of Global Affairs in the University of Toronto presents the

# 2015 G20 Antalya Summit

# Interim Compliance Report:

# Part 1

16 November 2015 to 5 April 2016

Prepared by Sarah Scott, Alissa Wang and the G20 Research Group, Toronto

> 17 July 2016 www.g20.utoronto.ca g20@utoronto.ca

"The University of Toronto ... produced a detailed analysis to the extent of which each G20 country has met its commitments since the last summit ... I think this is important; we come to these summits, we make these commitments, we say we are going to do these things and it is important that there is an organisation that checks up on who has done what."

— David Cameron, Prime Minister, United Kingdom, at the 2012 Los Cabos Summit

# Contents

Preface	
Research Team Based at the University of Toronto	í
Introduction and Summary	5
Methodology and Scoring System	
Commitment Breakdown	5
Selection of Commitments	5
Interim Compliance Scores	
Interim Compliance by Member6	5
Interim Compliance by Commitment6	5
Table 1: 2015 G20 Antalya Summit Commitments Selected for Compliance Monitoring 7	
Table 2: 2015 G20 Antalya Summit Interim Compliance Scores	3
Table 3: 2015 G20 Antalya Summit Interim Compliance by Country	
Table 4: 2015 G20 Antalya Summit Interim Compliance by Commitment	
Table 5: G20 Compliance by Member, 2008-2015 10	
Conclusions11	L
Future Research and Reports11	
Considerations and Limitations11	
Appendix: General Considerations12	2
1. Energy: Fossil Fuel Subsidies	3
2. Refugees	
3. Macroeconomics: Fiscal Policies	
4. Macroeconomics: International Monetary Fund	3
5. Trade: Protectionism	
6. Financial Regulation: Terrorist Finance	L
7. Development: Aid for Trade152	2
8. Development: Remittances	
9. Development: Tax	
10. Labour and Employment: Gender 213	3

### Preface

Since the G20 leaders met at their first summit in 2008 in Washington, the G20 Research Group at the University of Toronto and the Center for International Institutions Research of the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration (RANEPA), formerly with the International Organizations Research Institute at the National Research University Higher School of Economics (HSE), in Moscow have produced reports on their progress in implementing the priority commitments made at each summit. These reports monitor each G20 member's efforts to implement a carefully chosen selection of the many commitments produced at each summit. The reports are offered to the general public and to policy makers, academics, civil society, the media and interested citizens around the world in an effort to make the work of the G20 more transparent, accessible and effective, and to provide scientific data to enable the meaningful analysis of the causes of compliance and the impact of this important informal international institution. Previous reports are available at the G20 Information Centre at http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/analysis.

The G20 Research Group has been working with Marina Larionova's team at RANEPA and previously at HSE since initiating this G20 compliance research in 2009, after the Washington Summit in November 2008. The initial report, covering only one commitment made at that summit, tested the compliance methodology developed by the G8 Research Group and adapted it to the G20. This current report contains the first of two parts, and has been conducted by the G20 Research Group's team based at the University of Toronto.

To make its assessments, the G20 Research Group relies on publicly available information, documentation and media reports. To ensure accuracy, comprehensiveness and integrity, we encourage comments from stakeholders. Indeed, scores can be recalibrated if new material becomes available. All feedback remains anonymous. Responsibility for the contents of this report lies exclusively with the authors and analysts of the G20 Research Group.

This interim report assesses performance by G20 members with 10 priority commitments among the total of 113 commitments made at the 2015 Antalya Summit, held on 15-16 November 2015. It covers compliant behaviour between 16 November 2015 to 5 April 2016. The final report, will be released on the eve of the 2016 Hangzhou Summit.

I am most grateful to Sarah Scott and our G20 Research Group team, as well as Marina Larionova and her team in Moscow at RANEPA.

Professor John Kirton Co-director, G20 Research Group

#### **Research Team Based at the University of Toronto**

Professor John Kirton, Co-director, G20 Research Group Sarah Scott, Chair, Summit Studies Alissa Wang, Editor in Chief Cindy Ou, Compliance Director Derakhshan Qurban-Ali, Compliance Director Phil Gazaleh, Compliance Director Daniel Park, Compliance Director Matt Gumley, Compliance Director Emma Best, Compliance Director Monica Layarda, Compliance Director

*Lead Analysts* Alessandra Harkness Andrew Liu Carol Drumm Grace Lee

#### Analysts

Adrian DiTommaso Alejandra Bellatin Alessandra Jenkins Alison Dillman Anah Mirza Andrew Aulthouse Angela Hou Anju Xing Anna Roach Arthur Lui Aylin Manduric Bojana Radan Bushra Ebadi Cindy Ou Coral Cripps Daniel Bodirsky Daniel Valls Doris Li Eileen (Yijia) Liu Elena Lifshits Carrera Emile Lavergne Emilia Lochowska **Emily Nickel Emily Shaw** Fatima Saya George Mason Germán Andres Guberman Diaz Hivda Ates Jennifer Kou Jiayang Shan

Helene Emorine Mridvika Sahajpal Natalia Valencia Caquimbo Sophie Barnett

Jinhui Jiao Jinnan Li Jiyoon Han Jose Isla Joud Hadi Joy Lizette Aguilar Julia Tops Jwjini Wong Kabir Bhatia Katrina Y.K. Li Kaylee Mak Kertia Johnson Keshini Mahesan Kyle Van Hooren Laila Kanji Larissa Parker Lauren Dalgliesh Lucinda Yae-Rim Ro Maria Alexiou Maria Zelenova Mariam Jammal, Mariya-Kvitlana Tsap Mathieu Sitayai Michael Switzer Michael Warchol Mike Cowan Miranda Bocci Mojann Zibapour Motahareh Nabavi Niaki Mustafa Sayed Nabiha Chowdhury

Ujwal Ganguly Yashwinie Shivanand

Nadine Abdel Razek Nidhi Varma Novera Khan Olivier X. Li Omar Bitar Philip Basaric Qasim Sheikh Rebecca Dickey Reema Gill Richard Turcsanvi Rinchen-Dolma Karma Rochelle D'souza Rodrigo Noorani Ron Shnaidstein Sarah Bear Shruti Anandan Sonja Dobson Sonu Arora Sunny Jang Sydney Anderson Tatiana Ferrara Tanzim Rashid Thomas Kariunas Tina Vulevic Trinh Theresa Do Yalda Mehran Yolanda Clatworthy Zachary Skeith Zineb Drissi

### **Introduction and Summary**

The G20 2015 Antalya Interim Compliance Report: Part I, prepared by the G20 Research Group based at the University of Toronto, analyzes compliance by G20 members with a selection of 10 priority commitments of a total of 113 commitments made at the Antalya Summit on 15-16 November 2015. The report covers compliance-relevant actions taken by the G20 members between 16 November 2015 to 5 April 2016. This timeframe allows for an assessment of compliance part way between the 2015 Antalya Summit and the Hangzhou Summit, which will be hosted by China on 4-5 September 2016.

#### Methodology and Scoring System

This report draws on the methodology developed by the G8 Research Group, which has been monitoring G7/8 compliance since 1996 (IORI HSE joined this multiyear project in 2005, and Bond University participated in 2014). The use of this methodology builds cross-institutional and cross-member consistency and also allows compatibility with compliance assessments of other institutions.

The methodology uses a scale from -1 to +1, where +1 indicates full compliance with the stated commitment, -1 indicates a failure to comply or action taken that is directly opposite to the stated instruments or goal of the commitment, and 0 indicates partial compliance or work in progress, such as initiatives that have been launched but are not yet near completion and whose full results can therefore not be assessed. Each member assessed receives a score of -1, 0 or +1 for each commitment. For convenience, the scores in the tables have been converted to percentages, where -1 equals 0% and +1 equals 100%.<sup>1</sup>

A failing compliance score does not necessarily imply an unwillingness to comply on the part of G20 members. In some cases policy actions can take multiple compliance cycles to implement and measure. As the G20 Research Group and IORI HSE continue to monitor developments in this issue area, progress made by members can be recorded in future compliance reports.

The Compliance Coding Manual that describes the methodology in detail is available on the G20 Information Centre website at http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/analysis/index.html#method.

#### Commitment Breakdown

The G20 made a total of 113 commitments at the Antalya Summit.<sup>2</sup> These commitments, as identified by the G20 Research Group and HSE, are drawn from the official G20 Leaders' Communiqué and the Statement on the Fight Against Terrorism.

#### Selection of Commitments

For each compliance cycle (that is, the period between summits), the research team selects commitments that reflect the breadth of the G20 agenda and also reflect the priorities of the summit's host, while balancing the selection to allow for comparison with past and future summits, following the methodology developed by the G8 Research Group.<sup>3</sup> The selection also replicates the breakdown of issue areas and the proportion of commitments in each one. Primary criteria for priority commitment selection are the comprehensiveness and relevance to the summit, the G20 and the world, as well as individual and collective pledges. Selected commitments must also meet secondary criteria of performance measurability and ability to comply to some degree within a year,

 $<sup>^{1}</sup>$  The formula to convert a score into a percentage is P=50×(S+1), where P is the percentage and S is the score.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> A commitment is defined as a discrete, specific, publicly expressed, collectively agreed statement of intent — a politically binding promise by summit members that they will undertake future action, often to move toward, meet or adjust to an identified target. More details are contained in the Reference Manual for Summit Commitment and Compliance Coding (available at http://www.g8.utoronto.ca/evaluations/index.html#manual).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Guidelines for choosing priority commitments, as well as other applicable considerations, are available in the Reference Manual for Summit Commitment and Compliance Coding.

as well as tertiary criteria of significance as identified by scientific teams and relevant stakeholders in the host country.

For the 2015 G20 Antalya Interim Compliance Report: Part I, 10 priority commitments were selected for assessment by the University of Toronto team from the 113 commitments made at the Antalya Summit (see Table 1).

#### Interim Compliance Scores

The assessment is based on relevant, publicly available information relating to action taken from 16 November 2015 to 5 April 2016. The interim compliance scores by commitment are contained in Table 2. Country rankings are listed in Table 3 and commitment rankings are listed in Table 4.

For the period from 16 November 2015 to 5 April 2016, G20 members achieved an average interim compliance score of +0.25, which translates to 63%.

#### Interim Compliance by Member

For interim compliance with the Antalya Summit's priority commitments, the United States has the highest rate of compliance at +0.80 (90%), followed by Australia, Germany and Italy tied at +0.60 (80%) and Canada and China at +0.50 (75%). The lowest scoring member is Brazil at -0.30 (35%). The difference between the highest and lowest G20 member compliance scores is +1.00. For more information about compliance by G20 members, see Table 3.

#### **Interim Compliance by Commitment**

This particular compliance cycle produced a high level of interim compliance for a few issue areas: aid for trade, tax administration, and labour and employment tied for first place at +0.60 (80%). They were followed by reform of the International Monetary Fund at +0.55 (78%) and financial regulation and antiprotectionism tied at +0.40 (70%) The lowest score was on fossil fuels subsidies at -0.55 (23%). For more information on scoring by commitment, see Table 4.

1	Energy: Fossil Fuel Subsidies	"We reaffirm our commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies that encourage wasteful
		consumption, over the medium term, recognising the need to support the poor." (G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué)
2	Refugees	"We commit to continue further strengthening our support for all efforts to provide protection [for the unprecedented numbers of refugees and internally displaced persons in various parts of the world]" (G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué)
3	Macroeconomics: Fiscal Policies	"We reiterate our commitment to implement fiscal policies flexibly to take into account near-term economic conditions, so as to support growth and job creation, while putting debt as a share of GDP on a sustainable path." (G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué)
4	Macroeconomics: International Monetary Fund	"We reaffirm our commitment to maintaining a strong, quota- based and adequately resourced IMF." (G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué)
5	Trade: Protectionism	"We further reaffirm our longstanding commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures" (G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué)
6	Financial Regulation: Terrorist Finance	"We will continue to implement relevant FATF recommendations and instruments." (G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué)
7	Development: Aid for Trade	"We emphasize the important role of trade in global development efforts and will continue to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance." (G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué)
8	Development: Remittances	"Our G20 National Remittance Plans developed this year include concrete actions towards our commitment to reduce the global average cost of transferring remittances to five per cent with a view to align with the SDGs and Addis Ababa Action Agenda." (G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué)
9	Development: Tax	"We support the efforts for strengthening developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda." (G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué)
10	Labour and Employment: Gender	"We will continue monitoring the implementation of our Employment Plans as well as our goals to reduce gender participation gap." (G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué)

Table 1: 2015 G20 Antalya Summit Commitments Selected for Compliance Monitoring

Table 2: 2015 G20 Antalya Summit Interim Compliance Scores

-																						r	
		Argentina	Australia	Brazil	Canada	China	France	Germany	India	Indonesia	Italy	Japan	Korea	Mexico	Russia	Saudi Arabia	South Africa	Turkey	United Kingdom	United States	European Union	Average	)
1	Energy: Fossil Fuel Subsidies	-1	-1	-1	-1	0	0	0	+1	-1	0	-1	-1	-1	-1	0	-1	-1	-1	+1	-1	-0.55	23%
	Refugees	0	0	0	+1	0	+1	+1	-1	-1	0	0	0	0	-1	0	-1	+1	+1	+1	0	+0.10	55%
3	Macroeconomics: Fiscal Policies	0	+1	+1	0	0	0	+1	0	0	+1	0	0	0	0	0	+1	0	0	0	0	+0.25	63%
4	Macroeconomics: IMF	0	+1	-1	+1	+1	0	+1	+1	0	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	0	0	0	0	+1	+1	+0.55	78%
5	Trade: Protectionism	0	+1	0	+1	+1	0	0	0	+1	0	+1	0	+1	-1	+1	0	0	+1	+1	0	+0.40	70%
6	Financial Regulation: Terrorist Finance	+1	0	-1	+1	0	+1	+1	0	0	+1	-1	0	0	+1	0	0	+1	+1	+1	+1	+0.40	70%
7	Development: Aid for Trade	+1	+1	0	+1	+1	0	+1	0	0	+1	+1	0	-1	+1	+1	0	+1	+1	+1	+1	+0.60	80%
	Development: Remittances	-1	+1	-1	-1	0	-1	-1	0	0	0	-1	0	-1	-1	-1	0	-1	0	0	0	-0.45	28%
	Development: Tax Administration	0	+1	0	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	0	+1	0	0	0	0	0	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+0.60	80%
10	Labour and Employment: Gender	0	+1	0	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	+1	-1	-1	0	+1	+1	0	+1	+1	+0.60	80%
	Average	0 50%			+0.50 75%																	+0.25+0.63	63%

Rank	Member	Avera	ıge
1	United States	+0.80	90%
	Australia	+0.60	80%
2	Germany	+0.60	80%
	Italy	+0.60	80%
5	Canada	+0.50	75%
J	China	+0.50	75%
7	United Kingdom	+0.40	70%
/	European Union	+0.40	70%
	France	+0.30	65%
9	India	+0.30	65%
	Turkey	+0.30	65%
	Japan	+0.10	55%
12	Saudi Arabia	+0.10	55%
12	South Africa	+0.10	55%
	Korea	+0.10	55%
16	Argentina	0	50%
10	Indonesia	0	50%
18	Mexico	-0.20	40%
10	Russia	-0.20	40%
20	Brazil	-0.30	35%

Table 3: 2015 G20 Antalya S	Summit Interim Compliance by Country
-----------------------------	--------------------------------------

Table 4: 2015 G20 Antalya Summit Interim Compliance by Commitment

Rank	Commitment	Ave	rage
	Development: Aid for Trade	+0.60	80%
1	Development: Tax Administration	+0.60	80%
	Labour and Employment: Gender	+0.60	80%
4	Macroeconomics: International Monetary Fund	+0.55	78%
5	Trade: Protectionism	+0.40	70%
)	Financial Regulation: Terrorist Finance	+0.40	70%
7	Macroeconomics: Fiscal Policies	+0.25	63%
8	Refugees	+0.10	55%
9	Development: Remittances	-0.45	28%
10	Energy: Fossil Fuel Subsidies	-0.55	23%

	Final		inal Final Final		Final Final			Final H		Final	Interim		Final		Interim		Final		Interim				
Member	Washi	ington	Lon	ıdon	Pittsł	ourgh	Tore	onto	to Seoul		Cannes		Los Cabos	St. Pete	rsburg	st. Petersburg		Brisbane		Brisbane		Antalya	
	20			09	20		20		20	10	201	1	2012	2013		2013		2014		2014		2015	
Argentina	0	50%	-0.60	20%	-0.13	44%	0	50%	-0.08	46%	0	50%	+0.31 66%	+0.06	53%	+0.06	53%	-0.12	44%	+0.06	53%	0	50%
Australia	n/a	_	+0.60	80%	+0.50	75%	+0.56	78%	+0.85	93%	+0.67	84%	+0.94 97%	+0.38	69%	+0.63	81%	+0.47	74%	+0.59	79%	+0.60	80%
Brazil	+1.00	100%	+0.20	60%	-0.63	19%	+0.29	65%	+0.42	71%	+0.60	80%	+0.56 78%	+0.31	66%	+0.31	66%	0	50%	+0.12	56%	-0.30	35%
Canada	+1.00	100%	+0.60	80%	+0.63	82%	+0.78	89%	+0.69	85%	+0.73	87%	+0.75 88%	+0.44	72%	+0.44	72%	+0.59	79%	+0.71	85%	+0.50	75%
China	0	50%	-0.40	30%	+0.13	57%	+0.38	69%	+0.42	71%	+0.53	77%	+0.38 69%	0	50%	+0.19	59%	+0.41	71%	+0.59	79%	+0.50	75%
France	+1.00	100%	+0.80	90%	+0.63	82%	+0.56	78%	+0.77	89%	+0.60	80%	+0.69 85%	+0.69	84%	+0.69	84%	+0.35	68%	+0.63	81%	+0.30	65%
Germany	+1.00	100%	+0.80	90%	+0.63	82%	+0.56	78%	+0.54	77%	+0.67	84%	+0.56 78%	+0.56	78%	+0.75	88%	+0.47	74%	+0.69	84%	+0.60	80%
India	0	50%	-0.40	30%	-0.38	31%	-0.29	36%	+0.42	71%	+0.60	80%	+0.50 75%	+0.19	59%	+0.63	81%	+0.29	65%	+0.59	79%	+0.30	65%
Indonesia	n/a	-	-0.40	30%	-0.63	19%	-0.13	44%	+0.36	68%	+0.14	57%	+0.47 74%	+0.50	75%	+0.50	75%	-0.18	41%	+0.12	56%	0	50%
Italy	+1.00	100%	0	50%	+0.13	57%	+0.56	78%	+0.77	89%	+0.80	90%	+0.19 60%	+0.31	66%	+0.44	72%	-0.12	44%	+0.13	56%	+0.60	80%
Japan	+1.00	100%	+0.20	60%	+0.50	75%	+0.56	78%	+0.62	81%	+0.47	74%	+0.50 75%	+0.31	66%	+0.31	66%	+0.35	68%	+0.65	82%	+0.10	55%
Korea	n/a	_	0	50%	+0.75	88%	+0.56	78%	+0.46	73%	+0.60	80%	+0.63 82%	+0.19	59%	+0.38	69%	+0.47	74%	+0.65	82%	+0.10	55%
Mexico	+1.00	100%	0	50%	+0.25	63%	-0.14	43%	+0.58	79%	+0.67	84%	+0.69 85%	+0.38	69%	+0.38	69%	+0.29	65%	+0.47	74%	-0.20	40%
Russia	0	50%	+0.40	70%	+0.38	69%	+0.13	57%	+0.59	80%	+0.60	80%	+0.63 82%	+0.50	75%	+0.44	72%	+0.53	76%	+0.47	74%	-0.20	40%
Saudi Arabia	n/a	-	+0.20	60%	-0.13	44%	-0.13	44%	+0.08	54%	+0.21	61%	+0.50 75%	-0.06	47%	+0.06	53%	-0.18	41%	-0.24	38%	+0.10	55%
South Africa	+1.00	100%	+0.40	70%	+0.63	82%	-0.14	43%	+0.33	67%	+0.47	74%	+0.47 74%	+0.25	63%	+0.25	63%	-0.29	35%	-0.12	44%	+0.10	55%
Turkey	n/a	_	+0.20	60%	-0.25	38%	-0.14	43%	+0.17	59%	+0.20	60%	+0.25 63%	+0.13	56%	+0.25	63%	-0.06	47%	0	50%	+0.30	65%
UK	+1.00	100%	+1.00	100%	+0.50	75%	+0.78	89%	+0.77	89%	+0.87	94%	+0.81 91%	+0.88	94%	+0.75	88%	+0.65	82%	+0.76	88%	+0.40	70%
US	0	50%	+0.40	70%	+1.00	100%	+0.33	67%	+0.38	69%	+0.53	77%	+0.81 91%	+0.63	81%	+0.69	84%	+0.71	85%	+0.76	88%	+0.80	90%
EU	+1.00	100%	+0.60	80%	+0.38	69%	+0.57	79%	+0.82	91%	+0.85	93%	+0.75 88%	+0.69	84%	+0.63	81%	+0.44	72%	+0.75	88%	+0.40	70%
Average	+0.67	83%	+0.23	62%	+0.24	62%	+0.28	64%	+0.50	75%	+0.54	77%	+0.57 79%	+0.37	68%	+0.44	72%	+0.25	63%	+0.42	71%	+0.25	63%
	Fii	nal	Fi	nal	Fii	nal	Fir	nal	Fin	ıal	Fin	al	Final	Inter	rim	Fin	al	Inter	rim	Fin	nal	Inter	rim

Table 5: G20 Compliance by Member, 2008-2015

Note: n/a = not available

#### Conclusions

G20 compliance performance for the chosen priority commitments, measured as a summit average, improved incrementally from the April 2009 London Summit and September 2009 Pittsburgh Summit (both at 62%) to the June 2010 Toronto Summit (64%) and then rose with the November 2010 Seoul Summit (75%) and the November 2011 Cannes Summit (78%). With the St. Petersburg Summit, compliance dropped to 72% and the compliance of the Brisbane summit dropped to 71%. The interim average of 63% for the Antalya Summit is even lower. If the G20 can improve its performance on delivering on its promises, it may validate its claim for legitimacy as a global governance institution.

Many of the commitments assessed in this report have timelines that extend beyond the 2015 Antalya Summit or reflect medium- and long-term priorities. A unique feature of this report is the incorporation of deadlines for commitments monitored over multiple compliance cycles. The convergence of medium- and long-term commitments and those with deadlines in the near future reflects the nature of G20 decisions as a crisis management forum and a global governance steering institution. It also illustrates the multifaceted nature of compliance assessment. As the relationship among short, medium, and long-term commitments becomes clearer, the compliance landscape for many of these priority commitments may change over the course of future compliance periods.

#### Future Research and Reports

The information contained in this report provides G20 members and other stakeholders with an indication of their compliance in the period immediately following the Antalya Summit. This draft has been produced as an invitation for others to provide additional or more complete information on compliance before the finished final report will be published in near future. Feedback should be sent to g20@utoronto.ca.

#### **Considerations and Limitations**

Several elements affect the findings contained in this report. While the purpose of the report is to monitor compliance with G20 commitments, it is necessary to ensure that the monitoring mechanism is realistic and considers the context within which the commitments are made. With new commitments, more attention must be paid to the initial implementation constraints faced by members. One way to accommodate these constraints is to regard the intent to implement policy measures as an illustration of compliance, or being "on track" towards compliance. This initial leeway should only be granted for new commitments; intent is not a suitable indicator of compliance for medium-term or longstanding commitments. Over time as commitments become integrated in the G20 compliance mechanism, compliance guidelines should become more stringent (as members become more accustomed to the nature of the issue and the requirements for compliance).

See also Appendix: General Considerations.

# **Appendix: General Considerations**

In evaluating the results of this report, the following considerations should be kept in mind.

- 1. Assessments contained in this report apply to commitment-related actions taken by G20 members only since the commitments were declared publicly at the last summit.
- 2. Compliance has been assessed against a selected set of priority commitments, rather than all commitments contained in the summit documents. The selection is intended to produce a representative subset of the total body of commitments. An ideal set of priority commitments represents proportionally the amount of attention paid to each policy area in summit documents, reflects the relative ambition of summit commitments, and holds as many G20 members to account for compliance as possible.
- 3. In addition to producing commitments, summits provide value by establishing new principles and norms, creating and highlighting issues and issue areas and altering the traditional discourse used to discuss priorities. Some of the most important decisions reached at summits may be done in private and not encoded in the public record of the summit documents.
- 4. Some commitments cover several years and thus compliance takes longer than the summit-tosummit timeframe applied in this report. For this reason, full compliance (denoted by a +1 score) might not require that G20 members carry out a given commitment completely, but might instead demand clear, visible progress commensurate with the overall timetable as well as public statements of support of commitment objectives.
- 5. In some cases, a G20 member might choose not to comply with a particular summit commitment for good reason, for example if global conditions have changed dramatically since the commitment was made or if new knowledge has become available about how a particular problem can best be solved.
- 6. As each G20 member has its own constitutional, legal and institutional processes for undertaking action at the national level (and in the case of the European Union at the supranational level), each member is free to act according to its own legislative schedule. Of particular importance here is the annual schedule for creating budgets, seeking legislative approval and appropriating funds.
- 7. Commitments in G20 summit documents might also be included, in whole or in part, in documents released by other international forums, as the decisions of other international organizations or even national statements such as the State of the Union Address in the United States, the Queen's Speech in the United Kingdom and the Speech from the Throne in Canada. Merely repeating a G20 commitment in another forum does not count fully as compliant behaviour.
- 8. This report assesses G20 members' action in accordance with the text of actual, specific commitments made in G20 summit documents. Because commitments demand that policymakers and regulators act specifically to meet the identified objectives, this report holds policymakers accountable for pushing and passing recommended policies. Furthermore, compliance is assessed against the precise, particular commitment, rather than what might be regarded as a necessary or appropriate action to solve the problem being addressed.
- 9. As individual members can take different actions to comply with the same commitment, no standardized cross-national evaluative criterion can be universally applied. The interpretive guidelines attempt to provide an equitable method for assessing compliance.
- 10. Because the evaluative scale used in this compliance report runs from -1 to +1, any score in the positive range represents at least some degree of compliance.

# **1. Energy: Fossil Fuel Subsidies**

"We reaffirm our commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies that encourage wasteful consumption, over the medium term, recognising the need to support the poor."

G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Argentina	-1		
Australia	-1		
Brazil	-1		
Canada	-1		
China		0	
France		0	
Germany		0	
India			+1
Indonesia	-1		
Italy		0	
Japan	-1		
Korea	-1		
Mexico	-1		
Russia	-1		
Saudi Arabia		0	
South Africa	-1		
Turkey	-1		
United Kingdom	-1		
United States			+1
European Union	-1		
Average		-0.55	

#### Assessment

#### Background

At the 2015 Antalya Summit, G20 leaders reiterated their commitment to rationalise and phase-out, over the medium term, inefficient fossil fuel subsidies that encourage wasteful consumption.

At the 2009 Pittsburgh Summit, this commitment was first introduced. National Energy and Finance Ministers committed to assess their respective national circumstances in order to develop implementation strategies and a timeframe, and G20 members asked the International Energy Agency, Organization of the Petroleum Exporting Countries, Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development, and World Bank (hereafter referred to as the IGO-4) to analyze the existing scope of energy subsidies and provide suggestions for initiative implementation.

At the 2010 Toronto Summit, thirteen G20 members provided specific implementation strategies, and seven remaining members stated that they did not have inefficient fossil fuel subsidies (see Table 1). The IGO-4 presented a report with the analysis and suggestions requested by G20 members at the previous summit.<sup>4</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Analysis of the Scope of Energy Subsidies and Suggestions for the G20 Initiative. IEA, OPEC, OECD, World Bank (Toronto) 16 June 2010. Access Date: 15 February 2016. http://www.oecd.org/env/45575666.pdf

At the 2010 Seoul Summit, G20 members re-committed to rationalise and phase-out over the medium term inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, and the IGO-4 released a second report providing 2009 data on fossil fuel consumption subsidies as well as strategies for their phase-out.<sup>5</sup>

At the 2011 Cannes Summit, the IGO-4 provided a third report highlighting the extent of subsidies and other support to fossil-fuel production and consumption, potential economic and environmental benefits of subsidy reform, and guidance on how countries could undertake the reforms while still protecting the poor.<sup>6</sup>

At the 2012 Los Cabos Summit, G20 members requested Finance Ministers to explore options for a voluntary peer review process to assess commitment progress and report progress by the next summit.

At the 2013 St. Petersburg Summit, Finance Ministers presented a Methodology for G-20 Voluntary Peer Reviews on Inefficient Fossil Fuel Subsidies That Encourage Wasteful Consumption.<sup>7</sup>

At the 2014 Brisbane Summit, China and the United States agreed to be the first countries to engage in mutual peer reviews. As well, the World Bank Group prepared a report on transitional policies to assist the poor while rationalizing and phasing out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies that encourage wasteful consumption.

At the 2015 Energy Ministers Meeting, a report providing updates on recent progress relating to this commitment was presented to the G20 Energy Sustainability Working Group.<sup>8</sup> The same year, Germany announced it would serve on both the Chinese and American peer review teams and undergo a peer review of its own. Mexico announced that it would serve on the American peer review team and undergo a peer review as well.

Table 6 describes G20 members' self-reported implementation strategies pertaining to the progressive phase-out of inefficient fossil fuel subsidies and are not supported by material evidence. As such they will not be used to establish members' compliance scores, and are provided for informative purposes only. In this report, Australia, Brazil, France, Japan, Saudi Arabia, South Africa and the United Kingdom all claimed to have efficient fossil fuel subsidies.

<sup>6</sup> Joint Report by IEA, OPEC, OECD and World Bank on Fossil Fuel and Other Energy Subsidies: An update of the G20 Pittsburgh and Toronto Commitments. IEA, OPEC, OECD, World Bank (Paris) 2011. Access Date: 15 February 2016. http://www.oecd.org/site/tadffss/49006998.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The Scope of Fossil Fuel Subsidies in 2009 and a Roadmap for Phasing out Fossil Fuel Subsidies. IEA, OECD and World Bank (Seoul) 2010. Access Date: 15 February 2016. http://www.oecd.org/env/cc/46575783.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Methodology for G20 Voluntary Peer Reviews on Inefficient Fossil Fuel Subsidies that Encourage Wasteful Consumption. G20 (Toronto) 2010. Access Date: 15 February 2016.

http://www.g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228453233373904.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Update on Recent Progress in Reform of Inefficient Fossil Fuel Subsidies that Encourage Wasteful Consumption. IEA, OECD (Istanbul) 2 October 2015. Access Date: 15 February 2016.

http://www.g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228338573300315.pdf

Summe	
Argentina	Proposes to reduce household subsidy for propane gas consumption as natural gas access is expanded.
Canada	Proposes to implement recently released draft legislation to phase-out the
Callada	accelerated capital cost allowance for oil sands assets over the 2011-15 period.
	Previously phased-out other tax preferences applying to fossil fuel producers.
China	Proposes to gradually reduce the urban land-use tax relief for fossil fuel producers.
Germany	Proposes to discontinue subsidized coal mining in a socially acceptable manner by
Germany	the end of 2018.
India	Proposes to work out implementation strategies and timetables for rationalizing and
	phasing out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies based on the recommendation of the
	Empowered Group of Ministers that has been constituted.
Indonesia	Proposes to phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies in a gradual manner in parallel
	with managing demand by adopting measures that will reduce fossil fuel energy
	consumption and by gradually narrowing the gap between domestic and
	international prices.
Italy	Proposes to continue with the planned expiration of subsidies for certain
	cogeneration plants, and negotiate on a voluntary basis with private operators of
	these plants the timing of their recess from the subsidy scheme.
Korea	Proposes to phase-out subsidies to anthracite coal and briquette producers.
Mexico	Proposes to continue current policies. Based on current market conditions,
	subsidies to gasoline, diesel, and liquid petroleum gas are expected to disappear in
	the medium term.
Russia	Proposes to implement the commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient
	fossil fuel subsidies through national economic and energy policy, within the
	framework of its Energy Strategy 2030 and the Concept of Long-Term Social and
	Economic Development, as well as in the context of its accession to the World
	Trade Organization.
Turkey	Proposes to work on a restructuring plan to rationalise the inefficient producer
United States	Proposes to pass legislation to eliminate 12 preferential tax provisions related to the
	production of coal, oil and natural gas.
Turkey United States	Proposes to work on a restructuring plan to rationalise the inefficient producer subsidies transferred to a stated-owned hard coal producing enterprise. Proposes to pass legislation to eliminate 12 preferential tax provisions related to th

# Table 6: Country-Specific Implementation Strategies, Delivered at the 2012 Los Cabos Summit<sup>9</sup>

#### **Commitment Features**

This commitment has two parts: 1) rationalizing and phasing out fossil fuel subsidies over the medium term and 2) providing support for the poor.

#### Part 1 — Fossil Fuel Subsidies (FFS):

According to the 2015 United Nations Environmental Programme "Fossil Fuel Subsidy Policy Brief,"<sup>10</sup> fossil fuel subsidies have important policy objectives because, in theory, they can protect the poor from fluctuating fuel prices, exploit natural resources for the benefit of the citizens of energy rich countries, and boost the competitiveness of domestic industries. In reality, however, subsidies have negative impacts on the environment, absorb substantial fiscal resources, fail to benefit targeted groups, and encourage excessive consumption of energy. Furthermore, FFS are highly regressive in that the richest 20 per cent of households receive more than 40 per cent of the benefits from energy subsidies. This drains public finances and reduces funds available for addressing social and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> G20 Initiative on Rationalizing and Phasing Out Inefficient Fossil Fuel Subsidies. G20 Research Group (Toronto) 4 September 2013. Access Date: 15 February 2016. http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/compliance/2012loscabos-final/11-2012-g20-compliance-final.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Fossil Fuel Subsidies Policy Brief (Geneva) 2015 Access Date: 15 February 2016 http://www.unep.org/greeneconomy/Portals/88/documents/GE\_BriefFossilFuelSubsidies\_EN\_Web.pdf

developmental objectives. Cheap fossil fuels also render low-carbon energy options more expensive and undermine progress towards a green economy.

While there is no universal definition of a subsidy, the WTO has developed a general definition that is accepted by 153 member states. There are various types of FFS:<sup>11</sup>

- Direct financial transfers: e.g. fuel vouchers or grants to producers or consumers
- Trade instruments: e.g. tariffs on imports of crude oil and petroleum products, making domestic fuel production more lucrative, quotas and restrictions
- Regulations: e.g. gasoline prices regulated at below international market levels, regulations that prioritise the use of domestic coal for power generation, market-access restrictions
- Tax breaks: e.g. favourable tax deductions for depletion or investment in oil and gas fields and coal deposits, excise exemptions for fuels used in international air, rail or water transport
- Credits: e.g. loan guarantees to finance energy infrastructure or preferential rates on loans to producers
- Risk transfers: e.g. insurance or indemnification provided to fossil-fuel producers at below-market levels, limitation of financial liability
- Below-full cost access to government goods and services: e.g. provision of seismic data for oil and gas exploration.

We will undergo compliance analysis with the understanding that all subsidies are inefficient and hence all FFS encourage wasteful consumption.

#### Part 2 — Targeted Support for the Poor:

In this commitment, the G20 also recognized the need to support the poor. The World Bank found that even though FFS are economically inefficient, "price increases from the removal of fossil-fuel subsidies are likely to adversely affect lower-income households who are already struggling." The report by the World Bank, submitted to the G20, identified two broad types of approaches available to members seeking to reduce subsidies and support the poor: 1) improving the poverty targeting of existing subsidies, including limiting the number of subsidized goods to those used by the poor or limiting the quantities subsidized; and 2) introducing or strengthening other forms of support for the livelihoods of the poor, in cash or in-kind.

Compensation measures for vulnerable households and businesses can help cushion them against the adverse impacts of rising fuel prices following subsidy removal, but they need to be adapted to each member's domestic circumstances. Complementary measures such as broader energy sector improvements, communication campaigns to inform the public about reform objectives and expected impacts, and a supportive administrative apparatus will ensure smooth implementation of subsidy reforms.

In addition to assessing whether action is taken to rationalise and phase-out fossil fuel subsidies, G20 members will also be evaluated on their efforts to provide support for the poor.

#### **Scoring Guidelines**

-1	Member did not rationalise or phase-out fossil fuel subsidies over the medium term AND did not support the poor.
0	Member rationalised and phased-out fossil fuel subsidies over the medium term BUT did not support the poor.
+1	Member rationalised and phased-out fossil fuel subsidies over the medium term AND provided support to the poor.

Lead Analyst: Grace Lee

#### G20 Research Group: 2015 G20 Antalya Summit Interim Compliance Report, 17 July 2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Fossil Fuel Subsidies Policy Brief (Geneva) 2015 Access Date: 15 February 2016 http://www.unep.org/greeneconomy/Portals/88/documents/GE\_BriefFossilFuelSubsidies\_EN\_Web.pdf

#### Argentina: -1

Argentina has failed to comply with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

President Macri was sworn in on 10 December 2015 and in the early stages of his presidency, he has maintained a "controlled or fixed price of oil at USD67.50 a barrel for Medanito crude quality oil."<sup>12</sup> This provides oil companies with the incentive to pump out as much oil and gas as possible. He has also set the prices of new production at USD7.5/MBTU "in an attempt to improve the attractiveness of investing in Argentine gas deposits."<sup>13</sup>

On 17 December 2015 Argentina's state-run energy company YPF announced that they will "invest USD500 million into exploitation program at the El Orejano gas field."<sup>14</sup> President Macri emphasized that gas production aid job creation and economic development in Argentina.

In late January 2015, the Argentine government announced big hikes in wholesale electricity rates starting in February as a result of subsidy removal, but did not confirm specific number increases.<sup>15</sup> Analysts have predicted that electricity bills will increase by as much as 500 per cent,<sup>16</sup> but the government has promised to provide rate discounts to homes that reduce their power consumption compared with the same period of the previous year, or if consumption is less than 300 kilowatts per month.<sup>17</sup> Despite these promised fee reductions for all consumers, Argentina has yet to develop a specific plan to support the poor.

On 11 March 2016, the energy ministry announced "Considering that the price of crude oil has been in sharp decline over the past two years, it is necessary to apply stimulus measures to mitigate the impact of such reductions on the level of activity and local employment." The Ministry confirmed that exporters of heavy crude from Argentina would receive a subsidy of USD7.50 per barrel from the government as long as international prices remain under USD47.50 per barrel.<sup>18</sup>

On 1 April 2016, the government announced subsidy cuts as part of a new fiscal austerity plan, whereby Argentines will pay higher rates for natural gas consumption. In some areas, it is expected that heating prices will go up by 300 per cent.<sup>19</sup>

Argentina has lowered market regulation and provided incentive for the fossil fuel industry to grow in the country. It has also removed energy subsidies that have significantly increased the price of electricity impacting the poor.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Argentina looks to replicate US Oil and Gas Boom, BN Americas 26 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.bnamericas.com/en/intelligence-series/oilandgas/argentina-looks-to-replicate-us-oil-and-gas-boom/#

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Argentina looks to replicate US Oil and Gas Boom, BN Americas 26 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.bnamericas.com/en/intelligence-series/oilandgas/argentina-looks-to-replicate-us-oil-and-gas-boom/#

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Shale Pioneer McClendon Joins YPF in \$500 million Argentina Deal, Bloomberg. 15 January 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016.http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2016-01-14/shale-pioneer-mcclendon-joins-ypf-in-500-millionargentina-deal

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Argentina announces big hikes in electric rates, removes subsidies, Fox News Latino (Argentina) 27 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://latino.foxnews.com/latino/news/2016/01/27/argentina-announces-big-hikes-inelectric-rates-removes-subsidies.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Argentina to raise electricity bills by as much as 500 per cent, Bloomberg Business (New York) 29 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2016-01-29/argentina-to-raise-electricitybills-by-as-much-as-500-per cent.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Argentina announces big hikes in electric rates, removes subsidies, Fox News Latino (Argentina) 27 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://latino.foxnews.com/latino/news/2016/01/27/argentina-announces-big-hikes-inelectric-rates-removes-subsidies/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Argentina to subsidize oil exports to compensate for low prices, Reuters, 11 March 2016, Date Accessed 11 April 2016 http://www.reuters.com/article/us-argentina-oil-idUSKCN0WD1FM

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Argentine home heating prices to rise after years of subsidies, Reuters, 1 April 2016, Date Accessed 11 April 2016 http://af.reuters.com/article/energyOilNews/idAFL2N1741JR

Thus, Argentina has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Rinchen-Dolma Karma

#### Australia: -1

Australia has failed to comply with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

On 30 November 2015, it was reported that the Australian government is continuing to subsidize diesel to farmers and miners.<sup>20</sup> The government pays 38 cents per liter of diesel, and has allocated USD3.9 billion in its annual budget.<sup>21</sup>

On 1 December 2015, Australia refused to sign the communiqué supporting the reform of fossil fuel subsidies at the Paris Climate Summit, where 40 countries agreed to phase-out inefficient government subsidies for the use of coal, gas, and oil.<sup>22</sup> It cited concern for its current multi-billion-dollar diesel fuel rebate for farmers and miners.<sup>23</sup>

On 24 February 2016, the Australian Minister for Industry, Innovation and Science, Christopher Pyne said that "the Australian Government was investing USD15.4 million over four years in the growth centre."<sup>24</sup> This Growth Centre will "drive innovation, competitiveness and productivity across the oil, gas, coal and uranium sectors."<sup>25</sup> In particular, the centre will focus on "improving knowledge and techniques needed to unlock Australia's marginal gas resources like coal-seam gas."<sup>26</sup> The centre will be headed by "long-time oil and gas executive, Ken Fitzpatrick."

Australia has publicly refused to support the reform of current fossil fuel subsidies and made a direct investment into the fossil fuel industry. They have also failed to take any measures to provide targeted support to the poor.

Thus, Australia has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Yalda Mehran

#### Brazil: –1

Brazil has failed to comply with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> COP21 Paris climate talks: Australia U-turn on fossil-fuel reform, Financial Times 30 November 2015. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/2e7b7b34-9764-11e5-9228-87e603d47bdc.html#axzz41RF8l6rz.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> COP21 Paris climate talks: Australia U-turn on fossil-fuel reform, Financial Times 30 November 2015. Access Date: 28
 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/2e7b7b34-9764-11e5-9228-87e603d47bdc.html#axzz41RF8l6rz.
 <sup>22</sup> Paris UN Climate Conference 2015: Australia rejects fossil fuel pledge, Sydney Morning Herald 1 December 2015.

Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://www.smh.com.au/environment/un-climate-conference/paris-un-climateconference-2015-australia-rejects-fossil-fuel-pledge-20151130-glbw4s.html#ixzz41QTOTh4A.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Paris climate talks: Australia won't sign fossil fuel missive due to Nationals concerns about diesel rebate, ABC News 30 November 2015. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://www.abc.net.au/news/2015-11-30/australia-won't-sign-fossil-fuel-deal-at-paris-talks/6988380.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Energy Resources Growth Centre Launched, Pyne Online 24 February 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. https://www.pyneonline.com.au/media-centre/media-releases/energy-resources-growth-centre-launched

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Energy Resources Growth Centre Launched, Pyne Online 24 February 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016.

https://www.pyneonline.com.au/media-centre/media-releases/energy-resources-growth-centre-launched <sup>26</sup> Coalition digs deeper into fossil fuels with new "growth centre", Renew Economy 25 February 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://reneweconomy.com.au/2016/coalition-digs-deeper-into-fossil-fuels-with-new-growth-centre-82395

On 15 January 2016, President Dilma Rousseff stated that her administration would be evaluating government assistance to Petrobras in the event energy market conditions continue to deteriorate.<sup>27</sup> This was reiterated on 25 January 2016 by Jorge Camargo, head of Brazil's oil industry association, IBP, who met with President Rousseff and shared that she plans to introduce a stimulus package for the oil industry.<sup>28</sup> This would include a reduction of the tax on importation of equipment and construction of equipment in Brazil for oil exploration and production.<sup>29</sup>

On 9 March 2016, President Rousseff approved a new stimulus package as are part of a resolution by the National Council of Energy Policies (CNPE), unlocking up to USD120 billion of investment in the country's oil sector. These measures include extending the term of concession contracts for exploration and tax exemptions for the industry until 31 December 2020, which aim to benefit the entire industry chain according to Energy Minister Eduardo Braga.<sup>30</sup>

In 2015, according to the International Monetary Fund, Brazil's post-tax subsidies as a percent of Gross Domestic Product amounted to 2.35 per cent or USD 271.17 per capita.<sup>31</sup> No evidence was found suggesting that these subsidies were rolled back during the compliance period.

In January 2015, the World Bank produced a report entitled Fossil Fuel Subsidy and Pricing Policies. The report critized the Brazilian governements relationship of Petrobras stating, "The official position of the Government of Brazil is that the downstream petroleum sector was completely deregulated effective January 2002. The government has nevertheless continued its informal policy of keeping domestic prices of petroleum products artificially low through losses suffered by Petrobras, a semi-public oil company that controls more than 99 per cent of the refining capacity in the country.<sup>32</sup> Furermore, the report cited that state-owned energy companies such as Petrobras, have come under political pressure to set artificially low prices without an official re-introduction of price subsidies.<sup>33</sup> These articifcally low prices aim to curb competition and aim to increase consumption.

Brazil has increased subsidies to oil producers and failed to roll back existing subsidies.

Thus, Brazil has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Laila Kanji

http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/survey/so/2015/NEW070215A.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Brazil's Rousseff Says She Won't Rule Out Petrobras Rescue, Bloomberg Business 15 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2016-01-15/brazil-s-rousseff-says-she-won-t-rule-outpetrobras-rescue.

petrobras-rescue. <sup>28</sup> Brazil oil rules block \$120 billion in investment: IBP, Reuters 25 January 2016. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-brazil-oil-regulations-idUSKCN0V32GR.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Brazil oil rules block \$120 billion in investment: IBP, Reuters 25 January 2016. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-brazil-oil-regulations-idUSKCN0V32GR.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Brazil Extends Contracts and Tax Breaks for Oil & Gas Industry, riotimesonline, 10 March 2016, Date Accessed 10 April 2016

http://riotimesonline.com/brazil-news/rio-business/brazil-extends-contracts-and-tax-breaks-for-oilgas-industry/# <sup>31</sup> IMF Survey : Counting the Cost of Energy Subsidies, IMF 17 July 2015. Access Date: 21 July 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Fossil Fuel Subsidy and Pricing Policies Recent Developing Country Experience, World Bank Group January 2016, Access Date: 21 July 2016.

http://poseidon01.ssrn.com/delivery.php?ID=2660820640820240290900201030930020000690150020330020300900 5301512305803400705110609909712611811906500103304006300602807210500100100007001608606708901812 6086098087096087112125110090021124094&EXT=pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Fossil Fuel Subsidy and Pricing Policies Recent Developing Country Experience, World Bank Group January 2016, Access Date: 21 July 2016.

http://poseidon01.ssrn.com/delivery.php?ID=266082064082024029090020103093002000690150020330020300900 5301512305803400705110609909712611811906500103304006300602807210500100100007001608606708901812 6086098087096087112125110090021124094&EXT=pdf

#### Canada: –1

Canada has not complied with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

On 30 November 2015, Prime Minister Justin Trudeau outlined that support for and implementation of policies that contribute to a low-carbon economy is one of the five foundational principles upon which Canada's actions against climate change is based.<sup>34</sup> He stated that Canada had "endorsed the Fossil Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué, in support of accelerating action to eliminate inefficient fossil fuel subsidies."<sup>35</sup>

In early January 2016, Financial Minister Bill Morneau's federal budget consultation tour across the country reported that the Liberal Party's promise to "continue phasing out fossil fuel subsidies is projected to save CAD125 million in 2017-2018 and CAD250 million the following year."<sup>36</sup> This was confirmed by the newly appointed Minister of Environment and Climate Change Catherine McKenna, who indicated that the plan of "phasing out of fossil fuel subsidies," along with an endowment to the Low Carbon Economy trust of CAD2 million and a boost to investment in green infrastructure by CAD6 billion in the next 4 years, is scheduled to be realized over the course of the medium term of 2 to 5 years.<sup>37</sup>

On 25 February 2016, Export Development Canada, a federal crown corporation, stated that it designated CAD750 million to provide financial services, including loans and guarantees, to small and medium-sized Canadian energy firms weathering through low oil prices.<sup>38</sup>

On 23 March 2016, Canada's Natural Resources Minister Jim Carr announced that given the decline in oil prices, now was not the moment to phase out fossil fuel subsidies, despite a campaign promise to "phase out subsidies to the fossil fuel industry over the medium-term." He further went on to state that "there are all kinds of issues that are important in the oil and gas industry right now and the government wants to express its support for the industry in a variety of ways...Those are the priorities the government has chosen."<sup>39</sup>

While Canada has publicly endorsed the phasing out of fossil fuel subsidies over the medium term, it has chosen not to phase out subsidies to the oil and gas sector. No evidence was found with regards to supporting the poor.

Thus, Canada has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Rinchen-Dolma Karma

resources/edc-earmarks-750-million-to-help-energy-firms-weather-oil-price-drop/article28920058/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Address by Prime Minister Justin Trudeau in Canada, Minister of Environment and Climate Change (Ottawa) 12 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://news.gc.ca/web/article-en.do?nid=1024629.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Address by Prime Minister Justin Trudeau in Canada, Minister of Environment and Climate Change (Ottawa) 12 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://news.gc.ca/web/article-en.do?nid=1024629.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> The Big Shortfall: Preparing the budget promises to be a mammoth financial headache for Liberals, National Post Canadian Politics Section (Toronto) 23 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

http://news.nationalpost.com/news/canada/canadian-politics/the-big-shortfall-preparing-the-budget-promises-to-be-a-mammoth-financial-headache-for-liberals.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Meet Your New Climate Change Minister, Green Business Canada Magazine (Edmonton) 23 November 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016.

http://businessofgreen.ca/meet-your-new-climate-change-minister/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> EDC earmarks \$750 million to help energy firms weather oil price drop, The Globe and Mail, 25 February 2016, Date Accessed 15 April 2016 http://www.theglobeandmail.com/report-on-business/industry-news/energy-and-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Fossil Fuel Subsidies to Remain in Place, Despite Liberal's 'Greenest" Budget Ever, The Huffington Post, 24 March 2016, Date Accessed 15 April 2016 http://www.huffingtonpost.ca/2016/03/24/oil-patch-woes-give-federal-liberals-cold-feet-on-cutting-fossil-fuel-subsidies\_n\_9535232.html

#### China: 0

China has partially complied with its commitment to rationalise and phase out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

On 2 December 2015, during the Paris Climate Conference, the State Council announced plans to upgrade coal-fired generators to reduce pollutants by 60 per cent and close inefficient plants by the end of 2020.<sup>40</sup> The Chinese government stated that this would save approximately 100 million tonnes of raw coal and cut carbon dioxide emissions by 180 million tonnes per annum.<sup>41</sup>

On 9 December 2015, the National Development and Reform Commission announced that it would pay subsidies of RMB0.001/kWh for power plants meeting coal emission requirements before 1 January 2016.<sup>42</sup> For those meeting requirements after that date, the subsidy will be RMB0.005/kWh.<sup>43</sup>

On 23 December 2016, the State Council announced that the price of electricity generated by coalfired power plants would be cut by RMB0.03/kWh in order to "reduce the burden on enterprises and cut emissions," and to "reduce the price for businesses, upgrade power plants to ones with low emissions and to increase supply of renewable energy."<sup>44</sup>

On 30 December 2015, Nur Bekri, head of the National Energy Administration, announced that the Chinese government plans to reduce coal consumption from 64.6 per cent to below 62 per cent in 2016.<sup>45</sup> To support this goal, the Chinese government has suspended new coal mining sites for three years, beginning in 2016.<sup>46</sup>

On 24 March 2016, the country's energy regulator stated that it would halt construction of coal-fired plants in 15 regions across the country. In addition, China would also stop approving new projects in as many as 13 provinces and regions until 2018. According to Greenpeace, if the rules are fully implemented, it would involve up to 250 power projects with a total of 170 gigawatts (GW) in capacity.<sup>47</sup>

China has taken steps to phase out fossil fuel subsidies by closing inefficient plants, reducing prices of electricity generated by coal-fired power plants, and suspending new coal mining sites for three years. However, there is no evidence that it has taken any measures to ensure support for vulnerable populations.

Thus, China has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Anju Xing

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> China says to cut power sector emissions by 60 per cent by 2020, Reuters (Beijing) 2 December 2015. Access Date:
 20 February 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-climatechange-summit-china-emissionsidUSKBN0TL17J20151203.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> China says to cut power sector emissions by 60 per cent by 2020, Reuters (Beijing) 2 December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-climatechange-summit-china-emissions-idUSKBN0TL17J20151203.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> China offers bonus to coal power plants to meet emissions rules, Reuters (Beijing) 9 December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-china-coal-power-idUSKBN0TS11320151209.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> China offers bonus to coal power plants to meet emissions rules, Reuters (Beijing) 9 December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-china-coal-power-idUSKBN0TS11320151209.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> China cuts coal-fired power price, Xinhua News (Beijing) 23 December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/2015-12/23/c\_134945743.htm.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> 13.2 pct of China's energy consumption to be non-fossil fuels in 2016, Xinhua News (Beijing) 30 December 2015.
 Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/2015-12/30/c\_134962530.htm.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> 13.2 pct of China's energy consumption to be non-fossil fuels in 2016, Xinhua News (Beijing) 30 December 2015.
 Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/2015-12/30/c\_134962530.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> China to halt construction of coal-fired plants in 15 regions, Reuters, 24 March 2016, Date Accessed 16 April 2016 http://uk.reuters.com/article/china-power-coal-idUKL3N16W322

#### France: 0

France has partially complied with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

On 30 November 2015, France, along with 40 other countries endorsed the Fossil Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué presented to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC).<sup>48</sup> The Communiqué "calls on the international community to increase efforts to phase-out subsidies for fossil fuel production and use."<sup>49</sup>

On 13 January 2016, the Ministry of Ecology, Sustainable Development and Energy granted permission for the launch of research related to conventional hydrocarbons in Champfolie and Herbsheim, but postponed the two others in the Scattered Islands.<sup>50</sup> Minister Ségolène Royal announced that starting 2016, any new application for exploration permissions for fossil fuels would be refused.<sup>51</sup> The proposed changes were in accordance with the bill on transition energétique enacted earlier in August 2015, through which France anticipates a reduction in the consumption of fossil fuels of 30 per cent from 2012 to 2030.<sup>52</sup>

On 1 February 2016, the French government introduced the construction of 1000 kilometers of solar panels over the next five years.<sup>53</sup> As the Minister of Environment Ségolène Royal highlighted, the program "Wattway" will eventually furnish 5 million people with electricity, equaling to 8 per cent of the French population.<sup>54</sup>

France has reduced inefficient exploration subsidies for fossil fuels, but it has not shown dedication to helping the poor through any measures.

Thus, France has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Olivier Li

#### Germany: 0

Germany has partially complied with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient subsidies that encourage wasteful consumption, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

On 30 November 2015, Germany, along with 40 other countries endorsed the Fossil Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué presented to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Fossil-Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué Presented to UNFCCC (New Zealand) 30 November 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://climate-l.iisd.org/news/fossil-fuel-subsidy-reform-communique-presented-to-unfccc/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Fossil-Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué Presented to UNFCCC (New Zealand) 30 November 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://climate-l.iisd.org/news/fossil-fuel-subsidy-reform-communique-presented-to-unfccc/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> La France N'accordera Plus de Permis de Recherches d'Hydrocarbures Conventionnels, Up Inspirer Le Quoditien 12 January 2016. Access Date: 15 February 2016. http://www.up-inspirer.fr/19799-la-france-naccordera-plus-de-permisde-recherches-dhydrocarbures-conventionnels-royal.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> La France N'accordera Plus de Permis de Recherches d'Hydrocarbures Conventionnels, Up Inspirer Le Quoditien 12 January 2016. Access Date: 15 February 2016. http://www.up-inspirer.fr/19799-la-france-naccordera-plus-de-permis-de-recherches-dhydrocarbures-conventionnels-royal.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> La France N'accordera Plus de Permis de Recherches d'Hydrocarbures Conventionnels, Up Inspirer Le Quoditien 12 January 2016. Access Date: 15 February 2016. http://www.up-inspirer.fr/19799-la-france-naccordera-plus-de-permisde-recherches-dhydrocarbures-conventionnels-royal.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> France's 'Wattway' Solar Road Set To Power Millions Of Homes, The Huffington Post Canada 12 February 2016. Access Date: 15 February 2016. http://www.huffingtonpost.ca/2016/02/11/france-solar-roadwattway n 9190024.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> France's 'Wattway' Solar Road Set To Power Millions Of Homes, The Huffington Post Canada 12 February 2016. Access Date: 15 February 2016. http://www.huffingtonpost.ca/2016/02/11/france-solar-road-wattway\_n\_9190024.html.

(UNFCCC).<sup>55</sup> The Communiqué "calls on the international community to increase efforts to phaseout subsidies for fossil fuel production and use."<sup>56</sup>

On 30 November 2015, the World Bank reported that Germany, along with three other European countries and the World Bank Group announced a USD500 million initiative for developing countries to tackle climate change.<sup>57</sup> Developing countries that remove or reduce fossil fuel subsidies and replace them with more renewable forms of energy would be paid for emission cuts, leading to low carbon development and a reduction in carbon cities.<sup>58</sup> The initiative is stated to start operating in 2016.<sup>59</sup>

In November 2015, Germany was reported to be the only country to successfully "integrate tax expenditures with subsidies in their annual budget."<sup>60</sup> It has remained determined to eliminate its coal industry and has effective plans in place for stakeholders in coal production, including early retirement schemes for current workers, and sharing costs of closures and liabilities with the industry.<sup>61</sup>

On 3 December 2015, German consumers were reported to be bearing the costs of transitions to renewable energy, reflected in its higher electricity rates compared to other countries.<sup>62</sup> The price of government projects is estimated to be EUR550 billion, or about USD97 billion, by 2050.<sup>63</sup>

Germany has reduced inefficient subsidies for fossil fuels, but has not introduced targeted measures to help the poor, with evidence that all consumers are bearing the cost of the transition to renewable energy.

Thus, Germany has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Novera Khan

#### India: +1

India has fully complied with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Fossil-Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué Presented to UNFCCC (New Zealand) 30 November 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://climate-l.iisd.org/news/fossil-fuel-subsidy-reform-communique-presented-to-unfccc/.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Fossil-Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué Presented to UNFCCC (New Zealand) 30 November 2015. Access Date: 21
 February 2016. http://climate-l.iisd.org/news/fossil-fuel-subsidy-reform-communique-presented-to-unfccc/.
 <sup>57</sup> Press Release: New \$500 million initiative to boost large scale climate action in developing countries, The World Bank

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Press Release: New \$500 million initiative to boost large scale climate action in developing countries, The World Bank
 30 November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-

release/2015/11/30/new-500-million-initiative-to-boost-large-scale-climate-action-in-developing-countries.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Press Release: New \$500 million initiative to boost large scale climate action in developing countries, The World Bank 30 November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-

release/2015/11/30/new-500-million-initiative-to-boost-large-scale-climate-action-in-developing-countries.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Press Release: New \$500 million initiative to boost large scale climate action in developing countries, The World Bank 30 November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/press-

release/2015/11/30/new-500-million-initiative-to-boost-large-scale-climate-action-in-developing-countries.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Empty promises: G20 subsidies to oil, gas and coal production, Overseas Development Institute November 2015.
 Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.odi.org/publications/10058-production-subsidies-oil-gas-coal-fossil-fuels-g20-broken-promises.
 <sup>61</sup> Empty promises.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Empty promises: G20 subsidies to oil, gas and coal production, Overseas Development Institute November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.odi.org/publications/10058-production-subsidies-oil-gas-coal-fossil-fuels-g20-broken-promises.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Germany May Offer Model for Reining In Fossil Fuel Use, The New York Times 3 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.nytimes.com/2015/12/04/world/europe/germany-may-offer-model-for-reining-in-fossilfuel-use.html? r=0.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Germany May Offer Model for Reining In Fossil Fuel Use, The New York Times 3 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.nytimes.com/2015/12/04/world/europe/germany-may-offer-model-for-reining-in-fossil-fuel-use.html?\_r=0.

On 30 November, Prime Minister Narendra Modi addressed India's role in climate change at the United Nations Climate Change Conference to be held in December.<sup>64</sup> He addressed phasing out fossil fuels in his speech, stating: "We are reducing dependence on fossil fuel through levies and reduction in subsidies; switching sources of fuel where possible; and, transforming cities and public transportation."<sup>65</sup>

On 1 January 2016, the Indian government announced a scheme to implement Direct Benefit Transfers for Kerosene Subsidies, which are set to start early April.<sup>66</sup> This was set up in order to avoid leakages and fully integrate underprivileged sectors.<sup>67</sup>

On 9 January 2016, Oil Minister Dharmendar Pradhan released a statement on the impact of this policy towards the poor, "volunteering to give up LPG [liquefied petroleum gas] subsidy amount to contributing for national development & empowerment of poor people, who will be the beneficiary."<sup>68</sup>

On 17 February 2016, the Indian government proposed subsidy cuts for higher income households.<sup>69</sup> The Oil Ministry issued a statement indicating that "there will be no subsidy for cooking gas cylinders if either the registered consumer, or his/her spouse have an annual taxable income of more than Rs10 lakh."<sup>70</sup>

On 29 February 2016, Finance Minister Arun Jaitley presented the annual Union Budget 2016-2017.<sup>71</sup> It posits petroleum subsidies at a 10.76 per cent share from overall subsidies, a decrease from last year's share of 11.64 per cent.<sup>72</sup> The budget also includes increased taxes on fuels, with its "clean energy cess increased from Rs200 per ton to Rs400 per ton on coal, lignite and peat."<sup>73</sup>

In line with the proposals in the Budget, the Finance Minister has "proposed phase-out of tax concession to commissioned projects under Section 80-IA of the Income Tax Act, raising costs of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Narendra Modi's at COP21 in Full, The Wall Street Journal India edition (Paris) 1 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://blogs.wsj.com/indiarealtime/2015/12/01/narendra-modis-speech-at-cop21-in-full/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> Narendra Modi's at COP21 in Full, The Wall Street Journal India edition (Paris) 1 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://blogs.wsj.com/indiarealtime/2015/12/01/narendra-modis-speech-at-cop21-in-full/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> Government Announces Direct Transfer Benefits Scheme for Kerosene Subsidy, Business Standard (New Delhi) 1 January 2016. Access Date: 18 February 2016. http://www.business-standard.com/article/economy-policy/govtannounces-direct-benefit-transfer-scheme-for-kerosene-subsidy-116010100799\_1.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Government Announces Direct Transfer Benefits Scheme for Kerosene Subsidy, Business Standard (New Delhi) 1 January 2016. Access Date: 18 February 2016. http://www.business-standard.com/article/economy-policy/govtannounces-direct-benefit-transfer-scheme-for-kerosene-subsidy-116010100799 1.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Jaitley Gives up Subsidised LPG, The Hindu (New Delhi) 9 January 2015. Access Date: 18 February 2016. http://www.thehindu.com/news/national/jaitley-gives-up-subsidised-lpg/article6772175.ece.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> No more LPG Subsidy If You Earn Above Rs 10 Lakh A Year, Times of India (New Delhi) 29 December 2015. Access Date: 17 February 2016. http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/No-more-LPG-subsidy-if-you-earn-above-Rs-10-lakh-a-year/articleshow/50360841.cms.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> No more LPG Subsidy If You Earn Above Rs 10 Lakh A Year, Times of India (New Delhi) 29 December 2015. Access Date: 17 February 2016. http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/No-more-LPG-subsidy-if-you-earn-above-Rs-10-lakh-a-year/articleshow/50360841.cms.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> Budget 2016, Where the money comes from and where it goes, The Hindu 1 March 2016. Access Date: 1 March 2016. http://www.thehindu.com/business/budget/budget-2016-where-the-money-comes-from-and-where-it-goes/article8297149.ece?homepage=true.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> Budget 2016, Where the money comes from and where it goes, The Hindu 1 March 2016. Access Date: 1 March 2016. http://www.thehindu.com/business/budget/budget-2016-where-the-money-comes-from-and-where-it-goes/article8297149.ece?homepage=true.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> All you need to know about Budget 2016 in under 60 points, Daily News & Analysis, 1 March 2016. Access Date: 1 March 2016. http://www.dnaindia.com/money/report-key-highlights-from-the-budget-2016-2183855.

power firms."<sup>74</sup> In addition, another proposal is a "tax on large dividends" of companies including Coal India, which received Rs13,000 from its subsidiaries last year."<sup>75</sup>

India has created and implemented policies that phase-out inefficient fuel subsidies, while also supporting the poor.

Thus, India has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Nidhi Varma

#### Indonesia: –1

Indonesia has failed to comply with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

On 17 December 2015, Indonesian Senior Minister Coordinating Energy and Mining announced an improvement to the Production Sharing Contract (PSC) scheme to attract more oil and gas investment in Indonesia. The new planned scheme "will give the oil companies a 5 per cent higher in cost recovery given they invest in country's oil exploration. The current cost recovery scheme is 15 per cent."<sup>76</sup>

On 4 January 2016, Energy Minister Sudirman Said reported the postponement of a new levy on fossil fuels intended to support development of renewable energy resources and improve energy security.<sup>77</sup>

On 5 January 2016 due to falling global oil prices, the Indonesian government announced a cut in fuel prices.<sup>78</sup> President Director of state owned energy company Pertamina Dwi Sutjipto made the announcement and the cuts were larger than what was previously expected.<sup>79</sup> The government controls the price of diesel which was cut to Rp5,650 per liter from Rp6,700 a liter previously.<sup>80</sup> The cut in prices would increase consumption of fossil fuels.

On 26 February 2016, Indonesian Vice President Jusuf Kalla "admitted the government still needs more time to decide which is the most suitable scheme for the development of the gas rich block located in the Arafuru Sea."<sup>81</sup> He further added that since the block is one of the largest oil and gas

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Budget 2016: Coal cess in line with India's climate commitments, The Economic Times- India (New Delhi/ Kolkotta) 1 March 2016. Access Date: 1 March 2016. http://economictimes.indiatimes.com/industry/indl-goods/svs/metalsmining/budget-2016-coal-cess-in-line-with-indias-climate-commitments/articleshow/51202168.cms.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Budget 2016: Coal cess in line with India's climate commitments, The Economic Times- India (New Delhi/ Kolkotta) 1 March 2016. Access Date: 1 March 2016. http://economictimes.indiatimes.com/industry/indl-goods/svs/metalsmining/budget-2016-coal-cess-in-line-with-indias-climate-commitments/articleshow/51202168.cms.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Indonesia to Improve Cost Recovery Scheme to Increase OII and Gas Investment, Berita Migas 17 Dec 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://beritamigas.com/HOME/indonesia-to-improve-cost-recovery-scheme-to-increase-oil-and-gas-investment

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> Indonesia postpones new levy on gas and diesel, Reuters 4 January 2016. Access Date: 21 February 2016.

http://sustainability.thomsonreuters.com/2016/01/05/indonesia-postpones-new-levy-on-gasoline-and-diesel/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Good News for Customers, Indonesia Govt Cuts Fuel Price from Jan 5, RanbuEnergy 5 January 2016. Access Date: 7 March 2016. http://www.rambuenergy.com/2016/01/good-news-for-customers-indonesia-govt-cuts-fuel-price-fromjan-5/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Good News for Customers, Indonesia Govt Cuts Fuel Price from Jan 5, RanbuEnergy 5 January 2016. Access Date: 7 March 2016. http://www.rambuenergy.com/2016/01/good-news-for-customers-indonesia-govt-cuts-fuel-price-fromjan-5/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> Good News for Customers, Indonesia Govt Cuts Fuel Price from Jan 5, RanbuEnergy 5 January 2016. Access Date: 7 March 2016. http://www.rambuenergy.com/2016/01/good-news-for-customers-indonesia-govt-cuts-fuel-price-fromjan-5/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>81</sup> Jusaf Kalla: Govt Waits for the Perfect Day to Announce Masela's Fate, Katadata 26 February 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://en.katadata.co.id/news/2016/02/26/jusuf-kalla-govt-waits-for-the-perfect-day-to-announcemaselas-fate

projects in Indonesia the government "needs to be extra careful in doing its calculations and making the final decision between the onshore and offshore options." The development of Masela block will be led by Inpex Corporation and Royal Dutch Shell and they will receive cost recovery assistance per the PSC.

On 23 March 2016, Indonesian President Joko Widodo rejected the offshore option, stating that an onshore facility would provide greater economic payoffs to Indonesia's impoverished east where the Masela block is located.<sup>82</sup> Inpex Corporation and Royal Dutch Shell are committed to the onshore plan and have been requested by the Indonesian government to adjust and re-submit its development plan.<sup>83</sup>

On 30 March 2016, the Indonesian government announced new prices of subsidized fuels to be applied from 1 April 2016. Both gasoline and automotive diesel were lowered by Rp500 per litre. These price changes are the second round of price adjustments since the government announced in November 2015 that it would evaluate and adjust the price of subsidized fuel every three months.<sup>84</sup>

Indonesia has increased the subsidy for fossil fuel production and there is no evidence that they are supporting vulnerable groups with regards to energy access.

Thus, Indonesia has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Laila Kanji

#### Italy: 0

Italy has partially complied with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

On 30 November 2015, Italy, along with 40 other countries endorsed the Fossil Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué presented to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC).<sup>85</sup> The Communiqué "calls on the international community to increase efforts to phase-out subsidies for fossil fuel production and use."<sup>86</sup>

On 1 January 2016 the Italian Parliament reintroduced restrictions on offshore oil and gas activity within 12 nautical miles off its coast.<sup>87</sup> The restriction was originally introduced in 2010 but was released in 2012. This restriction could "impact Rockhopper's Ombrina Mare project offshore Italy, which has also faced opposition locally, due to its proximity to a coastal nature reserve."

On February 11 2016, Premier Matteo Renzi's cabinet has set 17 April 2016 as the "date for a referendum on offshore drilling for oil and gas in Italy."<sup>89</sup> The referendum will cover "prospecting

<sup>88</sup> Italy Reintroduces 12 mile exploration restriction, OE Digital 6 January 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.oedigital.com/component/k2/item/11251-italy-reintroduces-12-mile-exploration-restriction

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> UPDATE 2- Indonesia rejects Inpex's mega-floating LNG project, wants to stay onshore, Reuters, 23 March 2016, Date Accesses 10 April 2016 http://uk.reuters.com/article/indonesia-inpex-c-lng-idUKL3N16V2E3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> Inpex, Shell Committed to Masela Project: SKKMigas, The Jakarta Post, 24 March 2016, Date Accessed 10 April 2016 http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2016/03/24/inpex-shell-committed-masela-project-skkmigas.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> Indonesia Energy Subsidy Briefing, Global Subsidies Initiative, International Institute of Sustainable Development, 1 April 2016, Date Accessed 10 April 2016 https://www.iisd.org/gsi/news/indonesia-news-briefing-april-2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> Fossil-Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué Presented to UNFCCC (New Zealand) 30 November 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://climate-l.iisd.org/news/fossil-fuel-subsidy-reform-communique-presented-to-unfccc/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Fossil-Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué Presented to UNFCCC (New Zealand) 30 November 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://climate-l.iisd.org/news/fossil-fuel-subsidy-reform-communique-presented-to-unfccc/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> Italy Reintroduces 12 mile exploration restriction, OE Digital 6 January 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.oedigital.com/component/k2/item/11251-italy-reintroduces-12-mile-exploration-restriction

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> Cabinet sets drilling referendum Apr 17, Ansa World 11 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.ansa.it/english/news/world/2016/02/11/cabinet-sets-drilling-referendum-apr-17\_43bb66e5-beba-41e6b865-36cba72ee985.html

permits as well as already authorized drilling."<sup>90</sup> The government has also said, "there will be no new drilling in Italy no matter how the referendum turns out."<sup>91</sup>

Italy has reinstated fossil fuel restrictions in offshore oil activity and has committed to restricting new drilling projects in Italy. However, there is no evidence of the government supporting the energy needs of the poor.

Thus, Italy has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Jennifer Kou

#### Japan: -1

Japan has failed to comply with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

On 18 November 2015, members of the Organization of Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) including Japan reached an agreement about restrictions on subsidies used to export technology for coal-fired power plants.<sup>92</sup> However, Minister of Environment Tamayo Marukawa stated that Japan would focus on promoting the development of efficient technology rather than on restricting subsidies on fossil fuel exports.<sup>93</sup> She has shown uncertainties about whether there would be an increase in Japan's export of coal-fired stations.<sup>94</sup>

On 9 February 2016, the Japanese government permitted construction of new coal-fired power plants, which would potentially increase greenhouse gas emissions.<sup>95</sup> Environment Minister Tamayo Marukawa highlighted that officials have begun to verify the consistency of these plants with the country's environmental regulations.<sup>96</sup>

On 23 February 2016, the Ministry of Environment decided to continue subsidizing new coal-fired power stations, providing up to 50 per cent of their total cost.<sup>97</sup>

On 1 April 2016, Think Progress reported that Japan "is planning to build 45 domestic coal plants, and the Japanese foreign investment bank is considering financing a massive project in Indonesia."<sup>98</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> Petroceltic gives up on Adriatic, Ansa Business 9 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016.

http://www.ansa.it/english/news/business/2016/02/09/petroceltic-gives-up-on-adriatic\_b6bcbf75-a714-4bc0-9e97-73540d3e346c.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Petroceltic gives up on Adriatic, Ansa Business 9 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016.

http://www.ansa.it/english/news/business/2016/02/09/petroceltic-gives-up-on-adriatic\_b6bcbf75-a714-4bc0-9e97-73540d3e346c.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> OECD Countries Agree to Restrict Financing for Overseas Coal Power Plants, The Guardian 18 November 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2015. http://www.theguardian.com/environment/2015/nov/18/oecd-countries-agree-to-restrict-financing-for-overseas-coal-power-plants.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Japan to Push Coal Technology Despite OECD Subsidy Cut, Japan's Environment Minister Says, The Japan Times 26 November 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2015. http://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2015/11/26/national/politicsdiplomacy/japan-push-coal-technology-despite-oecd-subsidy-cut-japans-environment-minister-says/#.VtKTddbrSp4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> Japan to Push Coal Technology Despite OECD Subsidy Cut, Japan's Environment Minister Says, The Japan Times 26 November 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2015. http://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2015/11/26/national/politicsdiplomacy/japan-push-coal-technology-despite-oecd-subsidy-cut-japans-environment-minister-says/#.VtKTddbrSp4. <sup>95</sup> Japan to Get More Coal-Fired Power Plants Thanks to Environment Ministry Policy Reversal, The Japan Times 2

February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2015. http://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2016/02/09/national/japan-to-getmore-coal-fired-power-plants-thanks-to-environment-ministry-policy-reversal/#.Vtl N9brSp4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> Japan to Get More Coal-Fired Power Plants Thanks to Environment Ministry Policy Reversal, The Japan Times 2 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2015. http://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2016/02/09/national/japan-to-getmore-coal-fired-power-plants-thanks-to-environment-ministry-policy-reversal/#.VtI\_N9brSp4.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> Japan Environment Ministry's Coal Plant Reversal Casts Doubt on CO2 Pledge, Reuters 23 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2015. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-japan-emissions-idUSKCN0VW0EV.

Japan has taken no action to reduce existing fossil fuel subsidies and did not provide any targeted support to the poor.

Thus, Japan has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Olivier Li

#### Korea: -1

Korea has failed to comply with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

On 30 November 2015, during the 21st session of the Conference of the Parties Climate Summit, President Park Geun-hye outlined the Korean government's strategies to reduce greenhouse gas emissions, implement new energy industries, and share new technologies and business models with the developing world including implementing "pro-sumer" markets which would enable the trade of electricity through new and renewable energy facilities.<sup>99</sup>

On 15 December 2015, Korea confirmed its intentions to continue with plans to build 20 new coalfired power plants by 2021, despite cutting this number by four plants in accordance with its Paris Summit commitment.<sup>100</sup>

On 31 January 2016, Minister of Trade, Industry and Energy Joo Hyung-hwan announced that the Korean government has made an agreement with leading green energy companies, such that they will invest KRW1.5 trillion to fuel the development of Korea's renewable energy sector.<sup>101</sup>

While Korea has implemented strategies to increase development in the renewable energy sector, it has not taken any direct steps to phase-out its inefficient subsidies nor has it provided any support to vulnerable populations.

Thus, Korea has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Anju Xing

#### Mexico: -1

Mexico has failed to comply with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

On 30 November 2015, Mexico, along with 40 other countries endorsed the Fossil Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué presented to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC).<sup>102</sup> The Communiqué "calls on the international community to increase efforts to phase-out subsidies for fossil fuel production and use."<sup>103</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup> This Country is Embracing Coal while the Rest of the World is Trying to Cut Emissions, Think Progress 1 April 2016. Access Date: 16 April 2016.

http://thinkprogress.org/climate/2016/04/01/3765187/japan-coal-problem/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> President stresses greenhouse gas reduction, Korea.net (Paris) 1 December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://www.korea.net/NewsFocus/Policies/view?articleId=131153.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> Japan, S Korea stick to coal despite global climate deal, Reuters (Seoul/Tokyo) 15 December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/climatechange-summit-coal-idUSL3N1401N020151215.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> Public firms investing 1.5 tln won in renewable energy, Yonhap (Seoul) 31 January 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://english.yonhapnews.co.kr/business/2016/01/31/0502000000AEN20160131001800320.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> Fossil-Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué Presented to UNFCCC (New Zealand) 30 November 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://climate-l.iisd.org/news/fossil-fuel-subsidy-reform-communique-presented-to-unfccc/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> Fossil-Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué Presented to UNFCCC (New Zealand) 30 November 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://climate-l.iisd.org/news/fossil-fuel-subsidy-reform-communique-presented-to-unfccc/.

On 22 February 2016, at the opening address of the energy conference IHS CERAWeek President Enrique Peña Nieto addressed upcoming energy reforms in Mexico.<sup>104</sup> He stated that they will allow Mexico to "maintain state ownership of sub-soil hydrocarbon resources and its profits and [allow] private sector participation across the entire hydrocarbons value chain."<sup>105</sup> This reform has already incorporated 30 new companies "in areas of exploration and extraction, giving rise to a new oil industry."<sup>106</sup> It will also expand the "national gas pipeline network" from 11,000 to 21,000 kilometers.<sup>107</sup>

President Nieto also announced that "Mexico will launch a deep water round — the country's fourth — in early December."<sup>108</sup> In its previous round of auctions, Mexico "attracted 40 companies willing to invest in oil and gas acreage" and awarded all 25 onshore areas.<sup>109</sup>

On 26 February 2016, Deputy Secretary of Energy for Hydrocarbons Lourdes Melgar, at the Mexico Ministry of Energy stated that "We're working with Pemex as fast as we can to present 'farm-outs.' This is part of the strategy to strengthen Pemex."<sup>110</sup> Petroleos Mexicanos or Pemex is the Mexican state-owned petroleum company. Melgar also stated, "Companies will be able to use Pemex pipelines and other equipment for gasoline or diesel exports if they pay a tariff to Pemex."<sup>111</sup>

While Mexico has reaffirmed its commitment to phase-out fossil fuel subsidies through the Fossil Fuel Subsidy Reform communique, the government is continuing to subsidize and support its stateowned petroleum company, Pemex. It has plans to continue to expand its oil industry and thus has failed its commitment to rationalise and phase-out fossil fuel subsidies. There is also no evidence of any support to the poor.

Thus, Mexico has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Cindy Ou

#### Russia: –1

Russia has failed to comply with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

On 22 December 2016, the Russian government approved an action plan for strategic investment in the Vostochny Petrochemical Complex.<sup>112</sup> A number of measures are planned, including "designing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> The border: space for security, prosperity, Houston Chronicle (Houston) 22 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.houstonchronicle.com/opinion/outlook/article/The-border-space-for-security-prosperity-6848126.php.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> The border: space for security, prosperity, Houston Chronicle (Houston) 22 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.houstonchronicle.com/opinion/outlook/article/The-border-space-for-security-prosperity-6848126.php.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>106</sup> The border: space for security, prosperity, Houston Chronicle (Houston) 22 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.houstonchronicle.com/opinion/outlook/article/The-border-space-for-security-prosperity-6848126.php.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> The border: space for security, prosperity, Houston Chronicle (Houston) 22 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.houstonchronicle.com/opinion/outlook/article/The-border-space-for-security-prosperity-6848126.php.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> Mexico Pushes Forward with Deepwater Round, Hart Energy (Houston) 22 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.epmag.com/mexico-pushes-forward-deepwater-round-839611#p=1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> Mexico Pushes Forward with Deepwater Round, Hart Energy (Houston) 22 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.epmag.com/mexico-pushes-forward-deepwater-round-839611#p=1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> Mexico sticks to plan in new cheap oil world, Yahoo Finance (San Francisco) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://finance.yahoo.com/news/mexico-sticks-plan-cheap-oil-182128483.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> Mexico sticks to plan in new cheap oil world, Yahoo Finance (San Francisco) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://finance.yahoo.com/news/mexico-sticks-plan-cheap-oil-182128483.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> Approving an action plan for the Vostochny Petrochemical Complex strategic investment project (Russia) 22 December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://government.ru/en/docs/21196/.

and deploying facilities, building infrastructure facilities, including under government and federal targeted programmes, and ensuring the resource base."<sup>113</sup>

On 22 January 2016, the Russian government submitted to the State Duma a "Draft law on ratifying the protocol to the agreement between the Russian and Chinese governments on cooperation on the Yamal LNG project."<sup>114</sup> The project was signed in Beijing on 17 December 2015 and allows the Chinese government to purchase additional shares of Yamal LNG, a proposed natural gas plant to be built in Russia.<sup>115</sup> The agreement also "reaffirmed Russia's commitment to purchase Yamal LNG bonds with the money from the National Wealth Fund."<sup>116</sup>

Russia has increased investments in fossil fuel subsidies and has shown no evidence of providing support to the poor.

Thus, Russia has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Jennifer Kou

#### Saudi Arabia: 0

Saudi Arabia has partially complied with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

On 28 December 2015, the King of Saudi Arabia announced the country's 2016 budget, which includes government plans to privatize "several sectors" and "amend the programs of oil, water and electricity subsidies through re-pricing them gradually over the coming five years."<sup>117</sup> Muhammad bin Salman, the kingdom's deputy crown prince has also stated that the Government of Saudi Arabia is thinking about listing shares in Saudi Aramco, the state-owned oil company that is the world's biggest oil producer.<sup>118</sup>

The Government of Saudi Arabia stated that they are cutting subsidies for energy, water, and electricity for the domestic population, which has resulted in an 8.3 per cent increase in price for these commodities.<sup>119</sup> The former United States ambassador to Saudi Arabia has warned that the cut to domestic subsidies will "hurt every single Saudi in their pocketbook."<sup>120</sup> The Saudi Arabia

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> Approving an action plan for the Vostochny Petrochemical Complex strategic investment project (Russia) 22 December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://government.ru/en/docs/21196/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> Draft law on ratifying the protocol to the agreement between the Russian and Chinese governments on cooperation on the Yamal LNG project submitted to the State Duma (Russia) 22 January 2016. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://government.ru/en/docs/21494/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> Draft law on ratifying the protocol to the agreement between the Russian and Chinese governments on cooperation on the Yamal LNG project submitted to the State Duma (Russia) 22 January 2016. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://government.ru/en/docs/21494/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> Draft law on ratifying the protocol to the agreement between the Russian and Chinese governments on cooperation on the Yamal LNG project submitted to the State Duma (Russia) 22 January 2016. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://government.ru/en/docs/21494/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> Saudi Arabia Plans Subsidy Cuts as King Reveals 2016 Budget, Bloomberg. 28 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2015-12-28/saudi-arabia-aims-to-cut-spending-to-840-billion-riyals-in-2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> Saudi Arabia is considering an IPO of Aramco, probably the world's most valuable company, The Economist (New York) 7 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.economist.com/news/middle-east-and-africa/21685529-biggest-oil-all-saudi-arabia-considering-ipo-aramco-probably.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> The Geopolitics of Cheap Oil: Economists said the market would save the planet. It didn't., Foreign Policy in Focus (Washington) 6 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://fpif.org/geopolitics-cheap-oil/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> Saudi Arabia faces 'economic bomb' and hikes gas prices 50%, CNNMoney (New York) 5 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://money.cnn.com/2016/01/05/news/economy/saudi-arabia-oil-budget-gas/.

Government has also increased the domestic price of gas by 50 per cent, from 16 cents to 24 cents a litre.<sup>121</sup>

From December 2015 to January 2016, inflation within the country has rose from 2.3 per cent to 4.3 per cent, leading to a 12.6 per cent increase in transportation prices and a 5.5 per cent increase in healthcare costs, which is disproportionately felt by the poor.<sup>122</sup> Jason Tuvey, Middle East economist at Capital Economics in London noted that "the surge in Saudi inflation was almost entirely due to the subsidy cuts that were announced alongside the budget."<sup>123</sup>

On 12 January 2016, the Government of Saudi Arabia stated that they plan to spend USD100 billion in renewable energy projects to meet the increasing energy demand within the country and to diversify the country's energy sector.<sup>124</sup> If these projects are implemented, Saudi Arabia holds the region's largest potential for both solar and wind energy use, which would reduce the country's dependence on fossil fuels.<sup>125</sup> However, this would not occur in the medium term.<sup>126</sup>

On 4 April 2016, Bloomberg reported that the Saudi government will "accelerate subsidy cuts and impose more levies as part of its plan to boost non-oil revenue by USD100 billion annually by 2020."<sup>127</sup>

Saudi Arabia has decreased oil subsidies but has not implemented policies to support the inflationary effects of subsidy cuts on the poor.

Thus, Saudi Arabia has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Bojana Radan

#### South Africa: -1

South Africa has failed to comply with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

On 23 November 2015, Eskom, the South African electricity public utility announced plans of a large expansion into the renewable energy sector with the goal that by 2030, the amount of energy for electricity would double from their current standing and that 42 per cent would be renewable energy.<sup>128</sup> However, this action will not take place in the medium term.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> Saudi Arabia faces 'economic bomb' and hikes gas prices 50%, CNNMoney (New York) 5 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://money.cnn.com/2016/01/05/news/economy/saudi-arabia-oil-budget-gas/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> Saudi Arabia inflation accelerates in January after subsidy cuts, The National (Washington) 23 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.thenational.ae/business/economy/saudi-arabia-inflation-accelerates-in-january-after-subsidy-cuts.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> Saudi Arabia inflation accelerates in January after subsidy cuts, The National (Washington, 23 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.thenational.ae/business/economy/saudi-arabia-inflation-accelerates-in-january-after-subsidy-cuts.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>124</sup> Saudi Arabia to spend \$100bn on renewable energy, TradeArabia (Bahrain) 12 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.tradearabia.com/news/OGN\_298494.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>125</sup> Saudi Arabia to spend \$100bn on renewable energy, TradeArabia (Bahrain) 12 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.tradearabia.com/news/OGN\_298494.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> Saudi Arabia to spend \$100bn on renewable energy, TradeArabia (Bahrain) 12 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.tradearabia.com/news/OGN\_298494.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>127</sup> Saudi Arabia plans international bond sale as early as September, Bloomberg 4 April 2016. Access Date: 18 April 2016. http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2016-04-04/saudi-arabia-plans-international-bond-sale-as-early-as-september

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> Nuclear and renewable: South Africa's ambitious new energy mix, The Japan Times (Paris) 23 November 2015. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2015/11/23/business/nuclear-and-renewablesouth-africas-ambitious-new-energy-mix/#.Vs1KHJwrLIU.

On 11 February 2016, in the State of the Nation address, South African President Jacob Zuma stated that the government would be continuing its use of coal for energy and would be selecting preferred bidders for the creation of new coal independent power plants.<sup>129</sup>

On 24 February 2016, the South African government released the 2016 National Budget and announced a fuel levy, which will increase fuel costs by ZAR0.30 per litre, disproportionately affecting the poor.<sup>130</sup> The 2016 National Budget also stated that oil refineries would be able to write off capital expenditure over three years, instead of five, as they upgrade to comply with new fuel specifications providing them an advantage in the market.<sup>131</sup>

During the week of 22 to 26 February 2016, hundreds of oil and gas industry players will converge in Durban, South Africa, at the first Annual Maritime Summit to discuss Durban's "ocean economy" and the expansion and creation of offshore drilling ports.<sup>132</sup> This Maritime Summit is the first significant step in the South African government's commitment to drill at least 30 deep-water oil and gas exploration wells within the next 10 years.<sup>133</sup>

On 30 March 2016, South Africa "issued 14 oil and gas exploration licenses for blocks off the coast."  $^{\rm 134}$ 

South Africa has not taken any actions to reduce fossil fuel subsidies nor support the poor.

Thus, South Africa has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Bojana Radan

#### Turkey: -1

Turkey has failed to comply with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

On 8 February 2016, Turkey's energy bill decreased by about USD17 billion compared to the previous year.<sup>135</sup> But, consumers faced significant hikes in many energy products and complementary transport services in January 2016.<sup>136</sup> Electricity prices were hiked by around 7 per cent, and natural

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>129</sup> Address by Prime Minister Jacob Zuma at the State of the Nation Address, Office of the President (Cape Town) 11 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/full-speech-state-of-thenation-address-2016-20160211.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>130</sup> Address by Minister of Finance Pravin Gordhan at 2016 Budget Speech, Cabinet Collegues and Deputy Ministers (Cape Town) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.pwc.co.za/en/assets/pdf/budget-speech-2016.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> Gordhan Targets South Africa's Wealthy to Boost Tax Revenue, Bloomberg Business (Washington) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2016-02-24/gordhan-targets-south-africa-swealthy-to-boost-tax-revenue.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>132</sup> City poised for future fuels boom, IOL (KwaZulu-Natal) 19 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.iol.co.za/dailynews/news/city-poised-for-future-fuels-boom-1986774.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>133</sup> City poised for future fuels boom, IOL (KwaZulu-Natal) 19 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.iol.co.za/dailynews/news/city-poised-for-future-fuels-boom-1986774.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>134</sup> South Africa's energy industry turns to gas, Oxford Business Group 30 March 2016. Access Date: 19 April 2016. http://www.oxfordbusinessgroup.com/news/south-africa%E2%80%99s-energy-industry-turns-gas

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>135</sup> Global energy plunge not producing lower prices in Turkey, Hurriyet Daily News 8 February 2016. Date of Access: 23 February 2016. http://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/global-energy-plunge-not-producing-lower-prices-inturkey.aspx?pageID=238&nID=94857&NewsCatID=348.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>136</sup> Global energy plunge not producing lower prices in Turkey, Hurriyet Daily News 8 February 2016. Date of Access: 23 February 2016. http://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/global-energy-plunge-not-producing-lower-prices-in-turkey.aspx?pageID=238&nID=94857&NewsCatID=348.

gas prices for residential areas were increased by 9 per cent.<sup>137</sup> The energy watchdog, EPDK, increased electricity prices by 6.7 per cent in industrial areas and 3.8 per cent in residential areas "because of necessary investments and the administrative costs of the electricity distribution companies."<sup>138</sup>

On 14 February 2016, the Turkish Economy Minister's budget plan for 2016 announced "a total of USD2.68 billion-worth of resources is planned to be allocated to Turkish Petroleum's oil and natural gas searches and production this year."<sup>139</sup>

In the same budget plan, it was announced that there will be "projects to develop new incentives and revise current incentives in electricity production plans, ultimately generation electricity through domestically mined coal."<sup>140</sup> The plan also announced that "search and mining efforts for the discovery of local coal fields will be expedited." The government will create a "new funding method"<sup>141</sup> that allows companies to benefit from large lignite coal fields.

Turkey has increased investment and subsidies to its coal, oil and natural gas industry. In addition, consumers faced an increase in energy prices that could affect the poor.

Thus, Turkey has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Yalda Mehran

#### United Kingdom: -1

The United Kingdom has failed to comply with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

On 30 November to 12 December 2015, at the UN Climate Change Conference, the UK government stated that they planned to phase-out unabated coal-fired power stations by the year 2025.<sup>142</sup> The UK further committed to this statement with their announcement of the closure of five coal-fired power plants in 2016.<sup>143</sup>

On 25 November 2015, the UK government announced that it was cutting a GBP1 billion grant for the development of carbon capture and storage (CCS) technology.<sup>144</sup> CCS is a process that attempts to reduce greenhouse gas emissions by capturing waste  $CO_2$  from larges source such as fossil fuel

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>137</sup> Global energy plunge not producing lower prices in Turkey, Hurriyet Daily News 8 February 2016. Date of Access: 23 February 2016. http://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/global-energy-plunge-not-producing-lower-prices-in-turkey.aspx?pageID=238&nID=94857&NewsCatID=348.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>138</sup> Global energy plunge not producing lower prices in Turkey, Hurriyet Daily News 8 February 2016. Date of Access: 23 February 2016. http://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/global-energy-plunge-not-producing-lower-prices-inturkey.aspx?pageID=238&nID=94857&NewsCatID=348.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>139</sup> \$2 billion worth of drilling from Turkish Petroleum, Daily Sabah (Istanbul) 14 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.dailysabah.com/energy/2016/02/15/2-billion-worth-of-drilling-from-turkish-petroleum

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>140</sup> Wider use of Turkish coal to decrease gas imports by \$7.2 billion, Daily Sabah (Istanbul) 23 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.dailysabah.com/energy/2016/02/24/wider-use-of-turkish-coal-to-decrease-gas-imports-by-72-billion

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>141</sup> Wider use of Turkish coal to decrease gas imports by \$7.2 billion, Daily Sabah (Istanbul) 23 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.dailysabah.com/energy/2016/02/24/wider-use-of-turkish-coal-to-decrease-gas-imports-by-72-billion

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>142</sup> Countdown to 2025: Tracking the UK coal phase out, Carbon Brief (London) 10 February 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.carbonbrief.org/countdown-to-2025-tracking-the-uk-coal-phase-out.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>143</sup> Countdown to 2025: Tracking the UK coal phase out, Carbon Brief (London) 10 February 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.carbonbrief.org/countdown-to-2025-tracking-the-uk-coal-phase-out.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>144</sup> UK government carbon capture £1bn grant dropped, BBC News (London) 25 November 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.bbc.com/news/uk-scotland-scotland-business-34357804.

power plants and trapping it in underground storage facilities.<sup>145</sup> Amber Rudd, the UK secretary of state for energy and climate change further admitted that the UK government could lose up to GBP300 million in funding from the EU to subsidize cleaner energy due to this CCS funding cut.<sup>146</sup>

On 25 November 2015, UK Chancellor George Osborne cut future funding for an energy scheme called the Energy Company Obligation (ECO), which helps reduce carbon emissions and cut family energy bills by the installation of efficient energy measures in the homes of poor and vulnerable consumers.<sup>147</sup> The cost of ECO has been forecasted to rise to GBP55 a year by 2020 but the cheaper version which the Chancellor has implemented will only cover roughly only half of the houses that it covered before the cuts.<sup>148</sup>

On 30 November 2015, the United Kingdom, along with 40 other countries endorsed The Fossil Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué presented to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC).<sup>149</sup> The Communiqué "calls on the international community to increase efforts to phase-out subsidies for fossil fuel production and use."<sup>150</sup>

On 11 December 2015, the UK government awarded a GBP650 million subsidy to fossil fuel generators including GBP155 million for new diesel plants.<sup>151</sup> The government awarded this subsidy "to ensure sufficient back-up power is available when intermittent energy sources — such as solar or wine — do not produce enough power to meet demand."<sup>152</sup>

On 17 December 2015, Secretary of State for Energy and Climate Change Amber Rudd announced a 65 per cent cut to renewable energy subsidies, as well as a cap for the total subsidy paid out in the renewable energy sector.<sup>153</sup> These renewable subsidies were expected to halve electricity bills for about 135,000 residents with an anticipated annual saving of GBP200 per household.<sup>154</sup>

On 28 January 2016, Prime Minister David Cameron announced that the UK government would invest GBP250 million in the UK City Deal, subsidizing costs for the oil and gas industry in North

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>145</sup> UK government carbon capture £1bn grant dropped, BBC News (London) 25 November 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.bbc.com/news/uk-scotland-scotland-business-34357804.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>146</sup> Carbon capture delay 'could add £20bm' to UK climate costs, Carbon Brief (London) 20 January 2016. Access Date:
 22 February 2016. http://www.carbonbrief.org/carbon-capture-delay-could-add-20bn-to-uk-climate-costs.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>147</sup> Families promised £30 energy bill savings as Chancellor slashes insulation scheme, The Telegraph (London) 25
 November. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/earth/energy/12017361/autumn-statement-2015-30-energy-bill-saving-as-Chancellor-cuts-insulation.html
 <sup>148</sup> Families promised £30 energy bill savings as Chancellor slashes insulation scheme, The Telegraph (London) 25

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>148</sup> Families promised £30 energy bill savings as Chancellor slashes insulation scheme, The Telegraph (London) 25 November. Access Date: 23 February 2016.http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/earth/energy/12017361/autumnstatement-2015-30-energy-bill-saving-as-Chancellor-cuts-insulation.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> Fossil-Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué Presented to UNFCCC (New Zealand) 30 November 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://climate-l.iisd.org/news/fossil-fuel-subsidy-reform-communique-presented-to-unfccc/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>150</sup> Fossil-Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué Presented to UNFCCC (New Zealand) 30 November 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://climate-l.iisd.org/news/fossil-fuel-subsidy-reform-communique-presented-to-unfccc/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>151</sup> Government award £650 million to fossil fuel subsidies to keep the lights on, busineesGreen (London) 11 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.businessgreen.com/bg/analysis/2438907/government-awardsgbp650m-in-fossil-fuel-subsidies-to-keep-the-lights-on

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>152</sup> Government award £650 million to fossil fuel subsidies to keep the lights on, busineesGreen (London) 11 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.businessgreen.com/bg/analysis/2438907/government-awardsgbp650m-in-fossil-fuel-subsidies-to-keep-the-lights-on

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>153</sup> UK cuts to renewable energy makes a mockery of its pledge at Paris climate talks, The Guardian (London) 17 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.theguardian.com/environment/damian-carringtonblog/2015/dec/17/uk-cuts-renewable-energy-make-a-mockery-of-its-pledge-paris-climate-talks.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>154</sup> Thousands of social tenants will lose out if solar subsidies cuts go ahead, The Guardian (London) 18 November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.theguardian.com/environment/2015/nov/18/thousands-social-tenantslose-out-solar-subsidies-cuts-go-ahead.

eastern Scotland.<sup>155</sup> This investment would be split among both the UK and Scottish governments, and would be used to help diversify the industry, further exploit any remaining North Sea reservoirs, and support oil and gas expansion into the Aberdeen harbour.<sup>156</sup>

On 28 January 2016, Secretary of State for Energy and Climate Change Amber Rudd announced a GBP20 million fund to unlock exploration activity on the UK Continental Shelf to discover new oil and gas resources and accelerate the drilling of new wells.<sup>157</sup>Amber Rudd further reported that "the UK government is backing our oil and gas industry, the hardworking people it employs and the families it supports."<sup>158</sup>

Although the UK has stated that they plan to phase-out coal-fired plants and has reaffirmed their commitment in Paris, they have expanded the provision of fossil fuel subsidies and made funding cuts to an energy program that supports the poor.

Thus, the United Kingdom has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Bojana Radan

#### United States: +1

The United States has fully complied with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

On 30 November 2015, the United States, along with 40 other countries endorsed the Fossil Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué presented to the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC).<sup>159</sup> The Communiqué "calls on the international community to increase efforts to phase-out subsidies for fossil fuel production and use."<sup>160</sup>

On 19 February 2016, the US government issued cuts in its 2017 Department of Energy Budget for coal, oil, and gas tax deductions.<sup>161</sup> "Domestic Manufacturing Deduction for Hard Mineral Fossil Fuels" has been cut by USD11 million.<sup>162</sup> The Budget also issued a "repeal [of] Domestic Manufacturing Tax Deduction for Oil and Natural Gas Companies" by USD470 million.<sup>163</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>155</sup> UK government confirms £250 million City Deal for Aberdeen, Department of Energy & Climate Change (London) 28 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/pm-announces-further-boostfor-uk-oil-and-gas-industry.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>156</sup> PM announces further boost for oil and gas industry, Department of Energy & Climate Change (London) 28 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/pm-announces-further-boost-for-uk-oil-and-gas-industry.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>157</sup> UK government shows support for local oil and gas industry, The Marine Professional (London), 01 February 2016. Access date: 22 February 2016. http://www.imarest.org/themarineprofessional/item/2137-uk-government-shows-support-for-local-oil-and-gas-industry.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>158</sup> PM announces further boost for oil and gas industry, Department of Energy & Climate Change (London) 28 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/pm-announces-further-boost-for-uk-oil-and-gas-industry.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>159</sup> Fossil-Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué Presented to UNFCCC (New Zealand) 30 November 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://climate-l.iisd.org/news/fossil-fuel-subsidy-reform-communique-presented-to-unfccc/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>160</sup> Fossil-Fuel Subsidy Reform Communiqué Presented to UNFCCC (New Zealand) 30 November 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://climate-l.iisd.org/news/fossil-fuel-subsidy-reform-communique-presented-to-unfccc/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>161</sup> Fiscal year 2017- Office of Management and Budget, Executive Office of the President 9 February 2016. Access Date: 19 February 2016. https://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/files/omb/budget/fy2017/assets/budget.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>162</sup> Fiscal year 2017- Office of Management and Budget, Executive Office of the President 9 February 2016. Access Date: 19 February 2016. https://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/files/omb/budget/fy2017/assets/budget.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>163</sup> Obama Proposes \$10 a barrel oil tax, BBC News (Washington) 9 January 2016. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://www.bbc.com/news/business-35535385.

The Budget also proposes a USD10.25 per barrel tax on oil.<sup>164</sup> The burden is to be paid by oil companies to "boost spending on transportation infrastructure, including mass transit and high-speed rail, and autonomous vehicles."<sup>165</sup> This is in accordance with President Obama's 21<sup>st</sup> Century Clean Transportation Initiative, which will stimulate the job market. <sup>166</sup> Alongside transportation investments, the Budget notes "15 per cent of revenues would be allocated to provide assistance to families with burdensome energy costs, including a focus on supporting households in the Northeast as they transition from fuel oil for heating to cleaner forms of energy."<sup>167</sup>

The US has committed itself to phasing out inefficient fuel subsidies through its taxation on oil and tax benefit cuts for other fossil fuels. It is also providing support to the poor during the transition period to cleaner energy.

Thus, the United States has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Nidhi Varma

#### European Union: -1

The European Union has failed to comply with its commitment to rationalise and phase-out inefficient fossil fuel subsidies, over the medium term, while recognizing the need to support the poor.

In November 2015, the EU was reported to provide EUR4.2 billion to hydrocarbons, but only EUR1.5 billion to alternative sources of energy.<sup>168</sup> Similarly, the European Investment Bank has spent EUR3.2 billion on 17 fossil fuel projects between 2007 and 2014, and the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development spent EUR 409 million more on fossil fuels than it did on renewable sources of energy.<sup>169</sup> The EU provided over EUR 4.2 billion for hydrocarbons, in contrast to EUR1.5 billion for alternative sources of energy.<sup>170</sup> No evidence was found that suggests this development funding been phased-out during the compliance period.

On 18 November 2015, the EU's energy commission invested in renewable and low carbon technology, which now cater to 78 million Europeans.<sup>171</sup> The commission plans to introduce a new Renewable Energy Directive and bioenergy sustainability policy in 2016.<sup>172</sup> This will outline the EU's

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>164</sup> Fiscal year 2017- Office of Management and Budget, Executive Office of the President 9 February 2016. Access
 Date: 19 February 2016. https://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/files/omb/budget/fy2017/assets/budget.pdf.
 <sup>165</sup> Fiscal year 2017- Office of Management and Budget, Executive Office of the President 9 February 2016. Access

Date: 19 February 2016. https://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/files/omb/budget/fy2017/assets/budget.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>166</sup> Fiscal year 2017- Office of Management and Budget, Executive Office of the President 9 February 2016. Access Date: 19 February 2016. https://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/files/omb/budget/fy2017/assets/budget.pdf.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>167</sup> Fiscal year 2017- Office of Management and Budget, Executive Office of the President 9 February 2016. Access
 Date: 19 February 2016. https://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/files/omb/budget/fy2017/assets/budget.pdf.
 <sup>168</sup> European public money for the energy sector in countries of the European Neighbourhood Policy, CEE Bankwatch
 Network November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://bankwatch.org/sites/default/files/ENP-energy-execsummary.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>169</sup> European public money for the energy sector in countries of the European Neighbourhood Policy, CEE Bankwatch Network November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://bankwatch.org/sites/default/files/ENP-energy-exec-summary.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>170</sup> European public money for the energy sector in countries of the European Neighbourhood Policy, CEE Bankwatch Network November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://bankwatch.org/sites/default/files/ENP-energy-exec-summary.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>171</sup> Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, The Council, the European Economic and Social Committee, the Committee of the Regions and the European Investment Bank, European Commission 18 November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. https://ec.europa.eu/transparency/regdoc/rep/1/2015/EN/1-2015-572-EN-F1-1.PDF.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>172</sup> Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, The Council, the European Economic and Social Committee, the Committee of the Regions and the European Investment Bank, European Commission 18 November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. https://ec.europa.eu/transparency/regdoc/rep/1/2015/EN/1-2015-572-EN-F1-1.PDF.

plan for obtaining 27 per cent of energy from renewable sources by 2030, as well as push for a decrease in fossil fuel subsidies.<sup>173</sup> The EU Energy commission plans to publish prices and costs of energy, including taxes, levies and subsidies in 2016.<sup>174</sup>

On 19 January 2016, Member States agreed on a Commission proposal to invest EUR217 million in key trans-European energy infrastructure projects. In total, 15 projects were selected with the aim to increase energy security and help end the isolation of Member States from EU-wide energy networks. They will also contribute to the completion of a European energy market and the integration of renewables into the electricity grid.<sup>175</sup> Of the 15 proposals selected for funding nine are in the gas sector (financial aid worth EUR207 million) and six in electricity sector (EUR10 million) as well as 13 related to studies, such as environmental impact assessments (EUR29 million), and two to construction works (EUR188 million).<sup>176</sup> While some of this funding is allocated to energy efficient projects, some is allocated to the expansion of fossil fuel projects, thus representing noncompliance.

On 16 February 2016, the European Commission and Energy Union adopted the "Sustainable Energy Security Package," making Liquefied Natural Gas the main backup in case of a gas supply crisis.<sup>177</sup> It was also announced that the transition to renewable energy sources could only be made gradually, and hence the EU would adopt a "decarbonisation plan" which entails using gas "intelligently" during the transition period until 2030.<sup>178</sup>

The EU has made plans to introduce a new sustainability police pushing for a decrease in fossil fuel subsidies, but is currently subsidising and investing in liquefied natural gas and gas transmission. Additionally, it has not provided any targeted support for the poor.

Thus, the European Union has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Novera Khan

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>173</sup> Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, The Council, the European Economic and Social Committee, the Committee of the Regions and the European Investment Bank, European Commission 18 November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. https://ec.europa.eu/transparency/regdoc/rep/1/2015/EN/1-2015-572-EN-F1-1.PDF.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>174</sup> Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, The Council, the European Economic and Social Committee, the Committee of the Regions and the European Investment Bank, European Commission 18 November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. https://ec.europa.eu/transparency/regdoc/rep/1/2015/EN/1-2015-572-EN-F1-1.PDF.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>175</sup> Energy: EU invests €217 million in energy infrastructure, European Commission Press Release Database (Brussels) 19 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-16-94\_en.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>176</sup> Energy: EU invests €217 million in energy infrastructure, European Commission Press Release Database (Brussels) 19 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-16-94\_en.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>177</sup> Speech by Commissioner Miguel Arias Cañete at the Security of Supply Package Press Conference, European

Commission Press Release Database (Brussels) 16 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release SPEECH-16-326 en.htm?locale=en.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>178</sup> Speech by Commissioner Miguel Arias Cañete at the Security of Supply Package Press Conference, European Commission Press Release Database (Brussels) 16 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_SPEECH-16-326\_en.htm?locale=en.

# 2. Refugees

"We commit to continue further strengthening our support for all efforts to provide protection [for the unprecedented numbers of refugees and internally displaced persons in various parts of the world]"

G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Argentina		0	
Australia		0	
Brazil		0	
Canada			+1
China		0	
France			+1
Germany			+1
India	-1		
Indonesia	-1		
Italy		0	
Japan		0	
Korea		0	
Mexico		0	
Russia	-1		
Saudi Arabia		0	
South Africa	-1		
Turkey			+1
United Kingdom			+1
United States			+1
European Union		0	
Average		+0.10	

#### Assessment

## Background

The 2015 G20 Summit marked the first time a commitment was made in response to the global refugee crisis. As of June 2015, the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) estimated there were nearly 60 million people forcibly displaced worldwide.<sup>179</sup> The recent upsurge in refugee numbers has resulted from the escalating conflicts and insecurity in conflict zones around the world, including but not limited to Syria, Iraq, Afghanistan, Eritrea, Yemen, South Sudan, Burundi, and Libya.

Globally, 86 per cent of refugees are hosted in developing countries. Of the four million refugees who have fled Syria alone, 95 per cent are in five main host countries: Turkey, Lebanon, Jordan, Iraq and Egypt. To date, G20 member states have committed to resettling approximately 140,000 refugees from Syria. In 2015, G20 countries offered resettlement places to a tenth of the refugees in need.<sup>180</sup> The global refugee crisis affects all G20 member states in addition to the broader international system. However, some G20 member states have been particularly affected, such as Turkey, Italy and Germany.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>179</sup> Mid-Year Trends 2015, United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (New York) 2015. Access Date: 10 February 2016. http://www.unhcr.org/56701b969.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>180</sup> G20 Summit: Rich countries must pull a U-turn on shameful refugee response, Amnesty International 13 November 2015. Access Date: 10 February 2016. https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2015/11/g20-must-pull-uturn-on-refugee-response/.

Through the years, states have affirmed their commitment to protecting refugees by acceding to the 1951 United Nations Convention relating to the Status of Refugees, the cornerstone document of refugee protection. The convention, which was developed and drafted by states, enumerates the rights and responsibilities of refugees and the obligations of States that are parties to it.<sup>181</sup> Refugees are defined according to the United Nations 1951 Refugee Convention as someone who, "owing to a well-founded fear of being persecuted for reasons of race, religion, nationality, membership of a particular social group or political opinion, is outside the country of his nationality, or is unable to, or owing to such fear, is unwilling to avail himself to the protection of that country."<sup>182</sup>

Protecting refugees is primarily the responsibility of states.<sup>183</sup> A refugee has the right to safe asylum. However, international protection comprises more than physical safety. For example, refugees should receive at least the same rights and basic help as any other foreigner who is a legal resident, including certain fundamental entitlements of every individual. Throughout its 50-year history, the UNHCR has worked closely with governments as partners in refugee protection. In every region of the world, governments have generously granted asylum to refugees and allowed them to remain until conditions were conducive for the refugees to return to their homes in safety and with dignity. Governments have allowed UNHCR to operate on their territories and have provided financial assistance to refugees, both through their own domestic refugee programs and by funding UNHCR's protection and assistance operation.<sup>184</sup>

G20 members have recognized that the scale of the ongoing refugee crisis is a global humanitarian concern with the ability to influence economic growth and political stability. The G20 called upon all states to contribute to responding to this crisis and share the burdens associated with it, including through: (1) refugee resettlement; (2) other forms of humanitarian admission; (3) humanitarian aid; (4) efforts to ensure that refugees can access services, education and livelihood opportunities.<sup>185</sup> The G20 also acknowledges that a coordinated and comprehensive response is required to address the complex challenges posed by the global refugee crisis.

#### **Commitment Features**

The G20 commitment is "to continue further strengthening support for all efforts to provide protection [for the unprecedented numbers of refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs) in various parts of the world]." "Protection" is understood as the physical protection of refugees and IDPs, as well as the legal protection of their basic human rights. This includes the right not to be returned involuntarily to a country where they face persecution, to repatriate to their homeland when conditions permit, and/or to integrate into states of asylum or resettle in third countries. This commitment relates to any and all efforts, both domestic and international in scope, to provide protection. This commitment applies to refugees from any nationality seeking protection.

"Support for all efforts" is understood as direct or indirect support of any action or statement that provides or facilitates protection. Thus, direct support is understood as an explicit government action

http://www.refworld.org/docid/3cd6a8444.html.

http://www.refworld.org/docid/3cd6a8444.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>181</sup> Refugee Protection: A Guide to International Refugee Law, UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR); Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU) 1 December 2001. Access Date: 10 February 2016.

http://www.refworld.org/docid/3cd6a8444.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>182</sup> Convention and Protocol Relating to the Status of Refugees, United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (Geneva) December 2010. Access Date: 10 February 2016. http://www.unhcr.org/3b66c2aa10.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>183</sup> Refugee Protection: A Guide to International Refugee Law, UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR); Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU) 1 December 2001. Access Date: 10 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>184</sup> Refugee Protection: A Guide to International Refugee Law, UN High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR); Inter-Parliamentary Union (IPU) 1 December 2001. Access Date: 10 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>185</sup> G20 Leaders' Communique, G20 Research Group 16 November 2015. Access Date: 10 February 2016. http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2015/151116-communique.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>186</sup> As defined by the 1951 Refugee Convention.

to better the protection of refugees without using the medium of a third party. Examples of member countries directly providing protection to refugees includes: accepting refugees through resettlement or other forms of humanitarian admission, and providing domestic support within their country to existing refugees through the provision of housing, food, medical care and/or financial aid, while taking into account the specific needs of women, children, the elderly and the disabled.

"Indirect support" is understood as a participatory government action for the betterment of refugee protection in which the government may not be the primary protector in the action. The medium of a third party will likely be present. Examples of a third party include a non-governmental organization, intergovernmental organization, private sector corporation, the general public, or another country and/or government. Thus, examples of member countries indirectly providing protection to refugees include collaborating with intergovernmental or non-governmental organizations, encouraging private sector humanitarianism, and the provision of humanitarian aid.

"To continue strengthening" refers to the fact that the commitment does not necessitate the implementation or creation of a new effort, but rather the strengthening an existing one. This includes expanding, increasing, enhancing the efficiency of, and prolonging existing actions. Examples of the continuation of strengthening include increasing existing aid, increasing number of refugees admitted, increasing domestic support, or making existing collaborations larger or more efficient. Thus, should a member country not have previously provided direct or indirect support, it is not required to do so for this particular commitment to receive full compliance.

To achieve full compliance, member countries must continue to strengthen their support for all existing efforts to provide protection for refugees and IDPs around the world by making efforts in the majority of the aforementioned areas. The implementation of new efforts will be noted, but is not required for compliance.

## Scoring Guidelines

-1	Country does not further strengthen support for all direct AND all indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and IDPs
0	Country further strengthens support for all direct OR all indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and IDPs
+1	Country further strengthens support for all direct AND all indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and IDPs

Lead Analyst: Sophie Barnett

## Argentina: 0

Argentina has partially complied with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

On 19 January 2016, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs released a formal statement reaffirming its belief that political dialogue can achieve peace and prevent further violence with full respect for international law, including international refugee law.<sup>187</sup>

On 9 February 2016, Foreign Minister Susana Malcorra delivered three letters from President Mauricio Macri to United Nations Secretary General Ban Ki-moon.<sup>188</sup> In them, Argentina offered to provide humanitarian aid through White Helmets, to help Syrian refugees.<sup>189</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>187</sup> El Gobierno argentino repudia asesinatos en Siria, Ministerio de Relaciones Exteriores y Culto (Buenos Aires) 19 January 2016. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://www.mrecic.gov.ar/el-gobierno-argentino-repudia-asesinatos-ensiria.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>188</sup> Malcorra se reunió con Ban Ki-moon, Ministerio de Relaciones Exteriores y Culto (Buenos Aires) 9 February 2016. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://www.mrecic.gov.ar/malcorra-se-reunio-con-ban-ki-moon.

On 19 February 2016, Foreign Minister Malcorra hosted the Czech Deputy Foreign Minister Marin Tlapa for a meeting in which they discussed the Syrian refugee crisis.<sup>190</sup>

Argentina has made indirect efforts to further strengthen its support for refugee and IDP protection. However, it has not yet further strengthened its direct efforts.

Thus, Argentina has received a score of 0.

Analysts: Mariam Jammal and Emilia Lochowska

#### Australia: 0

Australia has partially complied with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

On 3 December 2015, the Minister of Foreign Affairs the Honourable Julie Bishop further reaffirmed Australia's commitment to helping address the Syrian refugee crisis in her 2015 Valedictory Speech.<sup>191</sup>

On 26 January 2016, the Government of Australia reaffirmed its commitment to settlement services for refugees by announcing the members of the new Settlement Services Advisory Council, which focuses on improving migrant and refugee integration into Australian society.<sup>192</sup> The council also provides them with job training.<sup>193</sup>

On 4 February 2016, the Minister of Foreign Affairs attended the Syria Donors Conference, where she announced that Australia will be providing an additional AUD25 million in humanitarian assistance in Syria, Iraq, and surrounding countries hosting large numbers of refugees.<sup>194</sup> Of this aid, AUD20 million will go to partners in Syria, including United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), UNICEF, World Food Programme, and several Australian nongovernmental organizations.<sup>195</sup>

At the Syria Donors Conference, the Minister of Foreign Affairs also announced the deployment of 10 Australian Civilian Corps specialists to Jordan and Lebanon to advise the United Nations and various nongovernmental organizations in delivering education, protection, food, sanitation, and

<sup>191</sup> Address by Minister for Foreign Affairs The Hon Julie Bishop MP at Parliament House, Minister for Foreign Affairs (Canberra) 3 December 2015. Access Date: 10 March 2016.

http://foreignminister.gov.au/speeches/Pages/2015/jb\_sp\_151203a.aspx?w=tb1CaGpkPX%2FIS0K%2Bg9ZKEg%3D%3D

http://christianporter.dss.gov.au/media-releases/new-term-for-government-s-settlement-advisory-council. <sup>193</sup> New term for Government's settlement advisory council, The Hon Christian Porter MP Minister for Social Services, Minister for Social Services (Canberra) 26 January 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016.

http://christianporter.dss.gov.au/media-releases/new-term-for-government-s-settlement-advisory-council. <sup>194</sup> Increased Humanitarian Support for Syria and Iraq, Minister for Foreign Affairs The Hon Julie Bishop MP (Canberra)

http://foreignminister.gov.au/releases/Pages/2016/jb\_mr\_160204.aspx?w=tb1CaGpkPX%2FlS0K%2Bg9ZKEg%3D%3D.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>189</sup> Malcorra se reunió con Ban Ki-moon, Ministerio de Relaciones Exteriores y Culto (Buenos Aires) 9 February 2016. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://www.mrecic.gov.ar/malcorra-se-reunio-con-ban-ki-moon.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>190</sup> Reunión de consultas politicas con la República Checa, Ministerio de Relaciones Exteriores y Culto (Buenos Aires) 19 February 19 2016. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://www.mrecic.gov.ar/reunion-de-consultas-politicas-con-larepublica-checa.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>192</sup> New term for Government's settlement advisory council, The Hon Christian Porter MP Minister for Social Services, Minister for Social Services (Canberra) 26 January 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016.

Increased Humanitarian Support for Syria and Iraq, Minister for Foreign Affairs The Hon Julie Bishop MP (Canberra) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016.

http://foreignminister.gov.au/releases/Pages/2016/jb\_mr\_160204.aspx?w=tb1CaGpkPX%2FlS0K%2Bg9ZKEg%3D%3D. <sup>195</sup> Increased Humanitarian Support for Syria and Iraq, Minister for Foreign Affairs The Hon Julie Bishop MP (Canberra) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016.

logistics.<sup>196</sup> She also indicated that Australia is in the midst of developing a multi-year assistance package to help strengthen Jordan and Lebanon's capacity to continue hosting large numbers of refugees.<sup>197</sup>

Australia has taken measures to further strengthen its indirect efforts to provide refugee and IDP protection. However, it has not yet further strengthened its direct efforts.

Thus, Australia has received a score of 0.

Analysts: Zineb Drissi

#### Brazil: 0

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

On 4 February 2016, Minister of External Relations Mauro Viera attended the Supporting Syria and the Region conference held in London. At the conference, Brazil expressed its continued willingness to donate food to Syria and surrounding countries.<sup>198</sup> Minister Viera pledged a donation of USD1.3 million to the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR) for 2016.<sup>199</sup> The aid will be used to help refugees affected by the Syrian crisis.<sup>200</sup>

During the compliance period, the Government of Brazil continued to take actions to further strengthen its support for indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and IDPs around the world through humanitarian aid. However, it has not yet further strengthened its direct efforts.

Thus, Brazil has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Jinnan Li

## Canada: +1

Canada has fully complied with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

On 24 November 2015, the Government of Canada announced its five-phase plan to resettle 25,000 Syrian refugees by the end of February 2016.<sup>201</sup> The plan includes the identification of Syrian

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>196</sup> Increased Humanitarian Support for Syria and Iraq, Minister for Foreign Affairs The Hon Julie Bishop MP (Canberra) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March

<sup>2016.</sup>http://foreignminister.gov.au/releases/Pages/2016/jb\_mr\_160204.aspx?w=tb1CaGpkPX%2FlS0K%2Bg9ZKEg%3D %3D.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>197</sup> Increased Humanitarian Support for Syria and Iraq, Minister for Foreign Affairs The Hon Julie Bishop MP (Canberra) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016.

http://foreignminister.gov.au/releases/Pages/2016/jb\_mr\_160204.aspx?w=tb1CaGpkPX%2FlS0K%2Bg9ZKEg%3D%3D. <sup>198</sup> Press Release: Supporting Syria and the Region Conference – London, February 4, 2016, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Itamaraty Palace) 3 February 2016. Access Date: 21 February 2016.

http://www.itamaraty.gov.br/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=13092:supporting-syria-and-the-region-conference-london-february-4-2016&catid=578&Itemid=718&lang=en.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>199</sup> Press Release: Co-host's statement annex: fundraising, Supporting Syria & the Region conference (London) 8 February 2016. Access Date: 18 February 2016. https://www.supportingsyria2016.com/news/co-hosts-statemtentannex-fundraising/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>200</sup> Press Release: Co-host's statement annex: fundraising, Supporting Syria & the Region conference (London) 8 February 2016. Access Date: 18 February 2016. https://www.supportingsyria2016.com/news/co-hosts-statemtentannex-fundraising/.

annex-fundraising/. <sup>201</sup> #WelcomeRefugees to Canada, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 24 November 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://news.gc.ca/web/article-en.do?nid=1021909&\_ga=1.236256258.287485455.1456418627.

refugees coming to Canada and subsequent selection and processing, transportation to Canada, welcoming upon arrival, and settlement and community integration.<sup>202</sup>

On 29 November 2015, the Government of Canada released a map showing the 36 communities that have existing Resettlement Assistance Program (RAP) service provider organizations funded by the Department of Immigration, Refugees and Citizenship Canada (IRCC).<sup>203</sup> Through these IRCC-funded RAPs, the Government provides settlement and resettlement services for refugees.<sup>204</sup> The Canadian government assisted 25,000 Syrian refugees coming to Canada by the end of February 2016. They will be given permanent accommodation in the communities or surrounding area and have access to settlement service providers within the communities.<sup>205</sup>

On 10 December 2015, 163 privately sponsored Syrian refugees arrived by plane in Toronto.<sup>206</sup> Two days later, on 12 December 2015, another 161 privately sponsored Syrian refugees arrived by plane in Montreal.<sup>207</sup> On 15 December 2015, 214 privately sponsored, government-assisted, and blended visa office-referred (BVOR) Syrian refugees arrived by plane in Toronto.<sup>208</sup>

On 13 January 2016, the Government of Canada welcomed over 10,000 refugees.<sup>209</sup> In collaboration with the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), International Migration Organization (IOM), and host countries Jordan, Lebanon, and Turkey, it continues to assist Syrians who have fled their homes.<sup>210</sup>

On 26 January 2016, the Government of Canada introduced the Syrian Family Links initiative, which will help connect Syrian refugees abroad with private Canadian sponsors through the assistance of the refugees' family residing in Canada.<sup>211</sup> Through this programme, participating families in Canada will assist family members who are refugees in Lebanon, Jordan, or Turkey.<sup>212</sup>

On 5 February 2016, the Government of Canada invited municipalities interested in welcoming and integrating government-assisted refugees to submit a Community Partnership Settlement Plan.<sup>213</sup> These municipalities are not part of the network of cities and towns that traditionally welcome

http://news.gc.ca/web/article-en.do?nid=1031869& ga=1.243530502.287485455.1456418627.

# G20 Research Group: 2015 G20 Antalya Summit Interim Compliance Report,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>202</sup> #WelcomeRefugees to Canada, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 24 November 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://news.gc.ca/web/article-en.do?nid=1021909&\_ga=1.236256258.287485455.1456418627.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>203</sup> Map of destination communities and service provider organizations (Ottawa) 29 November 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/refugees/welcome/map.asp.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>204</sup> Map of destination communities and service provider organizations (Ottawa) 29 November 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/refugees/welcome/map.asp.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>205</sup> Map of destination communities and service provider organizations (Ottawa) 29 November 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/refugees/welcome/map.asp.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>206</sup> #WelcomeRefugees: Milestones and key figures, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 25 February 2016. Access Date:
 27 February 2016. http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/refugees/welcome/milestones.asp.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>207</sup> #WelcomeRefugees: Milestones and key figures, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 25 February 2016. Access Date:
 27 February 2016. http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/refugees/welcome/milestones.asp.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>208</sup> #WelcomeRefugees: Milestones and key figures, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 25 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.cic.gc.ca/english/refugees/welcome/milestones.asp.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>209</sup> Canada has welcomed its first 10,000 Syrian refugees (Ottawa) 13 January 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://news.gc.ca/web/article-en.do?nid=1027539&ga=1.210124694.287485455.1456418627)per cent20which.
 <sup>210</sup> Canada has welcomed its first 10,000 Syrian refugees (Ottawa) 13 January 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://news.gc.ca/web/article-en.do?nid=1027539&ga=1.210124694.287485455.1456418627)per cent20which.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>211</sup> Canada announces the Syrian Family Links initiative, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 26 January 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://news.gc.ca/web/article-en.do?nid=1029729& ga=1.265311244.287485455.1456418627.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>212</sup> Canada announces the Syrian Family Links initiative, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 26 January 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://news.gc.ca/web/article-en.do?nid=1029729& ga=1.265311244.287485455.1456418627.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>213</sup> Communities across Canada invited to apply to show how they can welcome and support Government-Assisted Refugees, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 5 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016.

government assisted refugees<sup>214</sup> and will work with employment, housing, educational, and other partners within their communities to create their Community Partnership Settlement Plan to acquire the necessary services to assist refugees in settlement and integration.<sup>215</sup>

On 27 February 2016, Minister of Immigration, Refugees, and Citizenship Spokesperson Camielle Edwards reported that the Government of Canada had met its goal of resettling 25,000 refugees.<sup>216</sup> The Government of Canada will continue to resettle Syrian refugees throughout 2016 with the Minister of Immigration, Refugees, and Citizenship John McCallum. It previously stated its hope to accept a total of 35,000 to 50,000 refugees by the end of the year.<sup>217</sup>

During the compliance period, Canada has taken significant action to strengthen all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and IDPs.

Thus, Canada has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Joy Lizette Aguilar

## China: 0

China has partially complied with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

On 27 November 2015, the Ministry of Commerce announced that China will contribute USD6.5 million in humanitarian aid to four international organizations to tackle the Syrian refugee crisis.<sup>218</sup> The United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees, the World Food Programme, and the World Health Organization will each receive USD2 million.<sup>219</sup> The Government of China will allocate the remaining humanitarian aid of USD500, 000 to the International Committee of the Red Cross.<sup>220</sup>

On 4 February 2016, Chinese Foreign Minister Wang Yi pledged that China will donate 10,000 tonnes of food to help ease the food shortages among refugees in Syria.<sup>221</sup>

China has continued to provide humanitarian aid to and collaborate with organizations to indirectly support the protection of refugees IDPs in various parts of the world. However, it has not yet further strengthened its direct efforts.

Thus, China has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Emilia Lochowska

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>214</sup> Communities across Canada invited to apply to show how they can welcome and support Government-Assisted Refugees, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 5 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016.

http://news.gc.ca/web/article-en.do?nid=1031869& ga=1.243530502.287485455.1456418627.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>215</sup> Communities across Canada invited to apply to show how they can welcome and support Government-Assisted Refugees, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 5 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016.

http://news.gc.ca/web/article-en.do?nid=1031869&\_ga=1.243530502.287485455.1456418627.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>216</sup> Liberals reach resettlement goal as 25,000<sup>th</sup> Syrian refugee arrives in Canada (Toronto) 27 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/politics/25000th-syrian-refugee-arrives-in-canada-marking-milestone-for-liberals-resettlement-program/article28940211/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>217</sup> Liberals reach resettlement goal as 25,000<sup>th</sup> Syrian refugee arrives in Canada (Toronto) 27 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/politics/25000th-syrian-refugee-arrives-in-canada-marking-milestone-for-liberals-resettlement-program/article28940211/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>218</sup> China to offer humanitarian aid of 6.5 million USD to international organizations, Xinhuanet (Beijing) 27 November 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/2015-11/27/c\_134862847.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>219</sup> China to offer humanitarian aid of 6.5 million USD to international organizations, Xinhuanet (Beijing) 27 November 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/2015-11/27/c\_134862847.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>220</sup> China to offer humanitarian aid of 6.5 million USD to international organizations, Xinhuanet (Beijing) 27 November 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/2015-11/27/c\_134862847.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>221</sup> China pledges 10,000 tons of food support to Syria, CCTV (Beijing) 5 February 2016. Access Date: 19 February 2016. http://english.cntv.cn/2016/02/05/VIDEHqIC1CopmL3kSzYnaRQR160205.shtml.

#### France: +1

France has fully complied with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

On 17 November 2015, President Francois Hollande delivered a speech at the 70th General Conference of the United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) in Paris. He committed to accept 30,000 refugees over the next two years and invested USD53.3 million into housing.<sup>222</sup> The Government of France previously planned on accepting 24,000 refugees in September.<sup>223</sup>

On 24 November 2015, French Minister of Economy, Industry and Digital Affairs Emmanuel Macron stated that the Governments of France and Germany will be investing USD10.65 billion into addressing the refugee crisis in Europe.<sup>224</sup>

On 11 January 2016, Centre d'Accueil Provisonaire (CAP), a temporary reception centre, was opened for 1,500 refugees in Calais.<sup>225</sup> CAP consists of 125 shelters with electricity, heating, toilets, and water.<sup>226</sup> It also provides legal advice for refugees and is complementary to the Jules Ferry daycare center.<sup>227</sup>

On 13 January 2016, a new camp was opened in Grande-Synthe in partnership with Doctors Without Borders (MSF).<sup>228</sup> The camp can accommodate 2,500 refugees, 500 tents and sanitation facilities.<sup>229</sup> The Government of France will be investing GBP1.1 million to build a new camp in Grande-Synthe, near Dunkirk.<sup>230</sup> These are improvements from a camp in Grande-Synthe, which experienced food and sanitation facility shortages.<sup>231</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>222</sup> Francois Hollande: 30,000 Syrian refugees 'will be welcomed' in France despite attacks, The Washington Times (Washington) 18 November 18 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

http://www.washingtontimes.com/news/2015/nov/18/hollande-30000-syrian-refugees-will-be-welcomed-fr/. <sup>223</sup> Francois Hollande: 30,000 Syrian refugees 'will be welcomed' in France despite attacks, The Washington Times (Washington) 18 November 18 2015, Access Date: 21 February 2016.

http://www.washingtontimes.com/news/2015/nov/18/hollande-30000-syrian-refugees-will-be-welcomed-fr/. 224 France, Germany propose 10 bln Euro fund for refugee crisis – Macron, Reuters (London) 24 November 2015.

Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/europe-migrants-fund-macron-idUSB4N12Q01S20151124.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>225</sup> Fear in the Jungle, Time (New York City) 24 November 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://time.com/fear-in-the-jungle/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>226</sup> Fear in the Jungle, Time (New York City) 24 November 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://time.com/fearin-the-jungle/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>227</sup> The most shocking thing about Calais is that's its not even too big to solve, The Guardian (London) 7 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2016/jan/07/calais-french-migrant-camps-refugee-crisis.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>228</sup> France: new site required urgently for refugees in Grande-Synthe, Médecins Sans Frontieres (Geneva) 6 January 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.msf.org/article/france-new-site-required-urgently-refugees-grandesynthe.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>229</sup> France: new site required urgently for refugees in Grande-Synthe, Médecins Sans Frontieres (Geneva) 6 January 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.msf.org/article/france-new-site-required-urgently-refugees-grandesynthe.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>230</sup> Refugee crisis: police block aid to French camp "far worse" than Calais Jungle, Independent (London) 6 January 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/europe/refugee-crisis-police-blockaid-to-french-camp-far-worse-than-calais-jungle-a6799266.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>231</sup> Refugee crisis: police block aid to French camp "far worse" than Calais Jungle, Independent (London) 6 January 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/europe/refugee-crisis-police-blockaid-to-french-camp-far-worse-than-calais-jungle-a6799266.html.

On March 7, 2016, a new refugee camp opened in Grande-Synthe, after the demolition of a refugee camp in Calais.<sup>232</sup> The new camp was constructed by the local town hall in collaboration with MSF and cost EUR3.1 million.<sup>233</sup> The refugee camp has 375 cabins and is intended for 2,500 refugees.<sup>234</sup> It is also the first refugee camp in France to meet international standards.<sup>235</sup>

France has made both direct and indirect efforts to further strengthen its support for refugee and IDP protection.

Thus, France has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Mariya-Kvitlana Tsap

#### Germany: +1

Germany has fully complied with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

On 22 November 2015, Head of the Federal Chancellery and Refugee Coordinator Peter Altmaier called for a solution based on common European contingents to solve the refugee crisis and stressed the importance of determining numbers of refugees that will be accepted without being forced into illegality and trafficking.<sup>236</sup> He also noted the significance of working with Turkey for the European Union to achieve a solution involving contingents to the current refugee crisis.<sup>237</sup>

On 25 November 2015, Chancellor Angela Merkel reaffirmed the need for European contingents and a permanent European allocation mechanism to manage refugee intake.<sup>238</sup> The Chancellor called to clamp down on human traffickers and ensure the legality of refugees entering European countries.<sup>239</sup> She also stressed the aim of reducing the numbers of refugees arriving in Germany yet keeping the German borders open to them.<sup>240</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>232</sup> France's first ever internationally recognised refugee camp opens near Dunkirk, The Telegraph (London) 7 March 2016. Date of Access: 20 April 2016. http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/europe/france/12186407/Frances-first-ever-internationally-recognised-refugee-camp-opens-near-Dunkirk.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>233</sup> France's first ever internationally recognised refugee camp opens near Dunkirk, The Telegraph (London) 7 March 2016. Date of Access: 20 April 2016. http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/europe/france/12186407/Frances-first-ever-internationally-recognised-refugee-camp-opens-near-Dunkirk.html

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>234</sup> France opens first refugee camp built to international standards, France 24 (Paris) 8 March 2016. Date of Access: 21
 April 2016. http://www.france24.com/en/20160308-france-first-international-standard-refugee-camp-opens
 <sup>235</sup> France opens first refugee camp built to international standards, France 24 (Paris) 8 March 2016. Date of Access: 21

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>239</sup> France opens first refugee camp built to international standards, France 24 (Paris) 8 March 2016. Date of Access: 21 April 2016. http://www.france24.com/en/20160308-france-first-international-standard-refugee-camp-opens

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>236</sup> Common European contingents, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 23 November 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2015/11\_en/2015-11-23-fluechtlinge-kontingentloesung\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>237</sup> Common European contingents, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 23 November 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2015/11\_en/2015-11-23-fluechtlingekontingentloesung\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>238</sup> Sharing the burden and tackling the root causes, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 27 November 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2015/11\_en/2015-11-27-flucht-asylwoche-im-ueberblick\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>239</sup> Sharing the burden and tackling the root causes, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 27 November 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2015/11\_en/2015-11-27-flucht-asylwoche-im-ueberblick\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>240</sup> Sharing the burden and tackling the root causes, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 27 November 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2015/11\_en/2015-11-27-flucht-asylwoche-im-ueberblick\_en.html?nn=709674.

On 25 November 2015, Federal Interior Minister Thomas de Maizière announced that in 2016, the Federal Office for Migration and Refugees (BAMF) would employ 4,000 more staff and federal states would receive support through the creation of 150 posts for federal police officers and other measures to help with repatriation initiatives.<sup>241</sup> The 2016 Federal Budget also included an additional EUR326 million for integration initiatives.<sup>242</sup>

On 16 December 2015, Federal Minister of Family Affairs Manuela Schwesig reported to the cabinet on the Government of Germany's protection of unaccompanied refugee minors.<sup>243</sup> According to the November 2015 law that the federal government passed assuming responsibility of allocating refugee minors across the country, the government committed to alleviating the burdens of local authorities by providing them with EUR350 million yearly in the allocation of the minors.<sup>244</sup> Through its Welcome Among Friends programme, the Government of Germany is also assisting local authorities through the programme's 6 regional offices.<sup>245</sup> In addition to providing advice and training for local authorities, the offices connect authorities, associations, and education and refugee facilities to create local alliances.<sup>246</sup> With funding of EUR12 million, the programme will operate for 4 years.<sup>247</sup>

On 19 January 2016, Federal Minister of Family Affairs Manuela Schwesig announced a callout for volunteers interested in acting as mentors, guardians and host families as part of the government's People Support People programme.<sup>248</sup> In addition to establishing 25,000 mentorships between refugees and volunteers, the programme will assign voluntary guardians and host families to accommodate unaccompanied refugee minors arriving in Germany.<sup>249</sup> The Government of Germany allocated EUR10 million to this program for 2016.<sup>250</sup>

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>241</sup> Sharing the burden and tackling the root causes, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 27 November 2015.
 Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2015/11\_en/2015-11-27-flucht-asyl-woche-im-ueberblick\_en.html?nn=709674.
 <sup>242</sup> Sharing the burden and tackling the root causes, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 27 November 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>242</sup> Sharing the burden and tackling the root causes, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 27 November 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2015/11\_en/2015-11-27-flucht-asylwoche-im-ueberblick\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>243</sup> Protection for unaccompanied minors, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 16 December 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2015/12\_en/2015-12-16-minderjaehrige-fluechtlinge en.html?nn=709674.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>244</sup> Protection for unaccompanied minors, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 16 December 2015. Access Date:
 27 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2015/12\_en/2015-12-16-minderjaehrige-fluechtlinge en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>245</sup> Protection for unaccompanied minors, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 16 December 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2015/12\_en/2015-12-16-minderjaehrigefluechtlinge\_en.html?nn=709674.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>246</sup> Protection for unaccompanied minors, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 16 December 2015. Access Date:
 27 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2015/12\_en/2015-12-16-minderjaehrige-fluechtlinge\_en.html?nn=709674.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>247</sup> Protection for unaccompanied minors, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 16 December 2015. Access Date:
 27 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2015/12\_en/2015-12-16-minderjaehrige-fluechtlinge en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>248</sup> Wanted – mentors for refugees, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 19 January 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/01\_en/2016-01-19-patenprogramm-fluechtlinge\_en.html?nn=709674.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>249</sup> Wanted – mentors for refugees, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 19 January 2016. Access Date: 27
 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/01\_en/2016-01-19-patenprogramm-fluechtlinge\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>250</sup> Wanted – mentors for refugees, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 19 January 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/01\_en/2016-01-19-patenprogramm-fluechtlinge\_en.html?nn=709674.

On 22 January 2016, Chancellor Merkel announced further German cooperation with Turkey on handling the refugee crisis at the German-Turkish intergovernmental consultations.<sup>251</sup> She stressed the importance of Germany and Turkey combatting the efforts of illegal smugglers and traffickers in the seas between Turkey and Greece and emphasized that refugees must be given an opportunity to enter Europe legally without risking their lives.<sup>252</sup>

On 26 to 28 January 2016, Federal Development Minister Gerd Müller presented the Cash-for-Work investment and structural programme during his visit to Jordan,<sup>253</sup> Turkey,<sup>254</sup> and Iraq,<sup>255</sup> which aims to create 500,000 jobs for Syrian refugees within the region.<sup>256</sup>

On 4 February 2016, Chancellor Merkel announced at the Supporting Syria and the Region conference that the Government of Germany would increase its contributions to resolving the Syrian humanitarian crisis.<sup>257</sup> From now until 2018, the Government will contribute EUR2.3 billion<sup>258</sup> and pledge EUR1 billion for UN humanitarian aid programmes in 2016.<sup>259</sup> From this EUR1 billion, EUR570 million will be allotted to the World Food Programme.<sup>260</sup> The government will also be involved in the Partnership for Prospects programme, which aims to create a total of 500,000 jobs in Syria and within the region to support the creation of community centres, schools and hospitals that will be constructed by refugees.<sup>261</sup> For 2016, the government will contribute EUR200 million to this

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>251</sup> Joining forces to address terrorism and illegal migration, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 22 January 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/01\_en/2016-01-21-deutschland-tuerkei\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>252</sup> Joining forces to address terrorism and illegal migration, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 22 January 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/01\_en/2016-01-21-deutschland-tuerkei\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>253</sup> Minister Müller in talks with Jordanian government regarding investments in economic development, crafts and trades, and infrastructure, Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (Berlin) 26 January 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2016/januar/160126\_pm\_006\_Marshall-Plan-for-the-Middle-East-Minister-Mueller-in-talks-with-Jordanian-government-regarding-investments-in-economic-development-crafts-and-trades-and-infrastructure/index.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>254</sup> Minister Müller in northern Iraq: key to resolving the refugee crisis lies in the region itself, Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (Berlin) 27 January 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016.

http://bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2016/januar/160127\_pm\_007\_Minister-Mueller-in-northern-Iraq-key-to-resolving-the-refugee-crisis-lies-in-the-region-itself/index.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>255</sup> Minister Müller in northern Iraq: key to resolving the refugee crisis lies in the region itself, Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (Berlin) 27 January 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2016/januar/160127\_pm\_007\_Minister-Mueller-in-northern-Iraq-key-toresolving-the-refugee-crisis-lies-in-the-region-itself/index.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>256</sup> Assistance for Jordan, Turkey and Northern Iraq, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 28 January 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/01\_en/2016-01-27-mueller-nordirak\_en.html.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>257</sup> Eleven billion dollars for Syrian refugees, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 28
 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Reiseberichte/2016/2016-02-04-syrien-konferenz-london\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>258</sup> Eleven billion dollars for Syrian refugees, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Reiseberichte/2016/2016-02-04-syrien-konferenzlondon\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>259</sup> Eleven billion dollars for Syrian refugees, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Reiseberichte/2016/2016-02-04-syrien-konferenzlondon\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>260</sup> Eleven billion dollars for Syrian refugees, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Reiseberichte/2016/2016-02-04-syrien-konferenzlondon\_en.html?nn=709674.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>261</sup> Eleven billion dollars for Syrian refugees, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 28
 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Reiseberichte/2016/2016-02-04-syrien-konferenz-london\_en.html?nn=709674.

initiative. <sup>262</sup> The Chancellor also stated that the government will provide 1,900 university scholarships for Syrian refugees. <sup>263</sup> In addition, it is establishing internet-based communication platforms to connect towns in Jordan, Lebanon, and Turkey with German federal states, towns, and cities, which will offer their assistance.<sup>264</sup>

On 8 February 2016, Chancellor Merkel offered the services of the German Federal Agency for Technical Relief in assisting the Turkish Aid Agency to provide care for refugees at the Turkish-Syrian border,<sup>265</sup> which has experienced bombing raids.<sup>266</sup>

On 12 February 2016, Chancellor Merkel stated that Germany and Poland would work together on humanitarian projects for refugees within the crisis region, such as fitting out a hospital.<sup>267</sup>

On 26 February 2016, the Bundesrat approved a second asylum package.<sup>268</sup> The package includes an accelerated procedure for asylum-seekers from countries classified as safe countries, those submitting a second request for asylum and those who do not comply with asylum procedures.<sup>269</sup> Asylum-seekers will stay in the initial reception facilities until the accelerated procedure is completed<sup>270</sup> and also receive benefits on the condition that they follow stricter residence rules.<sup>271</sup> Families of asylum-seekers with subsidiary protection will not be allowed to follow them to Germany for two years,<sup>272</sup> allowing Germany to better handle the influx of refugees.<sup>273</sup> Legal refugee minors will also be afforded better

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>262</sup> Eleven billion dollars for Syrian refugees, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 28
 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Reiseberichte/2016/2016-02-04-syrien-konferenz-london\_en.html?nn=709674.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>263</sup> Eleven billion dollars for Syrian refugees, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 28
 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Reiseberichte/2016/2016-02-04-syrien-konferenz-london\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>264</sup> Eleven billion dollars for Syrian refugees, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Reiseberichte/2016/2016-02-04-syrien-konferenzlondon\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>265</sup> Angela Merkel offers Turkey assistance for border region, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin), 8 February 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Reiseberichte/2016/2016-02-08-merkel-ankara\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>266</sup> Angela Merkel offers Turkey assistance for border region, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin), 8 February 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Reiseberichte/2016/2016-02-08-merkelankara\_en.html?nn=709674.
<sup>267</sup> The refugee crisis can only be resolved by working together, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 12 February

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>207</sup> The refugee crisis can only be resolved by working together, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 12 February 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/02\_en/2016-02-12-merkel-szydlo\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>268</sup> Swifter procedures, fewer families to follow asylum-seekers, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/02\_en/2016-02-04-asylpaket2\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>269</sup> Swifter procedures, fewer families to follow asylum-seekers, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/02\_en/2016-02-04-asylpaket2\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>270</sup> Swifter procedures, fewer families to follow asylum-seekers, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/02\_en/2016-02-04-asylpaket2\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>271</sup> Swifter procedures, fewer families to follow asylum-seekers, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/02\_en/2016-02-04-asylpaket2\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>272</sup> Swifter procedures, fewer families to follow asylum-seekers, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/02\_en/2016-02-04-asylpaket2\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>273</sup> Swifter procedures, fewer families to follow asylum-seekers, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/02\_en/2016-02-04-asylpaket2\_en.html?nn=709674.

protection in reception facilities and shared accommodation as the employees in these facilities will soon require a police clearance.<sup>274</sup>

On 29 February 2016, Chancellor Merkel reiterated the German stance on the refugee crisis, emphasizing legal migration and addressing the root factors causing people to leave their homes in order to reduce refugee flows.<sup>275</sup> She rejected the idea of European member states promoting their own national actions to handle the refugee crisis, opting for a collective European strategy to deal with refugee flows.<sup>276</sup> The Chancellor also rejected the idea of fixed ceilings for refugee numbers and disagreed with Macedonia's decision to close its borders with Greece, leaving thousands of refugees stranded.<sup>277</sup>

On 1 March 2016, Federal Development Minister Gerd Müller stressed the importance of German efforts to stabilize Mediterranean states in North Africa on political and economic terms in order to reduce refugee numbers during his visit to Morocco, Algeria and Tunisia.<sup>278</sup> He stated that the key to solving the refugee crisis was to support these states during their process of societal transition so that people would not leave these countries in search of a better future.<sup>279</sup> During his visit to Morocco, Algeria and Tunisia, he held meetings with business representatives to arrange training and economic cooperation agreements.<sup>280</sup> He announced that the German Federal Government would increase the number of Germany companies operating in Tunisia to trigger economic development and create jobs especially for young people in North Africa.<sup>281</sup> He also stated that Germany would support the reintegration of returnees in their home countries.<sup>282</sup> Germany and Morocco would also collaborate further on solar energy initiatives to create green jobs.<sup>283</sup> In addition, Germany plans to support Morocco in the creation of more welcome centres in 10 municipalities to help immigrants from Sub-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>274</sup> Swifter procedures, fewer families to follow asylum-seekers, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/02\_en/2016-02-04-asylpaket2\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>275</sup> A European solution is in Germany's interests, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 29 February 2016. Access Date: 29 February 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/02\_en/2016-02-29-merkel-annewill\_en.html.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>276</sup> A European solution is in Germany's interests, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 29 February 2016. Access Date: 29 February 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/02\_en/2016-02-29-merkel-annewill\_en.html.
 <sup>277</sup> A European solution is in Germany's interests, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 29 February 2016. Access

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>211</sup> A European solution is in Germany's interests, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 29 February 2016. Access Date: 29 February 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/02\_en/2016-02-29-merkel-annewill\_en.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>278</sup> New Partnership with North Africa, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 1 March 2016. Access Date: 20 April 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/03\_en/2016-03-01-wirtschaftspartnerschaft-nordafrika.html?nn=709674

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>279</sup> New Partnership with North Africa, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 1 March 2016. Access Date: 20 April 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/03\_en/2016-03-01-wirtschaftspartnerschaft-nordafrika.html?nn=709674

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>280</sup> New Partnership with North Africa, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 1 March 2016. Access Date: 20 April 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/03\_en/2016-03-01-wirtschaftspartnerschaft-nordafrika.html?nn=709674

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>281</sup> New Partnership with North Africa, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 1 March 2016. Access Date: 20 April 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/03\_en/2016-03-01-wirtschaftspartnerschaft-nordafrika.html?nn=709674

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>282</sup> New Partnership with North Africa, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 1 March 2016. Access Date: 20 April 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/03\_en/2016-03-01-wirtschaftspartnerschaft-nordafrika.html?nn=709674

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>283</sup> New Partnership with North Africa, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 1 March 2016. Access Date: 20 April 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/03\_en/2016-03-01-wirtschaftspartnerschaft-nordafrika.html?nn=709674

Saharan Africa with integration.<sup>284</sup> The Federal Development Minister also opened a new institute in Algeria, which offers professional training on renewable energy and other subjects.<sup>285</sup>

On 1 March 2016, German Chancellor Angela Merkel emphasized the importance of better protection for the EU's external border in Greece and the renewal of the Schengen Area alongside Prime Minister of the Republic of Croatia, Tihomir Orešković at a joint press conference.<sup>286</sup> The Chancellor also dismissed calls for Germany to admit more refugees currently in Greece and stated that refugees are not entitled to choose the European country in which they would like to request asylum.<sup>287</sup>

During the compliance period, Germany has taken significant actions to strengthen all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and IDPs.

Thus, Germany has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Joy Lizette Aguilar

#### India: –1

India has failed to comply with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

The Government of India has not indicated its intention to strengthen direct or indirect efforts for refugee and IDP protection.

Thus, India has received a score of -1.

Analysts: Nadine Abdel Razek and Larissa Parker

#### Indonesia: -1

Indonesia has failed to comply with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

The Government of Indonesia has not indicated its intention to strengthen direct or indirect efforts for refugee and IDP protection.

Thus, Indonesia has received a score of -1.

Analysts: Nadine Abdel Razek and Larissa Parker

#### Italy: 0

Italy has partially complied with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>284</sup> New Partnership with North Africa, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 1 March 2016. Access Date: 20 April 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/03\_en/2016-03-01-wirtschaftspartnerschaft-nordafrika.html?nn=709674

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>285</sup> New Partnership with North Africa, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 1 March 2016. Access Date: 20 April 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/03\_en/2016-03-01-wirtschaftspartnerschaft-nordafrika.html?nn=709674

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>286</sup> We must return to Schengen, says Chancellor, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 1 March 2016. Access Date: 20 April 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/03\_en/2016-03-01-antrittsbesuch-premier-kroatien\_en.html?nn=709674

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>287</sup> We must return to Schengen, says Chancellor, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 1 March 2016. Access Date: 20 April 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2016/03\_en/2016-03-01-antrittsbesuch-premier-kroatien\_en.html?nn=709674

On 18 December 2015, the Government of Italy provided EUR2.18 million to the United Nations Relief and Works Agency (UNRWA).<sup>288</sup> The contribution will enable the Agency to distribute food to approximately 106,866 food-insecure Palestinian refugees in Gaza in 2016.<sup>289</sup>

As of 2016, the Ministry of Interior has been working to operationalize more hotspots and regional relocation hubs in addition to the already operational hotspots in Lampedusa, Trapani, and Pozzallo and regional relocation hubs Villa Sikania and Bari.<sup>290</sup>

On 1 February 2016, the Government of Italy donated EUR1 million to the UNRWA to assist Palestinian refugees in Syria.<sup>291</sup> The donation will allow the UNRWA to support up to 33,708 Palestinian refugees with 8,427 family food parcels, 4,500 hygiene kits, and additional life-sustaining food commodities to supplement their daily needs.<sup>292</sup>

On 2 February 2016, Prime Minister Matteo Renzi announced that Rome will contribute to the European Union's fund to help Turkey manage the flood of refugees from the Middle East.<sup>293</sup> In response to the refugee crisis, the Prime Minister asserted that Italy will continue to "make any effort to save human lives in the Mediterranean."<sup>294</sup>

On 14 February 2016, Italy contributed USD1.5 million in emergency humanitarian aid for Libya's estimated 2.4 million internal refugees to the United Nations High Commission on Human Rights (UNHCR).<sup>295</sup>

On 18 February 2016, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation approved the allocation of EUR3.5 million in humanitarian aid to the UNHCR to tackle current emergencies in the Central African Republic, Yemen and Cameroon.<sup>296</sup> The funding of EUR1 million for the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>288</sup> Italy Contributes EUR 2.18 Million for Food Assistance to Palestine Refugees in Gaza, United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East (East Jerusalem) 18 December 2015. Access Date: 19 February 2016. http://www.unrwa.org/newsroom/press-releases/italy-contributes-eur-218-million-food-assistance-palestinerefugees-gaza.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>289</sup> Italy Contributes EUR 2.18 Million for Food Assistance to Palestine Refugees in Gaza, United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East (East Jerusalem) 18 December 2015. Access Date: 19 February 2016. http://www.unrwa.org/newsroom/press-releases/italy-contributes-eur-218-million-food-assistance-palestinerefugees-gaza.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>290</sup> Italy – Sea Arrivals, United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees. January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://reliefweb.int/sites/reliefweb.int/files/resources/UNHCRCountryUpdateItaly-January2016.pdf.
 <sup>291</sup> Italy Contributes EUR 1 Million for Food Assistance to Palestine Refugees in Syria, United Nations Relief and Works

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>291</sup> Italy Contributes EUR 1 Million for Food Assistance to Palestine Refugees in Syria, United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East (Damascus) 1 February 2016. Access Date: 19 February 2016.

http://www.unrwa.org/newsroom/press-releases/italy-contributes-eur-1-million-food-assistance-palestine-refugees-syria.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>292</sup> Italy Contributes EUR 1 Million for Food Assistance to Palestine Refugees in Syria, United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East (Damascus) 1 February 2016. Access Date: 19 February 2016. http://www.unrwa.org/newsroom/press-releases/italy-contributes-eur-1-million-food-assistance-palestine-refugeessyria.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>293</sup> Italy will finally contribute to EU's refugee aid to Turkey, The Regional Center for Strategic Studies (Cairo) 2 February 2016. Access Date: 19 February 2016. http://neurope.eu/article/italy-will-finally-contribute-to-eus-refugee-aid-to-turkey/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>294</sup> Italy will finally contribute to EU's refugee aid to Turkey, The Regional Center for Strategic Studies (Cairo) 2 February 2016. Access Date: 19 February 2016. http://neurope.eu/article/italy-will-finally-contribute-to-eus-refugee-aid-to-turkey/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>295</sup> Italy gives \$1.5 million for UNHCR's Libyan refugee work, The Regional Center for Strategic Studies (Cairo) 14 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.rcssmideast.org/en/Article/10677/Italy-gives-15-millionfor-UNHCRper centE2per cent80per cent99s-Libyan-refugee-work#.Vs\_ucylQCb8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>296</sup> Italy allocates 3.5 million euros in humanitarian aid to UNHCR to tackle current emergencies in Yemen, the Central African Republic and Cameroon, The Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation (Rome) 18 February 2016. Access Date: 20 February 2016.

 $http://www.esteri.it/mae/en/sala\_stampa/archivionotizie/comunicati/2016/02/dall-italia-aiuti-umanitari-per.html.$ 

Central African Republic will allow the UNHCR to provide assistance to 450,000 IDPs.<sup>297</sup> The contribution of EUR1.5 million to Yemen will enable the High Commissioner to provide protection to 1.2 million IDPs and 250,000 refugees fleeing violent conflict in the country, while the funding of EUR1 million for Cameroon will serve to alleviate the suffering of 70, 000 Nigerian refugees registered following the violence perpetrated by Boko Haram.<sup>298</sup>

Italy has further strengthened its support for indirect efforts to provide refugee and IDP protection. However, it has not yet further strengthened its direct efforts.

Thus, Italy has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Emilia Lochowska

#### Japan: 0

Japan has partially complied with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection to refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

Japan continues to have stringent legal barriers in place preventing the settlement of refugees in the country. Only 27 of a total 7,586 refugee applicants were accepted in 2015.<sup>299</sup> This is an increase from the 11 refugees accepted in 2014<sup>300</sup> however, it remains an insignificant number relative to the immense number of refugees worldwide. Consequently, this falls short of 'supporting all [direct] efforts' to facilitate the physical protection of refugees.

On 20 January 2016 the Japanese Parliament approved USD350 million in humanitarian aid for Syrian and Iraqi refugees in addition to the USD810 million package approved in 2015.<sup>301</sup>

In February 2016 Japan also donated more than USD38 million to the United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees in the Near East (UNRWA).<sup>302</sup>

On 3 March 2016, the Japanese government pledged USD16 million for IDPs in Afghanistan and Pakistan's northwestern tribal areas.<sup>303</sup>

During the compliance period, Japan has further strengthened its support for indirect efforts to provide refugee and IDP protection. However, it has not yet further strengthened its direct efforts.

http://www.esteri.it/mae/en/sala\_stampa/archivionotizie/comunicati/2016/02/dall-italia-aiuti-umanitari-per.html. <sup>299</sup> Japan sees 50% jump in refugee applications in 2015, admits 27, Nikkei Asian Review 23 January 2016. Access Date: 03 March 2016. http://asia.nikkei.com/Politics-Economy/Policy-Politics/Japan-sees-50-jump-in-refugee-applications-in-2015-admits-27

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>297</sup> Italy allocates 3.5 million euros in humanitarian aid to UNHCR to tackle current emergencies in Yemen, the Central African Republic and Cameroon, The Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation (Rome) 18 February 2016. Access Date: 20 February 2016.

http://www.esteri.it/mae/en/sala\_stampa/archivionotizie/comunicati/2016/02/dall-italia-aiuti-umanitari-per.html. <sup>298</sup> Italy allocates 3.5 million euros in humanitarian aid to UNHCR to tackle current emergencies in Yemen, the Central African Republic and Cameroon, The Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation (Rome) 18 February 2016. Access Date: 20 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>300</sup> Japan sees 50% jump in refugee applications in 2015, admits 27, Nikkei Asian Review 23 January 2016. Access Date: 03 March 2016. http://asia.nikkei.com/Politics-Economy/Policy-Politics/Japan-sees-50-jump-in-refugee-applications-in-2015-admits-27

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>301</sup> Japan rejected 99.6per cent of refugee applications in 2015, accepting only 27 people, International Business Times (New York) 23 January 23 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.ibtimes.co.uk/japan-rejected-99-6-refugee-applications-2015-accepting-only-27-people-1539685.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>302</sup> Japan Contributes US\$ 38.21 million to UNRWA to support Palestine Refugees in Gaza, the West Bank, Lebanon and Syria, UNRWA 29 February 2016. Access Date: 3 March 2016. http://www.unrwa.org/newsroom/press-releases/japancontributes-us-3821-million-unrwa-support-palestine-refugees-gaza-west.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>303</sup> Japan grants \$16m for FATA returnees, Afghan refugees, Daily Times 3 March 2016. Access Date: 03 March 2016 http://www.dailytimes.com.pk/national/03-Mar-2016/japan-grants-16m-for-fata-returnees-afghan-refugees.

Thus, Japan has received a score of 0.

Analysts: Daniel Bodirsky

#### Korea: 0

Korea has partially complied with its to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

In 2015, Korea contributed USD15,956,557 to the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR). In 2016, Korea contributed USD13,171,457, USD25,851,000 less.<sup>304</sup>

On 23 December 2015, the first group of 22 Myanmar refugees arrived in Korea, marking the first time refugees have arrived in Korea since the 2013 Refugee Act took effect.<sup>305</sup> Staff members were also sent to Myanmar to help with the refugee application process and accompany refugees back to Korea.<sup>306</sup> Until 2017, as part of a pilot program, the Government of Korea will accept 30 refugees from Myanmar each year.<sup>307</sup> Refugees will stay at the Immigration Reception Centre in Incheon for six to twelve months and receive an education on Korean culture, language, and society.<sup>308</sup> After, the Government of Korea stated that the refugees will likely live in Gyeonggi Province.<sup>309</sup>

Korea has taken action to further strengthen its direct efforts to provide refugee and IDP protection. However, it has not yet strengthened its indirect efforts.

Thus, Korea has received a score of 0.

Analysts: Sunny Jang and Emily Nickel

#### Mexico: 0

Mexico has partially complied with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

In 2015, Mexico contributed USD150,000 to the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR). In 2016, Mexico contributed USD55,000, USD45,000 less.<sup>310</sup>

On 29 November 2015, Subsecretary of Exterior Relations Carlos de Icaza González announced that the Mexican government continues to be in dialogue with international organizations to establish how to best support refugees and refugee camps.<sup>311</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>304</sup> Donor Profiles, UNHCR Access Date: 13 July 2016. http://reporting.unhcr.org/donor-

profiles#\_ga=1.228374621.1910829844.1467654212 <sup>305</sup> Press Release: South Korea Welcomes First Refugees for Resettlement, International Organization For Migration (Seoul) 22 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. https://www.iom.int/news/south-korea-welcomes-firstrefugees-resettlement.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>306</sup> Press Release: Refugees from Myanmar arrive in S. Korea for resettlement, Yonhap News Agency (Seoul) 23 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016.

http://english.yonhapnews.co.kr/search1/2603000000.html?cid=AEN20151223002251315.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>307</sup> Press Release: Refugees from Myanmar arrive in S. Korea for resettlement, Yonhap News Agency (Seoul) 23 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016.

http://english.yonhapnews.co.kr/search1/2603000000.html?cid=AEN20151223002251315.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>308</sup> Press Release: South Korea: Refugee Resettlement Program, Library of Congress (Washington) 4 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.loc.gov/law/foreign-news/article/south-korea-refugee-resettlementprogram/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>309</sup> Press Release: South Korea receives first refugees in pilot programme, UNHCR (Seoul) 23 December 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.unhcr.org/567a73aa6.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>310</sup> Donor Profiles, UNHCR Access Date: 13 July 2016. http://reporting.unhcr.org/donorprofiles# ga=1.228374621.1910829844.1467654212

On 2 December 2015, President Enrique Peña Nieto affirmed the General Law of the Rights of Girls, Boys, and Adolescents implemented in December 2014, which increases the rights for refugee children.<sup>312</sup> Specifically, Article 108 outlines enhanced collaboration between the National Institute for Migration and the Mexican Commission to Help Refugees in order to identify asylum seekers and refugees who are children.<sup>313</sup> Article 109 lays out a time limit of 48 hours for government agencies to communicate with each other and adopt necessary measures.<sup>314</sup>

On 4 February 2016, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs (SRE) announced that Mexico will be donating USD3 million towards supporting Syrian refugees.<sup>315</sup> The agency explained that the announcement was within the framework of the Conference in Support of Syria and the region, held in London.<sup>316</sup>

During the compliance period, Mexico has taken action to further strengthen support for indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and IDPs. However, it has not further strengthened its direct efforts.

Thus, Mexico has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Sunny Jang and Yolanda Clatworthy

#### Russia: –1

Russia has failed to comply with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

Since 3 February 2016, the South Rostov region authorities have left one temporary refugee centre operating for Ukrainian refugees compared to the seven which were still open at the start of 2016.<sup>317</sup>

On 18 February 2016, the Center for the Adaptation and Training of Refugee Children, a non-profit charitable organization, was evicted by the Department of Property after being professed as a "foreign agent,"<sup>318</sup> meaning that they receive foreign donations and support foreign political initiatives. The

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>311</sup>News Article: México Hace Aportaciones a Campos de Refugiados en Turquía, Líbano y Jordania, La Jornada 29 November 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.jornada.unam.mx/2015/11/29/politica/015n1pol.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>312</sup> Government Press Release: Reglamento de la Ley General de los Derechos de Niñas, Niños y Adolescentes, Secretaría de Gobernación 2 December 2015. Access Date: March 8 2016.

http://www.dof.gob.mx/nota\_detalle.php?codigo=5418303&fecha=02/12/2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>313</sup> Government Press Release: Reglamento de la Ley General de los Derechos de Niñas, Niños y Adolescentes,

Secretaría de Gobernación 2 December 2015. Access Date: March 8 2016.

http://www.dof.gob.mx/nota\_detalle.php?codigo=5418303&fecha=02/12/2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>314</sup> Government Press Release: Reglamento de la Ley General de los Derechos de Niñas, Niños y Adolescentes,

Secretaría de Gobernación 2 December 2015. Access Date: March 8 2016.

http://www.dof.gob.mx/nota\_detalle.php?codigo=5418303&fecha=02/12/2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>315</sup> News Article: Dona México 3 MDD Para Refugiados Sirios, Reforma 4 February 2016. Access Date: 8 March 2016. http://www.reforma.com/aplicacioneslibre/preacceso/articulo/default.aspx?id=758764&v=3&urlredirect=http://www. reforma.com/aplicaciones/articulo/default.aspx?id=758764&v=3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>316</sup> News Article: Dona México 3 MDD Para Refugiados Sirios, Reforma 4 February 2016. Access Date: 8 March 2016. http://www.reforma.com/aplicacioneslibre/preacceso/articulo/default.aspx?id=758764&v=3&urlredirect=http://www. reforma.com/aplicaciones/articulo/default.aspx?ld=758764&v=3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>317</sup> Some 1.2 million Ukrainian refugees stay in Russia – Federation Council Vice Speaker, TASS Russian News Agency (Moscow) 16 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://tass.ru/en/politics/844608.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>318</sup> Center for refugee children evicted from Moscow premises, The Moscow Times (Moscow) 19 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.themoscowtimes.com/article/center-for-refugee-children-evicted-from-moscow-premises/560054.html.

center was previously assisting 70 refugee children from Syria, Afghanistan, Ukraine and other countries.<sup>319</sup>

On 25 February 2016, the Government of Russia intended to deport three Syrian refugees seeking asylum from Dagestan.<sup>320</sup> However, this plan was cancelled due to protest from nongovernmental organizations and Moscow's Civil Assistance Committee.<sup>321</sup>

The Government of Russia has failed to further strengthen its support for direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and IDPs. Furthermore, Russia has reduced or eliminated existing efforts.

Thus, Russia has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Marrya-Kvitlana Tsap

#### Saudi Arabia: 0

Saudi Arabia has partially complied with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

On 17 November 2015, the King Salman Humanitarian Aid and Relief Centre signed a contract with the Rahma Medical Centre in Kuwait to run mobile clinics at a refugee camp in Obock, Djibouti.<sup>322</sup> King Salman Bin AbdalAziz Al Saud also gave a speech expressing his gratitude for the international efforts to help Syrian refugees.<sup>323</sup>

On 25 November 2015, Deputy Permanent Representative of the Delegation of the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia to the UN Adviser Saad bin Abdullah Al-Saad expressed concern at a General Assembly about the increasingly hostile discourse against refugees and asked the international community, press agencies, and non-governmental organizations to help increase awareness about refugees in order to ensure their protection. He also claimed that Saudi Arabia is ready to cooperate with the UN in order to address the worsening humanitarian disaster by working to protect and provide appropriate support both domestically and abroad.<sup>324</sup>

On 12 January 2016, Saudi Ambassador to Lebanon Ali Awad Asiri held a meeting with the Representative of UNCHR Mireille Girard, Representative of the World Food Organization Jawahir Atif, and Director of the Office of the Saudi National Campaign to Support Our Brothers in Syria

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>319</sup> Center for refugee children evicted from Moscow premises, The Moscow Times (Moscow) 19 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.themoscowtimes.com/article/center-for-refugee-children-evicted-from-moscow-premises/560054.html.
<sup>320</sup> Russia: 'shameful' plan to deport Syrian refugees back to warzone violates International Law, Amnesty International

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>320</sup> Russia: 'shameful' plan to deport Syrian refugees back to warzone violates International Law, Amnesty International (London) 25 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2016/02/russia-shameful-plan-to-deport-syrian-refugees-back-to-warzone-violates-international-law/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>321</sup> Russia cancels planned deportation of three Syrian refugees, The Moscow Times (Moscow) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.themoscowtimes.com/news/article/russia-cancels-planned-deportationof-three-syrian-refugees/560765.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>322</sup> The Acting Official of the Kingdom's Embassy in Djibouti Attends the Inauguration of the Mobile Medical Clinic in the Obock Refugee Camp, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Riyadh) 17 November 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.mofa.gov.sa/ServicesAndInformation/news/MinistryNews/Pages/ArticleID20151116143059572.aspx.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>322</sup> Custodian of the Two Holy Mosques Emphasizes the Need for the International community to Redouble its Efforts to Root Out Terrorism and Rid the World of Evil, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Riyadh) 17 November 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016.

http://www.mofa.gov.sa/ServicesAndInformation/news/statements/Pages/ArticleID2015111691635440.aspx. <sup>324</sup> The Kingdom Expressed Concern Due to the Increasingly Hostile and Racist Discourse Against Refugees at the UN's General Assembly, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Riyadh) 25 November 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.mofa.gov.sa/ServicesAndInformation/news/MinistryNews/Pages/ArticleID201511240216284.aspx.

Walid Al-Jalal to discuss mechanisms to transport food, medical supplies, blankets, and clothing to children in Madaya.<sup>325</sup>

On 5 January 2016, the Saudi Fund for Development signed a memorandum of understanding with the UNHCR in which the Kingdom pledged to contribute a total of over USD1 million to better protect the Rohingya refugees in Thailand.<sup>326</sup>

On 21 February 2016, Ambassador of the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia Nayif Bin Bandar Al-Sadiri and Ambassadors of the Gulf Cooperation Council met with the official municipal adviser and coordinator for Syrian refugees in Canada, Michael Qaqish, and University of Ottawa Professor Rouba Al-Fattal to discuss how to better facilitate the stay of Syrian refugees in Canada.<sup>327</sup>

During the compliance period, Saudi Arabia has taken some actions to further strengthen its support for indirect efforts to provide protection for the unprecedented numbers of refugees and IDPs. However, it has not yet further strengthened its direct efforts.

Thus, Saudi Arabia has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Joud Hadi

## South Africa: -1

South Africa has failed to comply with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

On 25 November 2015, Minister of Home Affairs Malusi Gigaba briefed the public on the Government of South Africa's closing of the Zimbabwe Special Permit programme and the subsequent opening of the Lesotho Special Permit programme.<sup>328</sup> These dispensations were in part intended to ease the pressure exerted on the country's Refugee Reception Offices and authorizes the use of special permits is helping to separate economic migrants from asylum seekers and refugees to enhance refugee management and protection.<sup>329</sup>

On 28 November 2015, Deputy Minister Zou Kota-Fredericks stressed that the third pillar in the Habitat III Outcome Document, a document guiding urbanization efforts and aims to "enhance

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>325</sup> Saudi Ambassador to Lebanon to Discuss how to Provide Humanitarian Aid to Those Trapped in Madaya, Syria with Representatives of the UN, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Riyadh) 12 January 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.mofa.gov.sa/ServicesAndInformation/news/MinistryNews/Pages/ArticleID2016111204627880.aspx.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>326</sup> The Kingdom Signs a Memorandum of Understanding with the High Commissioner of the United Nations for Refugees (UNHCR) for "Rohingya" refugee relief in Thailand, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Riyadh) 15 January 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016.

http://www.mofa.gov.sa/ServicesAndInformation/news/GovernmentNews/Pages/ArticleID201611420449938.aspx. <sup>327</sup> Ambassador of the Custodian of the Two Holy Mosques in Canada and the Ambassadors of the Gulf Cooperation Council (GCC) Meet with Canadian Officials in Support of the Syrian Refugee Issue, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Riyadh) 21 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016.

http://www.mofa.gov.sa/ServicesAndInformation/news/MinistryNews/Pages/ArticleID2016220211243574.aspx. <sup>328</sup> Statement by Home Affairs Minister Malusi Gigaba at the Media Briefing on the Closing of the Zimbabwa Special Permit Programme and the Opening of the Lesotho Special Permit, Department of Home Affairs (Pretoria) 25 November 2015. Access Date: 23 Febrary 2016. http://www.dha.gov.za/index.php/statements-speeches/704statement-by-home-affairs-minister-malusi-gigaba-at-the-media-briefing-on-the-closing-of-the-zimbabwe-specialpermit-programme-and-the-opening-of-the-lesotho-special-permit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>329</sup> Statement by Home Affairs Minister Malusi Gigaba at the Media Briefing on the Closing of the Zimbabwa Special Permit Programme and the Opening of the Lesotho Special Permit, Department of Home Affairs (Pretoria) 25 November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.dha.gov.za/index.php/statements-speeches/704statement-by-home-affairs-minister-malusi-gigaba-at-the-media-briefing-on-the-closing-of-the-zimbabwe-specialpermit-programme-and-the-opening-of-the-lesotho-special-permit.

people-centered urban and human settlements development" through several means, including the "facilitating access to urban services and housing for migrants and refugees.<sup>330</sup>

On 13 February 2016, President Jacob Zuma stated the South Africa would like "to see an end to wars and conflicts in [Africa]. [South Africa] wants to see an end to the flight of many Africans from their countries to become refugees because of the conflict."<sup>331</sup>

During the compliance period, South Africa has signaled its intent to strengthen its support for all efforts to provide protection to refugees and IDPs. However, no direct or indirect contributions have been made as of yet.

Thus, South Africa has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Joud Hadi

#### Turkey: +1

Turkey has fully complied with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

On 30 November 2015, the Temporary Protection Module was launched to enhance the productivity of refugee registration.<sup>332</sup> It facilitates access to information by different ministries. Furthermore, the Prime Ministry Disaster and Emergency Management Authority also developed the Elektronik Yardim Dagitim, an electronic aid distribution system that matches Syrian refugees in need with assistance providers.<sup>333</sup> Additionally, the Ministry of Health has commenced the extension of healthcare services to refugees, to be provided by both the Government of Turkey and nongovernmental organizations.<sup>334</sup>

On 10 February 2016, the Joint Action Plan between Turkey and the EU took effect.<sup>335</sup> The Plan aims to enhance cooperation to support Syrian refugees under temporary protection and their host

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>330</sup> Statement by Deputy Minister, Ms Zou Kota-Fredericks at the occasion of the Global Platform for the Right to the City Africa Regional Meeting on 28 November 2015 at the University of Witwatersrand, Department of Human Settlements (Pretoria) 28 November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://www.dhs.gov.za/sites/default/files/speeches/Statementper cent20Southper cent20Africaper cent20atper cent20GPR2Cper cent2028per cent20Novper cent202015\_2.pdf. <sup>331</sup> Remarks by President Jacob Zuma on the occasion of the 2nd Annual Ubuntu Awards, Cape Town International

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>331</sup> Remarks by President Jacob Zuma on the occasion of the 2nd Annual Ubuntu Awards, Cape Town International Convention Centre (CTICC), Department of International Relations and Cooperation (Pretoria) 13 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.dirco.gov.za/docs/speeches/2016/jzum0213.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>332</sup> Turkey's Response to the Syrian Refugee Crisis and the Road Ahead, World Bank Group (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www-

wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/WDSP/IB/2015/12/21/090224b083ed7485/1\_0/Rendered/PD F/Turkey0s0respo0s0and0the0road0ahead.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>333</sup> Turkey's Response to the Syrian Refugee Crisis and the Road Ahead, World Bank Group (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www-

wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/WDSP/IB/2015/12/21/090224b083ed7485/1\_0/Rendered/PD F/Turkey0s0respo0s0and0the0road0ahead.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>334</sup> Turkey's Response to the Syrian Refugee Crisis and the Road Ahead, World Bank Group (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www-

wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/WDSP/IB/2015/12/21/090224b083ed7485/1\_0/Rendered/PD F/Turkey0s0respo0s0and0the0road0ahead.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>335</sup> Turkey's Response to the Syrian Refugee Crisis and the Road Ahead, World Bank Group (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www-

wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/WDSP/IB/2015/12/21/090224b083ed7485/1\_0/Rendered/PD F/Turkey0s0respo0s0and0the0road0ahead.pdf.

communities in Turkey.<sup>336</sup> Therefore, Turkey has committed to ensure that refugees are registered and provided with appropriate documents and have access to public services such as education and health care.<sup>337</sup>

On 18 March 2016, Prime Minister Ahmet Davutoğlu signed an agreement with the EU.<sup>338</sup> The agreement stated that all irregular migrants travelling from Turkey to Greece would be returned to Turkey with expenses paid by the EU and that for every Syrian returned to Turkey, a Syrian from Turkey would be resettled in an EU member state.<sup>339</sup>

Turkey has made direct and indirect efforts to further strengthen its commitment to refugee and IDP protection.

Thus, Turkey has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Mariam Jammal and Emily Nickel

#### United Kingdom: +1

The United Kingdom has fully complied with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

On 8 January 2016, Prime Minister David Cameron met with Queen Rania of Jordan to discuss effective responses to the crisis in Syria. They agreed that improving education and employment is key to creating long-term positive impact in the region and reiterated their commitments to help.<sup>340</sup>

On 18 January 2016, Secretary of State for International Development Justine Greening visited Jordan and met with Minister of Education H.E. Dr Mohammed Thuneibat and Minister for International Cooperation and Planning H.E. Mr Imad Fakhoury. They discussed how the UK could assist Jordan in providing employment to Syrian refugees.<sup>341</sup>

On 20 January 2016, Prime Minister Cameron encouraged members of the European Union to relax trade rules with Jordan to allow greater access to its market.<sup>342</sup> He stressed that an economically

https://www.supportingsyria2016.com/news/156-2/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>336</sup> Turkey's Response to the Syrian Refugee Crisis and the Road Ahead, World Bank Group (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www-

wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/WDSP/IB/2015/12/21/090224b083ed7485/1\_0/Rendered/PD F/Turkey0s0respo0s0and0the0road0ahead.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>337</sup> Turkey's Response to the Syrian Refugee Crisis and the Road Ahead, World Bank Group (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www-

wds.worldbank.org/external/default/WDSContentServer/WDSP/IB/2015/12/21/090224b083ed7485/1\_0/Rendered/PD F/Turkey0s0respo0s0and0the0road0ahead.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>338</sup> EU strikes deal with Turkey to send back refugees (Brussels) 18 March 2016. Access Date: 22 April 2016.

http://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/mar/18/eu-strikes-deal-with-turkey-to-send-back-refugees-from-greece <sup>339</sup> A qualitative step closer to our goal, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 8 March 2016. Access Date: 22 April 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Reiseberichte/2016/2016-03-07-eu-tuerkeiginfel\_en\_html?np=709674

gipfel\_en.html?nn=709674 <sup>340</sup> Press Release: UK Prime Minister meets with Queen Rania of Jordan, Supporting Syria & the Region conference (London) 8 January 2016. Access Date: 18 February 2016. https://www.supportingsyria2016.com/news/uk-primeminister-david-cameron-meets-with-queen-rania-of-jordan/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>341</sup> Press Release: UK Secretary of State for International Development visits Jordan, Supporting Syria & the Region conference (London) 18 January 2016. Access Date: 18 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>342</sup> Press Release: UK Prime Minister urges European leaders to relax trade rules with Jordan, Supporting Syria & the Region conference (London) 20 January 2016. Access Date: 18 February 2016. https://www.supportingsyria2016.com/news/154-2/.

strong Jordan would provide more employment opportunities for Syrian refugees residing in Jordan.<sup>343</sup>

On 22 January 2016, International Development Secretary Justine Greening pledged GBP30 million to support the most vulnerable refugees who have arrived in Europe fleeing the Syrian conflict.<sup>344</sup>

On 28 January 2016, Prime Minister Cameron called on King Salman of Saudi Arabia, German Chancellor Angela Merkel, and Norwegian Prime Minister Erna Solberg to discuss the agenda for the Supporting Syria and the Region conference to be held in London on 4 February 2016. They identified the importance of maintaining a strong regional economy in the Middle East to help Syrian refugees develop sustainable livelihood.<sup>345</sup>

On 30 January 2016, the UK government announced that it would double its donations to United Nations International Children's Emergency Fund (UNICEF) UK's Syria Winter Appeal by the end of February to provide essential life support to Syrian refugees in winter.<sup>346</sup> The UK had already committed to match donations to UNICEF UK's Syria Winter Appeal, expiring on 31 January 2016 however, this new announcement also extended the commitment for another month.<sup>347</sup>

On 31 January 2016, the International Development Secretary Justine Greening called on world leaders to make efforts in providing education for Syrian refugee children in the region. She stressed the importance of education and urged leaders to pledge more donations at the Supporting Syria and the Region conference.<sup>348</sup>

On 1 February 2016, Prime Minister Cameron spoke with Emir of Qatar His Highness Sheikh Tamim and Canadian Prime Minister Justin Trudeau to discuss the upcoming Supporting Syria and the Region conference. They both agreed to send delegates to the conference and both agreed to pledge support.<sup>349</sup> On 3 February 2016, Prime Minister Cameron extended the conversation to

https://www.supportingsyria2016.com/news/154-2/.

<sup>346</sup> Press Release: UK government makes public support for UNICEF UK Syria appeal go twice as far, Supporting Syria & the Region conference (London) 30 January 2016. Access Date: 19 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>343</sup> Press Release: UK Prime Minister urges European leaders to relax trade rules with Jordan, Supporting Syria & the Region conference (London) 20 January 2016. Access Date: 18 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>344</sup> Press Release: Justine Greening announces £30 million in support for refugees arriving in Europe in Winter, Department for International Development and The Rt Hon Justine Greening MP (London) 22 January 2016. Access Date: 19 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/justine-greening-announces-30-million-in-support-forrefugees-arriving-in-europe-in-winter.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>345</sup> Press Release: David Cameron calls leaders to discuss London Conference, Supporting Syria & the Region conference (London) 28 January 2016. Access Date: 19 February 2016.

https://www.supportingsyria2016.com/news/david-cameron-calls-leaders-to-discuss-london-conference/.

https://www.supportingsyria2016.com/news/uk-government-makes-public-support-unicef-uk-syria-appeal-go-twice-far/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>347</sup> Press Release: UK government makes public support for UNICEF UK Syria appeal go twice as far, Supporting Syria & the Region conference (London) 30 January 2016. Access Date: 19 February 2016.

https://www.supportingsyria2016.com/news/uk-government-makes-public-support-unicef-uk-syria-appeal-go-twice-far/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>348</sup> Press Release, Justine Greening: no Syrian child should miss out on an education, Supporting Syria & the Region conference (London) 31 January 2016. Access Date: 19 February 2016.

https://www.supportingsyria2016.com/news/justine-greening-no-syrian-child-should-miss-out-on-an-education/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>349</sup> Press Release: David Cameron calls with the Emir of Qatar and the Prime Minister of Canada, Supporting Syria & the Region conference (London) 1 February 2016. Access Date: 19 February 2016.

https://www.supportingsyria 2016.com/news/david-cameron-calls-with-the-emir-of-qatar-and-the-prime-minister-of-canada/.

United States President Barack Obama, who also agreed to pledge strong support at the conference.<sup>350</sup>

On 4 February 2016, the UK co-hosted the Supporting Syria and the Region conference in London with Germany, Norway, Kuwait, and the United Nations to fundraise money for Syrian IDPs and search for solutions to create stability, employment and education in the region.<sup>351</sup>

On 4 February 2016, Prime Minister Cameron attended the Supporting Syria and the Region and pledged a donation of USD730 million for the year 2016 and USD120 million for the year 2017 to the UNHCR to help refugees affected by the Syrian crisis.<sup>352</sup>

On 4 February 2016, Prime Minister Cameron pledged to donate GBP1.2 billion in international aid to Syria and the region in addition to the GBP1.2 billion that the United Kingdom had previously pledged. Both His Royal Highness the Prince of Wales and Prime Minister Cameron attended the conference reception.<sup>353</sup>

During the compliance period, the UK has taken actions to further strengthen its support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection for refugees and IDPs.

Thus, the United Kingdom has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Jinnan Li

#### United States: +1

The United States fully complied with its commitment to strengthen its support for direct and indirect efforts to provide protection to refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

On 23 November 2015, the US government pledged USD4 million in humanitarian assistance for Sahrawi refugees after flooding in the Sahrawi camp in Tindouf, Algeria.<sup>354</sup> This contribution will assist the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR), World Food Program, and UN Children's Fund<sup>355</sup> in their efforts to rebuild infrastructure and replace food rations.<sup>356</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>350</sup> Press Release: David Cameron calls President Obama to discuss London Conference, Supporting Syria & the Region conference (London) 3 February 2016. Access Date: 19 February 2016.

https://www.supportingsyria2016.com/news/david-cameron-call-with-president-obama/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>351</sup> Press Release: UK to invest an extra £1.2 billion supporting Syria and the region, Supporting Syria & the Region conference (London) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 19 February 2016.

https://www.supportingsyria2016.com/news/uk-to-invest-an-extra-1-2-billion-supporting-syria-and-the-region/. <sup>352</sup> Annex: Co-host's statement annex: fundraising, Supporting Syria & the Region conference (London) 8 February 2016. Access Date: 18 February 2016. https://www.supportingsyria2016.com/news/co-hosts-statemtent-annex-fundraising/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>353</sup> Press Release: UK to invest an extra £1.2 billion supporting Syria and the region, Supporting Syria & the Region conference (London) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 19 February 2016.

https://www.supportingsyria2016.com/news/uk-to-invest-an-extra-1-2-billion-supporting-syria-and-the-region/. <sup>354</sup> Media Note: The U.S. Announces Additional Humanitarian Assistance for Sahrawi Refugees in Response to Severe

Floods, The White House, Office of the Spokesperson (Washington) 23 November 2015. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2015/11/249915.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>355</sup> Media Note: The U.S. Announces Additional Humanitarian Assistance for Sahrawi Refugees in Response to Severe Floods, The White House, Office of the Spokesperson (Washington) 23 November 2015. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2015/11/249915.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>356</sup> Media Note: The U.S. Announces Additional Humanitarian Assistance for Sahrawi Refugees in Response to Severe Floods, The White House, Office of the Spokesperson (Washington) 23 November 2015. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2015/11/249915.htm.

On 4 December 2015, the US government pledged approximately USD24 million in humanitarian assistance for the UNHCR to assist refugees across Europe to overcome the onset of winter.<sup>357</sup>

On 13 January 2016 Secretary of State John Kerry announced a new plan to expand the US Refugee Admissions Program to include refugees from El Salvador, Guatemala, and Honduras.<sup>358</sup> The plan involves collaborating with the UN to create safe centres in neighbouring Central American countries to process refugees and spare them the journey to US borders.<sup>359</sup> The discussions to determine the countries that might host these centres remain in progress.<sup>360</sup>

On 4 February 2016, the US government announced a contribution of approximately USD601 million in humanitarian assistance for IDPs in and refugees from Syria.<sup>361</sup> The funds will support the UN and other organizations to provide Syrians with "food, shelter, water, medical care, humanitarian protection, and other urgent relief."<sup>362</sup> On the same day, the US also pledged USD290 million in developmental assistance to Jordan and Lebanon to improve access to education for students, including Syrian refugees.<sup>363</sup>

On 10 March 2016, the US pledged over USD31 million in response to the political crisis in Burundi, to assist "refugees from Burundi, Congolese refugees living in Burundi, and others in Burundi who are food insecure." <sup>364</sup> The contribution includes over USD23 million for the UNHCR Burundi Situation Emergency Appeal and over USD8 million for the UN World Food Program. <sup>365</sup> The funding will be used to supply refugees in the DRC, Rwanda, Tanzania, Uganda, and Zambia with healthcare, shelter, clean water, and programs to protect children and to address gender-based violence. <sup>366</sup>

On 28 March 2016, the US pledged USD20 million to help the UNHCR, the United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA), and the International Federation of Red Cross (IFRC), to offer increased protection, shelter, and emergency assistance to refugees in Europe. <sup>367</sup> This figure included

http://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2016/03/254606.htm.

http://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2016/03/254606.htm.

<sup>366</sup> United States To Provide Additional \$31 Million To Support Humanitarian Assistance for Burundi Crisis, Office of the Spokesperson (Washington), 10 March 2016. Date accessed: 22 April 2016.

http://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2016/03/254606.htm.

<sup>367</sup> The United States Provides an Additional \$20 Million in Response to Europe Refugee and Migration Crisis, Office of the Spokesperson (Washington), 28 March 2016. Date accessed: 22 April 2016.

http://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2016/03/255212.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>357</sup> Media Note: U.S. Pledges Additional Humanitarian Assistance for Refugees and Migrants in Europe, The White House, Office of the Spokesperson (Washington) 4 December 2015. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2015/12/250346.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>358</sup> Fact Sheet: Refugee Resettlement in the United States, Office of the Spokesperson (Washington) 13 January 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2016/01/251176.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>359</sup> U.N. to Help U.S. Screen Central American Migrants, Julia Preston, David M. Herszenhorn and Michael D. Shear, The New York Times, 12 January 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.nytimes.com/2016/01/13/us/politics/un-to-help-us-screen-central-american-migrants.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>360</sup> U.N. to Help U.S. Screen Central American Migrants, Julia Preston, David M. Herszenhorn and Michael D. Shear, The New York Times, 12 January 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.nytimes.com/2016/01/13/us/politics/un-to-help-us-screen-central-american-migrants.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>361</sup> Fact Sheet: New U.S. Assistance to Respond to Syria Crisis, Office of the Spokesperson (Washington) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2016/02/252113.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>362</sup> Fact Sheet: New U.S. Assistance to Respond to Syria Crisis, Office of the Spokesperson (Washington) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2016/02/252113.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>363</sup> Fact Sheet: New U.S. Assistance to Respond to Syria Crisis, Office of the Spokesperson (Washington) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2016/02/252113.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>364</sup> United States To Provide Additional \$31 Million To Support Humanitarian Assistance for Burundi Crisis, Office of the Spokesperson (Washington), 10 March 2016. Date accessed: 22 April 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>365</sup> United States To Provide Additional \$31 Million To Support Humanitarian Assistance for Burundi Crisis, Office of the Spokesperson (Washington), 10 March 2016. Date accessed: 22 April 2016.

USD17.5 million for the UNHCR's Regional Refugee and Migrant Response Plan for Europe, USD2 million for the IFRC's revised Emergency Appeal for Greece, and USD500 thousand for the UNFPA's Initial Response Plan for Refugee and Migrant Women and Girls in South-Eastern Europe.<sup>368</sup>

The US has increased direct and indirect support for the protection of refugees.

Thus, the United States has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Maria Alexiou

#### European Union: 0

The European Union has partially complied with its commitment to further strengthen support for all direct and indirect efforts to provide protection to refugees and internally displaced persons (IDPs).

On 24 November 2015, the EU announced the creation of a Facility for Refugees in Turkey to coordinate a total amount of EUR3 billion for 2016-2017 to provide new financial resources from both the EU budget and from assigned revenues of Member States to ensure that the needs of refugees and host communities are addressed in a comprehensive and coordinated manner in Turkey. The creation of the Facility for Refugees in Turkey thus represents a substantial increase of EU funding for refugees in the country compared to previous levels.<sup>369</sup>

On 25 November 2015, the European Commission announced it would quadruple its current funding for education in emergencies to 4 per cent of the EU's humanitarian aid budget.<sup>370</sup>

On 16 December 2015, the European Commission adopted its humanitarian aid budget for 2016. With nearly EUR1.1 billion as an initial allocation, it is the highest EU humanitarian budget for lifesaving relief in manmade and natural disasters to date. In keeping with guidance of the European Council of 23 September 2015, the budget includes a further EUR300 million to address the essential needs of people affected by crisis in Syria and Iraq. Together with EUR200 million already contracted in 2015, the Commission will thereby have delivered on its commitment to provide an extra EUR500 million over 2015-16 to help meet the humanitarian needs of the refugee crisis.<sup>371</sup>

On 19 December 2015, the European Commission released EUR13 million in emergency funding to Serbia and Macedonia for refugee support.<sup>372</sup> Throughout December 2015, it granted further emergency funding packages to Sweden, Finland, and Belgium.<sup>373</sup>

On 4 March 2016, the EU announced its first projects under the Facility for Refugees in Turkey programme, pledging EUR95 million in education and humanitarian assistance to Syrian refugees in Turkey.<sup>374</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>368</sup> The United States Provides an Additional \$20 Million in Response to Europe Refugee and Migration Crisis, Office of the Spokesperson (Washington), 28 March 2016. Date accessed: 22 April 2016.

http://www.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2016/03/255212.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>369</sup> EU-Turkey Cooperation: A €3 billion Refugee Facility for Turkey, European Comission 24 November 2015. Access Date: 04 July 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-15-6162\_en.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>370</sup> EU to support over 2,300,000 children in 42 countries with education in emergency situations, European Comission 5 April 2016. Acess Date: 4 July 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-16-1224\_en.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>371</sup> Record EU humanitarian budget adopted for 2016, European Commission 16 December 2015. Access Date: 04 July 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-15-6336\_en.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>372</sup> Refugee Crisis: New €13 million in humanitarian aid for refugees in Western Balkans, European Commission Migration and Home Affairs. 19 December 2015. Access Date: 3 March 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/dgs/home-affairs/what-is-new/news/2015/20151210\_2\_en.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>373</sup> Refugee Crisis: European Commission awards €35 million to Sweden, €8 million to Finland and €5 million to Belgium in emergency funding, European Commission Migration and Home Affairs. 23 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/dgs/home-affairs/what-is-new/news/news/2015/20151223\_1\_en.htmv.

On 18 February 2016, the EU agreed to provide humanitarian assistance to the countries neighbouring Syria and stressed the need to take immediate actions.<sup>375</sup>

In March 2016, representatives from the EU and Turkey made an agreement to halt the flow of refugees and migrants traveling to Europe via Turkey. The plan stipulates that for each refugee from Syria sent back to Turkey, a Syrian already in Turkey will be resettled in a European Union country, with Turkey receiving extra funding from the European Union.<sup>376</sup> While the EU has strengthened several other aspects of support, halting the flow of refugees represents a substantial weakening of direct support.

On 18 March 2016, Turkish Prime Minister Ahmet Davuto lu signed an agreement with the EU.<sup>377</sup> The agreement stated that all irregular migrants travelling from Turkey to Greece would be returned to Turkey with expenses paid by the EU and that for every Syrian returned to Turkey, a Syrian from Turkey would be resettled in an EU member state.<sup>378</sup>

The EU has not made significant progress to meet self-determined targets for the relocation and resettlement of refugees. In 2015, the EU committed to relocate 160,000 asylum and to resettle over 22,000 people in need of international protection within two years. As of 10 June 2016, only 2280 asylum seekers have been relocated and only 7,272 people have been resettled.<sup>379</sup>

The EU has strengthen financial support to provide protection to refugee and IDPs, however the EU is far from meeting its targets to provide direct support by means of resettlement and relocation.

Thus, European Union has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Daniel Bodirsky

<sup>377</sup> EU strikes deal with Turkey to send back refugees (Brussels) 18 March 2016. Access Date: 22 April 2016.
 http://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/mar/18/eu-strikes-deal-with-turkey-to-send-back-refugees-from-greece
 <sup>378</sup> A qualitative step closer to our goal, Federal Government of Germany (Berlin) 8 March 2016. Access Date: 22 April 2016. https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Reiseberichte/2016/2016-03-07-eu-tuerkei-gipfel\_en.html?nn=709674

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>374</sup> EU announces first projects under the Facility for Refugees in Turkey: €95 million to be provided for immediate educational and humanitarian assistance, European Commission Migration and Home Affairs. 4 March 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/dgs/home-affairs/what-is-new/news/news/2016/20160304\_2\_en.htm. <sup>375</sup> Press Release: European Council Conclusions on Migration, European Union (Brussels) 18 February 2016. Access

Date 25 February 2016. http://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/press/press-releases/2016/02/18-euco-conclusionsmigration/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>376</sup> Statement of the EU Heads of State or Government, 07/03/2016, European Council Council of the European Union. Access Date: 09 March 2016. http://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/press/press-releases/2016/03/07-eu-turkeymeeting-statement/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>379</sup> Relocation and resettlement State of Play, European Commission 15 June 2016. Access Date: 04 July 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/dgs/home-affairs/what-we-do/policies/european-agenda-migration/backgroundinformation/docs/20160615/factsheet\_relocation\_and\_resettlement\_-\_state\_of\_play\_en.pdf

# **3.** Macroeconomics: Fiscal Policies

"We reiterate our commitment to implement fiscal policies flexibly to take into account near-term economic conditions, so as to support growth and job creation, while putting debt as a share of GDP on a sustainable path."

G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Argentina		0	-
Australia			+1
Brazil			+1
Canada		0	
China		0	
France		0	
Germany			+1
India		0	
Indonesia		0	
Italy			+1
Japan		0	
Korea		0	
Mexico		0	
Russia		0	
Saudi Arabia		0	
South Africa			+1
Turkey		0	
United Kingdom		0	
United States		0	
European Union		0	
Average		+0.25	

## Assessment

## Background

At the 2013 St. Petersburg Summit, G20 leaders agreed to develop and implement "Comprehensive Growth Strategies." G20 leaders presented peer-reviewed strategies as part of the 2014 Brisbane Action Plan, acknowledging that these strategies represented a key mechanism through which global economic recovery could be achieved. In February 2014, the finance ministers and central bank governors indicated that adherence to this commitment by G20 countries, rather than reliance on existing macroeconomic policies, would raise the collective gross domestic product (GDP) by more than 2 per cent over the next five years. Subsequent analysis by the International Monetary Fund and the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development revealed that this increase in collective GDP would be closer to 2.1 per cent, attributing a quarter of the increase to positive spillovers to the global economy resulting from simultaneous implementation of policies.

On 15-16 November 2014, G20 leaders at the Brisbane Summit acknowledged that recovery from the global financial crisis remained uneven, hampered by "weak cyclical recovery…weakened productive capacity in key economies, and a legacy of vulnerabilities from the financial crisis." G20 leaders reaffirmed the need for a concerted effort towards strong, sustainable and balanced growth, and agreed that implementing flexible fiscal strategies, which take into consideration national economic circumstances, are key to recovery and job creation.

On 15-16 November 2015, G20 leaders at the Antalya Summit renewed their commitment to "fully implement our comprehensive growth strategies in a timely manner, as well as all our past

commitments, to move towards our overarching objective of strong, sustainable and balanced growth." Many members "updated their St. Petersburg fiscal strategy as part of their growth strategy for the Brisbane Summit and their adjusted growth strategy for the Antalya Summit taking into account policy development, short-term growth and inflation developments."

## **Commitment Features**

This commitment is based on achieving fiscal sustainability through the implementation of sound economic policy measures, tailored to the specific objectives and circumstances of each country. Specifically, this commitment recognizes that each country will have different priorities, dictated by their individual economic circumstances. During the 2014 Brisbane Summit, each G20 country submitted individual Comprehensive Growth Strategies, which describe each country's fiscal policy objectives. Adjusted growth strategies were submitted ahead of the Antalya Summit. The objectives outlined in the growth strategies have taken into account each country's near-term economic conditions, which is evident in the variance — in strength and nature — of policy commitments across countries. Moreover, each country's comprehensive growth strategy outlines measures within their fiscal objectives that address putting debt-to-GDP ratios on a sustainable path.

Therefore, for the purpose of this report, the fiscal policy objectives within the individual country Comprehensive Growth Strategies will provide the basis for assessing country compliance. Each individual country report below will begin by identifying the fiscal policy objectives outlined in each comprehensive growth strategy. The report will then assess compliance based on any actions taken by each member to fulfill the stated fiscal policy objectives. Full compliance will be awarded to G20 members that have taken actions towards implementing all their stated fiscal policy objectives within their individual growth strategies.

## **Scoring Guidelines**

-1	Member has made NO progress towards implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy.
0	Member has made SOME progress towards implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy.
+1	Member has implemented ALL fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy.

Lead Analyst: Alessandra Harkness

## Argentina: 0

Argentina has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

Argentina outlined the following fiscal strategies in its comprehensive growth strategy:

- Increase the production of oil, gas and refined fuels and boosting hydroelectric power through the building of two large dams;
- Increase employment, improve workers' skills and fight against informality in employment;
- Raise pension coverage with the goal of augmenting it to benefit 100 per cent of people who reach retirement age;
- Increase capacity and improve performance of the main freight railway in Argentina;
- Reinforce the Central Bank's policies to increase the level of financing available for small and medium sized enterprises and less developed regions through different mechanisms and incentives.<sup>380</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>380</sup> Comprehensive Growth Strategy: Argentina, Australia 2014 G20 (Brisbane), 15 November 2014. Access Date: 3 March 2016. http://www.g20australia.org/official\_resources/current\_presidency/growth\_strategies.

On 1 December 2015, construction for a hydroelectric dam in Patagonia began.<sup>381</sup> This dam is expected to have an installed capacity of 1.7 gigawatts and will be the largest dam contained in one country.<sup>382</sup> The dam is expected to bring jobs to the region and grow the size of the town.<sup>383</sup>

On 18 December 2015, President Mauricio Macri, Vice President Gabriela Michetti, Minister of Treasury and Finance Alfonso Prat-Gay, and Minister of Interior Affairs, Public Works and Housing Rogelio Frigerio met with Luis Alberto Moreno Mejía, the President of Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) at Government House to reach an agreement.<sup>384</sup> At the conference, they committed ARS5 billion pesos to be released over the next four years to support development. This money will be spent on infrastructure and social assistance to move Argentina towards a nation with zero poverty.<sup>385</sup> These projects include, but are not limited to, modernizing state facilities and alleviating early childhood poverty.

On 2 February 2016, the Minister of Treasury and Finance, Alfonso Prat-Gay, and the Governor of Cordoba, Juan Schiaretti, sealed an addendum to the Framework Convention on financing ARS540 million signed in April 2015 in order to rebuild infrastructure in the region.<sup>386</sup> The loan is intended for infrastructure projects needed to cope with the economic and social impact of intense storms, such as the storm in the Sierras Chicas of February 2015.<sup>387</sup>

On 15 February 2016, Minister of Treasury and Finance, Alfonso Prat-Gary, travelled to Tucuman, Argentina to meet with local leaders and present a plan focused on job creation and local development for Argentina's Northern regions. The minister stated that during his trip he wanted to gain a greater understanding of the challenges small and medium sized businesses face. Further, Minister Prat-Gay was looking for ways to improve the Belgrano Plan, which is a multifaceted government plan to alleviate poverty and improve infrastructure. The Belgrano Plan was announced during Mauricio Macri's presidential campaign in October 2015.<sup>388</sup>

On 20 February 2016, President Macri said the increase in the income tax floor announced on 18 February 2016 will not be followed quickly by tax bracket modifications, which have not been updated since 2000, noting the change would only be implemented in 2017 following a debate in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>381</sup> Argentina leader leaves controversial legacy with Patagonia dams project, The Guardian (London) 1 December 2015. Access Date: 3 March 2016. http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/dec/01/argentina-president-cristina-fernandezde-kirchner-patagonia-hydroelectric-dam-project.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>382</sup> Argentina leader leaves controversial legacy with Patagonia dams project, The Guardian (London) 1 December 2015.
 Access Date: 3 March 2016. http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/dec/01/argentina-president-cristina-fernandez-de-kirchner-patagonia-hydroelectric-dam-project
 <sup>383</sup> Argentina leader leaves controversial legacy with Patagonia dams project, The Guardian (London) 1 December 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>383</sup> Argentina leader leaves controversial legacy with Patagonia dams project, The Guardian (London) 1 December 2015. Access Date: 3 March 2016. http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/dec/01/argentina-president-cristina-fernandezde-kirchner-patagonia-hydroelectric-dam-project.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>384</sup> Press: The Argentina the IDB support for infrastructure and social assistance, Ministry of Finance (Buenos Aires) 18 December 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.economia.gob.ar/apoyo-del-bid-a-la-argentina-parainfraestructura-y-ayuda-social/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>385</sup> Press: The Argentina the IDB support for infrastructure and social assistance, Ministry of Finance (Buenos Aires) 18 December 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.economia.gob.ar/apoyo-del-bid-a-la-argentina-parainfraestructura-y-ayuda-social/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>386</sup> Press: The Government speeds up a financing agreement for \$540 million with Córdoba to rebuild infrastructure damaged by the storm of 2015, Ministry of Finance (Buenos Aires) 2 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.economia.gob.ar/el-gobierno-agiliza-un-convenio-de-financiamiento-por-540-millones-con-cordoba-para-reconstruir-la-infraestructura-danada-por-el-temporal-de-2015/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>387</sup> Press: The Government speeds up a financing agreement for \$540 million with Córdoba to rebuild infrastructure damaged by the storm of 2015, Ministry of Finance (Buenos Aires) 2 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.economia.gob.ar/el-gobierno-agiliza-un-convenio-de-financiamiento-por-540-millones-con-cordoba-para-reconstruir-la-infraestructura-danada-por-el-temporal-de-2015/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>388</sup> Prat-Gay visited Tucuman with an agenda focused on job creation and local development, Ministry of Finance (Buenos Aires) 15 February 2016. Access Date: 3 March 2016.

Congress.<sup>389</sup> Macri asked "everybody" to understand that inflation has to decrease and in order to do that the government's "spending must be reduced."<sup>390</sup>

On 1 March 2016, Minister of Treasury and Finance Alfonso Prat-Gay announced that Argentina had reached an agreement with creditors to cancel sovereign debt to allow Argentina to start growing. He said that this was "the first time in 15 years Argentina begins to definitely leave the default."<sup>391</sup>

Argentina has made some progress towards implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy. While Argentina has taken some actions, it has not yet adopted specific policies to boost oil production, increase employment, bolster pension coverage, or improve the business environment for Small and Medium-sized Enterprises (SMEs). They have made investments in their two hydroelectric dam projects and undergone efforts to reduce their debt.

Thus, Argentina has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Jiayang Shan

## Australia: +1

Australia has fully complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

Australia outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Boost infrastructure investment through the AUD50 billion Infrastructure Investment Programme, which includes the Infrastructure Growth Package and the Northern Australia Infrastructure Facility.
- Grow jobs and small business through the AUD5.5 billion Growing Jobs and Small Business Package that includes AUD5 billion in tax relief for small businesses.
- Support labour force participation through the AUD4.4 billion Families Package that will improve access to child care, as well as education and training reforms.
- Improve competition through reducing regulatory and administrative burdens, including by reducing red tape by AUD1 billion every year.
- Contribute to global trade liberalization by implementing free trade agreements (FTAs) with China, Korea and Japan and pursuing FTAs with other regional partners.<sup>392</sup>

On 20 December 2015, the China-Australia Free Trade Agreement (ChAFTA) entered into force. The first round of tariff cuts occurred with its initiation and a second round of cuts was scheduled for 1 January 2016.<sup>393</sup>

On 1 January 2016, the Australian government commenced a AUD250 million Interim Home Based Career Pilot Programme. This programme is targeted to assist shift workers whose irregular hours

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>389</sup> Macri: no changes to income tax brackets, Buenos Aires Herald (Buenos Aires) 20 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://buenosairesherald.com/article/209120/macri-no-changes-to-income-tax-brackets.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>390</sup> Macri: no changes to income tax brackets, Buenos Aires Herald (Buenos Aires) 20 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://buenosairesherald.com/article/209120/macri-no-changes-to-income-tax-brackets

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>391</sup> The Argentine government reached an agreement with holdouts to cancel the sovereignty debt. Ministry of Finance (Buenos Aires) 1 March 2015. Access Date: 3 March 2016. http://www.economia.gob.ar/el-gobierno-argentino-llego-a-un-acuerdo-con-holdouts-para-cancelar-la-deuda-soberana/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>392</sup> Adjusted Growth Strategy: Australia, G20 Turkey 2015 (Antalya) 15 - 16 November 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2015. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-Australia.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>393</sup> Historic China-Australia FTA Enters into Force, Minister for Trade and Investment (Canberra) 20 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://trademinister.gov.au/releases/Pages/2015/ar\_mr\_151220a.aspx?w=O%2F%2FeXE%2BIYc3HpsIRhVl0XA%3D%3 D.

make it hard for them to access traditional child care and will fund approximately 4,000 nannies, providing subsidized care to approximately 10,000 children.<sup>394</sup>

On 4 February 2016, Minister for Trade and Investment Andrew Robb formally signed the Trans Pacific Partnership Agreement, which will see the elimination of 98 per cent of tariffs among 12 countries.<sup>395</sup>

Australia has implemented all fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy.

Thus, Australia has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Lauren Dalgliesh

#### Brazil: +1

Brazil has fully complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

Brazil outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Fiscal consolidation to support economic growth and fiscal sustainability;
- Rebalance expenditures from concurrent expenses toward investment, and boosting investment in infrastructure;
- Increase market productivity, boosting youth employment and making it easier to open and operate Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs);
- Advance trade facilitation.<sup>396</sup>

On 24 February 2016, Moody's downgraded Brazil's sovereign rating by two steps to Ba2.<sup>397</sup> Moreover, it projected that more downgrades were likely to take place in the future. Indeed, annual inflation rates in Brazil are at their highest in more than a decade.<sup>398</sup>

On 26 February 2016, the Brazilian government proposed a pension and tax reform for the purpose of imposing a growth limit to public spending.<sup>399</sup> Furthermore, it reemphasized the importance of further structural reforms and expressed its desire to continue its commitment to such reforms.<sup>400</sup> On 25 February 2015, Brazil announced a monthly surplus of BRL14.835 billion — the highest for the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>394</sup> Healthy Families and Flexible Care, Budget 2015 Overview (Canberra) 12 May 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.budget.gov.au/2015-16/content/overview/download/Budget-2015-Overview.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>395</sup> Robb Signs historic Trans Pacific Trade Pact (TPP) in New Zealand, Minister for Trade and Investment (Canberra) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://trademinister.gov.au/releases/Pages/2016/ar\_mr\_160204.aspx?w=0%2F%2FeXE%2BIYc3HpsIRhVl0XA%3D%3D. <sup>396</sup> Comprehensive Growth Strategy: Brazil, G20 Turkey 2015 (Antalya) November 2015. Access: 26 February 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-Brazil.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>397</sup> Brazil Credit Ratings Cut to Junk by Moody's, Bloomberg Business (New York) 24 February 2016. Access: 26 February 2016. http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2016-02-24/brazil-downgraded-to-junk-by-moody-s-with-negative-outlook.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>398</sup> Brazil Credit Ratings Cut to Junk by Moody's, Bloomberg Business (New York) 24 February 2016. Access: 26 February 2016. http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2016-02-24/brazil-downgraded-to-junk-by-moody-s-with-negative-outlook.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>399</sup> Minister emphasizes the importance of structural reforms for sustainable growth, Ministry of Finance (Brasilia) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://fazenda.gov.br/noticias/2016/fevereiro/ministro-ressalta-aimportancia-de-reformas-estruturais-para-crescimento-duradouro.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>400</sup> Minister emphasizes the importance of structural reforms for sustainable growth, Ministry of Finance (Brasilia) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://fazenda.gov.br/noticias/2016/fevereiro/ministro-ressalta-aimportancia-de-reformas-estruturais-para-crescimento-duradouro.

month since 2013, and the first positive result since April of 2015. It also announced a real growth of 28 per cent in the balance of its national treasury, and alluded to future structural reform.<sup>401</sup>

On 25 January 2016, the Brazilian government adopted a greener and more efficient energy plan by shutting down thermal plants with prohibitively expensive operating costs.<sup>402</sup> This has been projected to yield a six to seven per cent decrease in the average consumer's electricity bill starting in April of 2016.<sup>403</sup>

On 24 February 2016, Brazil announced a government concession of BRL3.58 billion for the building of federal roads.<sup>404</sup> This concession is part of the Logistics Investment Program, the purpose of which is to expand Brazil's transport infrastructure.<sup>405</sup> On 16 December 2015, the Brazilian government announced an investment of BRL103 million towards the expansion of subway and tramway networks.<sup>406</sup>

On 18 February 2016, Idilvan Alecar, President of the National Fund for Education Development, presented a series of technologically enhanced expansion modules for nurseries and preschools.<sup>407</sup> Alecar asserts that these modules, in quickening construction and lowering cost of nurseries and preschools, will advance the first target of Brazil's National Economic Plan.<sup>408</sup>

On 11 February 2016, the Brazilian government announced the transfer of BRL11.83 billion to the country's education allowance, representing an increase of 3.3 per cent from the 2015 allowance.<sup>409</sup> On 22 February 2016, Brazil announced the creation of 4,000 jobs to be offered in the Youth Program of Post Apprenticeships. The program, which offers 20 hours of learning opportunities and a salary of BRL413.33, aims at developing the familiarity and effectiveness of students in the workplace.<sup>410</sup>

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>401</sup> Central government has a primary surplus of R \$ 14.8 billion in January, Ministry of Finance (Brasilia) 25 February
 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://fazenda.gov.br/noticias/2016/fevereiro/governo-central-apresenta-superavit-primario-de-r-14-8-bi-em-janeiro.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>402</sup> Electricity bill will be cheaper from April, Portal Brazil (Brasilia) 25 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.brasil.gov.br/infraestrutura/2016/02/conta-de-luz-ficara-mais-barata-a-partir-de-abril.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>403</sup> Electricity bill will be cheaper from April, Portal Brazil (Brasilia) 25 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016.
 http://www.brasil.gov.br/infraestrutura/2016/02/conta-de-luz-ficara-mais-barata-a-partir-de-abril.
 <sup>404</sup> BNDES approves R \$ 3.58 billion for concession of federal roads, Portal Brazil (Brasilia) 24 February 2016. Access

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>404</sup> BNDES approves R \$ 3.58 billion for concession of federal roads, Portal Brazil (Brasilia) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.brasil.gov.br/infraestrutura/2016/02/bndes-aprova-r-3-58-bi-para-concessionaria-de-rodovias-federais.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>405</sup> BNDES approves R \$ 3.58 billion for concession of federal roads, Portal Brazil (Brasilia) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.brasil.gov.br/infraestrutura/2016/02/bndes-aprova-r-3-58-bi-para-concessionaria-de-rodovias-federais.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>406</sup> DF receives R \$ 103 million to expand subway and tramway, Portal Brazil (Brasilia) 16 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.brasil.gov.br/infraestrutura/2015/12/df-recebe-r-103-milhoes-para-expandir-metro-e-vlt.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>407</sup> New technology revolutionizes expansion of day care centers and preschools, Portal Brazil (Brasilia) 19 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.brasil.gov.br/educacao/2016/02/nova-tecnologia-revoluciona-ampliacao-de-creches-e-pre-escolas.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>408</sup> New technology revolutionizes expansion of day care centers and preschools, Portal Brazil (Brasilia) 19 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.brasil.gov.br/educacao/2016/02/nova-tecnologia-revolucionaampliacao-de-creches-e-pre-escolas.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>409</sup> Salary-education projects transfer of R \$ 11.8 billion to states and municipalities in 2016, Portal Brazil (Brasilia) 11 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.brasil.gov.br/educacao/2016/02/salario-educacao-projetarepasse-de-r-11-8-bi-a-estados-e-municipios-em-2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>410</sup> Post open positions for Young Apprentice throughout the country, Portal Brazil (Brasilia) 11 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.brasil.gov.br/economia-e-emprego/2016/02/correios-abrem-vagas-para-jovem-aprendiz-em-todo-o-pais.

On 18 February 2016, Brazil and Argentina have announced that they will relaunch their bilateral Trade Commission with the aim of developing productive and commercial integration.<sup>411</sup>

On 22 February 2016, Brazil's National Bank for Economic and Social Development expanded its financing of the export of capital goods and domestic consumer goods through launching the Exim Pre-shipment Innovative Company. These measures are directed at micro, small, and medium enterprises with annual revenues of up to BRL300 million.<sup>412</sup>

On 25 February 2016, the Brazilian government announced that its Consumer Confidence Index (CCI) rose for the second consecutive month. The rise of 2.1 points to 68.5 represents the highest value in CCI since August of 2015.<sup>413</sup>

Brazil has implemented all fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy. Brazil has shown progress in implementing fiscal consolidation to support economic growth and fiscal sustainability; in rebalancing expenditures towards investment, and boosting infrastructural investment; increasing market productivity, boosting youth employment, and making easier the operation of SMEs; and facilitating trade.

Thus, Brazil has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Michael Switzer

#### Canada: 0

Canada has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

Canada outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Help families and reduce taxes for the middle class;
- Create high quality jobs and improve sustainability through infrastructure investment;
- Invest in skills, training and innovation.<sup>414</sup>

On 30 November 2015, Prime Minister Justin Trudeau announced the launch of Mission Innovation, a clean technology initiative with 19 other countries and leading representatives from the private sector.<sup>415</sup> Canada will invest an additional CAD100 million each year in clean technology

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>411</sup> Brazil and Argentina decided to expand production and trade integration, Portal Brazil (Brasilia) 18 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.brasil.gov.br/economia-e-emprego/2016/02/brasil-e-argentina-retomamintegracao-produtiva-e-comercial.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>412</sup> New BNDES financing line stimulates export, Portal Brazil (Brasilia) 22 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.brasil.gov.br/economia-e-emprego/2016/02/nova-linha-de-financiamento-do-bndes-estimula-a-exportacao.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>413</sup> Consumer Confidence Index rises for the second consecutive month, Portal Brazil (Brasilia) 22 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.brasil.gov.br/economia-e-emprego/2016/02/indice-de-confianca-doconsumidor-sobe-pelo-segundo-mes-consecutivo.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>414</sup> Adjusted Growth Strategy: Canada, G20 Turkey 2015 (Antalya) 15 - 16 November 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2015. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-Canada.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>415</sup> Prime Minister Announces Action on Clean Jobs and Energy, Prime Minister of Canada Justin Trudeau (Ottawa) 30 November 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2015. http://pm.gc.ca/eng/news/2015/11/30/prime-minister-announcesaction-clean-jobs-and-energy.

production.<sup>416</sup> The government will also invest an additional CAD200 million each year to support innovation and the use of clean technologies in the natural resources sector.<sup>417</sup>

On 7 December 2015, Finance Minister Bill Morneau announced a tax cut aimed at the middle class that will benefit 9 million Canadians each year.<sup>418</sup> The personal income tax rate will be cut from 22 per cent to 20.5 per cent.<sup>419</sup> Single individuals who benefit will see an average tax reduction of CAD330 per year and couples who benefit will see an average tax reduction of CAD540 per year.<sup>420</sup> To fund this middle class tax cut, a new top personal income tax rate of 33 per cent for individual taxable incomes in excess of CAD200,000 was created.<sup>421</sup> Tax-Free Savings Account annual contribution limit will be lowered to CAD5,500 from CAD10,000. These tax changes will take effect on 1 January 2016.422

On 5 January 2016, Minister of International Trade Chrystia Freeland and the Minister of Small Business and Tourism Bardish Chagger announced a program, CanExport, which will provide CAD50 million to help Canadian small and medium-sized enterprises take advantage of the global export opportunities while creating jobs and growth in Canada.<sup>423</sup>

On 10 February 2016, Canada signed a Foreign Investment Promotion and Protection Agreement (FIPA) with Hong Kong.424

Canada has made some progress in implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy. Canada has implemented fiscal policies in tax reform, creating high quality jobs and funding innovation, but it has not made much progress addressing families, infrastructure investments or investments in skills and training.

Thus, Canada has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Lauren Dalgliesh

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>416</sup> Prime Minister Announces Action on Clean Jobs and Energy, Prime Minister of Canada Justin Trudeau (Ottawa) 30 November 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2015. http://pm.gc.ca/eng/news/2015/11/30/prime-minister-announcesaction-clean-jobs-and-energy.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>417</sup> Prime Minister Announces Action on Clean Jobs and Energy, Prime Minister of Canada Justin Trudeau (Ottawa) 30 November 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2015. http://pm.gc.ca/eng/news/2015/11/30/prime-minister-announcesaction-clean-jobs-and-energy. <sup>418</sup> Government of Canada Announces Tax Cut to Strengthen the Middle Class, Department of Finance Canada (Ottawa)

<sup>7</sup> December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.fin.gc.ca/n15/15-086-eng.asp.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>419</sup> Government of Canada Announces Tax Cut to Strengthen the Middle Class, Department of Finance Canada (Ottawa) 7 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.fin.gc.ca/n15/15-086-eng.asp.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>420</sup> Government of Canada Announces Tax Cut to Strengthen the Middle Class, Department of Finance Canada 7 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.fin.gc.ca/n15/15-086-eng.asp.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>421</sup> Government of Canada Announces Tax Cut to Strengthen the Middle Class, Department of Finance Canada (Ottawa) 7 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.fin.gc.ca/n15/15-086-eng.asp.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>422</sup> Government of Canada Announces Tax Cut to Strengthen the Middle Class, Department of Finance Canada (Ottawa) 7 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.fin.gc.ca/n15/15-086-eng.asp.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>423</sup> Ministers of International Trade and Small Business and Tourism Announce New Export Program for Canadian Companies, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 5 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://news.gc.ca/web/article-

en.do?crtr.sj1D=&crtr.mnthndVl=12&mthd=advSrch&crtr.dpt1D=6673&nid=1026739&crtr.lc1D=&crtr.tp1D=1&crtr.yrS trtVl=2016&crtr.kw=&crtr.dyStrtVl=1&crtr.aud1D=&crtr.mnthStrtVl=1&crtr.page=3&crtr.yrndVl=2016&crtr.dyndVl=31.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>424</sup> Canada and Hong Kong Sign Investment Agreement, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 10 February 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://news.gc.ca/web/article-

en.do;jsessionid=d1829dba364fc3f5e9af2b7ebcf9467f34c7bc0f0e5ea9c91434693d302dd7ee.e38RbhaLb3gNe3aPc3r0 ?crtr.sj1D=&crtr.mnthndVl=12&mthd=advSrch&crtr.dpt1D=6673&nid=1032989&crtr.lc1D=&crtr.tp1D=1&crtr.yrStrtVl= 2016&crtr.kw=&crtr.dyStrtVI=1&crtr.aud1D=&crtr.mnthStrtVI=1&crtr.page=1&crtr.yrndVI=2016&crtr.dyndVI=31.

# China: 0

China has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

China outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Keep economic growth within a proper range;
- Focus on quality improving and upgrading of the economy;
- Maintain price stability;
- Give high priority to improving people's wellbeing;
- Maintain basic balance of international payments.<sup>425</sup>

On 23 November 2015, the State Council of the People's Republic of China issued a guideline to boost consumption by bringing new opportunities for development in areas such as infrastructure and public services.<sup>426</sup> The guideline is aimed at "promoting consumption in care for the elderly"<sup>427</sup> and "encouraging people to spend more on education, culture, and sports."<sup>428</sup>

On 14 February 2016, the State Council called for the enhancement of research and development of drugs in urgent need and the acceleration of the industrialization of drugs for diseases.<sup>429</sup> It recognized the lack of innovative medicine in China that leads to patients seeking these drugs overseas and stressed the importance of development and industrialization of domestic pharmaceutical enterprises.<sup>430</sup>

On 16 February 2016, the People's Bank of China along with eight economic regulators released a guide for China to expand credit to industrial enterprises.<sup>431</sup> They will provide more support for "industries as they are being encouraged to transform themselves amid the country's industrial upgrades."<sup>432</sup>

On 17 February 2016, the State Council issued a guideline to provide more support for the poor to meet basic needs.<sup>433</sup> This guideline will allow eligible people to receive basic necessities from the government as well as basic care services as needed.<sup>434</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>425</sup> Adjusted Growth Strategy: China, G20 Turkey (Antalya) October 2015. Date of Access: 22 February 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-China.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>426</sup> State Council issues guideline to boost role of consumption, The State Council (Beijing) 23 November 2015. Date of Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://english.gov.cn/policies/latest\_releases/2015/11/23/content\_281475240632924.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>427</sup> State Council issues guideline to boost role of consumption, The State Council (Beijing) 23 November 2015. Date of Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://english.gov.cn/policies/latest\_releases/2015/11/23/content\_281475240632924.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>428</sup> State Council issues guideline to boost role of consumption, The State Council (Beijing) 23 November 2015. Date of Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://english.gov.cn/policies/latest\_releases/2015/11/23/content\_281475240632924.htm.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>429</sup> Pharmaceutical industry requires upgrade and innovation, The State Council 15 February 2016. Access Date: 22
 February 2016. http://english.gov.cn/policies/policy\_watch/2016/02/15/content\_281475290364118.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>430</sup> Pharmaceutical industry requires upgrade and innovation, The State Council 15 February 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://english.gov.cn/policies/policy\_watch/2016/02/15/content\_281475290364118.htm.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>431</sup> China to increase financial support for industrial upgrade, Xinhua (Beijing) 16 February 2016. Access Date: 22
 February 2016. http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/2016-02/16/c\_135103898.htm.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>432</sup> China to increase financial support for industrial upgrade, Xinhua (Beijing) 16 February 2016. Access Date: 22
 February 2016. http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/2016-02/16/c\_135103898.htm.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>433</sup> China to increase financial support for industrial upgrade, Xinhua (Beijing) 16 February 2016. Access Date: 22
 February 2016. http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/2016-02/16/c\_135103898.htm.

On 17 February 2016, the State Council executive meeting concluded that regulations needed to be relaxed for scientific and technical research achievements so they could be transferred from national research institutions to enterprises.<sup>435</sup> This decision is intended to accelerate the process of scientific findings and to promote scientific innovation.<sup>436</sup>

On 22 February 2016, the Political Bureau of the Communist Party of China's Central Committee pledged to "stabilize and improve macro policies to create an amicable environment for economic growth and ongoing structural reforms."<sup>437</sup>

China has made some progress towards implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy. China has implemented several policies to support growth, improve the economy, and improve people's wellbeing but it has not implemented policies to keep economic growth in proper range, maintain price stability, or maintain a basic balance of international payments.

Thus, China has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Doris Li

# France: 0

France has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

France outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Lower the cost of factors of production to stimulate employment and improve business competitiveness;
- Improve labour market functioning and increase incentives to take up jobs;
- Adapt goods and services market regulations to allow for productivity gains and lower consumer prices and to boost business competitiveness gains;
- Support productive investment to increase long-term growth;
- Simplify administrative formalities for businesses;<sup>438</sup>

On 18 January 2016, France's President François Hollande announced a two-year USD2.2 billion plan aiming to subsidize the hiring of 500,000 people.<sup>439</sup>

On 3 February 2016, the Conseil de la simplification pour les entreprises — the Council for the Simplification of Business Procedures introduced 90 measures for the simplification of business activities, including a cost simulator for small and medium enterprises (SMEs).<sup>440</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>434</sup> China to increase financial support for industrial upgrade, Xinhua (Beijing) 16 February 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/2016-02/16/c\_135103898.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>435</sup> Relaxed rules on research findings to promote scientific innovation, The State Council (Beijing), 18 February 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

http://english.gov.cn/policies/policy\_watch/2016/02/18/content\_281475292105490.htm.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>436</sup> Relaxed rules on research findings to promote scientific innovation, The State Council (Beijing), 18 February 2016.
 Access Date: 22 February 2016.

http://english.gov.cn/policies/policy\_watch/2016/02/18/content\_281475292105490.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>437</sup> Chinese leadership vows stable macroeconomic policies to sustain growth, Xinhua (Beijing) 22 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/2016-02/22/c\_135120870.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>438</sup> "Adjusted Growth Strategy 2015: France" G20 Turkey 2015 (Antalya) November 2015. Access Date: February 26 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-France.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>439</sup> "François Hollande Aims 2 Billion Euro Plan at France's Economic 'Emergency'" The New York Times (New York) 18 January 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.nytimes.com/2016/01/19/business/international/hollandeaims-2-billion-plan-at-frances-high-unemployment.html.

France has made some progress towards implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy. France has taken steps to improve labour market functioning and to simplify formalities for businesses, as outlined in its growth strategy, however, it has not taken any action to lower factors of production or to adapt goods and services regulations to enable productivity gains.

Thus, France has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Emile Lavergne

#### Germany: +1

Germany has complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

Germany outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Maintain a sound fiscal position; improving framework conditions for investment and innovation, particularly for small and medium enterprises;
- Additional public investment, mainly in infrastructure.<sup>441</sup>

On 27 November 2015, the Bundestag approved the 2016 federal budget. Finance Minister Schäuble stated budget priorities include education, research, and innovation, whilst mentioning significant increases in infrastructure investments.<sup>442</sup> To this end, the budget of the Federal Ministry of Education and Research was increased by EUR1.1 billion, representing an increase of around 7 per cent compared to 2015.<sup>443</sup> As part of the High-Tech strategy, research funding for electronics systems increased by almost 9 per cent, and innovation assistance to former East German *länder* also increased by around 9 per cent compared to 2015.<sup>444</sup>

On 13 January 2016, the German Finance Ministry presented the 2015 provisional accounts which demonstrated that the 2015 federal budget required no new borrowing.<sup>445</sup> The Ministry also set aside a reserve of EUR12.1 billion from the budget surplus, of which it plans to allocate EUR7.2 billion for costs related to the reception and accommodation of asylum-seekers and refugees.<sup>446</sup> As such, Germany has complied with the commitment to balance (in nominal terms) the federal budget.

On 26 February 2016, the European Commission published its 2016 country report on Germany, noting that public investment remains subdued and poses risks for the future growth potential of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>440</sup> "Le choc de simplification" Gouvernment.fr (Paris) 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016.

http://www.gouvernement.fr/action/le-choc-de-simplification

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>441</sup> Adjusted Growth Strategy 2015: Germany, G20 Turkey 2015 (Antalya) November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016 http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-Germany.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>442</sup> German Bundestag approves budget for next fiscal year, Die Welle (Germany), 27 November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.dw.com/en/german-bundestag-approves-budget-for-next-fiscal-year/a-18880539.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>443</sup> The Budget of the Federal Ministry of Education and Research (Germany). 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. https://www.bmbf.de/en/education-and-research-priority-areas-of-federal-government-policy-1410.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>444</sup> The Budget of the Federal Ministry of Education and Research (Germany). 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. https://www.bmbf.de/en/education-and-research-priority-areas-of-federal-government-policy-1410.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>445</sup> Provisional accounts for 2015 budget, The Federal Ministry of Finance (Germany), 13 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/Content/EN/Standardartikel/Topics/Fiscal\_policy/Articles/2016-01-13-provisional-accounts-for-2015-budget.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>446</sup> Provisional accounts for 2015 budget, The Federal Ministry of Finance (Germany), 13 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/Content/EN/Standardartikel/Topics/Fiscal\_policy/Articles/2016-01-13-provisional-accounts-for-2015-budget.html.

German economy.<sup>447</sup> The report highlighted the availability of fiscal space for further public investment. The report did state that public investment as a share of GDP fell in 2015 in both nominal and real terms. However, the European Commission report expects public investment to gain momentum in 2016 and 2017 as a result of measures already adopted by the federal government.<sup>448</sup> In the federal budget, funds earmarked for investment increased by 2.1per cent in 2015 and 5.4per cent in 2016, with federal spending on transport infrastructure expected to reach over EUR 13 billion by 2018, and over EUR 12 billion in 2016, representing an increase from EUR 10.5 billion in 2014.<sup>449</sup>

According to the Federal Ministry of Finance's February 2016 report, to date year-on-year expenditure in transport and communication increased by almost 9 per cent, with expenditure of railways and public transport increasing by over 25 per cent.<sup>450</sup> This demonstrates commitment to additional public investment in infrastructure spending.

Germany has implemented all fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy.

Thus, Germany has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Daniel Valls

# India: 0

India has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

India outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Infrastructure investment;
- Enabling tax policy;
- Ease of doing business;
- Promote competition by promoting foreign direct investment in certain sectors of the economy;
- Inclusive growth.<sup>451</sup>

On 21 December 2015, the Indian government introduced the Insolvency and Bankruptcy Code 2015.<sup>452</sup> This legal framework is designed to encourage entrepreneurship by solving insolvency and bankruptcy cases in a timely manner.<sup>453</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>447</sup> European Commission 2016 Country Report for Germany. 26 February 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/europe2020/pdf/csr2016/cr2016\_germany\_en.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>448</sup> European Commission 2016 Country Report for Germany. 26 February 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/europe2020/pdf/csr2016/cr2016\_germany\_en.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>449</sup> European Commission 2016 Country Report for Germany. 26 February 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/europe2020/pdf/csr2016/cr2016\_germany\_en.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>450</sup> "Federal Ministry of Finance Monthly report for February 2016," Federal Ministry of Finance (Germany) 19 February 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/Content/EN/Standardartikel/Press\_Room/Publications/Monthly\_Report/Abst ract/2016-02-english-version.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>451</sup> Adjusted Growth Strategy: India, G20 Turkey (Antalya) October 2015. Date of Access: 20 February 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-India.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>452</sup> Insolvency and Bankruptcy Code: A legislation to promote investments, develop credit markets, The Indian Express (Noida) 22 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://indianexpress.com/article/india/india-newsindia/insolvency-and-bankruptcy-code-a-legislation-to-promote-investments-develop-credit-markets/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>453</sup> Insolvency and Bankruptcy Code: A legislation to promote investments, develop credit markets, The Indian Express (Noida) 22 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://indianexpress.com/article/india/india-newsindia/insolvency-and-bankruptcy-code-a-legislation-to-promote-investments-develop-credit-markets/.

On 29 December 2015, Secretary in the Department of Industrial Policy and Promotion Amitabh Kant stated "FDI will grow by 40-45 per cent in 2016 despite the global slowdown. The government has taken vast number of policy measures this year."<sup>454</sup>

On 29 December 2015, the government set up a INR40,000 crore National Investment and Infrastructure Fund (NIIF).<sup>455</sup>

On 2 February 2016, the Indian national government announced the creation of the Tax Policy Research Unit (TPRU) and the Tax Policy Council.<sup>456</sup> The Tax Policy Research Unit will "carry-out studies on various topics of fiscal and tax policies."<sup>457</sup> The Tax Policy Council will also consider research findings from the TPRU and "suggest broad policy measures for taxation."<sup>458</sup>

On 17 February 2016, Prime Minister Narendra Modi called for a meeting with the Opposition to push forward stalled legislative initiatives, especially the goods and services tax bill.<sup>459</sup>

On 15 February 2016, Economic Secretary to the United Kingdom Treasury Harriet Baldwin said that the UK and India will sign an agreement on infrastructure investment at the G20 Finance Ministers meeting in Shanghai in late February.<sup>460</sup>

India has made some progress towards implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy.

Thus, India has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Doris Li

#### Indonesia: 0

Indonesia has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

Indonesia outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Create a larger fiscal space through improvement in the state budget structure;
- Cut subsidies and increase the space for public investment;
- Improve the functioning of the tax administration;

nation/government-hopeful-on-gst-as-pm-narendra-modi-reaches-out-to-opposition/articleshow/51016603.cms. <sup>460</sup> Infra financing: UK, India to sign formal pact, The Hindu Business Line (New Delhi) 15 February 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.thehindubusinessline.com/news/world/infra-financing-uk-india-to-sign-formalpact/article8241340.ece.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>454</sup> Govt expects FDI to rise by 45% in 2016, International Business Times (Bangalore) 29 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.ibtimes.co.in/govt-expects-fdi-rise-by-45-2016-reforms-push-661265.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>455</sup> Rs 40K-cr infra fund in place, sovereign funds keen to join: Jaitley, Hindustan Times (New Delhi) 29 December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://www.hindustantimes.com/business/rs-40k-cr-infra-fund-inplace-sovereign-funds-keen-to-join-jaitley/story-9FVRe5yFCi8D8FzUwosaYP.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>456</sup> Government sets-up Tax Policy Research Unit and Tax Policy Council to bring consistency, multidisciplinary inputs, and coherence in Tax Policy, Press Information Bureau (New Delhi) 2 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.finmin.nic.in/press\_room/2016/setup\_TPRU\_TPC02022016.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>457</sup> Government sets-up Tax Policy Research Unit and Tax Policy Council to bring consistency, multidisciplinary inputs, and coherence in Tax Policy, Press Information Bureau (New Delhi) 2 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.finmin.nic.in/press\_room/2016/setup\_TPRU\_TPC02022016.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>458</sup> Government sets-up Tax Policy Research Unit and Tax Policy Council to bring consistency, multidisciplinary inputs, and coherence in Tax Policy, Press Information Bureau (New Delhi) 2 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.finmin.nic.in/press\_room/2016/setup\_TPRU\_TPC02022016.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>459</sup> Government hopeful on GST as PM Narendra Modi reaches out to opposition, The Economic Times (New Delhi) 17 February 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://economictimes.indiatimes.com/news/politics-and-

- Maintain a budget deficit of no more than 3 per cent of gross domestic product (GDP);
- Keep the debt to GDP ratio at a sustainable level;
- Refocus government programs to more productive sectors;<sup>461</sup>

After the implementation of reforms for diesel and gasoline subsidies in early 2015, the government of Indonesia has begun considering what steps to take regarding its remaining subsidies, especially the subsidy program for liquefied petroleum gas.<sup>462</sup>

In order to increase tax revenue, President Joko Widodo is currently trying to convince lawmakers to pass a plan for tax amnesty, the fourth since independence.<sup>463</sup> If approved, the amnesty plan could entice Indonesian tycoons to bring money stashed in other countries back to Indonesia, potentially bringing in IDR60 trillion (USD4.4 billion) in revenue for the government.<sup>464</sup>

Since the time of the Antalya summit, no new budget has been finalized for the government. However, due to the recent fall in oil prices, the government has had to revise its projections for state revenue from the oil and gas sector.<sup>465</sup> The government's projection was US50 per barrel when the budget was made, and the revision will account for a price of US30 per barrel.<sup>466</sup> This revision of the budget represents an improvement in state budget structure.

No actions have been taken to maintain a budget deficit of less than 3 per cent of GDP, which is the legal limit on a budget deficit due to a 2003 law.<sup>467</sup> The 2015 budget deficit was the largest in 25 years, reaching 2.78 per cent.<sup>468</sup>

While debt-to-GDP ratio remains at 27 per cent, no specific actions have been taken to keep the ratio at this level.  $^{469}$ 

Indonesia has made some progress towards implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy. Indonesia has taken action to cut subsidies and increase space for public investment, improve the functioning of the tax administration, and create a larger fiscal space through improvement in the state budget structure. No action has been taken to keep the debt to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>461</sup> Adjusted Growth Strategy: Republic of Indonesia, G20 Turkey 2015 (Antalya). 16 November 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-Indonesia.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>462</sup> What's Big and Wasteful and... Increasingly Well-Targeted? Jakarta Dialogue on International Experiences with LPG Subsidy Reform. Global Subsidies Initiative, International Institute for Sustainable Development (United States). 8 February 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.iisd.org/gsi/news/jakarta-lpg-dialogue.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>463</sup> Jokowi's Push for 2016 Tax Amnesty Plan Kick-Off Seen as Flawed. Bloomberg Business (NYC). 3 January 2016. Access Date:22 February 2016. http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2016-01-03/jokowi-seeks-2016-kick-off-fortax-amnesty-plan-seen-as-flawed.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>464</sup>Jokowi's Push for 2016 Tax Amnesty Plan Kick-Off Seen as Flawed. Bloomberg Business (NYC). 3 January 2016. Access Date:22 February 2016. http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2016-01-03/jokowi-seeks-2016-kick-off-for-tax-amnesty-plan-seen-as-flawed.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>465</sup> Govt to revise 2016 state budget because of falling oil prices. The Jakarta Post (Jakarta). 19 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2016/01/19/govt-revise-2016-state-budget-because-falling-oil-prices.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>466</sup> Govt to revise 2016 state budget because of falling oil prices. The Jakarta Post (Jakarta). 19 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2016/01/19/govt-revise-2016-state-budget-because-falling-oil-prices.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>467</sup> Rising Indonesian budget deficit puts Widodo in a tight spot. CNBC (Jakarta). 21 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.cnbc.com/2015/12/21/reuters-america-rising-indonesian-budget-deficit-puts-widodo-in-atight-spot.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>468</sup> Rising Indonesian budget deficit puts Widodo in a tight spot. CNBC (Jakarta). 21 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.cnbc.com/2015/12/21/reuters-america-rising-indonesian-budget-deficit-puts-widodo-in-atight-spot.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>469</sup> Indonesia's Debt to GDP Ratio Below Neighbouring Countries. Ministry of Finance, Government of Indonesia (Jakarta). 13 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

http://www.kemenkeu.go.id/en/Berita/indonesia% E2%80%99 s-debt-gdp-ratio-below-neighbouring-countries.

GDP ratio on a sustainable path, keep the budget deficit at 3 per cent of GDP, or to refocus government programs to more productive structures.

Thus, Indonesia has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Qasim Sheikh

## Italy: +1

Italy has fully complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

Italy outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Structural reforms to improve the business environment;
- Changes to the tax code;
- Reform of the education system;
- Measures to boost investment and facilitate its financing;
- Growth and employment-friendly public finances;<sup>470</sup>

On 16 November 2015, the European Commission opined that the Italian Draft Budgetary plan for 2016 was at risk of non-compliance with the provisions of the Stability and Growth Pact.<sup>471</sup>

On 23 December 2015, the Ministry of Economy and Finance published the public debt guidelines for 2016 in which they indicated that 2016 should be the first year with a reduction of the debt to GDP ratio.<sup>472</sup>

As of January 2016, the implementation of the Youth Guarantee has started in all EU countries. The Youth Guarantee is a new approach to tackling youth unemployment which ensures that all young people under 25 – whether registered with employment services or not – get a good-quality, concrete offer within 4 months of them leaving formal education or becoming unemployed. The good-quality offer should be for a job, apprenticeship, traineeship, or continued education and be adapted to each individual need and situation. The European Commission regularly assesses country progress and noted Italy's progress.<sup>473</sup>

On 1 January 2016, the Italian Stability Law of 2016 came into effect.<sup>474</sup> This law aims to reduce the tax burden on workers, households, and businesses.<sup>475</sup> This amounts to an overall tax relief of around EUR3.5 billion.<sup>476</sup> The 2016 Stability Law also provides for a reduction in corporate income tax

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>470</sup> Adjusted Growth Strategy: Italy, G20 Turkey 2015 (Antalya). 16 November 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016 http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-Italy.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>471</sup> European Commission Opinion on the Draft Budgetary Plan of Italy, European Commission (Brussels) 16 November 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016.

http://ec.europa.eu/economy\_finance/economic\_governance/sgp/pdf/dbp/2015/it\_2015-11-16\_co\_en.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>472</sup> Guidelines for public debt management. Department of Treasury (Italy) 23 December 2016. Access Date: 26 February

<sup>2016.</sup>http://www.dt.tesoro.it/export/sites/sitodt/modules/documenti\_en/debito\_pubblico/presentazioni\_studi\_relazi oni/Guidelines\_for\_public\_debt\_management\_2016.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>473</sup> Youth Guarantee, European Commission Access Date: 13 July 2016.

http://ec.europa.eu/social/main.jsp?catId=1079&langId=en

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>474</sup> Italian Stability Law of 2016. Ministry of Finance (Italy) 08 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.mef.gov.it/focus/article\_0014.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>475</sup> Adjusted Growth Strategy: Italy, G20 Turkey 2015 (Antalya). 16 November 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-Italy.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>476</sup> Italian Stability Law of 2016. Ministry of Finance (Italy) 08 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.mef.gov.it/focus/article\_0014.html.

starting in 2017. However, the reduction in property taxation does not follow the recommendation by the European Commission for a more efficient tax structure by shifting taxation onto property and away from factors of production.<sup>477</sup> Taking this law into account, Italy's deficit is projected to slightly decrease to 2.5 per cent of GDP and the government debt-to-GDP ratio is projected to decrease to 132.4 per cent in 2016 and 130.6 per cent in 2017.<sup>478</sup>

On 21 January 2016, the Italian Cabinet approved the "Reorganization, rationalization and simplification of Port Authorities" decree, which reviews a system which has been in place for over 20 years. The Ports Decree is part of the re-launch of ports and logistics in Italy promoted by the Ministry for Infrastructure and Transport. The Ports Decree focuses on the competitiveness of ports and supports the role of Italy as a hub in the Mediterranean and European logistics platform.<sup>479</sup>

On 28 January 2016, Italy passed new legislation aimed at increasing administrative cooperation for the mutual recognition of academic degrees at the European Union level. The new legislation deals with the recognition of professional degrees already acquired in another EU country that allow the person to practice his profession in his country of origin, with the purpose of allowing access to a regulated profession in Italy. It also establishes the criteria for the recognition of professional internships carried out by Italian citizens in another EU country.<sup>480</sup>

On 18 February 2016, the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development forecast that Italian GDP would rise by 1 per cent in 2016, revising its November estimate of 1.4 per cent.<sup>481</sup>

Italy has made significant progress towards implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy.

Thus, Italy has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Daniel Valls

# Japan: 0

Japan has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

Japan outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Further fiscal consolidation, aiming to halve the primary ratio of deficit to gross domestic product from the 2010 value;
- Corporate governance reform, aiming to reduce Japan's effective corporate tax rate;
- Promotion of business ventures with particular consideration to strengthening the base revenue of Small and Medium-sized Enterprises (SMEs);
- Increase of economic participation by women, the elderly, and foreigners.<sup>482</sup>

http://www.gop.it/doc\_pubblicazioni/530\_3rzbn8azeb\_eng.pdf

<sup>481</sup> OECD Interim Economic Outlook, OECD, 18 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

https://www.oecd.org/eco/outlook/OECD-Interim-Economic-Outlook-February-2016.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>477</sup> European Commission 2016 Country Report for Italy, European Commission (Brussels) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/europe2020/pdf/csr2016/cr2016\_italy\_en.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>478</sup> European Commission 2016 Country Report for Italy, European Commission (Brussels) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/europe2020/pdf/csr2016/cr2016\_italy\_en.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>479</sup> Italian Port reform. Reorganization, rationalization and simplification of port authorities and additional projects for the renewal of ports and logistics in Italy, GOP 2016. Access Date: 7 July 2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>480</sup> Italy: Decree to Implement European Legislation on Cooperation for Recognition of Professional Degrees, Library of Congress 15 March 2016. Access Date: 7 July 2016. http://www.loc.gov/law/foreign-news/article/italy-decree-toimplement-european-legislation-on-cooperation-for-recognition-of-professional-degrees/

On 24 December 2015, Japan approved a record-high JPY96.72 trillion budget for the 2016 fiscal year. The budget focuses on more robust spending on welfare, tourism, defense, and social security, and the increased servicing of debt. Moreover, in line with its commitment to bring about fiscal consolidation, the effective increase in this budget from last year will be capped at JPY530 billion.<sup>483</sup>

On 16 December 2015, Japan released its 2016 Tax Reform Outline, which includes a reduction in the corporate tax rate. The national corporate tax rate will, on 1 April 2016, be reduced to 23.4 per cent from 23.9 per cent. Moreover, the local enterprise tax rate will be nearly halved, dropping from 6.0 per cent to 3.6 per cent.<sup>484</sup>

On 22 February 2016, the Small and Medium Enterprise Agency of Japan started its strengthened program of support for SMEs and micro businesses.<sup>485</sup> This program entails loans with lower interest rates to certain job-creating initiatives; an expansion of funds for supporting social businesses, restructuring overseas business expansion, strengthening dynamism of enterprises; and an increase of support for micro businesses.<sup>486</sup>

Japan has made some progress towards implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy. Japan has made strides towards fiscal consolidation, corporate tax reform, and the promotion of business ventures, but it has not yet made tangible policy decisions regarding the further inclusion of women, the elderly, and foreigners in the economy.

Thus, Japan has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Michael Switzer

## Korea: 0

Korea has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

Korea outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Continue expansionary macroeconomic policies: the stimulus package worth KRW 46 trillion in 2014 and the additional fiscal spending worth KRW 22 trillion including the supplementary budget of KRW 12 trillion in 2015;
- Implement the roadmap to achieve 70 per cent employment rate, with a focus on youth employment;
- Revitalize investment including infrastructure investment;
- Implement a comprehensive structural reform package in four sectors of public, finance, labor and education;
- Continue to reform the regulatory system ("one in, one out" regulation regime, sunset clause, and negative list approach etc.);

<sup>485</sup> SMEA Strengthens Financial Support for SMEs and Micro Businesses, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry (Tokyo) 26 February 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.meti.go.jp/english/press/2016/0222\_01.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>482</sup>Comprehensive Growth Strategy: Japan, G20 Turkey 2015 (Antalya) November 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-Japan.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>483</sup> Cabinet approves record ¥96.7 trillion budget for fiscal 2016, The Japan Times (Tokyo) 24 December 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2015/12/24/national/politics-diplomacy/japans-cabinet-oks-record-%C2%A596-7-trillion-fiscal-2016-budget-focused-welfare-fiscal-health/#.VtMvBpwrLIV.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>484</sup> Japan releases 2016 tax reform outline, Ernst & Young (London) 16 December 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.ey.com/GL/en/Services/Tax/International-Tax/Alert--Japan-releases-2016-tax-reform-outline.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>486</sup> SMEA Strengthens Financial Support for SMEs and Micro Businesses, Ministry of Economy, Trade and Industry (Tokyo) 26 February 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.meti.go.jp/english/press/2016/0222\_01.html.

• Develop three tax schemes to increase household incomes.<sup>487</sup>

On 6 December 2015, the Korean government announced that the peak wage system will be fully adopted in the public sector next year.<sup>488</sup> The peak wage system guarantees retirement at the age of 60 with 3-5 years of adjusted wages before retirement, while at the same time ensuring that young adults are hired as new employees with labour cost savings.<sup>489</sup> The adoption of the new wage system is projected to create as many as 4,441 new jobs in 2016, making the total number of new employees in public institutions more than 18,000, a 4.5 per cent increase compared with 2015 and the largest in the past three years.<sup>490</sup>

On 16 December 2015, the Economic Policy Bureau released a "2016 Policies Focus on Maintaining Recovery Momentum and Strengthening Growth Potential." The plan's stated goals include adopting expansionary macroeconomic policies to support recovery momentum. The government will adopt the fiscal policy of increasing budget frontloading by KRW8 trillion in the first quarter to KRW125 trillion and increasing public institutions' investment in private sector projects by KRW6 trillion. The plan also detailed structural reform strategies in four sectors: the public sector, financial industry, labor market, and education system.<sup>491</sup>

On 19 November 2015 at the 22nd Ministerial Meeting the Korean government announced that it would begin work on building a highway between Seoul and Sejong, which will be a large project worth KRW6.7 trillion. The new PPP model of BTO-a[1] will be applied to the highway construction project, and about KRW 840 billion worth of transportation costs are expected to be saved while a total of 66,000 jobs will be created.<sup>492</sup>

On 3 February 2016 the sceond ministerial meeting on the economy, Deputy Prime Minister Yoo II Ho announced that the government will increase the first quarter fiscal spending by KRW6 trillion from the original plan, which will make the first quarter spending increased by KRW14 trillion year on year.<sup>493</sup> The measures also include KRW15.5 trillion in lending by policy banks during the first quarter.<sup>494</sup> The finance ministry said that individual consumption taxes on passenger cars would also be cut to 3.5 per cent from 5 per cent, effective until the end of June.<sup>495</sup> The government estimates the latest measures would lift economic growth for the January-March period by 0.2 per centage points on a quarter-on-quarter basis.

http://english.mosf.go.kr/pre/view.do?bcd=N0001&seq=3984&bPage=2.

http://english.mosf.go.kr/eco/view.do?bcd=E0001&vbcd=N0001&seq=3967&bPage=1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>487</sup> Comprehensive Growth Strategy: Korea, G20 Brisbane Summit Australia (Brisbane), 15 November 2014. Access Date: 3 March 2015. http://www.g20australia.org/official\_resources/current\_presidency/growth\_strategies.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>488</sup> Press Center: Peak Wage System to Be Fully Adopted in the Public Sector (Seoul) 6 December 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://english.mosf.go.kr/pre/view.do?bcd=N0001&seq=3978&bPage=1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>489</sup> Press Center: Peak Wage System to Be Fully Adopted in the Public Sector, Ministry of Finance (Seoul) 6 December 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://english.mosf.go.kr/pre/view.do?bcd=N0001&seq=3978&bPage=1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>490</sup> Press Center: Peak Wage System to Be Fully Adopted in the Public Sector, Ministry of Finance (Seoul) 6 December 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://english.mosf.go.kr/pre/view.do?bcd=N0001&seq=3978&bPage=1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>491</sup> Press Center: 2016 Policies Focus on Maintaining Recovery Momentum and Strengthening Growth Potential, Ministry of Strategy and Finance (Seoul) 16 December 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>492</sup> Press Center: Government to Work on Seoul-Sejong Highway Construction, Ministry of Strategies and Finance (Seoul) 19 November 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>493</sup> Press Center: Government to Increase Spending in Q1, Ministry of Finance (Seoul) 3 February 2016. Access Date: 29 February 2016. http://english.mosf.go.kr/pre/view.do?bcd=N0001&seq=4017&bPage=1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>494</sup> South Korea unveils stimulus measures to support faltering growth, Channel News Asia (Beijing) 3 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.channelnewsasia.com/news/business/south-korea-unveils/2483296.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>495</sup> South Korea unveils stimulus measures to support faltering growth, Channel News Asia (Beijing) 3 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.channelnewsasia.com/news/business/south-korea-unveils/2483296.html.

On 17 February 2016, the government unveiled the new round of measures to boost the private sector investment following the 9th Presidential Meeting to Promote Trade and Investment.<sup>496</sup> Measures include efforts to restart suspended projects, to grow promising service markets, to enhance farming sector competitiveness, and to attract investment in the Seamangeum area.<sup>497</sup>

Korea has made some progress towards implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy. Korea has implemented measures to grow its gross domestic product, invest in infrastructure and reduce unemployment, but it has not yet addressed its tax schemes or its regulatory system commitments.

Thus, Korea has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Jiayang Shan

## Mexico: 0

Mexico has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

Mexico outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Continue implementing the Energy Reform Plan;
- Continue implementing the Competition (Anti-trust) Reform Plan;
- Execute the National Infrastructure Program 2014-2018;
- Strengthen the role of National Development Banks on Infrastructure and SME (small and medium-sized enterprises) financing;
- Foster investment in infrastructure through the Financial Reform Infrastructure Fund;
- Responsible public finances to strengthen macroeconomic stability;<sup>498</sup>

On 24 December 2015, the Energy Transition Law was passed, which abrogated the Renewables Energies Law and the Law for the Sustainable use of Energies. These were two renewable energy market regulatory schemes.<sup>499</sup>

On 15 December 2015, Mexico's oil regulator awarded the rights to new developments at an auction, in keeping with measures in the Energy Reform.<sup>500</sup>

On 4 February 2016, Mexico signed the Trans-Pacific Partnership Agreement.<sup>501</sup>

On 22 February 2016, the Mexican President's office confirmed that from 1 April 2016, Mexico's Energy Reforms allowing any company to import gasoline and diesel will be implemented in order to obtain better prices on fuel.<sup>502</sup>

http://english.mosf.go.kr/pre/view.do?bcd=N0001&seq=4024&bPage=1.

<sup>501</sup> "Mexico signed the Trans-Pacific Partnership Agreement (TPP)" Gob.mx (Mexico) February 2016. Access Date: February 27, 2016. http://www.gob.mx/se/prensa/mexico-signed-the-trans-pacific-partnership-agreement-tpp

#### G20 Research Group: 2015 G20 Antalya Summit Interim Compliance Report, 17 July 2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>496</sup> Press Center: Government Unveils New Round of Investment Boosting Measures, Ministry of Strategy and Finance (Seoul) 17 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016.

http://english.mosf.go.kr/pre/view.do?bcd=N0001&seq=4024&bPage=1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>497</sup> Press Center: Government Unveils New Round of Investment Boosting Measures, Ministry of Strategy and Finance (Seoul) 17 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>498</sup> "Adjusted Growth Strategy: Mexico" G20 Turkey 2015 (Antalya) November 2015. Access Date: February 26 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-Mexico.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>499</sup> "Mexico's New Energy Transition Law" Baker & McKenzie (Mexico) December 2015. Access Date: February 27 2016. http://bakerxchange.com/cv/f0fe0a889e5be6dda7156526b089bdea4cf611ba/p=1867412

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>500</sup> "Mexico's oil regulator awards first onshore contract at auction" Reuters (Mexico) December 2015. Access Date: February 27 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/mexico-oil-idUSL1N1441CA20151215

Mexico has made some progress towards implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy. Mexico continues to implement changes in line with its Energy Reform, but it has not taken steps towards responsible public finances.

Thus, Mexico has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Emile Lavergne

## Russia: 0

Russia has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

Russia outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Increase the efficiency of public investment through public reporting and auditing;
- Implement large scale public investment projects partially financed by the sovereign wealth funds;
- Support small and medium-sized enterprises through tax relief of newly created enterprises;
- Enhance customs administration, exports, and access to foreign markets;<sup>503</sup>

In a tax update published in December of 2015, professional services provider Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Ltd asserted that Russia's latest tax reforms, set to enter into force on the 1st of January, 2016, made steps towards improving the attractiveness of investing in Russia and reducing the prevalence of profit shifting and tax evasion.<sup>504</sup> Moreover, it reported that "the Russian Government has proposed a law offering 10 per cent profits tax rates for newly established Russian industrial enterprises."<sup>505</sup>

On 9 December 2015, the Russian Direct Investment Fund partnered with Middle Eastern Sovereign Wealth Funds in order to invest in an integrated petrochemical complex in Russia's Tyumen Region. The total for this investment amounts to USD 9.5 billion.<sup>506</sup>

On 17 December 2015, the Russian Direct Investment Fund, Renaissance Capital, Onexim Group, and the CITIC, China's leading financial conglomerate, established a partnership in order to cooperate on high-opportunity projects in Russia, the Middle East, and Africa.<sup>507</sup>

On 11 January 2016, the Russia-China Investment Fund acquired 23.1 per cent of Russian company Detsky Mir, a transaction considered to be worth RUB9.75 billion, in order to facilitate its continued expansion.<sup>508</sup> Kirill Dmitriev, the chief executive officer of the Russian Development Fund and co-

<sup>503</sup> Comprehensive Growth Strategy: Russia, G20 Turkey 2015 (Antalya) November 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-Russia.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>502</sup> "Reforma Energetica: Tres Anuncios ey frases por venir" Gob.mx (Mexico) Feburary 2016. Access Date: February 27, 2016. http://www.gob.mx/presidencia/articulos/reforma-energetica-tres-anuncios-y-fases-por-venir

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>504</sup> Tax update 2016 Key changes and trends, Deloitte (New York) December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www2.deloitte.com/content/dam/Deloitte/ru/Documents/tax/tax-predictions-2016-en-print.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>505</sup> Tax update 2016 Key changes and trends, Deloitte (New York) December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www2.deloitte.com/content/dam/Deloitte/ru/Documents/tax/tax-predictions-2016-en-print.pdf.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>506</sup> RDIF AND INTERNATIONAL FUNDS INVEST IN SIBUR'S ZAPSIBNEFTEKHIM PROJECT, Sibur (Moscow) 9 December
 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://investors.sibur.com/investor-news/2015/dec/09122015.aspx?sc\_lang=en.
 <sup>507</sup> RUSSIAN DIRECT INVESTMENT FUND, CITIC MERCHANT, RENAISSANCE CAPITAL AND ONEXIM GROUP CREATE
 STRATEGIC PARTNERSHIP WITHIN THE FRAMEWORK OF RUSSIA-CHINA INVESTMENT BANK, Russian Direct Investment
 Fund (Moscow) 17 December 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.rdif.ru/Eng\_fullNews/1582/.
 <sup>508</sup> RUSSIA-CHINA INVESTMENT FUND ACQUIRED 23.1% OF JSC DETSKY MIR, Russian Direct Investment Fund (Moscow)
 11 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.rdif.ru/Eng\_fullNews/1595/.

CEO of the Russia-China Investment Fund, asserted that "the deal is in line with our investment strategy focused on growth of the middle class and its demand for goods, especially in the regions."<sup>509</sup>

On 19 January 2016, Russia's Economic Development Ministry announced that it expects that the volume of small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) in Russia will double by 2030, and that it has created a roadmap for the next two years in order to ensure that such an increase will be realized.<sup>510</sup>

On 3 February 2016, Russia announced that it will work with Egyptian banks to create a joint investment platform in order to support Russian companies that enter Egyptian markets and finance Russian-Egyptian projects in Egypt.<sup>511</sup>

Russia has made some progress towards implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy. While Russia has demonstrated progress on measures to enhance the scale and efficiency of investments, the growth of SMEs, exports, and access to foreign markets, Russia has not implemented substantial reform on customs administration.

Thus, Russia has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Michael Switzer

# Saudi Arabia: 0

Saudi Arabia has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

Saudi Arabia outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Create an expansionary budget to counter declining oil prices and promote medium-term growth prospects;
- Implement a training and vocational program for labourers;
- Promote measures to boost female labour participation, including after-family related break;
- Implement regional customs agreements with neighbouring Gulf States;
- Increase funding for small and medium sized enterprises (SMEs).<sup>512</sup>

On 28 December 2015, the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia announced the budget for 2016. The budget increased spending by 13 per cent over last year, and is expected to reach SR975 billion. In addition to this, oil subsidies in the country have been cut, and non-oil revenues have increased by 29 per cent compared to the 2014 numbers. In addition to these measures, the budget established a support provision of SR183 billion to increase flexibility amidst falling oil prices.<sup>513</sup>

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>509</sup> RUSSIA-CHINA INVESTMENT FUND ACQUIRED 23.1% OF JSC DETSKY MIR, Russian Direct Investment Fund (Moscow)
 11 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.rdif.ru/Eng\_fullNews/1595/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>510</sup> Russia plans to double share of SMEs in GDP structure by 2030 — ministry, TASS (Moscow) 19 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://tass.ru/en/economy/850531.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>511</sup> RDIF, EGYPTIAN BANKS TO LOOK FOR INVESTMENT PROJECTS IN EGYPT, Russian Direct Investment Fund (Moscow) 3 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.rdif.ru/Eng\_fullNews/1636/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>512</sup> "Antalya Action Plan," G20 Antalya Cycle Report (Ankara), Access Date: February 20, 2016.

http://www.oecd.org/g20/summits/antalya/Antalya-Action-Plan.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>513</sup> "Press Release: Recent Economic Developments and Highlights of Fiscal years 1436/1437 & 1437/1438," Kingdom of Saudi Arabia Ministry of Finance (Riyadh), Access Date: February 20, 2016.

https://www.mof.gov.sa/English/DownloadsCenter/Budget/Ministry's%20of%20Finance%20statment%20about%20the %20national%20budget%20for%202016.pdf.

In February, the Ministry of Labour brought forth an educational speaker series entitled, "Towards an attractive work environment for women," while days later releasing a resolution to improve the participation rate of female labourers in factories and the vocations.<sup>514</sup>

Saudi Arabia has made some progress towards implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy. Saudi Arabia has made an effort towards three of the five pillars of its Individual Comprehensive Growth Strategy, but there is no evidence of efforts to foster localized trade agreements, or increase investments into SMEs within the country.

Thus, Saudi Arabia has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Kyle Van Hooren

# South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

South Africa outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Fast tracking infrastructure development plan;
- Streamlining a national regulatory regime;
- Employment tax incentives;
- Facilitate international growth of South African firms;
- Improve the overall improve the investment atmosphere in the country.<sup>515</sup>

On 16 February 2016, the South African Deputy President announced that the government was "fast-tracking the implementation of the Invest South Africa initiative, which is a one-stop investment shop to assist investors in meeting all the necessary legislative and regulatory requirements," in the country.<sup>516</sup>

On 24 February 2016, the Government of South Africa released its proposed 2016 budget. In the detailed budget, infrastructure spending is up 6 per cent over the previous year. This includes heavy increases to the energy, transportation, and telecommunication sectors. Spending on energy increased by ZAR1.8 billion from last year.<sup>517</sup>

In addition, the budget alters the tax scheme of the country, creating tax breaks for small and medium enterprises (SMEs) through their "small business desk" program. This program increases the number of businesses that qualify for grants and increases the number that are tax exempt. Furthermore, it provides ZAR772.7 million in incentives for services in mining, manufacturing and agro services.<sup>518</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>514</sup> "Starting Educational Lectures about women's work in the private sector environment in three regions," Ministry of Labour (Riyadh), Access Date: February 25, 2016. http://portal.mol.gov.sa/ar/News/Pages/page\_189.aspx; "Action Plan on Conditions for the Employment of Women in Factories," Ministry of Labour (Riyadh), Access Date: February 25, 2016. http://portal.mol.gov.sa/ar/News/Pages/page 191.aspx.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>515</sup> Adjusted Growth Strategy: South Africa, G20 Report Antalya (Antalya) Access Date: February 25, 2015. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-South-Africa.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>516</sup> Statement by the deputy president to Deputy President Cyril Ramaphosa, Access Date: February 25, 2016.

http://www.timeslive.co.za/local/2016/02/16/Government-trying-to-improve-ease-of-doing-business-in-SA

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>517</sup> Estimate of National Expenditure, 2016, Government of South Africa (Cape Town). Access Date: February 25, 2016. http://www.treasury.gov.za/documents/national%20budget/2016/ene/FullENE.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>518</sup> Estimate of National Expenditure, 2016, Government of South Africa. Access Date: February 25, 2016. http://www.treasury.gov.za/documents/national%20budget/2016/ene/FullENE.pdf.

South Africa has implemented all fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy. South Africa has made significant efforts to implement accelerated spending on infrastructure to spur business growth, tax incentives for SMEs, and streamlining the bureaucracy for both national and international businesses within the country.

Thus, South Africa has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Kyle Van Hooren

# Turkey: 0

Turkey has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product (GDP) on a sustainable path.

Turkey outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Increase the ratio of general research and development expenditures to GDP to 1.80 per cent by 2018 from 0.95 per cent in 2013, and the share of small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs) in research and development expenditures to 20 per cent in the same period from 18 per cent;
- Raise employment through updated curricula for vocational schools, improving active labour market programs, developing for target groups and introducing conditionality for social benefits;
- Increase the employment of women through creating a balance between work and family, introducing incentives and promoting entrepreneurship;
- Increase competition by reviewing the legislation and other issues, which prevents business environment to improve;
- Boost trade with implementation of the World Trade Organization's Trade Facilitation Agreement.<sup>519</sup>

On 10 December 2015, Prime Minister Ahmet Davutoglu announced a sweeping economic structural reform agenda to be completed within a year.<sup>520</sup> Its two objectives are reaching a high income level with strong and sustainable growth and "inclusive growth" which will enable all parts of the society to benefit from the strong and sustainable growth.

The reforms range from improving education quality to increasing female labour participation to encouraging entrepreneurship. Highlights of the agenda include financial incentives for young people to attend university, as well as starting their own businesses — young entrepreneurs would be exempt from paying income taxes for the first three years of starting their own enterprises. Further, the government said it would strengthen research and development incentives, including establishing a fund for early stage research and development and design efforts. <sup>521</sup> The latter takes a step towards achieving the first goal of increasing research and development expenditure to GDP ratio.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>519</sup> 2015 G20 Adjusted Growth Strategy: Turkey, G20 Antalya November 2015. Access date: 23 February 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-Turkey.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>520</sup> 2016 Economic Reform Agenda, Republic of Turkey Undersecretariat of Treasury 6 January 2016. Access date: 24 February 2016.

http://www.treasury.gov.tr/File/?path=ROOT%2f1%2fDocuments%2fPages%2f20160106\_Economic+Reform+Agenda.p df.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>521</sup> 2016 Economic Reform Agenda, Republic of Turkey Undersecretariat of Treasury 6 January 2016. Access date: 24 February 2016.

http://www.treasury.gov.tr/File/?path=ROOT%2f1%2fDocuments%2fPages%2f20160106\_Economic+Reform+Agenda.p df.

On 14 December 2015, negotiations resumed on Turkey's accession to the European Union, specifically discussing Chapter 17 — economic and monetary policy.<sup>522</sup> The talks cover specific rules guaranteeing the independence of central banks, and are intended to lead to Turkey's GDP per capita convergence with the EU, as well as eventually adopting the euro.

On 11 January 2016, the government released Turkey's 2016 to 2018 medium-term economic program, encompassing the structural reforms outlined above. Deputy Prime Minister Mehmet im ek, during this announcement, said the government aims to reduce the rate of inflation to 5 to 7 per cent over the next three years, from 8.1 per cent in 2015.<sup>523</sup>

Turkey has made some progress towards implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy.

Thus, Turkey has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Trinh Theresa Do

# United Kingdom: 0

The United Kingdom has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

The United Kingdom outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Deficit reduction;
- Completion of the financial system reform;
- Creation of a comprehensive package of structural reforms;
- Support for public infrastructure investments;
- Boost support to help get young people and the long term unemployed people into work;
- Increase female labour participation;
- Create a stable housing market;
- Improve competition through reduction of administrative and regulatory burdens.<sup>524</sup>

On 25 November 2015, the HM Treasury released the Spending Review and Autumn Statement 2015 where it announced the creation of a EUR400 million Northern Powerhouse investment fund to help the growth of small businesses.<sup>525</sup> This fund will support businesses in the North that focus on investment, science, and arts.<sup>526</sup>

On 25 November 2015, in the same Spending Review and Autumn Statement Chancellor of the Exchequer George Osborne announced that the government will borrow EUR8 million less than

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>522</sup> EU-Turkey Intergovernmental Conference – Jean Asselborn announces the opening of Chapter 17 on economic and monetary policy, Presidency of the Council of the European Union (Brussels) 14 December 2015. Access date: 24 February 2016. http://www.eu2015lu.eu/en/actualites/articles-actualite/2015/12/14-cig-ue-turquie/index.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>523</sup> Deputy PM Şimşek reveals Turkey's 2016-2108 medium-term economic program, Daily Sabah (Istanbul) 11 January 2016. Access date: 23 February 2016. http://www.dailysabah.com/economy/2016/01/11/deputy-pm-simsek-reveals-turkeys-2016-2108-medium-term-economic-program.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>524</sup> Adjusted Growth Strategy: United Kingdom, G20 Turkey (Antalya) October 2015. Access Date: 18 February 2015. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-United-Kingdom.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>525</sup> Spending Review and Autumn Statement 2015: key announcements, HM Treasury (London) 25 November 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/spending-review-and-autumn-statement-2015-key-announcements

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>526</sup> Spending Review and Autumn Statement 2015: key announcements, HM Treasury (London) 25 November 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/spending-review-and-autumn-statement-2015-key-announcements

anticipated "making faster progress towards eliminating the deficit and paying down debt."<sup>527</sup> He also announced that not only will the deficit be eliminated in four years, the government will also have created a EUR10 billion surplus by 2019-2020.<sup>528</sup>

On 3 December 2015, the Secretary of State for Transport Patrick McLoughlin addressed the need to improve Wales' transport system in a speech at City Hall.<sup>529</sup> He announced a commitment to invest EUR70 billion to "transform travel in Wales and the UK."<sup>530</sup> He also reiterated the government's announcement from 30 November 2015 to build the H2S line six years early to speed up travel time from Crewe to London to 55 minutes from today's 90 minutes by 2027.<sup>531</sup>

On 17 December 2015, Chancellor of the Exchequer George Osborne launched a consultation on the powers the Bank of England should have on the UK's housing market. He stated that this is "the next step in ensuring that the Financial Policy Committee has the tools it needs to protect our economy."<sup>532</sup>

On 22 January 2016, Transport Minister of State Robert Goodwill announced the EUR371 million sale of its investment in the King's Cross to reduce deficit.<sup>533</sup>

On 28 January 2016, the Department of Transport introduced a new transport skills strategy to create 30,000 apprenticeships in the road and rail sector by 2020. Through this strategy, the government will stretch its target to attract more females to engineering and technical apprenticeships in the transport sector.<sup>534</sup>

On 10 February 2016, Home Secretary Theresa May addressed the issue of fraud in the UK financial system and announced the Joint Fraud Taskforce, a new taskforce consisting of "key representatives from government, law enforcement and the banking sector" to tackle this issue.<sup>535</sup>

On 19 February 2016, the government published the HM Treasury single departmental plan, 2015 to 2020 where it outlined key policies to "place public finances on a sustainable footing," "ensure the stability of the macro-economic environment and financial system, enabling strong, sustainable and balanced growth," and to "increase employment and productivity, and ensure strong growth and competitiveness across all regions of the UK through a comprehensive package of structural

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>527</sup> Chancellor George Osborne's Spending Review and Autumn Statement 2015 speech, HM Treasury (London) 25 November 2015.Access Date: 22 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/chancellor-georgeosbornes-spending-review-and-autumn-statement-2015-speech.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>528</sup> HM Treasury single departmental plan, 2015 to 2020, HM Treasury (London) 19 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/hm-treasury-single-departmental-plan-2015-to-2020/hm-treasury-single-departmental-plan-2015-to-2020#place-the-public-finances-on-a-sustainable-footing.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>529</sup> Investing in Welsh transport, Department for Transport (London) 3 December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/investing-in-welsh-transport.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>530</sup> Investing in Welsh transport, Department for Transport (London) 3 December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/investing-in-welsh-transport.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>531</sup> Investing in Welsh transport, Department for Transport (London) 3 December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/investing-in-welsh-transport.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>532</sup> Government launches consultation on further housing market powers for the Bank of England, HM Treasury (London) 17 December 2015. Access Date: 24 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/governmentlaunches-consultation-on-further-housing-market-powers-for-the-bank-of-england

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>533</sup> Government sells King's Cross development stake to reduce the deficit, Department for Transport and HM Treasury (London) 22 January 2016. Access Date: 20 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/government-sellskings-cross-development-stake-to-reduce-the-deficit.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>534</sup> Record investment in transport network used to guarantee apprenticeships, Department for Transport (London) 28 January 2016. Access Date: 20 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/record-investment-in-transportnetwork-used-to-guarantee-apprenticeships.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>535</sup> Home Secretary launches new joint fraud taskforce, Home Office (London) 10 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/home-secretary-launches-new-joint-fraud-taskforce.

reforms."<sup>536</sup> Key policies included, but were not limited to, saving EUR5 billion a year by 2019-2020 by cracking down on tax evasion, capping overall welfare spending, using tactics such as financial sanctions, anti-money laundering, counter-terrorism, and proliferation financial measures to ensure the stability of the UK financial system, and to ensure the competitiveness of the UK's tax system by cutting corporation tax to 19 per cent by 2017 and to 18 per cent by 2020.<sup>537</sup>

The UK has made some progress towards implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy. Although the UK has implemented several fiscal strategies to reduce deficit and support growth and employment, it has yet to complete the financial system reform and create a comprehensive package of structural reforms.

Thus, the United Kingdom has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Doris Li

## **United States: 0**

The United States has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product on a sustainable path.

The United States outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Reauthorize surface transportation funding at USD478 billion over six years;
- Protect families by requiring retirement advisers to abide by a "fiduciary" standard;
- Make two years of community college free for responsible students;
- Update the regulations regarding who qualifies for overtime protection;
- Expand the child care tax credit, introducing a second earner tax credit, and simplifying and expand education tax benefits;
- Raise the federal minimum wage to USD12 an hour by 2020.<sup>538</sup>

On 4 December 2015, President Obama signed the Fixing America's Surface Transportation (FAST) Act, a day after it was approved by Congress.<sup>539</sup> This act allocates USD305 billion for transit and highway spending through 2020, a total of five years.<sup>540</sup> Because this is far less than the USD478 billion over six years that was the stated goal (USD61 billion per year vs. USD95.6 billion per year), the United States failed to comply with this part of the commitment.

On 29 January 2016, The United States Department of Labor submitted their proposed final rule regarding requiring retirement advisers to abide by a "fiduciary standard" to the White House's Office of Management and Budget, one of the key steps in the process to legislating such a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>536</sup> Record investment in transport network used to guarantee apprenticeships, Department for Transport (London) 28 January 2016. Access Date: 20 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/record-investment-in-transportnetwork-used-to-guarantee-apprenticeships.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>537</sup> Record investment in transport network used to guarantee apprenticeships, Department for Transport (London) 28 January 2016. Access Date: 20 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/record-investment-in-transportnetwork-used-to-guarantee-apprenticeships.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>538</sup> Adjusted Growth Strategy: United States. G20 Turkey (Antalya). 16 November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-United-States.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>539</sup> Obama signs \$305B highway bill. The Hill (Washington DC). 4 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://thehill.com/policy/finance/262171-obama-signs-305b-highway-bill.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>540</sup> Obama signs \$305B highway bill. The Hill (Washington DC). 4 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://thehill.com/policy/finance/262171-obama-signs-305b-highway-bill.

standard.<sup>541</sup> With this standard, advisors would be required to put clients' interests first in the case of a conflict of interest, the same standard which fiduciaries are subject to.<sup>542</sup>

On 9 February 2016, the White House's Office of the Press Secretary released a fact sheet on President Obama's fiscal year 2017 budget.<sup>543</sup> Under this budget, the America's College Promise Act would be funded, letting certain students go to two-year community colleges or do two years of a bachelor-s degree program free of charge.<sup>544</sup>

The US has taken action to require retirement advisers to abide by a "fiduciary standard" as well as action to fund two years of free community college for qualifying students. However, it has not taken action to authorize USD478 billion in transport payments over 6 years, raise the federal minimum wage to USD12 per hour by 2020, expand the child care tax credit, introduce a second earner tax credit, simplify and expand education tax benefits, or updating the regulations regarding who qualifies for overtime protection. The US has made some progress towards implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy.

Thus, the United States has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Qasim Sheikh

# **European Union: 0**

The European Union has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement fiscal strategies flexibly, taking into account near-term economic conditions, while putting debt as a share of gross domestic product (GDP) on a sustainable path.

The European Union outlined the following fiscal strategies in its adjusted comprehensive growth strategy:

- Ensure sustainable public debt by maintaining broadly neutral fiscal stance in 2015/2016 for EU/euro area;
- Strengthen the link between structural reforms, investment and fiscal responsibility in support of jobs and growth;
- Improve the composition of public finances to foster growth;
- Tackle corporate tax avoidance and harmful tax competition in the EU<sup>545</sup>

On 24 November 2015, the European Commission proposed a euro-area wide insurance scheme for bank deposits and has set out further measures to reduce remaining risks in the banking sector in parallel.<sup>546</sup> The Commission said that such a scheme would strengthen the Banking Union, buttress bank depositor protection, reinforce financial stability and further reduce the link between banks and their sovereigns. Furthermore, the Single Resolution Mechanism became fully operational on 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>541</sup> Labor Department moves forward on retirement advice proposal. Reuters (Washington DC). 29 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-usa-brokers-fiduciary-idUSKCN0V7108.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>542</sup> Labor Department moves forward on retirement advice proposal. Reuters (Washington). 29 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-usa-brokers-fiduciary-idUSKCN0V7108.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>543</sup> FACT SHEET: The President's Fiscal Year 2017 Budget: Overview. Office of the Press Secretary, The White House (Washington DC). 9 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016.https://www.whitehouse.gov/the-press-office/2016/02/09/fact-sheet-presidents-fiscal-year-2017-budget-overview.
 <sup>544</sup> FACT SHEET: The President's Fiscal Year 2017 Budget: Overview. Office of the Press Secretary, The White House

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>544</sup> FACT SHEET: The President's Fiscal Year 2017 Budget: Overview. Office of the Press Secretary, The White House (Washington DC). 9 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016.https://www.whitehouse.gov/the-pressoffice/2016/02/09/fact-sheet-presidents-fiscal-year-2017-budget-overview.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>545</sup> Comprehensive Growth Strategy: European Union, G20 Turkey 2015 (Antalya), 15 November 2015. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Adjusted-Growth-Strategy-2015-EU.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>546</sup> Press Release - A stronger Banking Union: New measures to reinforce deposit protection and further reduce banking risks, 24 November 2015. Access date: 24 February 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-15-6152\_en.htm.

January 2016.<sup>547</sup> First proposed in July 2013, it is intended to bolster the resilience of the financial system and help avoid future crises by providing for the timely and effective resolution of cross-border and domestic banks. This is a step towards fulfilling the EU's medium-term objective of finalizing a genuine banking union.

On 26 November 2015, the European Commission released its Annual Growth Survey, which sets out general economic and social priorities for the EU.<sup>548</sup> It is built on the three pillars outlined in the previous year's survey — re-launching investment, pursuing structural reforms to modernise our economies, and responsible public finances. Part of ensuring responsible public finances includes enhancing coordination and surveillance of the economic policies of all euro area member states, given strong dependence and spillover effects among states. These priorities are largely in line with the adjustments to the EU's adjusted growth strategy for the G20, which reflects its continued commitment. As a result of the EU's ongoing efforts to put debt on a sustainable path, the debt-to-GDP ratio is forecast to fall from 87.8 per cent expected this year to 85.8 per cent in 2017.

On 21 January 2016, the Commission released its annual Employment and Social Developments in Europe review, which reveals the latest employment and social trends, reflects on upcoming challenges, and suggests possible policy responses.<sup>549</sup> The overarching theme of the review is the need to invest in people for economic growth. It stated that the EU could improve its economic potential by making better use of its human resources through mobility. It also encouraged the EU to promote greater labour market participation for non-EU workers, as well as women with children and older workers, especially in the context of an aging population.

On 28 January 2016, the Commission proposed an Anti Tax Avoidance Package that calls on member states to take a stronger and more coordinated stance against companies that seek to avoid paying their fair share of tax and to implement the international standards against base erosion and profit shifting.<sup>550</sup> It includes legally binding measures to block the most common methods companies use to avoid paying taxes, as well as a proposal for member states to share tax-related information on multinationals operating in the EU. The package must be submitted to the European Parliament for consultation and the European Council for adoption.<sup>551</sup> This action directly addresses the plank of the EU's adjusted 2015 growth strategy relating to tackling corporate tax avoidance.

The EU has made some progress towards implementing fiscal policy measures stated within its comprehensive growth strategy.

Thus, the European Union has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Trinh Theresa Do

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>547</sup> Press Release - Single Resolution Mechanism to come into effect for the Banking Union 31 December 2015. Access date: 25 February 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-15-6397\_en.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>548</sup> Press Release - Annual Growth Survey 2016: Strengthening the recovery and fostering convergence 26 November 2016. Access date: 25 February 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-15-6069\_en.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>549</sup> Press Release - 2015 Employment and Social Developments review: Investing in people is key to economic growth 21 January 2016. Access date: 25 February 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-16-93\_en.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>550</sup> Press Release - Fair Taxation: Commission presents new measures against corporate tax avoidance, 28 January 2016. Access date: 25 February 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-16-159\_en.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>551</sup> Press Release - Fair Taxation: Commission presents new measures against corporate tax avoidance, 28 January 2016. Access date: 25 February 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-16-159\_en.htm.

# 4. Macroeconomics: International Monetary Fund

"We reaffirm our commitment to maintaining a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF."

G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance Full Compliance		
Argentina		0		
Australia			+1	
Brazil	-1			
Canada			+1	
China			+1	
France		0		
Germany			+1	
India			+1	
Indonesia		0		
Italy			+1	
Japan			+1	
Korea			+1	
Mexico			+1	
Russia			+1	
Saudi Arabia		0		
South Africa		0		
Turkey		0		
United Kingdom		0		
United States			+1	
European Union			+1	
Average	+0.55			

## Assessment

# Background

On 15 December 2010, the International Monetary Fund (IMF) Board of Governors approved of a package of reforms concerning the institution's quotas and way of governance as part of the 14th General Review of Quotas.<sup>552</sup> On 18 December 2015, the US Congress authorized the 2010 reform package, which became effective on 26 January 2016.<sup>553,554</sup> The reform doubles quotas from approximately SDR258.5 billion to approximately SDR477 billion (about USD659 billion at current 2016 exchange rates) to better reflect the shifting weights of the IMF's member countries in the global economy.<sup>555</sup>

The core of the IMF's financial resources are extracted from quota subscriptions. A specific amount of quota is assigned to each member country of the IMF, which is determined by the country's relative economic standing amongst all other IMF members. A country's assigned quota determines

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>552</sup> Factsheet: IMF Quotas, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 13 September 2011. Access Date: 12 February
 2016. http://www.imf.org/external/np/exr/facts/quotas.htm.
 <sup>553</sup> IMF Managing Director Christine Lagarde Welcomes U.S. Congressional Approval of the 2010 Quota and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>553</sup> IMF Managing Director Christine Lagarde Welcomes U.S. Congressional Approval of the 2010 Quota and Governance Reforms (Washington) 18 December 2015. Access Date: 12 February 2016.

http://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/pr/2015/pr15573.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>554</sup> IMF Quotas (Washington) 27 January 2016. Access Date: 12 February 2016.

http://www.imf.org/external/np/exr/facts/quotas.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>555</sup> IMF Quotas (Washington) 27 January 2016. Access Date: 12 February 2016. http://www.imf.org/external/np/exr/facts/quotas.htm

their maximum financial commitment to the IMF, its voting power, and as well as the degree of the country's access to the institution's financial resources.<sup>556</sup>

The IMF Board of Governors conduct general quota reviews every five years. Any changes to the quotas have to be approved by an 85 per cent majority of the total voting power. As well, changing a member's quota requires the member's consent. Otherwise, the change cannot occur. At a general quota review, two primary concerns are addressed: (a) the size of the overall increase and (b) the distribution of the increase amongst the members. The IMF conducts the review to assess the adequacy of quotas both in terms of the members' balance of payment financing needs and their capacity to meet those needs. The review allows for increases in the members' quotas to better reflect the changes in their relative standing in the global economy.<sup>557</sup>

The 14th General Review of Quotas consists of several reforms and builds on the 2008 Quota and Voice Reform. The main outcomes of the 2010 reforms are as follows:

- 11. *Quota increase:* The IMF quotas doubled from SDR238.4 billion to SDR476.8 billion. Upon the establishment of the new quotas, there will be a corresponding reduction to the New Arrangements to Borrow (NAB). NAB is a back-stop arrangement between the IMF and a group of IMF members to provide additional lending resources to the institution, which preserves relative shares. The quota reform calls for the IMF to be adequately resourced, meaning that member countries need to provide the resources that were assigned to them in order for the IMF to operate at its maximum capacity.
- 12. Shift in quota shares: The minimum targets established in the October 2009 International Monetary and Financial Committee (IMFC) Communiqué will be exceeded with a more than 6 per cent quota shift from over-represented to under-represented members. As well, there is a more than 6 per cent shift of quota shares to dynamic Emerging Market and Developing Countries (EMDCs). When combined with the 2008 Quota and Voice Reform, the total shift in voting share to EMDCs as a whole will be 5.3 per cent.
- 13. *Protecting the voting power of the poorest:* Voting shares will be preserved for the poorest member countries, which is defined as those members in the IMF that are eligible to borrow from the Poverty Reduction and Growth Trust and whose per capita income is below the International Development Association threshold.
- 14. Quota formula and next review: The primary purpose of all General Reviews is to adjust quota shares to better reflect shifts in the global economy. Any realignment is expected to result in the increase of quota shares of dynamic economies in line with their relative positions in the global economy. The IMF will also take measures to protect the voice and shares of its poorest members.<sup>558</sup>

This new reform will result in a major realignment of the weights of the IMF member countries in the global economy. The new reform will place China as the third largest shareholder in the IMF, and the four EMDCs — China, Brazil, India, and Russia — will be amongst the ten largest members.<sup>559</sup>

Table 7 details the G20 member countries' quotas in millions of Special Drawing Rights and quota share percentage in 2010 and 12 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>556</sup> Factsheet: IMF Quotas, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 13 September 2011. Access Date: 12 February 2016. http://www.imf.org/external/np/exr/facts/quotas.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>557</sup> IMF Quotas (Washington) 27 January 2016. Access Date: 12 February 2016.

http://www.imf.org/external/np/exr/facts/quotas.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>558</sup> IMF Executive Board Approves Major Overhaul of Quotas and Governance (Washington) 5 November 2010. Access Date: 12 February 2016. http://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/pr/2010/pr10418.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>559</sup> IMF Executive Board Approves Major Overhaul of Quotas and Governance (Washington) 5 November 2010. Access Date: 12 February 2016. http://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/pr/2010/pr10418.htm

	Quota: Millions of	Quota share	Quota: Millions of	Quota share
Country	Special Drawing Rights <sup>a</sup>	percentage <sup>a</sup>	Special Drawing Rights <sup>b</sup>	percentage <sup>b</sup>
Argentina	2,117.1	0.89	2,117.1	0.64
Australia	3,236.4	1.36	6,572.4	1.98
Brazil	4,250.5	1.79	4,250.5	1.28
Canada	6,369.2	2.67	11,023.9	3.32
China	9,525.9	4.00	9,525.9	2.87
France	10,738.5	4.51	10,738.5	3.23
Germany	14,565.5	6.12	14,565.5	4.38
India	5,821.5	2.44	5,821.5	1.75
Indonesia	2,079.3	0.87	2,079.3	0.63
Italy	7,882.3	3.31	7,882.3	2.37
Japan	15,628.5	6.56	30,820.5	9.27
Korea	3.366.4	1.41	3,366.4	1.01
Mexico	3,625.7	1.52	3,625.7	1.09
Russia	5,945.4	2.50	5,945.4	1.79
Saudi Arabia	6,985.5	2.93	6,985.5	2.10
South Africa	1,868.5	0.78	1,868.5	0.56
Turkey	n/a	n/a	1,455.8	0.44
United Kingdom	10,738.5	4.51	10,738.5	3.23
United States	42,122.4	17.69	82,884.2	24.97

 Table 7: International Monetary Fund Quota and Voting Shares

*Notes:* <sup>a</sup> 2010. <sup>b</sup> As of 12 February 2016.

# **Commitment Features**

There are three components to this commitment:

Full compliance with the first part of the commitment indicates that the G20 member has contributed to maintaining a strong International Monetary Fund (IMF). A "strong" IMF is defined as the IMF being able to achieve its fundamental mission, which is to ensure the stability of the international monetary system. To achieve this mission, the IMF (a) monitors the global economy and the economies of member countries; (b) lends to countries with balance of payment difficulties; and (c) provides practical help to its member countries.<sup>560</sup> To receive full compliance, the G20 member therefore must contribute to the IMF's surveillance by self-reporting and supporting the IMF's initiatives; and cooperation and collaboration with the IMF's headquarters in Washington, D.C., and its network of Regional Technical Assistance Centres, Regional Training Centres, Regional Training Programs, Topical Trust Funds, and numerous bilateral donor-supported activities.

To acquire full compliance with the second component, the G20 member must have fully ratified and provided its newly assigned quota as indicated in the 14th General Review of Quotas. A non-compliance therefore indicates that the G20 member has either only partially met the quota or failed to meet the quota entirely.

Full compliance with the third part indicates that the G20 member has adequately resourced the IMF specifically when the Fund requests for additional funding for its initiatives and projects. The G20 member would have had to deliver all the required funding the IMF has requested. If the G20 member therefore either partially or fails to provide the requested funds to the IMF, it would be considered as a non-compliance.

Because this commitment emphasizes the maintenance of a strong, quota-based, and adequately resourced IMF, new actions are not required from the G20 members to score full compliance.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>560</sup> About the IMF (Washington). Access Date: 12 February 2016. http://www.imf.org/external/about.htm

However, the absence of supportive actions or statements, which would undermine the strength, quota reform, and adequate resourcing of the IMF would be considered as non-compliance.

## **Scoring Guidelines**

-1	The G20 member does not support the IMF's fundamental mission AND does not support a quota-based IMF AND does not adequately resources the IMF	
0	The G20 member supports the IMF's fundamental mission AND supports a quota-based IMF BUT does not adequately resource the IMF OR the G20 member supports the IMF's fundamental mission AND adequately resource the IMF BUT does not support a quota- based IMF OR The G20 member does not support the IMF's fundamental mission BUT supports a quota-based IMF AND adequately resource the IMF	
+1	The G20 member supports the IMF's fundamental mission AND supports a quota-based IMF AND adequately resources the IMF	

Lead Analyst: Fu Yuan (Andrew) Liu

# Argentina: 0

Argentina has partially complied with its commitment to maintain a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF).

On 22 January 2016, at the World Economic Forum in Davos, Argentine President Mauricio Macri indicated that he wanted the Argentine government to re-engage with the IMF. Specifically, President Macri remarked that Argentina has to "go back to the IMF in terms of fulfilling Article IV" to receive regular monitoring of economies and associated provision of policy advice from the IMF Executive Board Consultation.<sup>561</sup>

On 11 February 2016, Argentine authorities requested the IMF to publish documents on Argentina's economic development, which was prepared by the Fund's staff for informal IMF Executive Board briefings between 2013 and 2015. The Argentine government indicated that it considers the publications of these documents as part of their commitment towards transparency and accountability in their operations. The documents were prepared pursuant to the IMF's policy on excessive delays in the completion of Article IV consultations, and mandatory financial stability assessments, which requires that staff informally brief Executive Directors every 12 months on the economic developments and policies of relevant members. The objective of the policy are to promote re-engagement with members with excessively delayed consultations, and to share information with the IMF Executive Board to help it fulfill its surveillance function.<sup>562</sup>

On 27 February 2016, Argentine Finance Minister Alfonso Prat-Gay attended the G20 Finance Ministerial and Deputies Meetings in Shanghai, China. Minister Prat-Gay and other G20 representatives discussed the global financial architecture, with a special focus on the implementation of the new quota system of the IMF.<sup>563</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>561</sup> Stephen Adler and Sujata Rao, Argentina's Macri Hopes for Creditor Deal Early in 2016, Reuters (London) 23 January 2016. Access date: 10 March 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-argentina-president-idUSKCN0V00UP

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>562</sup> Policy Paper: Amendment to Steps to Address Excessive Delays in the Completion of Article IV Consultations or Mandatory Financial Stability Assessments and Application to the Case of Argentina, IMF (Washington) 11 February 2016. Access date: 10 March 2016. http://www.imf.org/external/pp/longres.aspx?id=5018

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>563</sup> G20 Finance Meet Seeks Agreements on Global Growth, Anti- Terrorism, Latin American Herald Tribune (Caracas) 27 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.laht.com/article.asp?ArticleId=2406594&CategoryId=12396

On 29 February 2016, the IMF released informal documents on the Argentine economy at the request of Argentine President Macri's government. The documents were drafted between 2013 and 2015 for the IMF Executive Board.<sup>564</sup>

There is a lack of evidence within the timeframe of the research on whether Argentina has formally accepted the shifting of the quota shares, the reshuffling of the Executive Board, or whether it has adequately resourced the IMF.

Thus, Argentina has received a score of 0.

Analysts: Jinhui Jiao

## Australia: +1

Australia has fully complied with its commitment to maintain a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF).

As of 31 January 2016, Australia has doubled its Special Drawing Rights (SDR) of SDR3,083.17 million in 2010 to SDR6,572.4 million as indicated in the 2010 IMF Quota Reform.<sup>565</sup> Since 31 December 1984, Australia has had no outstanding credit owed to the Fund.<sup>566</sup>

On 19 December 2015, Australia's Treasurer Hon. Scott Morrison welcomed the US Congress' ratification of the 2010 IMF Reform through the 2016 Consolidated Appropriations Act. Morisson further indicated that the Government of Australia has been a consistent advocate for the 2010 IMF Reform as "a credible, effective and well-resourced IMF is important to Australia's national interest."<sup>567</sup>

Through its consistent championing of the 2010 IMF Reform, Australia remains committed to the Fund's quota and governance reforms.

Thus, Australia has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Zachary Skeith

# Brazil: –1

Brazil has failed to comply with its commitment to maintain a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF).

On 22 January 2016, President Dilma Rousseff publicly denounced the IMF's initiatives concerning the future of Brazil's economy. In response to IMF's January report forecasting on the global economic growth, Brazilian President Dilma Rousseff indicated that: "I am appalled at the International Monetary Fund report, we know that the IMF talks a lot."<sup>568</sup>

Brazil has not indicated any future plans to comply with the IMF quota and governance reforms.

http://sjm.ministers.treasury.gov.au/media-release/028-2015/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>564</sup> Agence France-Presse, IMF, Argentina Move toward Repairing Rift, GlobalPost (Boston) 29 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.globalpost.com/article/6739963/2016/02/29/imf-argentina-move-toward-repairing-rift

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>565</sup> Financial Position in the Fund, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 31 January 2016. Access Date: 29
 February 2016. http://www.imf.org/external/np/fin/tad/exfin2.aspx?memberKey1=40&date1key=2016-03-02
 <sup>566</sup> IMF Credit Outstanding, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 31 January 2016. Access Date: 29 February

<sup>2016.</sup> http://www.imf.org/external/np/fin/tad/exportal.aspx?memberKey1=40&date1key=2016-01-31&category=EXC <sup>567</sup> Press Release: Australia welcomes US agreement to reform of the International Monetary Fund, Treasury of the Commonwealth of Australia (Canberra) 19 December 2015. Access Date: 29 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>568</sup> Rousseff Claims to be "Appalled" at IMF Forecast for Brazil Economy, EBC (Brasilia) 22 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://agenciabrasil.ebc.com.br/en/economia/noticia/2016-01/rousseff-claims-be-appalled-imfforecasts-brazils-economy

Thus, Brazil has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Mike Cowan

#### Canada: +1

Canada has fully complied with its commitment to maintain a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF).

On 22 December, 2015, Prime Minister Justin Trudeau met with IMF Managing Director Christine Lagarde. Trudeau "noted his government's intent to play a more active role in multilateral institutions."<sup>569</sup>

On 11 February 2016, Finance Minister Bill Morneau indicated Canada's commitment with the IMF: "I look forward to working with the IMF to effectively support its membership through high quality analysis and advice, technical assistance, and lending."<sup>570</sup>

On 23 February 2016, the IMF confirmed Canada amongst the countries that have accepted the Fund's governance reform of its Executive Board, which became effective as of 21 January 2016.<sup>571</sup>

On 23 February 2016, the IMF confirmed Canada amongst the countries that have consented to the IMF's quota reforms under the 14th General Review of Quotas, which became effective on January 2016 after a five year delay.<sup>572</sup>

On 26 February 2016, in advance of the G20 Finance Ministerial and Deputies Meeting in Shanghai, China, the Government of Canada's Finance Minister Bill Morneau reaffirmed Canada's commitment to implement economic and fiscal reforms agreed on at the 2015 G20 Antalya Summit: "I will be proud to reconfirm Canada's approach to economic growth as I work with my fellow G20 finance ministers to strengthen the global economy and help create prosperity for all of our citizens, particularly the middle class and the most vulnerable members of our societies."<sup>573</sup>

On 16 April, 2016, Finance Minister Bill Morneau met with World Bank President Dr. Jim Yong Kim, Bank of England Governor Mark Carney, U.S. Federal Reserve Chair Janet Yellen, and others. At the meeting, he said, "The IMF and others recognize the strength of Canada's new fiscal approach. Working together with the international community, we can build a strong global economy that benefits all members of society, from the middle class to those working hard to join it."<sup>574</sup>

Overall, Canada has reaffirmed its commitment to maintain a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>569</sup> Prime Minister Justin Trudeau Speaks with International Monetary Fund Managing Director Christine Lagarde, Prime Minister of Canada 22 December 2015. Access Date: 7 April 2016. http://pm.gc.ca/eng/news/2015/12/22/prime-minister-justin-trudeau-speaks-international-monetary-fund-managing-director

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>570</sup> Minister Morneau Supports Christine Lagarde for Second Term as Head of the International Monetary Fund, Department of Finance Canada (Ottawa) 11 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016.

http://www.fin.gc.ca/n16/16-021-eng.asp

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>571</sup> Acceptances of the Proposed Amendment of the Articles of Agreement on Reform of the Executive Board and Consents to 2010 Quota Increase, IMF (Washington) 23 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. https://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/misc/consents.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>572</sup> Acceptances of the Proposed Amendment of the Articles of Agreement on Reform of the Executive Board and Consents to 2010 Quota Increase, IMF (Washington) 23 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. https://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/misc/consents.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>573</sup> Minister Morneau to Tout Canada's New Path for Middle Class Growth at G20 Meeting in Shanghai, Department of Finance Canada (Ottawa) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.fin.gc.ca/n16/16-028-eng.asp

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>574</sup> Minister Morneau Finds Support for Canada's Fiscal Plan at G20, International Monetary Fund, and World Bank Meetings, 16 April 2016. Access Date: 17 April 2016. http://www.fin.gc.ca/n16/16-051-eng.asp

Thus, Canada has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Omar Bitar and Mike Cowan

## China: +1

China fully complied with its commitment to maintain a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF).

On 4 December 2015, Chinese President Xi Jinping introduced the USD60 billion aid package to Africa at the Forum on China-Africa Cooperation Johannesburg Summit (FOCAC).<sup>575</sup> The fund includes an initial capital of USD10 billion for the foundation of the China-Africa Capacity Cooperation Fund, USD5 billion of free aid and interest-free loans, USD35 billion of concessional loans and export credits, and USD5 billion of investment augmentation into the China-Africa Development Fund and Special Loans for Development of Small and Medium Enterprises in Africa.<sup>576</sup> The IMF Managing Director Christine Lagarde remarked on China's contribution to maintaining a strong IMF by stating that China "wants to work with the entire international community to create partnerships and go beyond its natural geographical zone."577

On 30 November 2015, the Executive Board of the IMF decided to include the RMB into the currency basket of the Special Drawing Rights (SDR). It will hold a weight of 10.92 per cent. The new basket will be effective on 1 October 2016.<sup>578</sup> The People's Bank of China indicated that the Government of China welcomes the decision of the IMF, and that it will go forward in promoting and safeguarding economic growth, and improving global economic governance.<sup>579</sup>

On 19 December 2015, after the United State Senate adopted the IMF's 2010 Reform, the People's Bank of China indicated that it welcomes the ratification of the reform. The Bank also indicated that the reform "will increase the representation and voice of emerging markets and developing countries in the IMF."580 The adoption of the reform places China as the third largest voting power in the IMF, with a quota share increase from 3.99 per cent to 6.39 per cent.<sup>581</sup>

On 26 February 2016, the Government of China's Premier Li Keqiang spoke from a video message to the G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors Meeting in Shanghai, China. The Premier indicated that all G20 members "need to increase communication and coordination, and work together to secure the stability of the international financial market."582

http://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/pr/2015/pr15543.htm

http://www.pbc.gov.cn/english/130721/2983967/index.html

http://www.pbc.gov.cn/goutongjiaoliu/113456/113469/2991202/index.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>575</sup> China initiates 10 bln USD fund to aid Africa development, Xinhua News Agency (Beijing) 11 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/2016-01/11/c 134999072.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>576</sup> 60 billion USD: China-Africa Cooperation Aims High, Forum on China-Africa Cooperation (Beijing) 13 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.focac.org/eng/zfgx/t1331126.htm <sup>577</sup> IMF chief welcomes China's aid package to Africa, Xinhua News Agency (Beijing) 12 January 2016. Access Date: 25

February 2016. http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/2016-01/12/c\_135002989.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>578</sup> Press Release: IMF Executive Board Completes the 2015 Review of SDR Valuation, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 1 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>579</sup> PBC Welcomes IMF Executive Board's Decision to Include the RMB into the SDR Currency Basket, The People's Bank of China (Beijing) 1 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>580</sup> IMF reforms clear last hurdle with US adoption, BBC News (London) 19 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.bbc.com/news/business-35141683

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>581</sup> People's Bank of China welcomes the US Congress' passing of the IMF 2010 Annual Governance and Reform Plan, The People's Bank of China (Beijing) 19 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>582</sup> Chinese Premier urges G20 policy coordination, Xinhua News Agency (Beijing) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://news.xinhuanet.com/english/2016-02/26/c 135135246.htm

On 19 April 2016, the foreign ministers of China, Russia and India issued a joint communiqué calling for further reforms at the International Monetary Fund granting emerging economies a greater voice. The joint statement follows the close of the 14th Russia-India-China Foreign Ministers Meeting held this year in Moscow. In it, the countries' ministers welcomed implementation of draft reforms from 2010 meant to raise quotas and reallocate voting shares at the IMF to grant developing countries a greater role in international monetary policy. The ministers went on to call on the IMF to push forward with further reforms to give emerging markets and developing nations greater representation and more say at the Fund "as quickly as possible." The communique also called for greater international and regional coordination by the three nations and reaffirmed China and Russia's support of India's desire for a greater role at the United Nations.<sup>583</sup>

China has taken action to support and adequately resource the IMF.

Thus, China has received a score of +1.

Analysts: Arthur Lui

## France: 0

France has partially complied with its International Monetary Fund (IMF) quota and governance reform commitment.

On 17 December 2015, a French court ordered Christine Lagarde to stand trial over her role in the payout of 400 million euros to businessman Bernard Tapie.<sup>584</sup> French Finance Minister Michel Sapin said, "she is innocent until proven guilty and should not be prevented from carrying out her IMF duties."<sup>585</sup>

As of 27 February 2016, France's voting shares in the IMF Executive Board account for 4.11 per cent.<sup>586</sup> France has therefore failed to comply with the governance reform.

As of 27 February 2016, its quota subscriptions account for 4.31 per cent.<sup>587</sup> France has therefore partially succeeded in reducing its quota subscriptions.

On 16 April 2016, Finance Minister Michel Sapin spoke to the International Monetary and Financial Committee, specifically reaffirming France's commitment to the 2010 IMF reform initiative. He said "an extension of the use of special drawing rights could be a factor of greater stability in the current transitions. The IMF's contribution in the coming months will be essential for future discussions. Finally, I welcome the entry into force of the 2010 Reforms, which strengthen the resources available to the IMF by doubling the Fund's permanent resources."<sup>588</sup>

The Government of France's Legislative Assembly has failed to implement or discuss the country's quota subscriptions to the IMF. However, it has partially reduced its voting shares to the level indicated in the 2010 IMF Governance Reform.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>583</sup> China, India, Russia call for more reforms at IMF, Fast FT 19 April 2101, Access Date: 11 May 2016. http://www.ft.com/fastft/2016/04/19/china-india-russia-call-for-more-reforms-at-imf/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>584</sup> IMF Chief Lagarde to face French trial over Tapie affair, Reuters 17 December 2015. Access Date: 17 April 2016. http://uk.reuters.com/article/uk-lagarde-investigation-idUKKBN0U022Y20151217

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>585</sup> ibid

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>586</sup> IMF Executive Directors and Voting Power, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 27 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. https://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/memdir/eds.aspx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>587</sup> IMF Members' Quotas and Voting Power, and IMF Board of Governors, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 27 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. https://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/memdir/members.aspx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>588</sup> IMFC Statement by Michel Sapin Minister of Finance and Public Accounts, France, IMF 16 April 2016. Access Date: 17 April 2016. https://www.imf.org/External/spring/2016/imfc/statement/eng/fra.pdf.

Thus, France has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Germán Andres Guberman and Mike Cowan

## Germany: +1

Germany has fully complied with its commitment to maintain a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF).

On 18 December 2015, the Government of Germany's central bank, the Deurche Bundesbank, indicated that it welcomes the US Congress' ratification of the 2010 IMF Quota and Governance Reforms. German has ratified the reform package back in 2012. Germany, the IMF's third-largest member with a voting share of 5.8 per cent, will be affected by the quota shift. Its voting share in the future will be 5.3 per cent, making the country the Fund's fourth-largest shareholder after the US, Japan, and China.<sup>589</sup>

On 20 January 2016, the German President Joachim Gauck indicated at the World Economic Forum in Davos, Switzerland, that the German government supports the IMF's position on refugees as being able to benefit the European economies. President Gauck indicated the German government's willingness to devote necessary funding to solve Europe's refugee problem, and remarked that the refugee quotas are "morally and politically necessary."<sup>590</sup>

Germany has fully complied with its commitment towards the IMF's fundamental mission and maintaining a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF.

Thus, Germany has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Jinhui Jiao

#### India: +1

India fully complied with its commitment to maintain a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF).

On 26 January 2016, following the ratification of the 2010 IMF Quota and Governance Reforms, India's voting shares increased to 2.69 per cent from the previous 2.3 per cent, while its Special Drawing Rights (SDR) quota increased to 2.81 per cent. India has consented to the quota increases indicated in the 14<sup>th</sup> General Review of Quotas.<sup>591</sup>

The IMF's April 2016 World Economic outlook titled 'Too slow for too long' reported India will be the fastest growing major economy in 2016-17 growing at 7.5 per cent, ahead of China, at a time when global growth is facing increasing downside risks. India's growth will continue to be driven by private consumption, which has benefited from lower energy prices and higher real incomes, IMF

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>589</sup> Press release: Bundesbank Welcomes Ratification of IMF Quota and Governance Reform by USA, Deutsche Bundesbank (Frankfurt) 18 December 2015. Access date: 23 February 2016.

https://www.bundesbank.de/Redaktion/EN/Pressemitteilungen/BBK/2015/2015\_12\_18\_usa\_ratification\_imf\_reform.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>590</sup> Refugee crisis: Germany reinstates controls at Austrian border, The Guardian (London) 20 January 2016. Access Date: 29 February 2016. http://www.theguardian.com/world/2015/sep/13/germany-to-close-borders-exit-schengen-emergency-measures

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>591</sup> Factsheet: IMF Members' Quotas and Voting Power, and IMF Board of Governors, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 25 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

said, adding that "With the revival of sentiment and pickup in industrial activity, a recovery of private investment is expected to further strengthen growth."<sup>592</sup>

On 19 April 2016, the foreign ministers of China, Russia and India issued a joint communiqué calling for further reforms at the International Monetary Fund granting emerging economies a greater voice. The joint statement follows the close of the 14th Russia-India-China Foreign Ministers Meeting held this year in Moscow. In it, the countries' ministers welcomed implementation of draft reforms from 2010 meant to raise quotas and reallocate voting shares at the IMF to grant developing countries a greater role in international monetary policy. The ministers went on to call on the IMF to push forward with further reforms to give emerging markets and developing nations greater representation and more say at the Fund "as quickly as possible." The communique also called for greater international and regional coordination by the three nations and reaffirmed China and Russia's support of India's desire for a greater role at the United Nations.<sup>593</sup>

India has fully complied with its commitment towards the IMF's fundamental mission and maintaining a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF.

Thus, India has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Jinhui Jiao

## Indonesia: 0

Indonesia has partially complied with its commitment to maintain a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF).

As of 9 March 2016, Indonesia has not doubled its Special Drawing Rights (SDR) of SDR2,079.3 million as indicated in the 2010 IMF Quota Reform.<sup>594</sup>

On 11 February 2015, at the G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors Meeting in Istanbul, Turkey, the Indonesian delegation expressed its concerns on the delay of the governance reform and quota addition of IMF, taking into account that this agenda was agreed in 2010.<sup>595</sup>

There is a lack of evidence within the timeframe of the research on whether India has formally accepted the reshuffling of the IMF Executive Board or the IMF's fundamental mission overall.

Thus, Indonesia has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Zachary Skeith

#### Italy: +1

Italy has fully complied with its commitment to maintain a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>592</sup> Live Mint, India remains a bright spot in IMF's global economic forecast 19 April 2016. Access Date: 11 May 2016. http://www.livemint.com/Politics/DVPbsd4nDOWGSDaOhggvNO/India-bright-spot-in-IMF-global-economic-forecast.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>593</sup> China, India, Russia call for more reforms at IMF, Fast FT 19 April 2101, Access Date: 11 May 2016. http://www.ft.com/fastft/2016/04/19/china-india-russia-call-for-more-reforms-at-imf/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>594</sup> Acceptances of the Proposed Amendment of the Articles of Agreement on Reform of the Executive Board and Consents to 2010 Quota Increase, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 23 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. https://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/misc/consents.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>595</sup> G20 Finance Ministers and Central Bank Governors Meeting Istanbul, Turkey, 9 – 10 February 2015 "Investment Strategy to Boost Growth", Ministry of Finance Republic of Indonesia (Jakarta) 11 February 2015. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.kemenkeu.go.id/en/SP/g20-finance-ministers-and-central-bank-governors-meeting-istanbul-turkey-9-%E2%80%93-10-february-2015

Italy has provided over SDR6.9 million to the New Arrangements to Borrow (NAB). While quota subscriptions of member countries are the IMF's main source of financing, the Fund can supplement its quota resources through borrowing if it believes that they might fall short of members' needs. Through the NAB, the IMF's main backstop for quota resources, a number of member countries and institutions stand ready to lend additional resources to the IMF. The NAB is a set of credit arrangements between the IMF and 38 member countries and Institutions, including a number of emerging market countries. The NAB is used in circumstances in which the IMF needs to supplement its quota resources for lending purposes.<sup>596</sup>

As of April 2016, the country's voting shares in the IMF account for 3.08 per cent.<sup>597</sup> This is lower than its pre-2010 per cent of 3.24 per cent, but higher than its 2010 Reform target of 3.01 per cent.<sup>598</sup> Italy has therefore partially complied with the governance reform.

As of 27 February 2016, the country's quota shares account for 3.23 per cent <sup>599</sup> of the IMF's Special Drawing Rights (SDR). This is lower than its pre-2010 per cent of 3.30 per cent, but higher than its 2010 Reform target of per cent of 3.16.<sup>600</sup> Italy has therefore partially complied in reducing its quota shares.

Italy has fully complied with its commitment towards the IMF's fundamental mission and maintaining a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF.

Thus, Italy has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Germán Andres Guberman

#### Japan: +1

Japan fully complied with its commitment to maintain a strong and quota-based International Monetary Fund (IMF).

On 16 April 2016 the Honorable Deputy Prime Minister of Japan and Governor of the IMF for Japan Taro Aso, at the Thirty-Three Meeting of the International Monetary and Financial Committee released a statement supporting the IMF and detailing some of the support Japan has extended. "Japan has actively supported the Fund's efforts by taking such initiatives as providing the Fund with a credit line of 100 billion US.Dollar in 2009, and 60 billion US Dollar in 2012. We hope that the Fund will continue to play an essential role toward achieving both international financial stability and sustainable growth in the global economy. For the IMF, we welcome the entry-into-effect of the 2010 Reforms that were agreed upon by all member countries 5 years ago, with a view to maintaining and augmenting its legitimacy, effectiveness, and credibility. As the 14th quota increase takes effect, the size of the quota has doubled, and the proportion of the quota resource in the Fund's overall resources has also increased considerably. Since we are not of the view that the Fund falls significantly short of its necessary resources for now, due consideration should be given to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>596</sup> IMF Standing Borrowing Arrangements, IMF 6 April 2016. Access Date: 13 July 2016. https://www.imf.org/external/np/exr/facts/gabnab.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>597</sup> IMF Executive Directors and Voting Power, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 27 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. https://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/memdir/eds.aspx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>598</sup> Illustration of Proposed Quota and Voting Shares, International Monetary Fund (Washington). Access Date: 27 February 2016. https://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/pr/2010/pdfs/pr10418\_table.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>599</sup> IMF Members' Quotas and Voting Power, and IMF Board of Governors, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 27 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. https://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/memdir/members.aspx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>600</sup> Illustration of Proposed Quota and Voting Shares, International Monetary Fund (Washington). Access Date: 27 February 2016. https://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/pr/2010/pdfs/pr10418\_table.pdf

careful examination of the adequacy of the Fund's resources in the further review of the quota. We need to check whether there is any room for improving the IMF's existing lending framework."<sup>601</sup>

On 18 April 2016, Japan has completed the requirements for adherence to the International Monetary Fund's Special Data Dissemination Standard (SDDS) Plus—the highest tier of the Data Standards Initiatives. Japan's SDDS Plus data are now posted on the Dissemination Standards Bulletin Board. <sup>602</sup> "In order to have a more accurate grasp of the global economies and to prevent the next financial crises, it is critical to promote data transparency," said Masatsugu Asakawa, Vice-Minister of Finance for International Affairs. <sup>603</sup> "As an adherent to the SDDS Plus, we are firmly committed to preparing highly transparent and detailed economic and financial data. We also urge further international efforts toward more transparent and reliable statistical data collection, and strongly believe that the SDDS Plus will play a key role."

Japan has fully complied with its commitment towards the IMF's fundamental mission and maintaining a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF.

Thus, Japan has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Mike Cowan

## Korea: +1

Korea has fully complied with its commitment to maintain a strong and quota-based International Monetary Fund (IMF).

Korea has provided over SDR3.3 million to the New Arrangements to Borrow (NAB). While quota subscriptions of member countries are the IMF's main source of financing, the Fund can supplement its quota resources through borrowing if it believes that they might fall short of members' needs. Through the NAB, the IMF's main backstop for quota resources, a number of member countries and institutions stand ready to lend additional resources to the IMF. The NAB is a set of credit arrangements between the IMF and 38 member countries and Institutions, including a number of emerging market countries. The NAB is used in circumstances in which the IMF needs to supplement its quota resources for lending purposes.<sup>605</sup>

On 1 December 2015, the Korean government's Minister of Finance, Yoo Il-ho, indicated his support for the inclusion of the renminbi into the IMF Special Drawing Rights (SDR) basket.<sup>606</sup>

On 11 December 2015, the Bank of Korea, together with the IMF, hosted a conference "Leverage in Asia: Lessons from the Past, What's New Now?, and Where to Watch Out For?" in Seoul, Korea. The conference was sponsored by the Korean Ministry of Strategy and Finance.<sup>607</sup>

https://www.imf.org/external/np/exr/facts/gabnab.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>601</sup> Press Release: IMF Executive Board Completes the 2015 Review of SDR Valuation, IMF 16 April 2016. Access Date: 11 May 2016. http://www.imf.org/external/country/jpn/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>602</sup> Japan Adheres to the International Monetary Fund's Special Data Dissemination Standard Plus Press Release No. 16/175, IMF 18 April 2016. Access Date: 11 May 2016. http://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/pr/2016/pr16175.htm

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>603</sup> Japan Adheres to the International Monetary Fund's Special Data Dissemination Standard Plus Press Release No.
 16/175, IMF 18 April 2016. Access Date: 11 May 2016. http://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/pr/2016/pr16175.htm
 <sup>604</sup> Japan Adheres to the International Monetary Fund's Special Data Dissemination Standard Plus Press Release No.

<sup>16/175,</sup> IMF 18 April 2016. Access Date: 11 May 2016. http://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/pr/2016/pr16175.htm <sup>605</sup> IMF Standing Borrowing Arrangements, IMF 6 April 2016. Access Date: 13 July 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>606</sup> Seoul eyes opportunity in yuan's SDR status, Chung Joo-won, The Korea Herald (Seoul) 1 December 2015. Access Date: 29 February 2016. http://www.koreaherald.com/view.php?ud=20151201001002

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>607</sup> Juyeol Lee: Leverage in Asia, Bank for International Settlements (Basel), 11 December 2015. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.bis.org/review/r151221d.htm

Korea has fully complied with its commitment to support the IMF's fundamental mission and adequately resource the IMF

Thus, Korea has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Jinhui Jiao

#### Mexico: +1

Mexico fully complied to maintain a strong, quota based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF).

On 17 November 2015, the IMF commended progress made by Mexico and its cooperation and coordination with the IMF. The press release stated, "Directors commended the authorities for their commitment to gradually consolidate public finances and set the ratio of public debt to GDP on a downward trajectory. They welcomed the targeted reduction in the public sector borrowing requirement and the proposed reform of fuel excise taxes aimed at reducing carbon emissions and stabilizing tax revenues over the medium term. Directors encouraged the authorities to also eliminate inefficient electricity subsidies while protecting vulnerable households through targeted transfers. Directors welcomed ongoing efforts to enhance fiscal discipline and accountability, while at the same time retaining sufficient flexibility to respond to changing circumstances."<sup>608</sup>

On 23 November 2015, the IMF reinstated Mexico's access to Flexible Credit Line (FLC) resources.<sup>609</sup> The two-year FLC agreement was approved in November 2014 and is equivalent to SDR47.29 billion, which acts as a flexible line of credit used for crisis prevention purposes.<sup>610</sup> The IMF Executive Board's First Managing Deputy Managing Director and Acting Chairman, David Lipton, indicated that the Mexican government has expressed their continued commitment to lower the Gross Domestic Product (GDP)-to-debt ratio and rebuild foreign exchange reserves.<sup>611</sup>

On 17 February 2016, the Mexican Foreign Exchange Commission decided to suspend the sale of dollar mechanisms immediately. This is an attempt to increase the value of the Mexican peso.<sup>612</sup>

On 17 February 2016, the Government of Mexico also decided to cut the spending of Federal Public Administration by MXN132.3 billion to maintain macroeconomic stability.<sup>613</sup> Both of these actions are aligned with the IMF's recommendations from November 2015 to help Mexico maintain its economic stability.

On 19 February 2016, the Governor of the Bank of Mexico and the Chairman of the International Monetary and Financial Committee (IMFC), Agustín Carstens, congratulated and supported

http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/scr/2015/cr15322.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>608</sup> IMF Executive Board Concludes 2015 Article IV Consultation with Mexico Press Release No. 15/519, IMF 15 November 2015. Access date: 11 May 2016. http://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/pr/2015/pr15519.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>609</sup> Mexico Review Under the Flexible Credit Line Agreement-Press Release; and Staff Report, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 24 November 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

http://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/scr/2015/cr15322.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>610</sup> IMF Executive Board Approves New Two-Year US\$70 Billion Flexible Credit Line Arrangement with Mexico, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 26 November 2014. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

https://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/pr/2014/pr14543.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>611</sup> Mexico Review Under the Flexible Credit Line Agreement-Press Release; and Staff Report, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 24 November 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>612</sup> La Comisión de Cambios decide suspender a partir de este anuncio los mecanismos de ventas de dólares vigentes, Secretarío de Hacienda y Crédito Público (Mexico City) 17 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

http://www.gob.mx/shcp/prensa/anuncio-de-la-comision-de-cambios-17-febrero-2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>613</sup> Ajuste preventivo al gasto de la Administración Pública Federal para refrendar su compromiso con la estabilidad macroeconómica, Secretarío de Hacienda y Crédito Público (Mexico City) 17 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.gob.mx/shcp/prensa/comunicado-de-prensa-020-2016

Christine Lagarde for her work as the Managing Director of the IMF. Carstens expressed his confidence in Lagarde and the IMF's ability to strengthen the international monetary system.<sup>614</sup>

Mexico has fully complied with its commitment towards the IMF's fundamental mission and maintaining a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF.

Thus, Mexico has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Emily Shaw

#### Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with its commitment to maintain a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF).

As of 27 February 2016, its quota shares account for 2.76 per cent<sup>615</sup> of the IMF Special Drawing Rights (SDR). This is lower than its pre-2010 commitment of 2.782 per cent, but marginally higher than its 2010 Quota Reform target of 2.7 per cent.<sup>616</sup> Russia has therefore partially succeeded in reducing its quota shares.

On 19 April 2016, the foreign ministers of China, Russia and India issued a joint communiqué calling for further reforms at the International Monetary Fund granting emerging economies a greater voice. The joint statement follows the close of the 14th Russia-India-China Foreign Ministers Meeting held this year in Moscow. In it, the countries' ministers welcomed implementation of draft reforms from 2010 meant to raise quotas and reallocate voting shares at the IMF to grant developing countries a greater role in international monetary policy. The ministers went on to call on the IMF to push forward with further reforms to give emerging markets and developing nations greater representation and more say at the Fund "as quickly as possible." The communique also called for greater international and regional coordination by the three nations and reaffirmed China and Russia's support of India's desire for a greater role at the United Nations.<sup>617</sup>

Russia has fully complied with its commitment towards the IMF's fundamental mission and maintaining a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF.

Thus, Russia has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Germán Andres Guberman

#### Saudi Arabia: 0

Saudi Arabia has partially complied with its commitment to maintain a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF).

As of 9 March 2016, Saudi Arabia has not doubled its Special Drawing Rights (SDR) of SDR6,985.50 million as indicated in the 2010 IMF Quota Reform.<sup>618</sup>

<sup>616</sup> Illustration of Proposed Quota and Voting Shares, International Monetary Fund (Washington). Access Date: 27 February 2016. https://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/pr/2010/pdfs/pr10418\_table.pdf

http://www.ft.com/fastft/2016/04/19/china-india-russia-call-for-more-reforms-at-imf/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>614</sup> Statement by Agustín Carstens Governor of Banco de Mexico and Chairman of the IMFC, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 19 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

http://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/pr/2016/pr1667.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>615</sup> IMF Members' Quotas and Voting Power, and IMF Board of Governors, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 27 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. https://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/memdir/members.aspx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>617</sup> China, India, Russia call for more reforms at IMF, Fast FT 19 April 2101, Access Date: 11 May 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>618</sup> Acceptances of the Proposed Amendment of the Articles of Agreement on Reform of the Executive Board and Consents to 2010 Quota Increase, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 23 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. https://www.imf.org/external/np/sec/misc/consents.htm

There is a lack of evidence within the timeframe of the research on whether Saudi Arabia is committed to the IMF's fundamental mission, the Fund's quota and governance reforms, or the adequate resourcing of the IMF.

Thus, Saudi Arabia has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Zachary Skeith

# South Africa: 0

South Africa has partially complied with its commitment to maintain a strong, quota based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF).

On 31 January 2016, South Africa agreed to the IMF's General Anti-Avoidance Rule (GAAR), and ensured that it would meet its aims. The central goal of GAAR is to stop any "unacceptable tax avoidance practices."<sup>619</sup>

There is a lack of evidence within the timeframe of the research on whether South Africa is committed to the IMF's fundamental mission, the Fund's quota and governance reforms, or the adequate resourcing of the IMF.

Thus, South Africa has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Emily Shaw

# Turkey: 0

Turkey has partially complied with its commitment to maintain a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF).

On 3 February, 2016, Turkish President Recep Erdogan said, "The IMF is not just managing loans and money. It gives you the loan and then tries to govern your politics. What kind of IMF is that?"<sup>620</sup>

As of 18 February 2016, Turkey's voting shares increased from 0.61 per cent to 0.95 per cent. Turkey has consented to the voting share increase of Emerging Market and Developing Countries (EMDCs) as indicated in the 2010 IMF Governance Reform.<sup>621</sup>

There is a lack of evidence within the timeframe of the research on whether Turkey is committed to the IMF's fundamental mission, the Fund's quota and governance reforms, or the adequate resourcing of the IMF.

Thus, Turkey has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Arthur Lui and Mike Cowan

# United Kingdom: 0

The United Kingdom has partially complied with its commitment to maintain a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>619</sup> Introducing a General Anti-Avoidance Rule (GAAR): Ensuring That a GAAR Achieves Its Purpose, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 31 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

https://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/tltn/2016/tltn1601.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>620</sup> Why Turkey's Erdogen Hates the IMF, Cihan 9 February 2016. Access Date: 17 April 2016.

https://www.cihan.com.tr/en/turkey-erdogan-hates-imf-2008288.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>621</sup> Turkey becomes 20<sup>th</sup> highest voting power in IMF, Hurriyet Daily News (Istanbul) 23 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/turkey-becomes-20th-highest-voting-power-in-imf.aspx?pageID=238&nID=95568&NewsCatID=345

As of 31 January 2016, the UK has not doubled its Special Drawing Rights (SDR) of SDR10,738.5 million to the IMF as indicated in the 2010 IMF Quota Reform.<sup>622</sup>

On 20 January 2016, UK Chancellor of Exchequer George Osborne and India's Finance Minister Arun Jaitley released a joint statement welcoming the ratification of the 2010 IMF reform by US Congress.<sup>623</sup>

On 14 April 2016, IMF Managing Director Christine Lagarde made an "impassioned plea" for Britain to stay in the European Union. This plea was made in anticipation of Britain's June referendum, in which the nation will decide whether to stay a member of the international institution.<sup>624</sup>

There is a lack of evidence within the timeframe of the research on whether the UK is committed to the IMF's fundamental mission, governance reforms, or the adequate resourcing of the IMF.

Thus, the United Kingdom has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Zachary Skeith

## United States: +1

The United States has fully complied with its commitment to maintain a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF).

On 18 December 2015, the US Senate voted to adopt the 2010 IMF Quota and Governance Reforms, which will effectively boost the influence of the Emerging Markets and Developing Countries (EMDCs) within the Fund.<sup>625</sup>

On 18 December 2015, in a statement regarding the US Senate's passing of the bill, the US Treasury Secretary Jacob Lew noted that: "The IMF reforms reinforce the central leadership role of the United States in the global economic system and demonstrate our commitment to maintaining that position."<sup>626</sup>

On 16 April, 2016, the United States Treasury Secretary, Jacob J. Lew, delivered a statement to the International Monetary and Financial Committee. In his statement, he said, "thanks to bipartisan Congressional support for the IMF quota and governance reforms, the United States has reaffirmed its commitment to a strong IMF."

The US has fully complied with its commitment towards the IMF's fundamental mission and maintaining a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF.

Thus, the United States has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Mike Cowan

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>622</sup> Financial Position in the Fund, International Monetary Fund (Washington) 31 January 2016. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://www.imf.org/external/np/fin/tad/exfin2.aspx?memberKey1=1010&date1key=2016-03-04

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>623</sup> India, UK welcome US Congress passing IMF quota reform, The Economic Times (London) 20 January 2016. Access Date: 3 March 2016. http://articles.economictimes.indiatimes.com/2016-01-20/news/69930981\_1\_imf-quota-reforms-eighth-largest-quota-holder-quota-increase

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>624</sup> IMF Chief Issues Impassioned Plea for Britain to Stay in EU, The Guardian 14 April 2016. Access Date: 17 April 2016. http://www.theguardian.com/business/2016/apr/14/imf-chief-issues-impassioned-plea-for-britain-to-stay-in-eu

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>625</sup> Senate Passes IMF Reform in Budget Bill, Reuters (London) 19 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-usa-fiscal-imf-idUSKBN0U204J20151219

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>626</sup> IMF Reforms Clear Last Hurdle with US Adoption, BBC (London) 19 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.bbc.com/news/business-35141683

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>627</sup> IMFC Statement by Jacob J. Lew Secretary of the Treasury, United States, IMF 16 April 2016. Access Date: 17 April 2016. https://www.imf.org/External/spring/2016/imfc/statement/eng/usa.pdf

#### European Union: +1

The European Union has fully complied with its commitment to maintain a strong, quota-based, and adequately resourced International Monetary Fund (IMF).

On 17 February 2016, Mario Draghi, the president of the European Central Bank (ECB), expressed his support for the IMF's financial assistance and economic adjustment programmes: "From an ECB perspective, the IMF's participation would be highly desirable given its considerable expertise in designing and monitoring financial assistance programmes."<sup>628</sup>

On 13 January 2016, in an interview with the European Commissioner for Economic and Financial Affairs, Taxation and Customs Pierre Moscovici, the Commissioner indicated that the IMF's role in the European Union (EU) is necessary: "For many [EU] member countries, not only Germany, the participation of the IMF is an absolute necessity."<sup>629</sup>

On 14 January 2016, after consulting with the IMF, the Eurogroup announced that it "agreed with the IMF's evaluation of the economic outlook for the euro area and of its policy challenges."<sup>630</sup> The consultations between the European Union and the IMF took place during December 2015. The announcement was delivered by the Eurogroup President Jeroen Dijsselbloem.<sup>631</sup>

On 12 February 2016, the European Commission affirmed that its Macro-Financial Assistance (MFA) to Tunisia aligns with and supports the IMF's aims for fiscal programme, particularly in relation to consolidation and external stabilization.<sup>632</sup>

The EU has fully complied with its commitment towards the IMF's fundamental mission and maintaining a strong, quota-based and adequately resourced IMF.

Thus, the EU has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Omar Bitar

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>628</sup> ECB's Draghi: IMF's Participation in the Greek Program Is 'Highly Desirable', GreekReporter (Athens) 19 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://greece.greekreporter.com/2016/02/19/ecbs-draghi-imfs-participation-in-the-greek-program-is-highly-desirable/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>629</sup> Moscovici tells Greece not to 'play games' with IMF, Politico (Arlington County, Virginia) 14 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.politico.eu/article/moscovici-greece-not-play-games-imf-bailout-tsipras-creditors/ <sup>630</sup> Eurogroup, 14/01/2016, European Council (Brussels) 14 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016.

http://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/meetings/eurogroup/2016/01/14/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>631</sup> Remarks by J.Dijsselbloem following the Eurogroup meeting of 14 January 2016, European Council (Brussels) 14 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/press/press-releases/2016/01/14-eurogroup-jd-remarks/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>632</sup> Commission Staff Working Document, European Commission (Brussels) 12 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/economy\_finance/eu\_borrower/documents/20160212\_ex-ante\_eval\_mfa\_tunisia\_en.pdf

# 5. Trade: Protectionism

"We further reaffirm our longstanding commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures"

G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Argentina		0	
Australia			+1
Brazil		0	
Canada			+1
China			+1
France		0	
Germany		0	
India		0	
Indonesia			+1
Italy		0	
Japan			+1
Korea		0	
Mexico			+1
Russia	-1		
Saudi Arabia			+1
South Africa		0	
Turkey		0	
United Kingdom			+1
United States			+1
European Union		0	
Average		+0.40	

## Assessment

# Background

The G20 has previously committed to reducing barriers to international trade in the form of protectionist measures. The commitment to reduce protectionist barriers has featured in G20 summit documents since the Washington Summit of 2008. This commitment was part of the response by the G20 to the 2008 financial crisis and has previously been extended three times: at the 2009 London Summit, at the 2010 Toronto Summit, and at the Los Cabos Summit until the end of 2014. At the St. Petersburg Summit the commitment was once again extended until the end of 2016.<sup>633</sup>

In 2016, again, the goal is of ensuring a more robust recovery and a healthier global economy by reducing barriers to trade posed by protectionist policies. That this commitment has featured in past summits and remains important to this day is a reflection of its significance — not only as a measure following the financial crisis, but also as a long-term goal for a healthy global economy.

During the most recent G20 Summit in Antalya, Turkey, the G20 Member countries once again reaffirmed their commitment to a standstill and roll back on protectionist measures.<sup>634</sup> To achieve this aim, the G20 asked the World Trade Organisation (WTO), the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), and the United Nations Conference on Trade and

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>633</sup> Russia G20, G20 leaders' declaration, Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development September 2013.
 Access Date: 13 March, 2016. http://www.oecd.org/g20/summits/saint-petersburg/Saint-Petersburg-Declaration.pdf
 <sup>634</sup> G20 Leaders' Communiqué, Antalya Summit, 15-16 November 2015. Access Date: 12 February 2016. http://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/press/press-releases/2015/11/16-g20-summit-antalya-communique/

Development (UNCTAD) to share the responsibility of monitoring and measuring of trade and investment restrictive measures.  $^{635}$ 

A 2015 report from the European Parliament has identified border measures, which includes export restrictions, as the predominant form of trade protectionism among G20 Member countries.<sup>636</sup> In addition, the report highlights behind-the-border measures, including measures relating to government procurement and restrictions associated with technical regulations, as the second common form of trade protectionism.<sup>637</sup> Furthermore, ongoing uncertainty in the global economy underlines the need for G20 economies to show restraint in the imposition of new measures and to actively eliminate existing ones. Of the 1,244 restrictive measures recorded by this exercise since the onset of the crisis in 2008, only 282 have been removed.<sup>638</sup> The total number of restrictive measures still in place now stands at 962 — up by 12 per cent by November 2014.<sup>639</sup>

In response to the increasing stockpile of restrictive measures, the WTO, OECD, and UNCTAD have called upon the G20 to roll back on existing forms of protectionism.<sup>640</sup> Compliance with the trade commitment must therefore also be measured in terms of how each member country has rolled back on protectionist measures.

According to a 2015 report from the B20, the G20 must prioritize rolling back on localization barriers to trade (LBTs), as they has been identified as an emerging and damaging non-tariff barrier.<sup>641</sup> LBTs can be defined as any measure that demands that a good or service maintains a certain amount of domestic input, at the expense of foreign investment.<sup>642</sup> This includes forced local content requirements, forced local procurement, forced local ownership, or forced data storage and processing or obstacles to data migration.<sup>643</sup>

# **Commitment Features**

This commitment mandates that G20 members both standstill — cease the implementation of new protectionist measures, while also rolling back — reducing or eliminating, existing protectionist measures. Raising new measures includes both the act of implementing a protectionist measure as well as announcing or enacting plans to implement new barriers as it is considered critically important that the state act in a way that discourages protectionism. Furthermore, this commitment obliges G20 members to vigilantly monitor progress. Monitoring progress can include self-reporting,

Department, European Parliament, (Brussels) 2015. Access Date: 12 February 2016. http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2015/549028/EXPO\_STU%282015%29549028\_EN.pdf <sup>638</sup> Reports on G20 Trade and Investment Measures (Mid-May to Mid-October 2015), WTO, OECD, UNCTAD, 30

October 2015. Access Date: 12 February 2016.

https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/news15\_e/g20\_joint\_summary\_oct15\_e.pdf

https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/news15\_e/g20\_joint\_summary\_oct15\_e.pdf

<sup>640</sup> Reports on G20 Trade and Investment Measures (Mid-May to Mid-October 2015), WTO, OECD, UNCTAD, 30 October 2015. Access Date: 12 February 2016.

https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/news15\_e/g20\_joint\_summary\_oct15\_e.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>635</sup> G20 Leaders' Communiqué, Antalya Summit, 15-16 November 2015. Access Date: 12 February 2016.

http://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/press/press-releases/2015/11/16-g20-summit-antalya-communique/ <sup>636</sup> Barone, Barbara, and Bendini, Roberto, Protectionism in the G20, Directorate-General for External Policies, Policy Department, European Parliament, (Brussels) 2015. Access Date: 12 February 2016.

http://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/STUD/2015/549028/EXPO\_STU%282015%29549028\_EN.pdf 637 Barone, Barbara, and Bendini, Roberto, Protectionism in the G20, Directorate-General for External Policies, Policy

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>639</sup> Reports on G20 Trade and Investment Measures (Mid-May to Mid-October 2015), WTO, OECD, UNCTAD, 30 October 2015. Access Date: 12 February 2016.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>641</sup> B20 Trade Taskforce Policy Paper, B20 Turkey 2015, September 2015. Access Date: 12 February 2016.
 http://b20turkey.org/policy-papers/b20turkey\_trade.pdf

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>642</sup> B20 Trade Taskforce Policy Paper, B20 Turkey 2015, September 2015. Access Date: 12 February 2016.
 http://b20turkey.org/policy-papers/b20turkey\_trade.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>643</sup> B20 Trade Taskforce Policy Paper, B20 Turkey 2015, September 2015. Access Date: 12 February 2016. http://b20turkey.org/policy-papers/b20turkey\_trade.pdf

establishing or supporting monitoring agencies and providing collective reports for the G20 as a whole.

Protectionist measures are implemented and designed to keep out imports while supporting domestic industries. Global Trade Alert, a monitoring service operated by the London-based Centre for Economic Policy Research, defines protectionism broadly as anything that hurts another country's commercial interests.<sup>644</sup> It includes government bailouts of domestic companies, wage subsidies, export and VAT rebates, export credits and financing from state-owned banks.<sup>645</sup> Whether the measures in question are positive or negative for the economy or country is not considered.<sup>646</sup>

Protectionist trade barriers, according to the World Trade Organization (WTO) include instruments such as "tariffs, non-tariff measures, subsidies, and burdensome administrative procedures regarding imports."<sup>647</sup> Subsidies in particular cause competition-distorting effects. The WTO states, "the longer the subsidies remain in place, the more they will distort market-based production and investment decisions globally, the greater will become the threat of chronic trade distortions developing, and the more difficult it will become to correct those distortions."<sup>648</sup> Investment barriers include, but are not limited to measures that discriminate against foreign-based institutions or act as barriers to outward investment flows.

# **Scoring Guidelines**

-1	New protectionist measures were implemented AND existing measures were not rolled back
	AND member country did not monitor its progress
0	New protectionist measures were implemented but existing measures were rolled back and country monitored its progress; OR New protectionist measures were not implemented and country monitored its progress BUT existing measures were not rolled back OR; New protectionist measures were not implemented and existing measures were rolled back BUT member country did not monitor its progress
+1	New protectionist measures were not implemented AND existing measures were rolled back AND member country monitored its progress

Lead Analyst: Ujwal Ganguly

# Argentina: 0

Argentina has partially complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

On 14 December 2015, President of Argentina Mauricio Macri stated, "there are no more excuses to not produce more. I will sign the decree today for the end of punitive export taxes and government

www.wto.org/english/news\_e/news09\_e/trdev\_14sep09\_e.htm.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>644</sup> The Hidden Pressures, The Economist 12 October 2013. Access Date: 23 September 2015.

http://www.economist.com/news/special-report/21587381-protectionism-can-take-many-forms-not-all-them-obvious-hidden-persuaders

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>645</sup> The Hidden Pressures, The Economist 12 October 2013. Access Date: 23 September 2015.

http://www.economist.com/news/special-report/21587381-protectionism-can-take-many-forms-not-all-them-obvious-hidden-persuaders

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>646</sup> The Hidden Pressures, The Economist 12 October 2013. Access Date: 23 September 2015.

http://www.economist.com/news/special-report/21587381-protectionism-can-take-many-forms-not-all-them-obvious-hidden-persuaders

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>647</sup> G20 governments refrain from extensive use of restrictive measures, but some slippage evident, World Trade Organization (Geneva) 14 September 2009. Access Date: 3 November 2010.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>648</sup> Report on the G20 Trade and Investment Measures, WTO 14 September 2009. Access Date 15 July 2015 https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/news09\_e/trdev\_14sep09\_e.htm

regulations"<sup>649</sup> Among the first protectionist reductions were the rolling back of currency controls that had previously kept the peso artificially strong.<sup>650</sup>

On 16 December 2015, Ambassador Alberto Pedro D'Alotta, Permanent Representative of Argentina to the United Nations, attended the 10th Ministerial Conference of the World Trade Organization in Nairobi, Kenya.<sup>651</sup> In his address, Mr. D'Alotta reaffirmed Argentina's commitment to multilateral rules in the WTO and promoting a fair, transparent system of agricultural trade for the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.<sup>652</sup>

On 17 December 2015, the Argentinian government reduced export duties, reduced restrictions on cross-border transfers, and eliminated a 35 per cent tax on goods and services purchased abroad.<sup>653</sup>

On 23 December 2015, Argentina eliminated its import licensing monitoring policy after it was to be violating international trade rules deemed by the World Trade Organisation.<sup>654</sup> The non-tariff barrier was replaced with a new Import Monitoring System and automatic licenses for all product imports.<sup>655</sup>

On the 12 February 2016, Minister of Foreign Affairs of Argentina Susana Malcorra and Minister of Foreign Affairs of Paraguay Eladio Loizaga published a joint statement.<sup>656</sup> The statement committed to increasing bilateral trade links between the two states as well as emphasizing their support for progressing dialogue on bi-regional trade partnerships such as the MERCOSUR-Pacific Partnership dialogue.<sup>657</sup>

On 11 March 2016, the energy ministry announced "Considering that the price of crude oil has been in sharp decline over the past two years, it is necessary to apply stimulus measures to mitigate the impact of such reductions on the level of activity and local employment." The Ministry confirmed that exporters of heavy crude from Argentina would receive a subsidy of USD7.50 per barrel from the government as long as international prices remain under USD47.50 per barrel.<sup>658</sup>

Argentina has rolled back some existing protectionist measures however has introduced new measures in the form of export subsidies.

<sup>653</sup> Argentina: new government eliminates restrictions on cross-border transfers, export duties, KPMG 18 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. https://home.kpmg.com/xx/en/home/insights/2015/12/tnf-argentina-newgovernment-eliminates-restrictions-on-cross-border-transfers-export-duties.html

<sup>654</sup> Importer sworn declaration for services (DJAS) and new systems of monitoring and of import licenses for goods, European Commission 4 February 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016.

http://madb.europa.eu/madb/barriers\_details.htm?barrier\_id=125425&version=9

<sup>655</sup> Importer sworn declaration for services (DJAS) and new systems of monitoring and of import licenses for goods, European Commission 4 February 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016.

http://www.cancilleria.gov.ar/comunicado-conjunto-reunion-de-cancilleres-de-argentina-y-paraguay

<sup>658</sup> Argentina to subsidize oil exports to compensate for low prices, Reuters, 11 March 2016, Date Accessed 11 April 2016 http://www.reuters.com/article/us-argentina-oil-idUSKCNOWD1FM

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>649</sup> Press release: Argentina President eliminates farm export taxes, 14 December 2015. Access date: 23 February 2016
 http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2015-12-14/macri-cuts-argentine-agricultural-export-taxes-on-wheat-corn
 <sup>650</sup> Argentina lifts currency controls, floats peso to boost growth and exports, International Business Times 17

December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://www.ibtimes.com/argentina-lifts-currency-controls-floats-peso-boost-growth-exports-2229634

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>651</sup> Declaracion De La Republica Argentina, World Trade Organization 16 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/thewto\_e/minist\_e/mc10\_e/statements\_e/arg\_s.pdf <sup>652</sup> Declaracion De La Republica Argentina, World Trade Organization 16 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>652</sup> Declaracion De La Republica Argentina, World Trade Organization 16 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/thewto\_e/minist\_e/mc10\_e/statements\_e/arg\_s.pdf

http://madb.europa.eu/madb/barriers\_details.htm?barrier\_id=125425&version=9

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>656</sup> Comunicado Conjuncto Reunion de Cancilleres de Argentina y Paraguay, Ministerio de Relaciones Exteriores y Culto de la República Argentina 12 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>657</sup> Comunicado Conjuncto Reunion de Cancilleres de Argentina y Paraguay, Ministerio de Relaciones Exteriores y Culto de la República Argentina 12 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://www.cancilleria.gov.ar/comunicado-conjunto-reunion-de-cancilleres-de-argentina-y-paraguay

Thus, Argentina has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Jose Isla

#### Australia: +1

Australia has fully complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

On 20 December 2015, the China-Australia Free Trade Agreement (ChAFTA) came into force.<sup>659</sup> It commits China and Australia to the elimination of customs duties, prohibits the imposition of tariffs by one party on the other, prohibits the application of import licensing, and prohibits the introduction or maintenance of export subsidies in trade relations between the two parties.<sup>660</sup>

On 6 October 2015, Australia signed the Trans Pacific Partnership (TPP).<sup>661</sup> Once ratified, Australia is obligated to apply Most Favourable Nation status to all its trading partners, it will be bound to eliminate any existing customs duties, it will be bound to permit duty-free access to commercial samples of negligible value, and it will be required to provide duty-free access to shipping containers.<sup>662</sup> It will be bound not to impose administrative fees that represent an indirect protection of domestic goods or a taxation of imports or exports, export duties, taxes, or other charges on the export of a good to the territory of another party unless such charges are also adopted for domestic consumption.<sup>663</sup>

On 3 March 2016, Australian Trade Minister Steve Ciobo indicated a free trade deal with Indonesia would be a priority.<sup>9</sup>

On 15 March 2016, both countries are believed to reach a stage where they can announce formal talks towards an Indonesia-Australia Free Trade Agreement. Ciobo said he hopes to "really build momentum in terms of the trade and investment relationship between Australia and Indonesia."<sup>10</sup>

Australia has fully complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback protectionist measures.

Thus, Australia has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Kabir Bhatia

#### Brazil: 0

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

On 20 November 2015, the Brazilian Chamber of Foreign Trade (CAMEX) signed a memorandum of understanding with the United States Department of Commerce aimed at developing transparency

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>659</sup> Free Trade Agreement Between the Government of Australia and the Government of the People's Republic of China, Government of Australia, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, 20 December 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://dfat.gov.au/trade/agreements/chafta/official-documents/Documents/chafta-agreement-text.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>660</sup> Free Trade Agreement Between the Government of Australia and the Government of the People's Republic of China, Government of Australia, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, 20 December 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://dfat.gov.au/trade/agreements/chafta/official-documents/Documents/chafta-agreement-text.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>661</sup> Robb signs historic trans Pacific Trade Pact (TPP) in New Zealand, Minister for Trade and Investment 4 February 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://trademinister.gov.au/releases/Pages/2016/ar\_mr\_160204.aspx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>662</sup> The Trans Pacific Partnership, Government of New Zealand, Foreign Affairs and Trade, 26 January 2016. Access Date 21 February 2016. https://www.mfat.govt.nz/en/about-us/who-we-are/treaty-making-process/trans-pacific-partnership-text-of-the-trans-pacific-partnership/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>663</sup> The Trans Pacific Partnership, Government of New Zealand, Foreign Affairs and Trade, 26 January 2016. Access Date 21 February 2016. https://www.mfat.govt.nz/en/about-us/who-we-are/treaty-making-process/trans-pacific-partnership-tept/text-of-the-trans-pacific-partnership/.

in the regulation of foreign trade, increasing coordination among bodies involved and the elimination of unnecessary regulatory barriers.<sup>664</sup>

On 25 November 2015, CAMEX applied a 24.7 per cent provisional anti-dumping duty on Brazilian imports of monobutyl ether ethylene glycol from Germany.<sup>665</sup>

On 25 November 2015, CAMEX eliminated import duties on 158 types of industrial machinery and equipment.<sup>666</sup> This ex-tariff program coincides with the Common External Tariff program of Mercosur, whereby attempts are made to reduce or eliminate tariffs on goods that have no domestically produced equivalent.<sup>667</sup>

On 18 December 2015, CAMEX lowered the import tax on Monocalcium Phosphate to 2 per cent.<sup>668</sup> This measure is valid for 12 months and falls under the Common Market Group (GMC) of Mercosur, which provides for specific actions in the tariff framework to account for shortages.<sup>669</sup>

On 18 December 2015, CAMEX reduced import tax on three pharmaceutical drugs used during kidney transplants and treatment of cancer patients.<sup>670</sup>

On 18 December 2015, CAMEX in conjunction with the CET temporarily reduced the rate of Capital Goods Import Duty (BK) and Information Technology and Telecommunications tariff on 796 products.<sup>671</sup> CAMEX expects these measures to generate a global investment in Brazil of USD2,678 Billion.<sup>672</sup>

On 31 December 2015, CAMEX reduced the import tax on anhydrous soap from 10 per cent to 2 per cent.<sup>673</sup> This product falls under the GMC policy of Mercosur.<sup>674</sup>

On 11 January 2016, CAMEX reduced the tariffs on eight different products including sheets and strips of aluminum and titanium oxide.<sup>675</sup> These products already have existing tariff reductions and this announcement renews the measures previously granted.<sup>676</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>664</sup> Camex inicia cooperação bilateral com EUA para eliminar barreiras desnecessárias ao comércio exterior (Brasilia) 20 November 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://www.camex.gov.br/noticias/ler/item/669

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>665</sup> Camex aprova antidumping provisório para importações de éter monobutílico do etilenoglicol da Alemanha (Brasilia) 24 November 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://www.camex.gov.br/noticias/ler/item/671
 <sup>666</sup> Camex reduz Imposto de Importação para 158 máquinas e equipamentos industriais (Brasilia) 25 November 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>600</sup> Camex reduz Imposto de Importação para 158 máquinas e equipamentos industriais (Brasilia) 25 November 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://www.camex.gov.br/noticias/ler/item/670

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>667</sup> Camex reduz Imposto de Importação para 158 máquinas e equipamentos industriais (Brasilia) 25 November 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://www.camex.gov.br/noticias/ler/item/670

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>668</sup> Camex reduz Imposto de Importação de fosfatos monocálcicos por desabastecimento no mercado brasileiro (Brasilia) 18 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://www.camex.gov.br/noticias/ler/item/678
 <sup>669</sup> Camex reduz Imposto de Importação de fosfatos monocálcicos por desabastecimento no mercado brasileiro

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>669</sup> Camex reduz Imposto de Importação de fosfatos monocálcicos por desabastecimento no mercado brasileiro (Brasilia) 18 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://www.camex.gov.br/noticias/ler/item/678

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>670</sup> Camex reduz Imposto de Importação de três medicamentos para transplantados renais e pacientes com cancer
 (Brasilia) 18 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://www.camex.gov.br/noticias/ler/item/677

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>671</sup> Camex aprova 796 ex-tarifários que reduzem custos de investimentos na indústria (Brasilia) 18 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://www.camex.gov.br/noticias/ler/item/676

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>672</sup> Camex aprova 796 ex-tarifários que reduzem custos de investimentos na indústria (Brasilia) 18 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://www.camex.gov.br/noticias/ler/item/676

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>673</sup> Camex reduz Imposto de Importação de insumo para fabricação de detergentes e papel (Brasilia) 31 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://www.camex.gov.br/noticias/ler/item/679

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>674</sup> Camex reduz Imposto de Importação de insumo para fabricação de detergentes e papel (Brasilia) 31 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://www.camex.gov.br/noticias/ler/item/679

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>675</sup> Resolução Camex reduz Imposto de Importação de oito produtos (Brasilia) 11 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://www.camex.gov.br/noticias/ler/item/680

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>676</sup> Resolução Camex reduz Imposto de Importação de oito produtos (Brasilia) 11 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://www.camex.gov.br/noticias/ler/item/680

On 27 January 2016, CAMEX announced that it was imposing an anti-dumping duty on steel products from China.677

On 27 January 2016, CAMEX reduced ex-tariff measures on 382 IT and telecommunications products as well as capital goods.<sup>678</sup> The measures implemented are expected to reduce project investment costs by more than USD1 billion.

On 27 January 2016, CAMEX permanently reduced tariffs on Barium Sulfate, Propargite and 4-Chloro-Alpha to 2 per cent.<sup>679</sup>

Brazil has rolled back multiple protectionist measures, however Brazil has imposed new protectionist measures in the form of antidumping measures.

Thus, Brazil has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Mathieu Sitayai

# Canada: +1

Canada has fully complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

On 4 February 2016, Canada signed the Trans-Pacific Partnership (TPP) Agreement in Auckland, New Zealand.<sup>680</sup> The text of the TPP was released on 26 January 2016, with Article 2.4 Chapter 2, National Treatment and Market Access for Goods, stipulating that no Party shall increase any existing customs duty, or adopt any new customs duty and that each Party shall progressively eliminate its customs duties or originating goods.<sup>681</sup>

As of February 2016, Canada also expressed its commitment to tariff liberalization as well as the acceleration of tariff elimination.<sup>682</sup> Canada committed to enhancing transparency provisions for import and export licensing procedures and advocated for the principled of transparency, cooperation and exchange of information in the trade of products of modern biotechnology.<sup>683</sup> Canada also agreed to a prohibition on using export subsidies in TPP markets and a commitment for TPP Parties to work together to discipline the use of export credits at the World Trade Organisation.<sup>684</sup>

Canada has fully complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback protectionist measures.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>677</sup> Camex aplica antidumping sobre produtos siderúrgicos originários da China (Brasilia) 27 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://www.camex.gov.br/noticias/ler/item/692 <sup>678</sup> Camex reduz Imposto de Importação de 382 máquinas e equipamentos industriais sem produção no Brasil (Brasilia)

<sup>27</sup> January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://www.camex.gov.br/noticias/ler/item/690

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>679</sup> Camex incorpora redução definitiva do Imposto de Importação de três insumos industriais (Brasilia) 27 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://www.camex.gov.br/noticias/ler/item/691

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>680</sup> Chrystia Freeland signs Trans-Pacific Partnership deal in New Zealand, CBC News 3 February 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/freeland-tpp-auckland-signing-1.3431631

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>681</sup> Annex: Text of the Trans-Pacific Partnership Chapter 2. National Treatment and Market Access for Goods, New Zealand Foreign Affairs & Trade 26 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016.

https://www.mfat.govt.nz/assets/ securedfiles/Trans-Pacific-Partnership/Text/2.-National-Treatment-and-Market-Access-for-Goods.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>682</sup> National Treatment and Market Access (NTMA) for Goods Chapter, Global Affairs Canada Government of Canada 1 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.international.gc.ca/trade-agreements-accordscommerciaux/agr-acc/tpp-ptp/understanding-comprendre/index.aspx?lang=eng

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>683</sup> National Treatment and Market Access (NTMA) for Goods Chapter, Global Affairs Canada Government of Canada 1 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.international.gc.ca/trade-agreements-accordscommerciaux/agr-acc/tpp-ptp/understanding-comprendre/index.aspx?lang=eng

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>684</sup> National Treatment and Market Access (NTMA) for Goods Chapter, Global Affairs Canada Government of Canada 1

December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.international.gc.ca/trade-agreements-accordscommerciaux/agr-acc/tpp-ptp/understanding-comprendre/index.aspx?lang=eng

Thus, Canada has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Rodrigo Noorani

#### China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

On 21-22 November 2015, Chinese Premier Li Keqiang attended the 18th China-Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) Summit.<sup>685</sup> During the Summit, the Premier promoted upgrading the China-ASEAN free trade area protocol, announced the provision of a RMB3.6 Billion gratis to less developed ASEAN members and the establishment of a USD10 Billion loan for the second phase of China-ASEAN infrastructure constructions.<sup>686</sup>

On 2 December 2015, South African President Jacob Zuma met with Chinese President XI Jinping to oversee the signing of 26 bilateral agreements relating to financial cooperation and infrastructure projects of a value of approximately USD6.5 billion by cabinet ministers and industry leaders.<sup>687</sup> The talks precede the upcoming Forum on China Africa Cooperation Summit, which the two leaders will co-host.<sup>688</sup>

On 4 December 2015, Chinese President Xi Jinping visited Zimbabwe and South Africa.<sup>689</sup> The trip promoted further collaborations and enhanced mutual trust between the trading partners.<sup>690</sup>

On 5 March 2016, the Chinese government signed an agreement with Maldives following discussions of establishing free trade between the two countries that had begun in September 2015. The Maldivian Economic Minister revealed that the discussions were geared towards establishing a system that does not charge tariff for the exportation of Maldivian fish products to China.<sup>691</sup>

By the end of 2016, the Ministry of Commerce plans to promote free trade agreements with partner countries by completing negotiations on the Regional Comprehensive Economic Partnership — by linking the Association of South Asian Nations with China, Australia, India, Japan, New Zealand and South Korea.<sup>692</sup>

China has fully complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback protectionist measures.

http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\_eng/zxxx\_662805/t1322223.shtml

<sup>690</sup> Work Together to Meet Challenges and Join Hands to Promote Development, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China 6 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>685</sup> Vice Foreign Minister Liu Zhenmin Introduces Outcomes of Premier Li Keqiang's Attendance at Leaders' Meetings on East Asia Cooperation, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China 22 November 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\_eng/topics\_665678/lkqcxdyhzldrxlhybdmlxyjxzsfw/t1317773.shtml <sup>686</sup> Vice Foreign Minister Liu Zhenmin Introduces Outcomes of Premier Li Keqiang's Attendance at Leaders' Meetings on

East Asia Cooperation, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China 22 November 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\_eng/topics\_665678/lkqcxdyhzldrxlhybdmlxyjxzsfw/t1317773.shtml

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>687</sup> Chinese president in South Africa to discuss trade, The Associated Press 2 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://bigstory.ap.org/article/5cc65a66e0ec4032a0e9d6d7db53e67b/chinese-president-south-africa-discuss-trade

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>688</sup> Chinese president in South Africa to discuss trade, The Associated Press 2 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://bigstory.ap.org/article/5cc65a66e0ec4032a0e9d6d7db53e67b/chinese-president-south-africa-discuss-trade

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>689</sup> Work Together to Meet Challenges and Join Hands to Promote Development, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China 6 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\_eng/zxxx\_662805/t1322223.shtml

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>691</sup> Press Release: Maldives, China end second free-trade talks, Haveeru Daily 5 March 2016. Access Date: 5 March 2016. http://www.haveeru.com.mv/business/67077

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>692</sup> Press Release: China to accelerate free-trade negotiations, China Daily 5 February 2016. Access Date: 5 March. http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/bizchina/2016-02/05/content\_23402286.htm

Thus, China has received a score of +1.

Analysts: Rodrigo Noorani

#### France: 0

France has partially complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

On 8 December 2015, France pledged EUR6 million to the World Trade Organization, of which EUR3 million will be provided to the Enhanced Integrated Framework which is dedicated to trade related capacity-building in Least Developed Countries (LDCs).<sup>693</sup> According to France's Secretary of State for Foreign Trade, Tourism and French Nationals Abroad, Matthias Fekl, "This renewed commitment demonstrates the importance France attaches to strengthening the capacity of LDCs, especially through the fostering of their production and export skills so that they may benefit fully from global trade.<sup>694</sup>

On 27-28 January 2016, France hosted Iranian President Hassan Rouhani.<sup>695</sup> During the visit, France and Iran signed a number of trade deals worth EUR40 billion in aerospace, automotive and oil sectors.<sup>696</sup> These agreements follow the lifting of sanctions on Iran and will produce increased bilateral economic access and trade ties.<sup>697</sup>

On 11 April 2016, France's economy minister sought to pressure the European Commission into raising import tariffs to similar levels as the United States to help Europe's ailing steel industry.<sup>698</sup> France, Britain and Germany are among the countries that have already asked the Commission to help the steel industry, which is suffering from an import surge from China, in particular, and collapsing prices.

On 19 April 2016, Trade Minister Matthias Fekl threatened to stall further negotiations on a new EU-US free trade deal barring significant progress in coming months. During a conference about the proposed Transatlantic Trade and Investment Fekl stated, "I indicated in September that if there was no progress, we should end the negotiations. That option is still on the table."<sup>699</sup>

France has implemented some new measures aimed at liberalizing trade however has not rolled back existing measures.

Thus, France has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Mathieu Sitayai

http://uk.reuters.com/article/uk-france-steel-idUKKCN0X82FZ

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>693</sup> France donates EUR 6 million to WTO Aid for Trade programmes (Paris) 8 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016 https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/pres15\_e/pr763\_e.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>694</sup> France donates EUR 6 million to WTO Aid for Trade programmes (Paris) 8 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016 https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/pres15\_e/pr763\_e.htm

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>695</sup> Trade talks and nostalgia as Hassan Rouhani returns to France (Paris) 27 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016 http://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/jan/27/trade-talks-memories-iran-hassan-rouhani-returns-to-france
 <sup>696</sup> Iran President Hassan Rouhani signs €40bn in trade deals on visit to France – but goes hungry (Paris) 28 January

<sup>2016.</sup> Access Date: 29 February 2016 http://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/europe/iran-president-hassan-rouhani-signs-40bn-in-trade-deals-on-visit-to-france-but-goes-hungry-a6840241.html

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>697</sup> Trade talks and nostalgia as Hassan Rouhani returns to France (Paris) 27 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February
 2016 http://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/jan/27/trade-talks-memories-iran-hassan-rouhani-returns-to-france
 <sup>698</sup> France's economy minister pushes EU to raise steel tariffs, Reuters 11 April 2016. Access Date: 11 May 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>699</sup> France threatens halt to TTIP talks barring progress in coming months, Reuters 19 April 2016. Access Date: 11 May 2016. http://uk.reuters.com/article/uk-trade-europe-usa-idUKKCN0XG2F5

# Germany: 0

Germany has partially complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

On 17 December 2015, planned cuts to energy storage subsidies in Germany were reversed.<sup>700</sup> In November 2015, the German government decided to end a 30 per cent credit for energy storage systems by the end of this year, but Germany's Green Party now says the subsidy will continue in some form.<sup>701</sup> Currently, state assistance also includes low interest loans, in addition to the credit. It is still unclear how long the domestic storage subsidy will be available.<sup>702</sup> The Green Party is pushing for three more years.<sup>703</sup>

On 7 February 2015, German Chancellor Angela Merkel called for greater global market integration, deeming protectionism and isolation "failed recipes of the past," and arguing that the integration of economic interests is an important factor in resolving conflicts. She committed to working with the United States to create "a single economic area from Vladivostok to Lisbon and on to Vancouver," on the precondition that the Ukrainian crisis be resolved.<sup>704</sup>

On 28 April 2016, it was reported that Germany will subsidise electric car purchases. Car buyers will receive EUR4,000 when they choose a purely electric vehicle and EUR3,000 for a plug-in hybrid, with the cost shared 50-50 between the public purse and car makers. Thus far, German auto companies Volkswagen, Daimler and BMW have signed up to it, but the programme is open to all national and foreign brands ensuring it is not a new protectionist measure. The government has budgeted EUR600 million for the purchase subsidies, which are expected to run until 2019 at the latest.<sup>705</sup>

Germany has not introduced new protectionist measures, however has not rolled existing measures.

Thus, Germany has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Kabir Bhatia

# India: 0

India has partially complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>700</sup> Germany Reverses Its Decision to End Residential Energy Storage Subsidies, GreenTech Media 17 December 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016 http://www.greentechmedia.com/articles/read/decision-to-end-energy-storage-subsidiesin-germany-reversed

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>701</sup> Germany Reverses Its Decision to End Residential Energy Storage Subsidies, GreenTech Media 17 December 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016 http://www.greentechmedia.com/articles/read/decision-to-end-energy-storage-subsidiesin-germany-reversed

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>702</sup> Germany Reverses Its Decision to End Residential Energy Storage Subsidies, GreenTech Media 17 December 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016 http://www.greentechmedia.com/articles/read/decision-to-end-energy-storage-subsidiesin-germany-reversed

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>703</sup> Germany Reverses Its Decision to End Residential Energy Storage Subsidies, GreenTech Media 17 December 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016 http://www.greentechmedia.com/articles/read/decision-to-end-energy-storage-subsidiesin-germany-reversed

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>704</sup> Angela Merkel at the Munich Security Conference. Respecting International Law, The Federal Government of Germany, 7 February 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016.

https://www.bundesregierung.de/Content/EN/Artikel/2015/02\_en/2015-02-07-rede-merkelscherheitskonferenz\_en.html?nn=709674.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>705</sup> Germany to give €1bn subsidy to boost electric car sales, Guardian 28 April 2016. Access Date: 11 May 2016. http://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/apr/28/germany-subsidy-boost-electric-car-sales

On 11 December 2015, the Government of India imposed anti-dumping duties on stainless steel imports from China ranging from 4.6 per cent to 57.4 per cent.<sup>706</sup> The Government of India has also stated that it intends to tax imports from South Korea, South Africa, and Thailand.<sup>707</sup>

On 5 February 2016, the Government of India imposed a minimum import price on steel, ranging between USD341 per tonne and USD752 per tonne depending on the type of steel product.<sup>708</sup>

On 1 March 2016, the Government of India released the 2016-2017 federal budget.<sup>709</sup> The budget continues to provide subsidies mainly on fuel, food and fertilizer and has increased the overall subsidy spending by about 5 per cent. Minister of State for Finance, Jayant Sinha said "We are trying through DBT [direct transfer of subsidies] trials in fertilizer.<sup>710</sup> On food subsidy, we are working on digital ration cards, biometric authentication and digitization of fair price shops. Remember, we are working at a time of agrarian distress."<sup>711</sup>

On 22 April 2016, India has ratified the new Trade Facilitation Agreement (TFA). Anjali Prasad, India's ambassador to the World Trade Organization (WTO), handed over her country's instrument of acceptance to Director-General Roberto Azevêdo. Concluded at the WTO's 2013 Bali Ministerial Conference, the TFA contains provisions for expediting the movement, release and clearance of goods, including goods in transit. It also sets out measures for effective cooperation between customs and other appropriate authorities on trade facilitation and customs compliance issues. It further contains provisions for technical assistance and capacity building in this area. The TFA will enter into force once two-thirds of the WTO membership has formally accepted the Agreement. India is the 76th WTO member to accept the TFA.<sup>712</sup>

India has implemented new protectionist measures however by sign the FTA has demonstrated willingness to rollback some existing measures.

Thus, India has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Kabir Bhatia

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>706</sup> India Imposes Anti-Dumping Duty on Steel Products, Times of India, 12 December 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/business/india-business/India-imposes-anti-dumping-duty-on-steel-products/articleshow/50145593.cms.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>707</sup> India Imposes Anti-Dumping Duty on Steel Products, Times of India, 12 December 2015. Access Date: 21 February
 2016. http://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/business/india-business/India-imposes-anti-dumping-duty-on-steel products/articleshow/50145593.cms.
 <sup>708</sup> Udyog, Bhawan, Notification No. 38/2015-2020, Government of India, Ministry of Commerce and Industry,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>708</sup> Udyog, Bhawan, Notification No. 38/2015-2020, Government of India, Ministry of Commerce and Industry, Department of Commerce, Directorate General of Foreign Trade, 5 February 2016. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://dgft.gov.in/exim/2000/NOT/NOT15/Notificaiton%20No.38(E).pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>709</sup> Duty alterations for Make in India to increase competitiveness, not protectionism: Jayant Sinha, Business Standard 2 March 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.business-standard.com/budget/article/q-a-jayant-sinha-unionminister-of-state-financea-day-after-the-budget-presentation-minister-of-state-for-finance-jayant-sinha-says-peoplewill-remember-it-for-public-spending-tax-processes-and-social-security-schemes-he-tells-dilasha-seth-aru-116030101391\_1.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>710</sup> Duty alterations for Make in India to increase competitiveness, not protectionism: Jayant Sinha, Business Standard 2 March 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.business-standard.com/budget/article/q-a-jayant-sinha-unionminister-of-state-financea-day-after-the-budget-presentation-minister-of-state-for-finance-jayant-sinha-says-peoplewill-remember-it-for-public-spending-tax-processes-and-social-security-schemes-he-tells-dilasha-seth-aru-116030101391\_1.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>711</sup> Duty alterations for Make in India to increase competitiveness, not protectionism: Jayant Sinha, Business Standard 2 March 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.business-standard.com/budget/article/q-a-jayant-sinha-unionminister-of-state-financea-day-after-the-budget-presentation-minister-of-state-for-finance-jayant-sinha-says-peoplewill-remember-it-for-public-spending-tax-processes-and-social-security-schemes-he-tells-dilasha-seth-aru-116030101391\_1.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>712</sup> India ratifies Trade Facilitation Agreement, WTO 22 April 2016. Access Date: 11 May 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/news16\_e/fac\_21apr16\_e.htm

#### Indonesia: +1

Indonesia has fully complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

Recent steps by the government of Indonesia indicate intent to strengthen economic engagement with the rest of the world.<sup>713</sup> Among these are the resumption of trade talks with the European Union, the announcement in the United States by President Joko "Jokowi" Widodo that the Government of Indonesia intended to join the Trans Pacific Partnership (TPP) agreement, and the ongoing negotiations on the Regional Comprehensive Economic Partnership, an agreement aimed at deepening integration between ASEAN and six of its major trading partners, including China.<sup>714</sup>

By the end of 2015, the share of import tariff lines subject to non-tariff measures (NTMs) grew from 37 per cent in 2009 to 51 per cent.<sup>715</sup> Import tariffs have been increased on both a temporary and permanent basis.<sup>716</sup> The total number of export NTMs tripled over the same period, and affected 41 per cent of the value of exports.<sup>717</sup>

Beginning in December 2015, Indonesia has loosened a number of restrictions on agricultural imports and exports, including rice,<sup>718</sup> eggs,<sup>719</sup> and salt.<sup>720</sup> Import restrictions on manufactured goods, specifically those related to after-sales services, were also loosened.<sup>721</sup>

On 27 January 2016, during a Working Meeting, the Ministry of Trade stated, "In the field of international trade negotiations, this year the Ministry of Trade will expand the market access through the FTA-CEPA [Free Trade Agreement – Comprehensive Economic Partnership Agreement- cooperation with the EU, EFTA [European Free Trade Association], Turkey, and Australia. In addition, the Ministry will also maximize Indonesia's participation in AEC [ASEAN Economic Community] as an export destination market and new job opportunities."<sup>722</sup>

Indonesia has fully complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback protectionist measures.

indonesia.html # sthash.Ha1goJSU.dpuf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>713</sup> The unbearable cost of protectionism in Indonesia, The Jakarta Post 15 December 2015. Sccess Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2015/12/14/the-unbearable-cost-protectionism-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>714</sup> The unbearable cost of protectionism in Indonesia, The Jakarta Post 15 December 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2015/12/14/the-unbearable-cost-protectionism-

indonesia.html#sthash.Ha1goJSU.dpuf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>715</sup> The unbearable cost of protectionism in Indonesia, The Jakarta Post 15 December 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2015/12/14/the-unbearable-cost-protectionism-

indonesia.html#sthash.Ha1goJSU.dpuf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>716</sup> The unbearable cost of protectionism in Indonesia, The Jakarta Post 15 December 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2015/12/14/the-unbearable-cost-protectionism-

indonesia.html#sthash.Ha1goJSU.dpuf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>717</sup> The unbearable cost of protectionism in Indonesia, The Jakarta Post 15 December 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2015/12/14/the-unbearable-cost-protectionism-

indonesia.html#sthash.Ha1goJSU.dpuf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>718</sup> Indonesia: revised import and export regime for rice, Global Trade Alert 6 January 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://www.globaltradealert.org/measure/indonesia-revised-import-and-export-regime-rice

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>719</sup> Indonesia: altered import and export restrictions for agricultural products, Global Trade Alert 4 March 2016. Access Date: http://www.globaltradealert.org/measure/indonesia-altered-import-and-export-restrictions-agricultural-products

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>720</sup> Indonesia: relaxed import restrictions on salt, Global Trade Alert 19 January 2016. Access Date 13 March 2016. http://www.globaltradealert.org/measure/indonesia-relaxed-import-restrictions-salt

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>721</sup> Indonesia: loosened import restrictions for manufactured goods, Global Trade Alert 6 January 2016. Access Date 13 March 2016. http://www.globaltradealert.org/measure/indonesia-loosened-import-restrictions-manufactured-goods

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>722</sup> Speeches: Minister of Trade Opening Remarks 2016; Working Meeting Ministry of Trade. P.1. 27 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.kemendag.go.id/en/news/2016/02/04/sambutan-menteri-perdaganganpada-rapat-kerja-kemendag-tahun-2016

Thus, Indonesia has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Lucinda Yae-Rim Ro

# Italy: 0

Italy has partially complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

On 20 January 2016, the European Commission opened an in-depth inquiry to assess whether Italian state support for steel producer Ilva was in line with European Union State aid rules.<sup>723</sup> In particular, the Commission will examine whether measures facilitating Ilva's access to finance for modernizing its plant in Taranto give the company an unfair advantage not available to its competitors. Commissioner Margrethe Vestager, in charge of competition policy, stated: "Steelmakers across the EU are struggling with worldwide overcapacity and strong imports... It is also why EU countries and the Commission have put in place strict safeguards against state aid to rescue and restructure steel companies in difficulty. This avoids harmful subsidy races between EU countries and that uncontrolled state aid in one EU country can unfairly put at risk thousands of jobs across the EU."<sup>724</sup>

On 2 February 2015 a package of measures to promote the Green Economy in Italy comes officially into force, after approval by the Italian Parliament in December 2015. Among provisions on sustainable transport, waste management and protected marine areas, the Italian government commits to becoming the first EU country to track and publish all of its environmentally harmful subsidies on a yearly basis. These include, but are not limited to, incentives, tax-breaks, subsidised loans and exemptions intended for the production and use of fossil fuels.<sup>725</sup>

Italy has not introduced new protectionist measures and is monitoring some existing measures, however Italy has not rolled back existing measures.

Thus, Italy has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Kabir Bhatia

# Japan: +1

Japan has fully complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

On 16 December 2015, as chair of the World Trade Organization's (WTO) Information Technology Agreement (ITA) expansion negotiations, Japan concluded an agreement with 53 member countries on eliminating tariffs on 201 IT-related products.<sup>726</sup>

On 4 February 2016, Japan signed the Trans-Pacific Partnership (TPP) Agreement, which will see the elimination of tariffs between signatory countries in a number of different sectors.<sup>727</sup>

Japan has fully complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback protectionist measures.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>723</sup> State aid: Commission opens in-depth investigation into Italian support for steel producer Ilva in Taranto, Italy,
 European Union 20 January 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-16-115\_en.htm
 <sup>724</sup> State aid: Commission opens in-depth investigation into Italian support for steel producer Ilva in Taranto, Italy,

European Union 20 January 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-16-115\_en.htm <sup>725</sup> Italy commits to track Environmentally Harmful Subsidies, Green Budget Europe 2 Febuary 2016. Access Date: 11

May 2016. http://green-budget.eu/italy-commits-to-becoming-the-first-eu-country-to-track-environmentally-harmfulsubsidies/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>726</sup> METI Announces the Conclusion of the WTO Information Technology Agreement (ITA) Expansion Negotiations (Nairobi) 16 December 2015. Access Date: 27 February 2016 http://www.meti.go.jp/english/press/2015/1217\_03.html

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>727</sup> Signing of the Trans-Pacific Partnership (TPP) Agreement (Auckland) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February
 2016 http://www.meti.go.jp/english/press/2016/0204\_02.html

Therefore, Japan has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Mathieu Sitayai

#### Korea: 0

Korea has partially complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

No evidence was found to suggest that Korea has implemented new protectionist measures however, no evidence was found suggesting Koreas has rolled back existing measures.

Thus, Korea has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Lucinda Yae-Rim Ro

#### Mexico: +1

Mexico has fully complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

On 4 February 2016, Mexico signed the Trans-Pacific Partnership (TPP) Agreement in Auckland, New Zealand.<sup>728</sup> The text of the TPP was released on 26 January 2016, with Article 2.4 Chapter 2, National Treatment and Market Access for Goods, stipulating that no Party shall increase any existing customs duty, or adopt any new customs duty and that each Party shall progressively eliminate its customs duties or originating goods.<sup>729</sup>

On 4 February 2016, Brazilian Trade Minister Armando Monteiro reported plans to liberalize trade in vehicles and auto parts with Mexico and Argentina.<sup>730</sup> The initiative is being led by Brazil though no actions have yet been taken. The Minister said the government's priority is to rework a bilateral auto deal with Argentina that expires in late June and advance talks to expand overall trade with Mexico.<sup>731</sup>

On 10 February 2016, the Mexican government and the European Commission announced the start of negotiations towards a bilateral agreement on trade in organic products. Both sides confirmed their interest to swiftly conclude an agreement that would allow expanding the market for organic farmers, reducing the burden for companies and supplying more organic products to consumers.<sup>732</sup>

Mexico has fully complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback protectionist measures.

Thus, Mexico has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Philip Basaric

#### Russia: –1

Russia has not complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback protectionist trade measures.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>728</sup> Chrystia Freeland signs Trans-Pacific Partnership deal in New Zealand, CBC News 3 February 2016. Access Date: 13
 March 2016. http://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/freeland-tpp-auckland-signing-1.3431631

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>729</sup> Annex: Text of the Trans-Pacific Partnership Chapter 2. National Treatment and Market Access for Goods, New Zealand Foreign Affairs & Trade 26 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016.

https://www.mfat.govt.nz/assets/\_securedfiles/Trans-Pacific-Partnership/Text/2.-National-Treatment-and-Market-Access-for-Goods.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>730</sup> Exclusive: Brazil aims to free auto trade with Argentina, Mexico - minister, Reuters News US Edition 4 February2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016

http://www.reuters.com/article/us-brazil-auto-trade-exclusive-idUSKCN0VD2L8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>731</sup>Exclusive: Brazil aims to free auto trade with Argentina, Mexico - minister, Reuters News US Edition 4 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://www.reuters.com/article/us-brazil-auto-trade-exclusive-idUSKCN0VD2L8

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>732</sup> European Commission and Mexico to start negotiations on a bilateral agreement on trade in organic products 10February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016 http://ec.europa.eu/agriculture/newsroom/259\_en.htm

On 15 December 2015, the Russian Minister of Finance Anton Siluanov announced that a state guarantee in the amount of RUB3.59 Billion to steel and metal manufacturer JSC Rusopolimet.<sup>733</sup> The guarantee was given by the government to allow Rusopolimet to produce import-substitution products for the industries of metallurgy and mechanical engineering in Russia.<sup>734</sup>

On 30 December 2015, the Russian government implemented a law requiring import licenses on crushed stone and gravel used in the construction and housing industries.<sup>735</sup> Licenses will be required on all imports of these products until 30 June 2016.<sup>736</sup> Countries within the Eurasian Economic Union will be exempt from import licensing requirements.<sup>737</sup>

On 5 January 2016, the Russian government implemented a previously made commitment of a 36month elimination of import tariffs on products shipped into Russia.<sup>738</sup> The tariff eliminations apply only to products exported by member countries of the Eurasian Economic Union.<sup>739</sup>

On 22 April 2016, Russia became the 77th World Trade Oraganization (WTO) member to ratify the new Trade Facilitation Agreement (TFA). The Russian Federation's Minister of Economic Development, Alexey Ulyukaev, met with Director-General Roberto Azevêdo and presented his country's TFA instrument of acceptance.<sup>740</sup> Concluded at the WTO's 2013 Bali Ministerial Conference, the TFA contains provisions for expediting the movement, release and clearance of goods, including goods in transit. It also sets out measures for effective cooperation between customs and other appropriate authorities on trade facilitation and customs compliance issues. It further contains provisions for technical assistance and capacity building in this area. The TFA will enter into force once two-thirds of the WTO membership has formally accepted the Agreement.<sup>741</sup>

Russia has suggested its support of trade liberalization by signing the FTA, however has introduced new protectionist measures while failing to roll back on existing measures.

Thus, Russia has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Adrian DiTommaso

# Saudi Arabia: +1

Saudi Arabia has fully complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>733</sup> Government Order No 2544-p, Russian Government 12 December 2015. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://government.ru/media/files/NKwkdq5L0jcAU8KxyxKAew8DvWKrEqWs.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>734</sup> Government Order No 2544-p, Russian Government 12 December 2015. Access Date: 24 February 2016.

http://government.ru/media/files/NKwkdq5L0jcAU8KxyxKAew8DvWKrEqWs.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>735</sup> Government Order No 1486, Russian Government 30 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://government.ru/media/files/Mh67bEqEX9znX1sPbrd1iUOhHjm1Aeo7.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>736</sup> Government Order No 1486, Russian Government 30 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://government.ru/media/files/Mh67bEqEX9znX1sPbrd1iUOhHjm1Aeo7.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>737</sup> Government Order No 1486, Russian Government 30 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://government.ru/media/files/Mh67bEqEX9znX1sPbrd1iUOhHjm1Aeo7.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>738</sup> Publication, Global Trade Alert 10 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://www.globaltradealert.org/measure/eurasian-economic-union-temporary-elimination-import-tariffs-ground-code-2510-20-0

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>739</sup> Publication, Global Trade Alert 10 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://www.globaltradealert.org/measure/eurasian-economic-union-temporary-elimination-import-tariffs-ground-code-2510-20-0

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>740</sup> Russian Federation ratifies Trade Facilitation Agreement, WTO 22 April 2016. Access Date: 11 May 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/news16\_e/fac\_22apr16\_e.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>741</sup> India ratifies Trade Facilitation Agreement, WTO 22 April 2016. Access Date: 11 May 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/news16\_e/fac\_21apr16\_e.htm

In December 2015, Saudi Arabia supported the decision of the Organization of the Petroleum Exporting Countries (OPEC) to hold back on implementing a production ceiling on crude oil, despite the global market remaining consistently oversupplied.<sup>742</sup>

On 28 December 2015, the King of Saudi Arabia announced the country's 2016 budget, which includes government plans to privatize "several sectors" and "amend the programs of oil, water and electricity subsidies through re-pricing them gradually over the coming five years."<sup>743</sup> Muhammad bin Salman, the kingdom's deputy crown prince has also stated that the Government of Saudi Arabia is thinking about listing shares in Saudi Aramco, the state-owned oil company that is the world's biggest oil producer.<sup>744</sup>

On 30 December 2015, the Government of Saudi Arabia announced several cuts to government spending and subsidies.<sup>745</sup> The government will reduce subsidies for water, electrical power and even gasoline.<sup>746</sup> The government immediately raised the price of retail gasoline by 50 per cent, from SAR0.60 to SAR0.90 per liter of premium gasoline — or from 16 cents to 24 cents.<sup>747</sup>

Saudi Arabia has fully complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback protectionist measures.

Thus, Saudi Arabia has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Philip Basaric

# South Africa: 0

South Africa has partially complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

On 2 December 2015, South African President Jacob Zuma met with Chinese President XI Jinping to oversee the signing of 26 bilateral agreements relating to financial cooperation and infrastructure projects of a value of approximately USD6.5 billion by cabinet ministers and industry leaders.<sup>748</sup> The talks precede the upcoming Forum on China Africa Cooperation Summit, which the two leaders will co-host.<sup>749</sup>

On 15 December 2015, President Zuma signed the Protection of Investment Act into law; which stipulates that "foreign investors and their investments must not be treated less favorably than South

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>742</sup> OPEC won't cut production to stop oil's slump, Bloomberg Business 5 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2015-12-04/opec-maintains-crude-production-as-group-defers-output-target-ihryzilb

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>743</sup> Saudi Arabia Plans Subsidy Cuts as King Reveals 2016 Budget, Bloomberg. 28 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2015-12-28/saudi-arabia-aims-to-cut-spending-to-840billion-riyals-in-2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>744</sup> Saudi Arabia is considering an IPO of Aramco, probably the world's most valuable company, The Economist (New York) 7 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.economist.com/news/middle-east-and-africa/21685529-biggest-oil-all-saudi-arabia-considering-ipo-aramco-probably.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>745</sup> Saudi Arabia Cuts Subsidies As Budget Deficit Soars, Oil Price 30 December 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016
 http://oilprice.com/Energy/Energy-General/Saudi-Arabia-Cuts-Subsidies-As-Budget-Deficit-Soars.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>746</sup> Saudi Arabia Cuts Subsidies As Budget Deficit Soars, Oil Price 30 December 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016 http://oilprice.com/Energy/Energy-General/Saudi-Arabia-Cuts-Subsidies-As-Budget-Deficit-Soars.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>747</sup> Saudi Arabia Cuts Subsidies As Budget Deficit Soars, Oil Price 30 December 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016 http://oilprice.com/Energy/Energy-General/Saudi-Arabia-Cuts-Subsidies-As-Budget-Deficit-Soars.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>748</sup> Chinese president in South Africa to discuss trade, The Associated Press 2 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://bigstory.ap.org/article/5cc65a66e0ec4032a0e9d6d7db53e67b/chinese-president-south-africa-discuss-trade

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>749</sup> Chinese president in South Africa to discuss trade, The Associated Press 2 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://bigstory.ap.org/article/5cc65a66e0ec4032a0e9d6d7db53e67b/chinese-president-south-africa-discuss-trade

African investors in like circumstances" and that "the Republic (of South Africa) must accord foreign investors and their investments a level of physical security as may be generally provided to domestic investors."<sup>750</sup>

On 18 December 2015, the South African Revenue Service (SARS) applied a 10 per cent import tariff on steel wire rods, steel reinforcing bars and structural steel.<sup>751</sup>

On 7 January 2016, South Africa resolved its long-running dispute over beef, pork and poultry that had threatened its place in a United State-Africa trade agreement.<sup>752</sup> South Africa pulled down its barriers to unfair and longstanding barriers to US products by permitting the unrestricted importation of American pork shoulder cuts and agreeing that America could import livestock from third countries for direct slaughter and export to South Africa.<sup>753</sup>

On 12 February 2016, SARS applied a 10 per cent import tariff on semi-finished steel, steel plates, cold-rolled steel and steel sections.<sup>754</sup>

On 23 February 2016, South Africa deposited its instrument of acceptance for the 2005 protocol amending the Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights (TRIPS), becoming the fourth member of the World Trade Organization (WTO) to do so in 2016. The protocol amending the TRIPS Agreement, which was adopted in 2005, is intended to make it easier for poorer WTO members to access affordable medicines. The protocol allows exporting countries to grant compulsory licences (one that is granted without the patent holder's consent) to their generic suppliers to manufacture and export medicines to countries that cannot manufacture the needed medicines themselves. These licenses were originally limited to predominantly supplying the domestic market.<sup>755</sup>

On 4 April 2016, South Africa sent in a filing to the WTO saying that it is considering imposing emergency tariffs on some iron and steel imports in an attempt to protect its steelmakers.<sup>5</sup>

South Africa has rolled back existing protectionist measures however, has imposed new measures.

Thus, South Africa has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Rodrigo Noorani

# Turkey: 0

Turkey has partially complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>750</sup> Government Gazette: Act No. 22 of 2015: Protection of Investment Act, 2015, South African Government 15 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016.

http://www.gov.za/sites/www.gov.za/files/39514\_Act22of2015ProtectionOfInvestmentAct.pdf

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>751</sup> Annex: Customs And Excise Act, 1964. Amendment Of Schedule No. 1, South African Revenue Service 18 December
 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.sars.gov.za/AllDocs/Embargo/Tariffs/LAPD-LSec-CE-TA-2015-61 %20Sch%201P1%20Steel%2018%20December%202015.pdf

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>752</sup> Press Release: South Africa and US resolve agricultural products trade dispute, The Financial Times 7 January 2016.
 Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/cms/s/0/55babca6-b559-11e5-8358 9a82b43f6b2f.html#axzz41FC7y8p1

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>753</sup> Press Release: South Africa and US resolve agricultural products trade dispute, The Financial Times 7 January 2016.
 Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/cms/s/0/55babca6-b559-11e5-8358 9a82b43f6b2f.html#axzz41FC7y8p1

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>754</sup> Annex: Customs and Excise Act, 1964. Amendment of Schedule No. 1, South African Revenue Service 12 February
 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.sars.gov.za/AllDocs/Embargo/Tariffs/LAPD-LSec-CE-TA-2016-01%20 %20Notice%20R172%20GG%2039868%2012%20February%202016.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>755</sup> South Africa accepts protocol amending the TRIPS Agreement, WTO 23 February 2016. Access Date: 11 May 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/news16\_e/trip\_23feb16\_e.htm

Turkey's Ministry of Economics announced a new import tax on solar panels. As of 19 December 2015, it was announced that all solar panels imported into Turkey will be charged a tax of USD35 per kilogram.<sup>756</sup>

On 5-6 March 2016, Turkey announced negotiations to lift trade barriers with Iran during the Turkey-Iran Business Forum held in Tehran.<sup>757</sup> Turkish Prime Minister Ahmet Davutoglu stated, "We negotiated and agreed to no delays in the implementation of a preferential trade agreement. We will lift the customs wall in a way that will propel efforts toward a free trade agreement following the preferential trade agreement."

On 16 March 2016, Turkey ratified the new Trade Facilitation Agreement (TFA), becoming the 71st member of the World Trade Organization (WTO) to do so. Ambassador Haluk Ilicak and Hüsnü Dilerme, Deputy Under-Secretary with the Turkish Ministry of Economy, presented their country's instrument of acceptance to WTO Deputy Director-General Yi Xiaozhun.<sup>759</sup> Concluded at the WTO's 2013 Bali Ministerial Conference, the TFA contains provisions for expediting the movement, release and clearance of goods, including goods in transit. It also sets out measures for effective cooperation between customs and other appropriate authorities on trade facilitation and customs compliance issues. It further contains provisions for technical assistance and capacity building in this area. The TFA will enter into force once two-thirds of the WTO membership has formally accepted the Agreement.<sup>760</sup>

Turkey has rolled back some protectionist measures, however has also implemented new measures.

Thus, Turkey has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Philip Basaric

#### United Kingdom: +1

The United Kingdom has fully complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

On 16 December 2015, the UK signed the World Trade Organization's (WTO) second Information Technology Agreement (ITA II).<sup>761</sup> ITA II is an agreement to eliminate tariffs on 90 per cent of the trade of information and technology products such as mobile phones, medical devices, game consoles and navigation systems.<sup>762</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>756</sup> Turkey: New Directive Sees Import Duties on Solar Modules, PV Magazine, 23 November 2015, Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://www.pv-magazine.com/news/details/beitrag/turkey--new-directive-sees-import-duties-on-solarmodules\_100022097/ - axzz42GmrQ3PR

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>757</sup> http://financialtribune.com/articles/economy-domestic-economy/37901/turkey-will-lift-iran-trade-barriers
 <sup>758</sup> Turkey Will Lift Iran Trade Barriers, Financial Tribune, 7 March 2016, Access Date: 7 March 2016.

http://financialtribune.com/articles/economy-domestic-economy/37901/turkey-will-lift-iran-trade-barriers <sup>759</sup> Turkey notifies acceptance of Trade Facilitation Agreement, WTO 16 March 2016. Access Date: 11 May 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/news e/news16 e/fac 16mar16 e.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>760</sup> India ratifies Trade Facilitation Agreement, WTO 22 April 2016. Access Date: 11 May 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/news e/news16 e/fac 21apr16 e.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>761</sup> Press Release: New IT Free Trade Deal Could Boost UK Exports by €113 Million, UK Government 16 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/new-it-free-trade-deal-could-boost-uk-ex ports-by-113-million

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>762</sup> Press Release: New IT Free Trade Deal Could Boost UK Exports by €113 Million, UK Government 16 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/new-it-free-trade-deal-could-boost-uk-ex ports-by-113-million

On 16 January 2016, the UK along with its partners in the European Union, lifted economic and financial sanctions placed on Iran.<sup>763</sup> UK Export Finance (UKEF) began providing support for UK companies looking to do business in Iran.<sup>764</sup> UKEF also committed to working directly with the Export Guarantee Fund of Iran and the Iranian Ministry of Economic Affairs and Finance in order to re-establish trade ties between the two countries.<sup>765</sup>

On 17 February 2016, the Crown Commercial Service of the UK released a report that sets out contracting authorities' international obligations when assigning public contracts.<sup>766</sup> The guidance stated that it is inappropriate for contracting authorities to boycott a supplier from any country from a procurement of public contracts, unless the government of the UK has put formal sanctions, embargoes or restrictions in place pertaining to that country.<sup>767</sup> It reaffirms that contracting authorities must consider the bids of all suppliers when awarding public contracts, regardless of the country which the supplier originates in.<sup>768</sup>

The UK has fully complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback protectionist measures.

Thus, the United Kingdom is awarded a score of +1.

Analyst: Adrian DiTommaso

# United States: +1

United States has fully complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

On 4 January 2016, the US Department of Commerce International Trade Administration stated, "The United States and India are working together to participate in the development of international standards and technical regulations to boost trade and help reduce administrative and logistical burdens."769

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>763</sup> Press Release: Sanctions Relief Paves the Way for Developing UK Trade Relationship with Iran, UK Government 16 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/sanctions-relief-paves-the-wayfor-developing-uk-trade-relationship-with-iran

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>764</sup> Press Release: Sanctions Relief Paves the Way for Developing UK Trade Relationship with Iran, UK Government 16 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/sanctions-relief-paves-the-wayfor-developing-uk-trade-relationship-with-iran

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>765</sup> Press Release: Sanctions Relief Paves the Way for Developing UK Trade Relationship with Iran, UK Government 16 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/sanctions-relief-payes-the-wavfor-developing-uk-trade-relationship-with-iran

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>766</sup> Information Note: Procurement Policy Note: Ensuring Compliance with Wider International Obligations when Letting Public Contracts, UK Crown Commercial Service 17 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment data/file/500811/PPN on wider international \_obligations.pdf <sup>767</sup> Information Note: Procurement Policy Note: Ensuring Compliance with Wider International Obligations when

Letting Public Contracts, UK Crown Commercial Service 17 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment data/file/500811/PPN on wider international obligations.pdf <sup>768</sup>Information Note: Procurement Policy Note: Ensuring Compliance with Wider International Obligations when Letting

Public Contracts, UK Crown Commercial Service 17 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\_data/file/500811/PPN\_on\_wider\_international obligations.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>769</sup> Background: United States, India focus on Breaking down standards-related trade barriers. Access date: 23 February 2016 http://www.aami.org/newsviews/newsdetail.aspx?ItemNumber=2980

On 26 January 2016, the Deputy US Trade Representative Michael Punke, with regards to the US-European Union trade deal said, "We are completely committed to completing negotiations in 2016. Those are the directions we have from the president."<sup>770</sup>

On 3 February 2016, US President Barack Obama said "The rules of global trade too often undermine our values and put our workers and businesses at a disadvantage. [The Trans-Pacific Partnership] will change that. It eliminates more than 18,000 taxes that various countries put on Made in America Products."<sup>771</sup>On 4 February 2016, President Obama signed the Trans-Pacific Partnership.<sup>772</sup>

On 12 January 2016, President Obama announced suspension of South Africa trade benefits saying "I have determined that South Africa is not meeting the requirements ... and that suspending the application of duty-free treatment to certain goods would be more effective in promoting compliance."<sup>773</sup>

Thus, United States has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Jose Isla

#### **European Union: 0**

The European Union has partially complied with its commitment to standstill and rollback on protectionist measures.

On 2 December 2015, the EU and Vietnam finalized a free trade agreement (FTA), which will ensure high quality investment on both sides in addition to an updated investment dispute resolution system.<sup>774</sup>

On 14 December 2015, the EU pledged EUR57 million towards the second phase of the Enhanced Integrated Framework (EIF) whereby; "the EIF supports Least Developed Countries (LDCs) to use trade as a vehicle for economic growth and poverty reduction by mainstreaming trade into their development policies and building capacity to trade."<sup>775</sup>

On 16 December 2015, the EU alongside 23 other World Trade Organization (WTO) members completed a trade agreement that will see the elimination of duties on over 200 high tech items.<sup>776</sup> The agreement extends the 1996 Information Technology Agreement (ITA) and accounts for EUR1.3 trillion in global trade.<sup>777</sup> Tariffs will be lifted on a wide range of goods, including semiconductors, medical equipment, game consoles and GPS devices, however, the EU will maintain

2016. http://time.com/4207350/barack-obama-tpp-trade-deal/

<sup>776</sup> EU and WTO partners finalise high tech trade deal (Brussels) 16 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=1419&title=EU-and-WTO-partners-finalise-high-tech-trade-deal

<sup>777</sup> EU and WTO partners finalise high tech trade deal (Brussels) 16 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=1419&title=EU-and-WTO-partners-finalise-high-tech-trade-deal

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>770</sup> Press release: Obama completely committed to conclude EU trade deal in 2016, 26 January 2016. Access date: 23
 February 2016 http://www.politico.eu/article/obama-completely-committed-to-conclude-eu-trade-deal-in-2016/
 <sup>771</sup> Press release: President Obama urges swift passage of TPP trade deal, 3 February 2016. Access date: 23 February

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>772</sup> Press release: TPP trade deal signed, 4 January 2016. Access date: 23 February 2016.

http://www.bbc.com/news/business-35480600

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>773</sup> Press release: US to suspend South Africa trade benefits, January 12 2016. Access date: 25 February 2016 http://www.africanindy.com/business/us-to-suspend-south-africa-trade-benefits-on-march-15-1515444 <sup>774</sup> The EU and Vietnam finalise landmark trade deal (Brussels) 2 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016

The EU and Vietnam finalise landmark trade deal (Brussels) 2 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=1409&title=The-EU-and-Vietnam-finalise-landmark-trade-deal <sup>775</sup> EU and several of its Member States support Phase Two of the Enhanced Integrated Framework (Nairobi) 14

December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=1415&title=EUand-several-of-its-Member-States-support-Phase-Two-of-the-Enhanced-Integrated-Framework

tariffs on domestically produced items such as televisions, certain monitors, projectors and non-digital car radios.<sup>778</sup>

On 17 December 2015, the EU agreed to donate EUR600,000 to LDCs as a means of facilitating their efforts in implementing the Trade Facilitation Agreement (TFA).<sup>779</sup>

On 19 December 2015, the EU along with the rest of its partners in the WTO ratified a deal, which will see the removal of "trade distorting export subsidies in agriculture."<sup>780</sup> The agreement "will protect vulnerable farmers in developing countries from the damaging effects of export subsidies.<sup>781</sup>

On 16 January 2016, the European Commission announced that it would extend its 2016/38 resolution, whereby the EU provides subsidies to the European wine sector.<sup>782</sup>

On 12 February 2016, the European Commission announced that it would impose anti-dumping duties on cold-rolled flat steel from China and Russia.<sup>783</sup> EU Trade Commissioner Cecilia Malmström argued that, "the European Commission is acting and applying the instruments at its disposal to support and ensure a level-playing field. We cannot allow unfair competition from artificially cheap imports to threaten our industry."<sup>784</sup> On the same day, the European Commission extended existing anti-dumping and anti-subsidy measures against Chinese made solar modules, which were found to be in violation of rules concerning the circumvention of EU trade defense policies.<sup>785</sup>

The EU has made considerable efforts at liberalizing trade and removing protectionist barriers. It has also chosen to extend pre-existing barriers and subsidies.

Thus, EU has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Mathieu Sitayai

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>778</sup> EU and WTO partners finalise high tech trade deal (Brussels) 16 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=1419&title=EU-and-WTO-partners-finalise-high-tech-trade-deal

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>779</sup> EU commits €600,000 to support developing countries' customs reforms (Nairobi) 17 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=1420&title=EU-commits-€600000-to-support-developing-countries-customs-reforms

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>780</sup> WTO delivers ground-breaking deal for development (Brussels) 19 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=1422&title=WTO-delivers-ground-breaking-deal-fordevelopment

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>781</sup> WTO delivers ground-breaking deal for development (Brussels) 19 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=1422&title=WTO-delivers-ground-breaking-deal-for-development

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>782</sup> EC: Extended state aid for wine sector prolonged (Brussels) 16 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.globaltradealert.org/measure/ec-extended-state-aid-wine-sector-prolonged

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>783</sup> Commission launches new anti-dumping investigations into several steel products (Brussels) 12 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=1462&title=Commission-launches-new-anti-dumping-investigations-into-several-steel-products

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>784</sup> Commission launches new anti-dumping investigations into several steel products (Brussels) 12 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016 http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=1462&title=Commissionlaunches-new-anti-dumping-investigations-into-several-steel-products

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>785</sup> Commission imposes duties to prevent imports of dumped and subsidised Chinese solar panel components via Taiwan and Malaysia (Brussels) 12 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016

http://trade.ec.europa.eu/doclib/press/index.cfm?id=1461&title=Commission-imposes-duties-to-prevent-imports-of-dumped-and-subsidised-Chinese-solar-panel-components-via-Taiwan-and-Malaysia

# 6. Financial Regulation: Terrorist Finance

"We will continue to implement relevant FATF recommendations and instruments."

G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Argentina			+1
Australia		0	
Brazil	-1		
Canada			+1
China		0	
France			+1
Germany			+1
India		0	
Indonesia		0	
Italy			+1
Japan	-1		
Korea		0	
Mexico		0	
Russia			+1
Saudi Arabia		0	
South Africa		0	
Turkey			+1
United Kingdom			+1
United States			+1
European Union			+1
Average		+0.40	

# Assessment

# Background

On 16 November 2015, at the Antalya Summit, G20 members issued a "Statement on the Fight Against Terrorism" in which they reasserted their commitment to tackle terrorism financing. This commitment entails "enhanced cooperation on exchange of information and freezing of terrorist assets, criminalization of terrorist financing and robust targeted financial sanctions regimes related to terrorism and terrorist financing."<sup>786</sup> G20 members called on the Financial Action Task Force (FATF) to continue to recommend relevant instruments and legal frameworks that will assist countries in combating terrorist financing.

The FATF is an inter-governmental body established in 1989 as the global standard-setter for measures to combat money laundering and terrorist financing. The FATF is currently the primary policy-making body which develops international standard and legal framework to combat terrorist financing. The FATF has developed the 40 Recommendations and produces regular assessment of their implementation by FATF member states.<sup>787</sup>

At the Antalya Summit, the FATF published its report to G20 leaders on the global implementation of key counter-terrorist financing measures recommended by the FATF. The FATF evaluated the progress of all of its 194 Member jurisdictions in the global anti-money laundering (AML) / counter-

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>786</sup> G20 Statement on the Fight Against Terrorism, G20 Information Centre (Toronto) 16 November 2015. Access Date:
 20 February 2016. http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2015/151116-terrorism.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>787</sup> Terrorist Financing: FATF Report to G20 Leaders - actions being taken by the FATF, Financial Action Task Force (Paris) 16 November 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/documents/documents/terroristfinancing-fatf-report-to-g20.html

terrorist financing (CFT) network in implementing FATF regulations pertaining to terrorist financing. In the conclusion of its report, the FATF proposed several measures that the G20 could take to further support the FATF's work in combating money laundering and terrorist financing. Among them are assisting the FATF in "ensuring all jurisdictions have implemented fundamental measures to counter terrorist financing on an urgent basis, led by example, and assist implementation in low-capacity jurisdiction."<sup>788</sup> These key aspects will form the basis of the following compliance assessment.

# **Commitment Features**

This commitment requires G20 member countries to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments geared towards combating money laundering and terrorist financing. As The FATF's Report, Terrorist Financing, to the G20 leaders released in November 2015 highlighted three major areas that G20 countries could focus on to both implement essential counter terrorist financing measures and aid low capacity jurisdictions in implementing these essential measures. The three areas outlined are criminalizing terrorist financing, responding to foreign terrorist fighters, and implementing targeted financial sanctions.

Full compliance requires member states to take actions in all three areas. If member states take actions only in one *or* two out of the three areas outlined they will be awarded partial compliance. Failure to take action in any of the three areas results in negative compliance. Because the commitment requires member states to "continue to implement" FATF recommendations, full compliance does not require member states to intensify their current efforts or introduce new measures. Member states who continue existing efforts can be awarded full compliance as long as they meet all the three areas recommended by the FATF.

Criminalizing terrorist financing includes any actions that specify terrorist financing as a distinct legal offence. This may be achieved by including such clause within the national legal code. As defined in the FATF report, terrorist financing includes both the financing of a terrorist organization and financing an individual terrorist for purposes unrelated to committing a terrorist act.

Responding to foreign terrorist fighters includes any action, whether legal or technical, introduced to inhibit the financing of travel of foreign terrorist fighters. This report adopts the definition of foreign fighters used in UNSC Resolution 2178 (2014), which include "individuals who travel to a State other than their States of residence or nationality for the purpose of the perpetration, planning, or preparation of, or participation in, terrorist acts or ... armed conflict." As outlined in the FATF report, ensuring expedited implementation of targeted financial sanctions and ensuring that financial institutions are subject to adequate regulation and implement FATF recommendations count towards compliance with this recommendation.<sup>789</sup>

#### **Scoring Guidelines**

-1	Member does not take any actions to continue to implement ANY of the three relevant FATF recommendations to counter terrorist financing.
0	Member takes actions to continue to implement one OR two relevant FATF recommendations to counter terrorist financing.
+1	Member takes actions to continue to implement ALL three relevant FATF recommendations to counter terrorist financing.

Lead Analyst: Carol Drumm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>788</sup> Terrorist Financing: FATF Report to G20 Leaders-actions being taken by the FATF, Financial Action Task Force (Paris)16 November 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://www.fatf-

gafi.org/publications/fatfrecommendations/documents/terrorist-financing-fatf-report-to-g20.html

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>789</sup> Terrorist Financing: FATF Report to G20 Leaders-actions being taken by the FATF, Financial Action Task Force (Paris)
 16 November 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/documents/documents/terrorist-financing-fatf-report-to-g20.html

#### Argentina: +1

Argentina has fully complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

On 27 January 2016, President Mauricio Macri appointed a former International Monetary Fund (IMF) official to head Argentina's financial crimes agency.<sup>790</sup> Mariano Federici's appointment is a move to bolster the country's contribution to the global fight against money laundering and drug trafficking and to improve the agency's relations with its counterpart in the United States.<sup>791</sup> "We are going to put a very strong emphasis on fighting drug trafficking, which is a priority for Macri," Mr. Federici said in an interview last week.<sup>792</sup>

On 17 February 2016, Argentina's Ministry of Justice and Human Rights (MJDH) announced the creation of a new counter-terrorism financing (CTF) and anti-money laundering (AML) program to help monitor CTF/AML policy implementation, as well as strengthening and coordinating national, provincial, and municipal CTF/AML efforts.<sup>793</sup>

As of March 2016 Argentina has revised its Anti-terrorism Law to broaden the definition of terrorism and increased monetary fines and prison sentences for crimes associated with terrorist financing.<sup>794</sup> The Argentine Financial Intelligence Unit can freeze assets that are associated with terrorist financing. Additionally, Argentina has criminalized the financing of terrorist organizations, individuals and acts.<sup>795</sup> The FATF has explicitly stated that is satisfied with Argentina's progress in implementing its CTF/AML instruments.<sup>796</sup>

On 21 March 2016, Argentina announced that it and the United States will resume sharing intelligence on money flows to bolster the fight against drug gangs and organized crime.<sup>797</sup> "Not collaborating only benefits organized crime, the corrupt and potentially even terrorists," said Mariano Federici, who heads Argentina's Financial Information Unit.<sup>798</sup> Information sharing between the Argentine and US financial intelligence units was suspended in 2015, after the US Treasury's Financial Crimes Enforcement Network said its Argentine counterpart leaked confidential data.<sup>799</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>790</sup> New Head of Argentina's Financial-Crimes Agency Aims to Repair Ties With U.S., Wall Street Journal 27 January 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.wsj.com/articles/new-head-of-argentinas-financial-crimes-agency-aims-to-repair-ties-with-u-s-1453872234

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>791</sup> New Head of Argentina's Financial-Crimes Agency Aims to Repair Ties With U.S., Wall Street Journal 27 January 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.wsj.com/articles/new-head-of-argentinas-financial-crimes-agency-aims-to-repair-ties-with-u-s-1453872234

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>792</sup> New Head of Argentina's Financial-Crimes Agency Aims to Repair Ties With U.S., Wall Street Journal 27 January 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.wsj.com/articles/new-head-of-argentinas-financial-crimes-agency-aims-to-repair-ties-with-u-s-1453872234

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>793</sup> Boletín Oficial: Decreto 360/2016: Programa de Coordinación Nacional para el Combate del Lavado de Activos y la Financiación del Terrorismo. Creación, Ministerio de Justicia y Derechos Humanos 17 February 2016. Access Date: February 26, 2016. https://www.boletinoficial.gob.ar/pdf/linkQR/SEtRNjJxa3pOQzQrdTVReEh2ZkU0dz09.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>794</sup> Country Reports on Terrorism 2013, U.S. Department of State. Access Date: 8 March 2016.

http://www.state.gov/j/ct/rls/crt/2013/224825.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>795</sup> Country Reports on Terrorism 2013, U.S. Department of State. Access Date: 8 March 2016. http://www.state.gov/j/ct/rls/crt/2013/224825.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>796</sup> Improving Global AML/CFT Compliance, FATF 24 October 2014. Access Date: 8 March 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/countries/a-c/argentina/documents/fatf-compliance-oct-2014.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>797</sup> Argentina and the US will resume sharing financial intelligence, Business Insider 21 march 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.businessinsider.com/argentina-and-us-to-resume-sharing-financial-intelligence-2016-3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>798</sup> Argentina and the US will resume sharing financial intelligence, Business Insider 21 march 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.businessinsider.com/argentina-and-us-to-resume-sharing-financial-intelligence-2016-3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>799</sup> Argentina and the US will resume sharing financial intelligence, Business Insider 21 march 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.businessinsider.com/argentina-and-us-to-resume-sharing-financial-intelligence-2016-3

Argentina has criminalized terrorist financing, implemented financial sanction financing of foreign terrorist fighters and made efforts to combat foreign terrorist fighting.

Thus, Argentina has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Aylin Manduric

#### Australia: 0

Australia has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

In April 2015, the FATF released the Mutual Evaluation Report on Anti-Money Laundering (AML) and Counter-Terrorism Financing (CTF) measures in Australia. The report highlighted that Australian residential property is a haven for international money laundering, particularly from China, and recommended that Australia implement counter-measures to ensure that real estate agents, lawyers and accountants facilitating real estate transactions are captured by the regulatory net.<sup>800</sup> As of 28 March 2016, the Australian government has failed to implement the second tranche of the reform to the 2006 AML and CTF Act.<sup>801</sup> In 2003, Australia agreed to implement AML regulations that captured accountants, lawyers, real estate agents and other non-financial businesses. However, the second tranche is still under review.<sup>802</sup>

As of March 2016 Australia has criminalized the financing of terrorist acts under its Criminal Code.<sup>803</sup> Australia has specific offences for financing terrorism. Under this code, a person commits an offence if they make funds available to another person, provide funds or collect funds.<sup>804</sup> An offence is still committed even if a terrorist act does not occur or if the funds will not be used towards a specific terrorist act.<sup>805</sup>

On 11 March 2016, FATF released its Annual Report.<sup>806</sup> According to the FATF, an effective system to combat money laundering and terrorist financing has eleven key areas. Australia has met moderately satisfied six areas, substantially satisfied four and highly satisfied one.<sup>807</sup>

Australia has implemented actions pertaining to some relevant FATF recommendations and instruments, however not made significant reforms to AML and CTF.

Thus, Australia has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Aylin Manduric

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>800</sup> Australia must tighten its money laundering laws, MacroBusiness 9 March 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.macrobusiness.com.au/2016/03/australia-must-tighten-its-money-laundering-laws/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>801</sup> Australia must tighten its money laundering laws, MacroBusiness 9 March 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.macrobusiness.com.au/2016/03/australia-must-tighten-its-money-laundering-laws/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>802</sup>Australia must tighten its money laundering laws, MacroBusiness 9 March 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.macrobusiness.com.au/2016/03/australia-must-tighten-its-money-laundering-laws/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>803</sup> Terrorism Financing in Australia 2015, Australian Transaction Reports and Analysis Centre. Access Date: 8 March 2016. http://www.austrac.gov.au/sites/default/files/documents/terrorism-financing-in-australia-2014.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>804</sup> Terrorism Financing in Australia 2015, Australian Transaction Reports and Analysis Centre. Access Date: 8 March 2016. http://www.austrac.gov.au/sites/default/files/documents/terrorism-financing-in-australia-2014.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>805</sup> Terrorism Financing in Australia 2015, Australian Transaction Reports and Analysis Centre. Access Date: 8 March

<sup>2016.</sup> http://www.austrac.gov.au/sites/default/files/documents/terrorism-financing-in-australia-2014.pdf

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>806</sup> FATF Annual Report 2014-2015, FATF 11 March 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/media/fatf/documents/reports/Annual-report-2014-2015.pdf
 <sup>807</sup> FATF Annual Report 2014-2015, FATF 11 March 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.fatf-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>807</sup> FATF Annual Report 2014-2015, FATF 11 March 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/media/fatf/documents/reports/Annual-report-2014-2015.pdf

## Brazil: -1

Brazil has failed to comply with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

On 19 February 2016, the FATF released outcomes from a plenary meeting in Paris.<sup>808</sup> The FATF stated that it is "deeply concerned by Brazil's continued failure to remedy the serious deficiencies identified in its third mutual evaluation report adopted in June 2010. Brazil has not criminalised terrorist financing since 2004 when Brazil's second mutual evaluation report was adopted. While we welcome progress by Brazil on the freezing of terrorist assets, further improvements are required to fully satisfy the FATF standards."<sup>809</sup> The FATF calls on Brazil to enact counter terrorist financing legislation.<sup>810</sup> If Brazil fails to do this by the next FATF Plenary (20 June 2016), the FATF will consider what the next steps will be in the follow up process.<sup>811</sup>

On 16 March 2016, Brazil enacted Law No. 13,260 to regulate section XLIII of article 5 of the Constitution, on terrorism. Section XLIII states that the law will regard the practice of torture, illicit trafficking in narcotics and similar drugs, terrorism, and those crimes defined as heinous as not subject to bail, clemency, or amnesty. Liability for these crimes extends to individuals giving the commands for such acts, those executing these commands, and those failing to avoid the commission of these crimes although able to do so.<sup>812</sup>

In response to the legislation, Human Rights Watch (HRW) issued a stronge objection. It stated that the bill, "contains overbroad and vague language that endangers basic human rights such as freedom of association and expression."<sup>813</sup> "Imprecise definitions of terrorism open the door to potential misuse of the law against people who have nothing to do with terrorism," said Maria Laura Canineu, HRW Brazil director. "The Chamber of Deputies should safeguard the fundamental rights of all Brazilians and reject the bill." <sup>814</sup>

Brazil has failed to impliment two relevant FATF recommendations to counter terrorist financing. The ramifications of the new law are not yet known.

Thus, Brazil has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Rochelle D'souza

#### Canada: +1

Canada has fully complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>808</sup> Outcomes of the Plenary Meeting of the FATF, FATF (Paris) 19 February 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/countries/a-c/brazil/documents/outcomes-plenary-february-2016.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>809</sup> Outcomes of the Plenary Meeting of the FATF, FATF (Paris) 19 February 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/countries/a-c/brazil/documents/outcomes-plenary-february-2016.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>810</sup> Outcomes of the Plenary Meeting of the FATF, FATF (Paris) 19 February 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/countries/a-c/brazil/documents/outcomes-plenary-february-2016.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>811</sup> Outcomes of the Plenary Meeting of the FATF, FATF (Paris) 19 February 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/countries/a-c/brazil/documents/outcomes-plenary-february-2016.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>812</sup> Brazil: New Anti-Terrorism Law Enacted, Global Legal Monitor 15 April 2016. Access Date: 20 July 2016.

http://www.loc.gov/law/foreign-news/article/brazil-new-anti-terrorism-law-enacted/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>813</sup> Brazil: Counterterrorism Bill Endangers Basic Rights, Human Rights Watch 15 Novem,ber 2015. Access Date: 20 July 2016. https://www.hrw.org/news/2015/11/13/brazil-counterterrorism-bill-endangers-basic-rights

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>814</sup> Brazil: Counterterrorism Bill Endangers Basic Rights, Human Rights Watch 15 Novem, ber 2015. Access Date: 20 July 2016. https://www.hrw.org/news/2015/11/13/brazil-counterterrorism-bill-endangers-basic-rights

As of March 2016, Canada has criminalized terrorist financing in accordance with international standards and freezes and confiscates terrorist assets without delay.<sup>815</sup> The Proceeds of Crime (Money Laundering) and Terrorist Financing Act (PCMLTFA) in Canada facilitates 'combating the laundering of the proceeds of crime and the financing of terrorist activities' by implementing measures to detect, deter and prosecute offenders.<sup>816</sup>

As of March 2016, Canada has implemented instruments to address terrorist financing. Canada's Anti-Money Laundering and Anti-Terrorist Financing (AML/ATF) Regime is a "horizontal initiative comprising eleven federal partner organizations," which is led by the Department of Finance Canada.<sup>817</sup> The Financial Transactions and Reports Analysis Centre of Canada (FINTRAC) specifically monitors money laundering and terrorist financing and was developed in conjunction with the PCMLTFA, in order to "collect and analyze financial transaction reports and to disclose pertinent information to law enforcement and intelligence agencies."<sup>818</sup>

On 1 April 2015, Government of Canada made amendments to the Immigration and Refugee Protection Regulations in order to "enable Canada to adopt a strengthened methodology in order to better identify high-risk travellers, such as persons known to be foreign fighters, and prevent them from travelling to Canada before they board a flight."<sup>819</sup> This was an addition to the existing AML/TF regime in Canada which continuously checks on suspicious financial transactions which could potentially be used to fund the travel of foreign fighters.<sup>820</sup>

Canada has criminalized terrorist financing as a distinct offence and implemented relevant financial sanctions. It has also taken steps to address the threat arising from foreign terrorist fighters.

Thus, Canada has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Kertia Johnson

## China: 0

China has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

On 19 October 2012, the FATF has released the Follow-up Report to the Mutual Evaluation Report of Hong Kong, China, which was adopted ion 11 July 2008.<sup>821</sup> In the 2008 Mutual Evaluation Report, China was rated partially compliant (PC) on a number of key (Recommendation 3, SR I and III) and core recommandations (Recommendations 5, 10 and SR II).<sup>822</sup> In October 2012, the FATF recognized that China had made significant progress in addressing the deficiencies identified in the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>815</sup> Country Reports on Terrorism 2013, U.S. Department of State. Access Date: 8 March 2016. http://www.state.gov/i/ct/rls/crt/2013/224825.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>816</sup> Proceeds of Crime (Money Laundering) and Terrorist Financing Act, Government of Canada (Ottawa) 12 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://laws-lois.justice.gc.ca/eng/acts/p-24.501/page-1.html

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>817</sup> Report on Plans and Priorities 2015-16: Supplementary Information Tables, Department of Finance Canada (Ottawa)
 31 March 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.fin.gc.ca/pub/rpp/2015-2016/st-ts-03-eng.asp

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>818</sup> Report on Plans and Priorities 2014-15: Supplementary Tables: Department of Finance Canada (Ottawa) 6 March 2014. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.fin.gc.ca/pub/rpp/2014-2015/st-ts-04-eng.asp

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>819</sup> Regulations Amending the Immigration and Refugee Protection Regulations, Canada Gazette (Ottawa) 1 April 2015. Access Date: 16 February 2016. http://canadagazette.gc.ca/rp-pr/p2/2015/2015-04-22/html/sor-dors77-eng.php

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>820</sup> Guideline 2: Suspicious Transaction, Financial Transactions and Reports Analysis Centre of Canada (Ottawa)
 December 2010. Access Date: 16 March 2016. http://www.fintrac.gc.ca/publications/guide/guide2/2-eng.asp
 <sup>821</sup> Follow-up report to the mutual evaluation report of Hong Kong, China, FATF 19 October 2012. Access Date: 28

March 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/countries/d-i/hongkongchina/documents/follow-

upreporttothemutualevaluationreportofhongkongchina.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>822</sup> Follow-up report to the mutual evaluation report of Hong Kong, China, FATF 19 October 2012. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/countries/d-i/hongkongchina/documents/followupreporttothemutualevaluationreportofhongkongchina.html

2008 Mutual Evaluation Report.<sup>823</sup> The FATF agreed that China should now report on any further improvements to its Anti-Money Laundering/Combating the Financing of Terrorism (AML/CFT) system on a biennial update basis.<sup>824</sup>

On 15 December 2015, Chinese officials held bilateral talks in New York.<sup>825</sup> During two days of talks, China and the United States discussed combating terrorist financing, national risk assessments for money laundering and a Sino-US anti-money laundering pact, the People's Bank of China said in a statement on its website.<sup>826</sup> The meeting is the latest effort of China and the US to improve cooperation to fight terrorism.<sup>827</sup>

On 16 December 2015, following two days of talks between China and the US, a memorandum of understanding (MOU) on money laundering and countering terrorist financing has been signed between China and the United States.<sup>828</sup> The MOU was signed between the China Anti-Money Laundering Monitoring and Analysis Center (CAMLMAC) and the US Financial Crimes Enforcement Network (FinCEN).829

On 27 December 2015, China's parliament passed a counter terrorism law.<sup>830</sup> The official Xinhua news agency reported that the law had been passed unanimously by the Standing Committee of the National People's Congress, saying it was intended to "address terrorism at home and help maintain global world security."<sup>831</sup> A final draft of the law was not immediately available.<sup>832</sup>

On 25 January 2016, Prime Minister Narendra Modi and French President Francois Hollande issued a joint statement on terrorism. This statement included resolutions to increase bilateral cooperation to "stop sources of terrorist financing, dismantle terrorist infrastructure, and prevent supply of arms to terrorists."833

On 25 March 2016, the People's Bank of China announced it will establish a technical support system to tackle money laundering and "terror" financing.<sup>834</sup> The National Internet Finance Association of China will monitor suspicious online trade activity, Pan Gongsheng said at an event

upreporttothemutualevaluationreportofhongkongchina.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>823</sup> Follow-up report to the mutual evaluation report of Hong Kong, China, FATF 19 October 2012. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/countries/d-i/hongkongchina/documents/follow-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>824</sup> Follow-up report to the mutual evaluation report of Hong Kong, China, FATF 19 October 2012. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/countries/d-i/hongkongchina/documents/follow-

upreporttothemutualevaluationreportofhongkongchina.html <sup>825</sup> China urges U.S. cooperation to battle terrorism financing, Reuters 15 December 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/uk-china-usa-terrorism-idUSKBN0TY1GT20151215

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>826</sup> China urges U.S. cooperation to battle terrorism financing, Reuters 15 December 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/uk-china-usa-terrorism-idUSKBN0TY1GT20151215

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>827</sup> China urges U.S. cooperation to battle terrorism financing, Reuters 15 December 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/uk-china-usa-terrorism-idUSKBN0TY1GT20151215

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>828</sup> China, US sign MOU on money laundering and terrorism, China Daily 16 December 2015. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/world/2015-12/16/content 22724877.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>829</sup> China, US sign MOU on money laundering and terrorism, China Daily 16 December 2015. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/world/2015-12/16/content 22724877.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>830</sup> China approves controversial antiterrorism law, Financial Times 27 December 2015. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/078a8b42-ac7b-11e5-b955-1a1d298b6250.html#axzz44FI7fugY

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>831</sup> China approves controversial antiterrorism law, Financial Times 27 December 2015. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/078a8b42-ac7b-11e5-b955-1a1d298b6250.html#axzz44FI7fugY

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>832</sup> China approves controversial antiterrorism law, Financial Times 27 December 2015. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/078a8b42-ac7b-11e5-b955-1a1d298b6250.html#axzz44FI7fugY

<sup>833</sup> Full Text of India-France Joint Statement on Terrorism. NDT (New Delhi) 25 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.ndtv.com/india-news/full-text-of-india-france-ioint-statement-on-terrorism-1269835

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>834</sup> China to establish body to tackle money laundering, terrorism financing, Reuters 25 March 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://uk.reuters.com/article/us-china-cenbank-regulations-idUSKCN0WR05T

marking the launch of the body.<sup>835</sup> New regulations on internet financing would be issued "soon," Pan said.<sup>836</sup>

As of March 2016, China has resolved many of its technical deficiencies concerning the criminalization of money laundering. Regarding the "implementation of international instruments related to terrorist financing," FATF found in 2012 that China has not brought the level of compliance to a sufficient level.<sup>837</sup> No new evidence has been found suggesting China has taken action to address this.<sup>838</sup> A remaining concern is that self-laundering is not independently criminalized.839

China has taken some actions to address relevant FATF recommendations however, has not addressed the financing of foreign terrorist fighters.

Thus China has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Kertia Johnson

#### France: +1

France has fully complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

On 8 December 2015, European Union finance ministers broadly agreed to a French-led initiative to better track and freeze terrorist funding across the bloc.<sup>840</sup> The bloc had already agreed to toughen existing anti-money-laundering rules earlier this year, but governments had until 2017 to implement those rules.<sup>841</sup> The French government wants a swifter application of those measures, plus more intelligence sharing and wider-ranging tracking measures.<sup>842</sup> French Finance Minister Michel Sapin said there was broad agreement on the measures he circulated in a 13-page discussion paper.<sup>843</sup>

On 28 December 2015, Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders was released.<sup>844</sup> The report stated that since 2010, France had the fifth greatest number of convictions for terrorist financing among the top ten jurisdictions.<sup>845</sup> The report also stated that France had applied targeted financial sanctions on their own motion on 79 'designated individuals and entities' up to 15 August

<sup>844</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

<sup>845</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

#### G20 Research Group: 2015 G20 Antalya Summit Interim Compliance Report, 17 July 2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>835</sup> China to establish body to tackle money laundering, terrorism financing, Reuters 25 March 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://uk.reuters.com/article/us-china-cenbank-regulations-idUSKCN0WR05T

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>836</sup> China to establish body to tackle money laundering, terrorism financing, Reuters 25 March 2016. Access Date: 28 March 2016. http://uk.reuters.com/article/us-china-cenbank-regulations-idUSKCN0WR05T

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>837</sup> Mutual Evaluation 8th Follow-Up Report, FATF (Paris) 17 February 2012. Access Date: 9 March 2016.

http://www.fatf-gafi.org/media/fatf/documents/reports/mer/Follow%20Up%20MER%20China.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>838</sup> Mutual Evaluation 8th Follow-Up Report, FATF (Paris) 17 February 2012. Access Date: 9 March 2016.

http://www.fatf-gafi.org/media/fatf/documents/reports/mer/Follow%20Up%20MER%20China.pdf <sup>839</sup> Mutual Evaluation 8th Follow-Up Report, FATF (Paris) 17 February 2012. Access Date: 9 March 2016.

http://www.fatf-gafi.org/media/fatf/documents/reports/mer/Follow%20Up%20MER%20China.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>840</sup> EU Sees Broad Agreement on Fighting Terrorist Financing, The Wall Street Journal 8 December 2015. Access Date:

<sup>29</sup> March 2016. http://www.wsj.com/articles/france-presses-on-terrorist-financing-1449577369

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>841</sup> EU Sees Broad Agreement on Fighting Terrorist Financing, The Wall Street Journal 8 December 2015. Access Date: 29 March 2016. http://www.wsj.com/articles/france-presses-on-terrorist-financing-1449577369

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>842</sup> EU Sees Broad Agreement on Fighting Terrorist Financing, The Wall Street Journal 8 December 2015. Access Date: 29 March 2016. http://www.wsj.com/articles/france-presses-on-terrorist-financing-1449577369

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>843</sup> EU Sees Broad Agreement on Fighting Terrorist Financing, The Wall Street Journal 8 December 2015. Access Date:

<sup>29</sup> March 2016. http://www.wsj.com/articles/france-presses-on-terrorist-financing-1449577369

2015 equaling EUR231,888. <sup>846</sup> Amounts frozen includes funds subsequently un-frozen or confiscated, as well as funds frozen currently.<sup>847</sup>

On 10 February 2016, French and German finance ministries met and discussed measures to better prevent money laundering and terrorist financing, including a Europe-wide ban on cash transactions of more than EUR5,000.<sup>848</sup> France has a limit of EUR1,000 on cash transactions, which was lowered from EUR3,000 after the terrorist attacks on Charlie Hebdo and a Jewish supermarket in January 2015.<sup>849</sup> The country also lowered its cash transaction limit for tourists from EUR15,000 to EUR10,000. Negotiations are still ongoing.<sup>850</sup>

As of March 2016, France has implemented many of the FATF approaches to counter terrorist financing. The financing of terrorism is a distinct offense under French criminal law.<sup>851</sup> Steps have also been taken to criminalize the travel of terrorist fighters.<sup>852</sup> France has been a supporter of the use of targeted sanctions against terrorism and its supporters.<sup>853</sup> French financial institutions are subject to regulation regarding money laundering and terrorist financing, and are monitored by the financial intelligence unit Tracfin to ensure compliance.<sup>854</sup> Additionally France has taken steps to counter potential threats posed by its nationals traveling abroad to engage in terrorist activity.<sup>855</sup> These measures predate the Antalya Compliance cycle, but continue to be implemented.

France has continued to implement relevant FATF recommendations and sanctions, has continued criminalizing terrorist financing and has addressed foreign terrorist fighters.

Thus, France has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrew Aulthouse

#### Germany: +1

Germany has fully complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

855 Country Reports on Terrorism 2014, U.S. Department of State. Access Date: 8 March 2016. http://www.state.gov/j/ct/rls/crt/2014/239406.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>846</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>847</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016.
 http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf
 <sup>848</sup> Cash is Not King: Germany, France Discuss €5,000 Cap to Fight Terrorism, Sputnik News 10 February 2016. Access

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>848</sup> Cash is Not King: Germany, France Discuss €5,000 Cap to Fight Terrorism, Sputnik News 10 February 2016. Access Date: 29 March 2016. http://sputniknews.com/europe/20160210/1034515521/5000-euros-cash-ban-terrorism.html#ixzz44KrlBbu2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>849</sup> Cash is Not King: Germany, France Discuss €5,000 Cap to Fight Terrorism, Sputnik News 10 February 2016. Access Date: 29 March 2016. http://sputniknews.com/europe/20160210/1034515521/5000-euros-cash-ban-terrorism.html#ixzz44KrIBbu2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>850</sup> Cash is Not King: Germany, France Discuss €5,000 Cap to Fight Terrorism, Sputnik News 10 February 2016. Access Date: 29 March 2016. http://sputniknews.com/europe/20160210/1034515521/5000-euros-cash-ban-terrorism.html#ixzz44KrlBbu2

<sup>851</sup> France Counter-Terrorism, Legislationline.org, Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights, OSCE (Warsaw) 2016. Access Date: 1 March 2016. http://www.legislationline.org/topics/country/30/topic/5 852 France Proposes Anti-Terrorist Travel Bans, BBC (London) 9 July 2014. Access Date: 1 March 2016. http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-28231947

<sup>853</sup> United Nations Sanctions, French Diplomatie (Paris) 24 December 2013. Access Date: 1 March 2016. http://www.diplomatie.gouv.fr/en/french-foreign-policy/united-nations/fields-of-action/peace-and-security/article/united-nations-sanctions

<sup>854</sup> France and the Fight Against Money-Laundering, Financing of Terrorism and Corruption, France Diplomatie (Paris) October 2014. Access Date: 1 March 2016. http://www.diplomatie.gouv.fr/en/french-foreign-policy/defencesecurity/money-laundering-and-corruption/article/france-and-the-fight-against-money

On 8 December 2015, European Union finance ministers broadly agreed to a French-led initiative to better track and freeze terrorist funding across the bloc.<sup>856</sup> The bloc had already agreed to toughen existing anti-money-laundering rules earlier this year, but governments had until 2017 to implement those rules.<sup>857</sup> Germany has been a strong supporter of the plan, however cautioned that similar deals took long periods to negotiate.<sup>858</sup>

On 28 December 2015, Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders was released.<sup>859</sup> The report stated that Germany had applied targeted financial sanctions on their own motion on four 'designated individuals and entities' up to 15 August 2015 equaling EUR5,300.<sup>860</sup> Amounts frozen includes funds subsequently un-frozen or confiscated, as well as funds frozen currently.<sup>861</sup>

On 10 February 2016, French and German finance ministries met and discussed measures to better prevent money laundering and terrorist financing, including a Europe-wide ban on cash transactions of more than EUR5,000.<sup>862</sup> Germany and France want to impose a Europe-wide ban on cash transactions of more than 5,000 (\$5,600) in order to better prevent money-laundering and terrorist financing, German finance minister Wolfgang Schauble told the press after meeting with French colleagues. Germany, along with Austria, is one of a minority of EU member states that currently do not have a limit on cash transactions. Negotiations are still ongoing.<sup>863</sup>

According to the FATF 2014 Mutual Evaluation Report Germany's amendments of the AntiMoney Laundering (AML) Law made it possible to remedy all technical deficiencies, thus making Germany 'largely compliant'.<sup>864</sup> "Germany has demonstrated sufficient progress with respect to all core Recommendations previously rated PC."<sup>865</sup> The report determined that due to the progress Germany had made in various recommendations of the FATF can be considered sufficient to be removed from the regular follow-up process.<sup>866</sup>

As of March 2016 Germany has criminalized the financing of terrorism and travel related to terrorism as distinct criminal offenses.<sup>867</sup> Germany has been largely compliant with FATF

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>856</sup> EU Sees Broad Agreement on Fighting Terrorist Financing, The Wall Street Journal 8 December 2015. Access Date:
 29 March 2016. http://www.wsj.com/articles/france-presses-on-terrorist-financing-1449577369

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>857</sup> EU Sees Broad Agreement on Fighting Terrorist Financing, The Wall Street Journal 8 December 2015. Access Date:
 29 March 2016. http://www.wsj.com/articles/france-presses-on-terrorist-financing-1449577369

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>858</sup> EU Sees Broad Agreement on Fighting Terrorist Financing, The Wall Street Journal 8 December 2015. Access Date: 29 March 2016. http://www.wsj.com/articles/france-presses-on-terrorist-financing-1449577369

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>859</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>860</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>861</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>862</sup> Cash is Not King: Germany, France Discuss €5,000 Cap to Fight Terrorism, Sputnik News 10 February 2016. Access Date: 29 March 2016. http://sputniknews.com/europe/20160210/1034515521/5000-euros-cash-ban-terrorism.html#ixzz44KrlBbu2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>863</sup> Cash is Not King: Germany, France Discuss €5,000 Cap to Fight Terrorism, Sputnik News 10 February 2016. Access Date: 29 March 2016. http://sputniknews.com/europe/20160210/1034515521/5000-euros-cash-ban-terrorism.html#ixzz44KrlBbu2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>864</sup> Mutual Evaluation of Germany, FATF (Paris) 2014. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://www.fatfgafi.org/media/fatf/documents/reports/mer/FUR-Germany-2014.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>865</sup> Mutual Evaluation of Germany, FATF (Paris) 2014. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://www.fatfgafi.org/media/fatf/documents/reports/mer/FUR-Germany-2014.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>866</sup> Mutual Evaluation of Germany, FATF (Paris) 2014. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://www.fatf-

gafi.org/media/fatf/documents/reports/mer/FUR-Germany-2014.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>867</sup> Germany: New Anti-Terrorism Legislation Entered Into Force, Library of Congress Global Legal Monitor (Washington D.C.) 10 July 2015. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/media/fatf/documents/reports/mer/FUR-Germany-2014.pdf

recommendations about regulating its financial system to prevent money laundering and terrorist financing.868

Germany has continued to implement relevant FATF recommendations and sanctions, has continued criminalizing terrorist financing and has addressed foreign terrorist fighters.

Thus, Germany has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Andrew Aulthouse

#### India: 0

India has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

In June 2015, the United State Department released Country Terrorism Reports 2014 and criticized India for ineffective implementation of anti-money laundering (AML) and counterterrorist financing (CFT) laws arguing that even when Washington supplied Modi government officials with intelligence on terrorism-related funds, basic seizures were not followed up with investigations, thus ceding ground on a more comprehensive approach.<sup>869</sup> The Department noted that despite India aligning its domestic AML-CFT regime with international standards, "The Indian government has yet to implement the legislation effectively, however, especially with regard to criminal convictions." No evidence was found suggesting these concerns were addressed within the compliance cycle.

On 28 December 2015, Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders was released.<sup>870</sup> The report stated that India had applied targeted financial sanctions on their own motion on 37 'designated individuals and entities' up to 15 August 2015 equaling EUR300,000.871 Amounts frozen includes funds subsequently un-frozen or confiscated, as well as funds frozen currently.<sup>872</sup>

On 25 January 2016, Prime Minister Narendra Modi and French President Francois Hollande issued a joint statement on terrorism. This statement included resolutions to increase bilateral cooperation to "stop sources of terrorist financing, dismantle terrorist infrastructure, and prevent supply of arms to terrorists."873

On 26 January 2016, Indian government agencies launched a National Risk Assessment (NRA) exercise "to identify the sectors that are susceptible to money laundering and terror funding, and plug the loopholes."874 The NRA exercise will take a year, involving the collection of data on "sectors that are prone to money laundering in high, medium, and lower categories at the national level."875 India

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>868</sup> Mutual Evaluation of Germany, FATF (Paris) 2014. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://www.fatfgafi.org/media/fatf/documents/reports/mer/FUR-Germany-2014.pdf <sup>869</sup> India failing to curb terror funds: U.S., The Hindu 20 June 2015. Access Date: 29 March 2016.

http://www.thehindu.com/news/international/india-failing-to-curb-terror-funds-us/article7334733.ece

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>870</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>871</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016.

http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>872</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>873</sup> Full Text of India-France Joint Statement on Terrorism, NDT (New Delhi) 25 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.ndtv.com/india-news/full-text-of-india-france-joint-statement-on-terrorism-1269835

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>874</sup> Operation begins to curb money laundering, terrorist funding, The Hinu (New Delhi) January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.thehindu.com/news/national/operation-begins-to-curb-money-laundering-terrorfunding/article8152688.ece

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>875</sup> Operation begins to curb money laundering, terrorist funding, The Hinu (New Delhi) January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.thehindu.com/news/national/operation-begins-to-curb-money-laundering-terrorfunding/article8152688.ece

will prepare an action plan based on that level of risk. However, as of March 2016 India has not implemented legislation regarding the criminalization of terrorist financing and money laundering.<sup>876</sup>

India has implemented some financial sanctions, however has not implemented other relevant FATF recommendations.

Thus, India has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Rebecca Dickey

#### Indonesia: 0

Indonesia has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

On 28 December 2015, Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders was released.<sup>877</sup> The report stated that Indonesia had applied targeted financial sanctions on their own motion on one 'designated individuals and entities' up to 15 August 2015 equaling an undisclosed amount.<sup>878</sup>

In 2010, the Government of Indonesia made an amendment to its criminal code to strengthen its commitment to counter terrorist financing. The Law criminalizes terrorist financing as a distinct criminal offense.<sup>879</sup>

As of March 2016, Indonesia regulates its financial system against money laundering and terrorist financing, through the Indonesian Financial Transaction Reports and Analysis Centre (PPATK).<sup>880</sup> Terrorist travel has become a crime in Indonesia following the terrorist attacks in Jakarta on 14 January 2016.<sup>881</sup>

Despite not being a member of the FATF, Indonesia has contributed to combating money laundering and terrorist financing through legislation concerning terrorist financing and travel, and through the support of targeted sanctions against terrorism. It has also taken steps to regulate its financial system against the threat of money laundering and terrorist financing, and criminalized terrorist financing as a distinct offence. However, Indonesia has not fully addressed the threat arising from foreign terrorist travel and the financing of it.

Thus, Indonesia has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Andrew Aulthouse

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>876</sup> Country Reports on Terrorism 2014, U.S. Department of State. Access Date: Operation begins to curb money laundering, terrorist funding, The Hinu (New Delhi) January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.thehindu.com/news/national/operation-begins-to-curb-money-laundering-terror-

funding/article8152688.ece9 March 2016. http://www.state.gov/i/ct/rls/crt/2014/239408.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>877</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>878</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

<sup>(</sup>Jakarta) 22 October 2010. Access Date: 13 March 2016.

http://www.flevin.com/id/lgso/translations/Laws/Law%20No.%208%20of%202010%20on%20Prevention%20and%20Er adication%20of%20Money%20Laundering%20(MoF).pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>880</sup> Rethinking the Anti-Terrorism Strategy in Indonesia, The Jakarta Post (Jakarta) 19 June 2015. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2015/06/19/rethinking-anti-terrorism-strategy-indonesia.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>881</sup> Jakarta Attacks Prompt Tougher Anti-Terrorism Laws in Indonesia, The Guardian (London) 17 February 2016. Access D Operation begins to curb money laundering, terrorist funding, The Hinu (New Delhi) January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.thehindu.com/news/national/operation-begins-to-curb-money-laundering-terror-funding/article8152688.eceate: 2 March 2016. http://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/feb/17/jakarta-attacks-prompt-tougher-anti-terrorism-laws-in-indonesia

# Italy: +1

Italy has fully complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

On 28 December 2015, Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders was released.<sup>882</sup> The report stated that Italy had applied targeted financial sanctions on their own motion on 17 'designated individuals and entities' up to 15 August 2015.<sup>883</sup>

On 11 February 2016, FATF published Mutual Evaluation Report Italy 2016. It provides a summary of the anti-money laundering and combating the financing of terrorism (AML/CFT) measures in place in Italy.<sup>884</sup> The report found, "Italy has a strong legal and institutional framework to fight money laundering and terrorist financing and authorities have a good understanding of the risks the country faces. There are areas where improvements are needed such as its money laundering investigative and prosecutorial action on risks associated with self-laundering, standalone money laundering, and foreign predicate offences, and the abuse of legal persons."<sup>885</sup>

Since March 2016, Italy has criminalized terrorist financing under articles 270 and 270 of its Criminal Code.<sup>886</sup> Through the Anti-Mafia Code, Italy can freeze the assets of "EU Internals," and supplement a gap in the EU framework.<sup>887</sup> Italy has also supplemented the EU framework via LD 109/2007 to include "assets" that are "owned or controlled" by a listed person within the scope of the freezing measures.<sup>888</sup> Additionally, Italy has enacted Decree Law on foreign terrorist fighters which addresses the financing of travel for foreign fighters.<sup>889</sup>

Italy has continued to implement relevant FATF recommendations and sanctions, has continued criminalizing terrorist financing and has addressed foreign terrorist fighters.

Thus, Italy has received a score of +1 for full compliance.

Analyst: Motahareh Nabavi Niaki

# Japan: -1

Japan has failed to comply with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

On 8 December 2015, Japan launched its counter terrorism unit (CTU-J). The CTU-J consists of 20 officials from various government bodies including Foreign Ministry, Defense Ministry and the

- <sup>883</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf
- 884 Italy's Measures to Combat Money Laundering and Terrorist Financing, FATF (Paris) February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/publications/mutualevaluations/documents/mer-italy-2016.html 885 Italy's Measures to Combat Money Laundering and Terrorist Financing, FATF (Paris) February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/publications/mutualevaluations/documents/mer-italy-2016.html 886 Italy's Measures to Combat Money Laundering and Terrorist Financing, FATF (Paris) February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/publications/mutualevaluations/documents/mer-italy-2016.html 886 Italy's Measures to Combat Money Laundering and Terrorist Financing, FATF (Paris) February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/publications/mutualevaluations/documents/mer-italy-2016.html 887 Detailed Assessment Report on Anti-Money Laundering and Combating the Financing of Terrorism, IMF (Washington) February 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. https://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/scr/2016/cr1643.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>882</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>888</sup> Detailed Assessment Report on Anti-Money Laundering and Combating the Financing of Terrorism, IMF
 (Washington) February 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. https://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/scr/2016/cr1643.pdf
 <sup>889</sup> Counter-Terrorism Committee visit to Italy focuses on foreign terrorist fighter threat, law enforcement and border control challenges, Security Council Counter-Terrorism Committee 29 May 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.un.org/en/sc/ctc/news/2015-05-29 CTC Italy FTF.html

National Police Agency. Its representatives will be sent to areas with high levels of terrorist activity, including Southeast Asia, the Middle East, and northwestern Africa.<sup>890</sup>

As of March 2016, the FATF is still concerned with Japan's continuous failure to "remedy the numerous and serious deficiencies identified in its third mutual evaluation report adopted in October 2008, despite Japan's high-level political commitment."<sup>891</sup> The most important deficiencies are incomplete criminalization of terrorist financing, the incomplete mechanism for the freezing of terrorist assets and the failure to ratify and fully implement the Palermo Convention.<sup>892</sup>

Japan has failed to implement relevant FATF recommendations.

Thus, Japan has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Motahareh Nabavi Niaki

#### Korea: 0

Korea has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

On 28 December 2015, Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders was released.<sup>893</sup> The report stated that Korea had applied targeted financial sanctions on their own motion on 64 'designated individuals and entities' up to 15 August 2015 equaling EUR211,710.894 Amounts frozen includes funds subsequently un-frozen or confiscated, as well as funds frozen currently.<sup>895</sup>

Since March 2016, Korea has tightened its legislative framework and administrative procedures to combat terrorist financing in accordance with United Nations (UN) Security Council Resolution 1267 and 1373. Korea's Prohibition of Financing for Offenses of Public Intimidation Act (PFOPIA) implemented the UN Convention for the Suppression of the Financing of Terrorism.<sup>896</sup> Under the Act, funds for public intimidation offenses are identified as "any funds or assets collected, provided, delivered, or kept for use in any of the following acts committed with the intention to intimidate the public or to interfere with the exercise of rights of a national, local, or foreign government."<sup>897</sup> Additionally, this Act explicitly criminalizes the financing of terrorism.<sup>898</sup> An amendment to the Act expanded the government's ability to confiscate funds related to terrorism, enabling the government to confiscate the direct proceeds of terrorism and the funds and assets derived from those proceeds.<sup>899</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>890</sup> Japan brings forward launch of anti-terror intelligence unit for overseas ops, Russia Today. 4 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. https://www.rt.com/news/324779-japan-anti-terrorism-unit/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>891</sup> FATF calls on Japan to implement adequate anti-money laundering and counter terrorist financing legislation, FATF 27 June 2014. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.fatf-

gafi.org/publications/?hf=10&b=0&q=Japan&s=desc(fatf\_releasedate <sup>892</sup> FATF calls on Japan to implement adequate anti-money laundering and counter terrorist financing legislation, FATF 27 June 2014. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.fatf-

gafi.org/publications/?hf=10&b=0&q=Japan&s=desc(fatf\_releasedate

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>893</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>894</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016.

http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>895</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>896</sup> Country Reports on Terrorism 2009, Embassy of the United States (Seoul) 5 August 2010. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://seoul.usembassy.gov/p sr 080610a.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>897</sup> Country Reports on Terrorism 2009, Embassy of the United States (Seoul) 5 August 2010. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://seoul.usembassy.gov/p sr 080610a.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>898</sup> Mutual Evaluation Report, FATF (Paris) 26 June 2009. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.fatfgafi.org/media/fatf/documents/reports/mer/MER%20Korea.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>199</sup> Country Reports on Terrorism 2009, Embassy of the United States (Seoul) 5 August 2010. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://seoul.usembassy.gov/p sr 080610a.html

Korea currently has two parallel regimes for restricting the financial activities of entities designated in accordance with S/RES/1267(1999) and S/RES/1373(2001): the first under the Foreign Exchange Transactions Act (FETA), and the second (most recent) under PFOPIA.<sup>900</sup>

Korea has implemented terrorist financing sanctions, however has not addressed the financing of travel for foreign terrorist fighters.

Thus, Korea has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Sonia Arora

## Mexico: 0

Mexico has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

On 28 December 2015, Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders was released.<sup>901</sup> The report did not note that Mexico had applied any targeted financial sanctions on their own motion as of August 2015. No other evidence was found suggesting it had within the compliance cycle.

As of March 2016, the FATF has acknowledged the progress Mexico has made to reduce its deficiencies that were outlined in its 2008 Mutual Evaluation Report.<sup>902</sup> Key measures that have been taken are amending the Federal Criminal Code and regulations to criminalize money laundering and the financing of terrorism consistent with the FATF standards, improving the efficiency of the prevention and combating of money laundering and establishing an asset freezing regime for terrorists, those that finance terrorism, and money launderers.<sup>903</sup>

Mexico has criminalized terrorist financing however, has not responded to the financing of foreign terrorist fighters.

Thus, Mexico has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Sonia Arora

# Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

On 18 November 2015, Russia created an interdepartmental commission dedicated to combating terrorism financing.<sup>904</sup> The commission is to receive information on suspicious activity from various domestic departments, including the Prosecutor General's Office, Russian Central Bank, and regional authorities.<sup>905</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>900</sup> Mutual Evaluation Report, FATF (Paris) 26 June 2009. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/media/fatf/documents/reports/mer/MER%20Korea.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>901</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>902</sup> Mutual Evaluation of Mexico: 7<sup>th</sup> Follow-up Report, FATF (Paris) February 2014. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/documents/news/fur-mexico-2014.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>903</sup> Mutual Evaluation of Mexico: 7<sup>th</sup> Follow-up Report, FATF (Paris) February 2014. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/documents/news/fur-mexico-2014.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>904</sup>Putin sets up commission to combat terrorism financing, Reuters (Moscow) 18 November 2015. Access Date: 1 March 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-mideast-crisis-russia-financing-idUSKCN0T70X120151118

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>905</sup>Putin sets up commission to combat terrorism financing, Reuters (Moscow) 18 November 2015. Access Date: 1 March 2016. http://www.reuters.com/article/us-mideast-crisis-russia-financing-idUSKCN0T70X120151118

On 28 December 2015, Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders was released.<sup>906</sup> The report stated that since 2010, Russia had the seventh greatest number of convictions for terrorist financing among the top ten jurisdictions.<sup>907</sup> The report also stated that Russia had applied targeted financial sanctions on their own motion on 3887 "designated individuals and entities" up to 15 August 2015, equaling EUR44,929.<sup>908</sup> Amounts frozen includes funds subsequently unfrozen or confiscated, as well as funds frozen currently.<sup>909</sup>

As of March 2016, Russia has criminalized terrorist financing as a distinct offence in Article 205.1 of Russia's Criminal Code (CC).<sup>910</sup> This targets any support or contribution to terrorist activity and is linked to 10 different terrorist crimes.<sup>911</sup> The CC also provides for targeted financial sanctions against perpetrators of terrorism finance through Article 104.1 CC.<sup>912</sup> Russia requires the freezing of terrorist assets without delay, but not later than one working day.<sup>913</sup> Russia has also worked to combat foreign terrorist fighters.<sup>914</sup> These laws are in accordance to FATF requirements and continue to combat the finance of terrorism.

Russia has continued to implement relevant FATF recommendations and sanctions, has continued criminalizing terrorist financing and has addressed foreign terrorist fighters.

Thus, Russia has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Mustafa Sayedi

# Saudi Arabia: 0

Saudi Arabia has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

As of March 2016 Saudi Arabia has implemented the Anti-Money Laundering Law (Royal Decree No. M/31, 2 April 2012) and the Law on Terrorism Crimes and Financing (Royal Decree No. M/16, 27 December 2013), which establish and solidify a process to criminalize terrorism of finance as a distinct offense, impose targeted financial sanctions on perpetrators, and provide the regulatory oversight required to ensure financial institutions implement Financial Action Task Force (FATF) regulations. Saudi Arabia continues to use these laws towards the fulfill its FATF commitments.

http://www.state.gov/j/ct/rls/crt/2014/239406.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>906</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>907</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>908</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016.

http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>909</sup> Terrorist Financing FATF Report to the G20 Leaders, FATF 28 December 2015. Access Date 29 March 2016. http://g20.org/English/Documents/PastPresidency/201512/P020151228375596818045.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>910</sup> 6<sup>th</sup> Follow-up Report: Mutual Evaluation of the Russian Federation, Financial Action Task Force (Paris) 21 October 2013. Access Date 28 February 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/media/fatf/documents/reports/mer/FUR-Russian-2013.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>911</sup> Second Mutual Evaluation Report: Anti-Money Laundering and Combating of the Financing of Terrorism – Russian Federation, Financial Action Task Force (Paris) 20 June 2008. Access Date: 29 February 2016. http://www.fatfgafi.org/media/fatf/documents/reports/mer/MER%20Russia%20ful.pdf <sup>912</sup> Second Mutual Evaluation Report: Anti-Money Laundering and Combating of the Financing of Terrorism – Russian

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>912</sup> Second Mutual Evaluation Report: Anti-Money Laundering and Combating of the Financing of Terrorism – Russian Federation, Financial Action Task Force (Paris) 20 June 2008. Access Date: 29 February 2016. http://www.fatfgafi.org/media/fatf/documents/reports/mer/MER%20Russia%20ful.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>913</sup> Country Reports on Terrorism 2014, U.S. Department of State. Access Date: 8 March 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>914</sup> Statement for the press on the UN resolution on foreign terrorist fighters, The Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the Russian Federation 26 September 2014. Access Date: 8 March 2016. http://www.mid.ru/en/iniciativy-rossii-v-oon/-/asset\_publisher/lt9FJKw0JOXM/content/id/669180

Saudi Arabia has been deemed at least "largely compliant" to the core and key recommendations of the FATF, which includes those relating to terrorist financing. Therefore, its request to move from regular follow-up to biennial updates has been approved. The next update is due at the 23rd plenary meeting of the Middle East and North Africa Financial Action Task Force (MENAFATF) in April/May 2016.

Although Saudi Arabia has criminalized terrorist financing and implemented appropriated financial sanction, it has not addressed foreign terrorist fighters.

Thus, Saudi Arabia has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Mustafa Sayedi

## South Africa: 0

South Africa has partially complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

On 19 February 2016, the Parliament of the Republic of South Africa published a report confirming that the Financial Intelligence Centre Amendment Bill and Financial Sector Regulation (FSR) Bill are currently being deliberated on in the National Assembly. The FSR Bill proposes reforms to financial regulation in South Africa to specifically improve its capacity to maintain financial stability and counter terrorist financing. The Bill specifically proposes the establishment special committees tasked with the enforcement of the new financial rules.<sup>915</sup>

According to the latest FATF Report on South Africa published in 2009, South Africa has "criminalized terrorist financing in section 4 of the Protection of Constitutional Democracy against Terrorist and Related Activities Act (POCDATARA)." The FATF particularly notes that the POCDATARA is "comprehensive and criminalizes the collection or provision of property with the intention that it be used for the purpose of committing a terrorist act, or by a terrorist organization or individual terrorist for any purpose."

In March 2015, The International Monetary fund (IMF) released a report assessing the state of antimoney laundering (AML) and combating the financing of terrorism (CFT) in South Africa.<sup>916</sup> Staff were guided by the current FATF 40 Recommendations and assessment methodology.<sup>917</sup> The report found that South Africa has made significant progress in improving its AML/CFT legal and institutional framework since it was last assessed against the AML/CFT standard in 2008.<sup>918</sup> Furthermore, it noted that the number of ML investigations has increased since 2009.

South Africa has made some progress towards implementing relevant FATF recommendations to counter terrorist financing. However, South Africa has not taken any actions in regard to foreign terrorist financing.

Thus, South Africa has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Ron Shnaidstein

<sup>915</sup> South Africa: National Treasury Requests Public Comments on Draft Financial Intelligence Centre Amendment Bill 2015, All Africa (Pretoria) 21 April 2015. Access Date: 11 March 2016. http://allafrica.com/stories/201504221424.html <sup>916</sup> South Africa Financial Sector Assessment Program, IMF March 2015. Access Date: 4 April 2016.

https://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/scr/2015/cr1551.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>917</sup> South Africa Financial Sector Assessment Program, IMF March 2015. Access Date: 4 April 2016. https://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/scr/2015/cr1551.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>918</sup> South Africa Financial Sector Assessment Program, IMF March 2015. Access Date: 4 April 2016. https://www.imf.org/external/pubs/ft/scr/2015/cr1551.pdf

# Turkey: +1

Turkey has fully complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

On 22 October 2014, FATF release a Mutual Evaluation Report.<sup>919</sup> The report stated that Turkey has made significant progress in addressing the deficiencies in its anti-money laundering/countering the financing of terrorism (AML/CFT) measures, as identified in the mutual evaluation report of February 2007.<sup>920</sup> Since the 2007 report, Turkey has: amended the money laundering offence in the Criminal Code, by lowering the threshold for predicate offences and including elements required by the relevant United Nations conventions; adopted new regulations and amendments to existing regulations, which strengthen the requirements on customer due diligence, beneficial ownership, risk and simplified/enhanced due diligence; strengthened the reporting requirements for suspected terrorist financing transactions; and adopted a new regime on the Prevention of the Financing of Terrorism.<sup>921</sup> FATF approved the exit from follow-up of Turkey.<sup>922</sup>

On 16 February 2013, the Law on the Prevention of the Financing of Terrorism entered into force which defines "financing of terrorism" to include individuals and organizations who support terrorism at the national or international level by providing funds, and any person who sends money to a terrorist organization listed in relevant United Nations Security Council resolutions would be prosecuted.<sup>923</sup> The law also authorizes the Financial Crimes Investigation Board (MASAK) under the Ministry of Finance to "freeze" assets of those suspected of financing terrorism as a "preventive measure," when a strong suspicion exists about the individual or organization concerned.<sup>924</sup>

In June 2015, the United States Department of State released the Country Reports on terrorism, which details the actions of several countries in regard to AML/CTF.<sup>925</sup> It stated that the Government of Turkey intensified efforts to interdict the travel of suspected foreign terrorist fighters through Turkey to and from Syria and Iraq.<sup>926</sup> These efforts include the development and implementation of a "banned from entry list," as well as the deployment of "Risk Analysis Units" to detect suspected foreign terrorist fighters at airports, land border crossings, and border cities.<sup>927</sup> Cooperation with other source countries increased during the year in response to the foreign terrorist fighter threat, with both Turkey and source countries seeking to improve information sharing in particular. Turkey is an active member of the Global Coalition to Counter ISIL.<sup>928</sup>

http://www.fatf-gafi.org/publications/mutualevaluations/documents/fur-turkey-2014.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>919</sup> Mutual Evaluation of Turkey : 15th Follow-Up Report, FATF 22 October 2016. Access Date 5 April 2016. http://www.fatf-gafi.org/publications/mutualevaluations/documents/fur-turkey-2014.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>920</sup> Mutual Evaluation of Turkey : 15th Follow-Up Report, FATF 22 October 2016. Access Date 5 April 2016.

http://www.fatf-gafi.org/publications/mutualevaluations/documents/fur-turkey-2014.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>921</sup> Mutual Evaluation of Turkey : 15th Follow-Up Report, FATF 22 October 2016. Access Date 5 April 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>922</sup> FATF Plenary meetings - Chairman's Summaries, FATF (2016) Access Date: 5 April 2016. http://www.fatfgafi.org/about/outcomesofmeetings/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>923</sup> Turkey: Law to Combat Financing of Terrorism, Global Legal Monitor (Washington) 12 March 2013. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://www.loc.gov/law/foreign-news/article/turkey-law-to-combat-financing-of-terrorism/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>924</sup> Turkey: Law to Combat Financing of Terrorism, Global Legal Monitor (Washington) 12 March 2013. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://www.loc.gov/law/foreign-news/article/turkey-law-to-combat-financing-of-terrorism/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>925</sup> Country Report on Terrorism 2014, US Department of State June 2015. Access Date: 05 April 2016. http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/239631.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>926</sup> Country Report on Terrorism 2014, US Department of State June 2015. Access Date: 05 April 2016. http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/239631.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>927</sup> Country Report on Terrorism 2014, US Department of State June 2015. Access Date: 05 April 2016. http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/239631.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>928</sup> Country Report on Terrorism 2014, US Department of State June 2015. Access Date: 05 April 2016. http://www.state.gov/documents/organization/239631.pdf

MASAK continues to operate in cooperation and coordination with the law enforcement authorities and prosecutors at the national level.<sup>929</sup> MASAK also cooperates with other Financial Intelligence Units and actively contributes to the efforts of the FATF.<sup>930</sup> Turkey has created a legal framework in line with the FATF recommendations in order to implement effectively UN Security Council resolutions 1267 and 1373, which calls for criminalizing terrorist financing and freezing terrorist assets.<sup>931</sup> The Turkish Ministry of Foreign Affairs reports that Turkey has made bilateral agreements with more than over 70 countries around the world in the field of counterterrorism.<sup>932</sup> These agreements provide the legal basis for bilateral cooperation against illegal entities including terrorist organization and facilitate exchange of information among the relevant agencies.<sup>933</sup>

Turkey has implemented all relevant FATF measures.

Thus Turkey has received a score of +1 for full compliance.

Analyst: Rebecca Dickey

## United Kingdom: +1

The United Kingdom has fully complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

The UK government has criminalized terrorist financing under the Proceeds of Crime Act 2002, the Terrorism Act (TACT) 2000, and the Money Laundering Regulations 2007.<sup>934</sup> The UK government has also adopted the relevant European Union measures, including measures to prevent the financing of terrorism. The EU Funds Transfers Regulation, which also binds the UK government, imposes identification and verification requirements on payers and by payment service providers.<sup>935</sup>

Under Sections 15-18 of TACT, the UK government criminalizes acts of "inviting, providing, or receiving" as well as "using or intending" and "being involved in an arrangement" which makes "money or other property available with the intention or reasonable suspicion that it will be used for the purposes of terrorism." This, therefore, includes the financing of foreign fighter travel for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>929</sup> Turkey's Contributions to International Community's Efforts to Fight Terrorism, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (2016) Access Date: 05 April 2016. http://www.mfa.gov.tr/turkey\_s-contributions-to-international-community\_s-efforts-tofight-terrorism.en.mfa

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>930</sup> Turkey's Contributions to International Community's Efforts to Fight Terrorism, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (2016) Access Date: 05 April 2016. http://www.mfa.gov.tr/turkey\_s-contributions-to-international-community\_s-efforts-tofight-terrorism.en.mfa

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>931</sup> Turkey's Contributions to International Community's Efforts to Fight Terrorism, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (2016) Access Date: 05 April 2016. http://www.mfa.gov.tr/turkey\_s-contributions-to-international-community\_s-efforts-tofight-terrorism.en.mfa

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>932</sup> Turkey's Contributions to International Community's Efforts to Fight Terrorism, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (2016) Access Date: 05 April 2016. http://www.mfa.gov.tr/turkey\_s-contributions-to-international-community\_s-efforts-tofight-terrorism.en.mfa

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>933</sup> Turkey's Contributions to International Community's Efforts to Fight Terrorism, Ministry of Foreign Affairs (2016) Access Date: 05 April 2016. http://www.mfa.gov.tr/turkey\_s-contributions-to-international-community\_s-efforts-tofight-terrorism.en.mfa

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>934</sup> UK national risk assessment of money laundering and terrorist financing, Home Office (London) October 2015. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\_data/file/468210/UK\_NRA\_October\_2015\_fina l\_web.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>935</sup> UK national risk assessment of money laundering and terrorist financing, Home Office (London) October 2015. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\_data/file/468210/UK\_NRA\_October\_2015\_fina | web.pdf

terrorist-related activities. As of March 2016, at least 17 convictions have been made under sections 15-18 of TACT since its introduction in September 2001.<sup>936</sup>

The Terrorist Asset-Freezing Act (TAFA) 2010 authorizes the UK government to freeze the assets of terrorists and prohibit their nationals and persons within its jurisdiction from making funds, resources or financial services available. Through TAFA, the UK has particularly complied FATF Recommendation 6 which requires freezing 'without delay' of the assets of individuals or entities designated under United Nation Security Council Resolutions 1267 and 1373.<sup>937</sup>

As of March 2016, the UK government has continued to enact all the above regulations which satisfy all the three relevant FATF recommendations.

Thus, the UK has been awarded a score of +1 for full compliance.

Analyst: Tatiana Ferrara

## United States: +1

The United States has fully complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

As of March 2016, the US has explicitly criminalized terrorist financing under the Uniting and Strengthening America by Providing Appropriate Tools Required to Intercept and Obstruct Terrorism Act of 2001 and money laundering under the Money Laundering Control Act (1986). The Office of Terrorist Financing Crimes (TFFC) works across all elements of the national security community, including law enforcement, regulatory, policy, diplomatic and intelligence communities and with the private sector and foreign governments to identify and address by all forms of illicit finance. TFFC has initiatives and strategies to combat money laundering and terrorist financing at home and abroad. These include initiatives that apply and implement targeted financial sanctions to national security threats. TFFC works to advance and implement FATF regulations and instruments.

The US has implemented relevant FATF recommendations, criminalized terrorist financing and addressed the financing of foreign terrorist fighters.

Thus, the US has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Ron Shnaidstein

#### European Union: +1

The European Union has fully complied with its commitment to continue to implement relevant Financial Action Task Force (FATF) recommendations and instruments.

On 2 February 2016, the European Commission published a communication to the European Parliament and Council on an Action Plan for strengthening the fight against terrorist financing.<sup>938</sup> The Action Plan focuses on tracing terrorists through financial movements and preventing them from moving funds and disrupting the sources of revenue used by terrorist organizations. The European

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>936</sup> UK national risk assessment of money laundering and terrorist financing, Home Office (London) October 2015. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\_data/file/468210/UK\_NRA\_October\_2015\_fina l\_web.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>937</sup> UK national risk assessment of money laundering and terrorist financing, Home Office (London) October 2015. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\_data/file/468210/UK\_NRA\_October\_2015\_fina l\_web.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>938</sup> Communication to the European Parliament and the Council, European Commission (Brussels) 2 February 2016. Access Date: 16 February 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/justice/criminal/files/com\_2016\_50\_en.pdf

Commission pledged that all proposed actions would be carried out by the end of 2017.<sup>939</sup> Some proposals have already been tabled, such as the strengthening of the EU legal framework with a comprehensive definition of the crime of terrorist financing, in line with the standards set by the Financial Action Task Force. Actions have also been taken to enhance the effectiveness of sanctions and asset freezing measures within the EU and in third countries. Especially the procedural improvements for ensuring swift and effective freezing measures based on United Nations Security Council Resolution are in the process of being implemented – without a need for specific legislative changes.

As of 2 February 2016, the Fourth Anti-Money Laundering Package is still being adopted by Member States.

This piece of legislation prevents the use of the financial system for the purposes of money laundering or terrorist financing.<sup>940</sup> The Commission has called on Member States to commit to do this by the end of 2016.<sup>941</sup>

As of March 2016, the EU has criminalized terrorist financing, implemented financial sanctions and criminalized and the funding of recruitment, training and travel for terrorism purposes.<sup>942</sup> Additionally, the European Union has programs that address specific FATF recommendations. The Regulation on funds transfers implements Special Recommendation VII of the FATF to ensure that identifying information accompanies wire transfers.<sup>943</sup> FATF Special Recommendation VI on alternative remittances was addressed by the Payments Services Directive.<sup>944</sup>

The EU has continued to criminalize terrorist financing, respond to foreign terrorist travel, and implement targeted financial sanctions.

Thus, the European Union has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Aylin Manduric

lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ:L:2007:319:0001:0036:EN:PDF

<sup>939</sup> Press Release: Commission presents Action Plan to strengthen the right against terrorist financing, European Commission (Strasbourg) 2 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-16-202\_en.htm

<sup>940</sup> Commission presents Action Plan to strengthen the fight against terrorist financing, European Commission (Strasbourg) 2 February 2016. Access Date: 8 March 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-16-202\_en.htm 941 Commission presents Action Plan to strengthen the fight against terrorist financing, European Commission (Strasbourg) 2 February 2016. Access Date: 8 March 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-16-202\_en.htm 942 Directive 2005/60/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council, Official Journal of the European Union 26 October 2005. Access Date: 8 March 2016. http://eur-

<sup>943</sup> Regulation (EC) No 1781/2006 of the European Parliament and of the Council, Official Journal of the European Union 15 November 2006. Access Date: 8 March 82016. http://eur-

lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ:L:2007:319:0001:0036:EN:PDF

<sup>944</sup> Directive 2007/64/EC of the European Parliament and of the Council, Official Journal of the European Union 13 November 2007. Access Date: 8 March 2016. http://eur-

lex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=OJ:L:2007:319:0001:0036:EN:PDF

# 7. Development: Aid for Trade

"We emphasize the important role of trade in global development efforts and will continue to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance."

G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Argentina			+1
Australia			+1
Brazil		0	
Canada			+1
China			+1
France		0	
Germany			+1
India		0	
Indonesia		0	
Italy			+1
Japan			+1
Korea		0	
Mexico	-1		
Russia			+1
Saudi Arabia			+1
South Africa		0	
Turkey			+1
United Kingdom			+1
United States			+1
European Union			+1
Average	+0.60		

## Assessment

# Background

During the 2005 World Trade Organization (WTO) Ministerial in Hong Kong, the WTO recognized the need to "help developing countries, particularly [least-developed countries], to build the supply-side capacity and trade-related infrastructure that they need to assist them to implement and benefit from WTO Agreements and more broadly to expand their trade."<sup>945</sup>

A specific WTO Task Force was subsequently created with the twofold mandate to 1) determine how Aid for Trade could be operationalized and 2) how Aid for Trade could contribute to the goals of the Doha Development Agenda.<sup>946</sup> Through consultation with the WTO, international members — along with the global monitoring effort of the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development — the Task Force defined Aid for Trade as "as trade-related development priorities in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>945</sup> WTO Ministerial Declaration, World Trade Organization 22 December 2005. Access Date: 13 February 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/thewto\_e/minist\_e/min05\_e/final\_text\_e.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>946</sup> What Future for the Global Aid for Trade Initiative? Towards a Fairer Assessment of its Achievements and Limitations, Organization for Economic Development and Co-operation. Access Date: 13 February 2016. http://www.oecd.org/dac/aft/WhatfutureAFT.pdf

the recipient country's national development strategies, e.g., trade-related infrastructure, adjustment and technical assistance."947

At the 2010 G20 Summit in Seoul, assistance to developing countries in improving their access and availability to trade was included as one of the nine pillars of the G20 Multi-Year Action Plan on development.<sup>948</sup> G20 leaders committed to improve the access and availability to trade with advanced economies and between developing and low-income countries.<sup>949</sup> At the conclusion of the 2010 Seoul Summit, G20 Member countries committed to maintain Aid for Trade levels that reflected the average level of the 2006 — 2008 period.<sup>950</sup> To accomplish this task, the G20 called upon the World Trade Organization (WTO), Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), and the World Bank (along with regional and multilateral bodies) to monitor the capacity of low-income countries to trade.<sup>951</sup>

During the previous 2015 G20 Summit in Antalya, Turkey, member countries once again highlighted the importance of inclusivity as a means of strengthening the global economy.<sup>952</sup> As such, G20 members reaffirmed their commitment to enhancing the capacity of developing countries to trade, through mechanisms including Aid for Trade.<sup>953</sup>

## **Commitment Features**

The Aid for Trade commitment mandates G20 countries to support trade and investment in developing countries that require assistance. In accordance with the post-2015 G20 Summit Development Agenda, an increase in financing for aid to trade is expected in order to incorporate "inclusive and sustainable development in social, economic, and environmental dimensions."<sup>954</sup>

In the Fifth Global Review of Aid for Trade in 2015, the Secretary-General of the OECD defined the initiative as seeking to "help developing countries build their supply-side capacities and overcome the constraints that prevent them from connecting to global markets."<sup>955</sup>

According to the methodology set out by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development and the World Trade Organization's Task Force on Aid for Trade 2006 recommendations Aid for Trade comprises of the following categories: <sup>956 957</sup>

<sup>952</sup> G20 Leaders' Communiqué Antalya Summit, G20 Group. Access Date: 10 February 2016.

http://www.mofa.go.jp/files/000111117.pdf

http://www.mofa.go.jp/files/000111117.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>947</sup> What Future for the Global Aid for Trade Initiative? Towards a Fairer Assessment of its Achievements and Limitations, Organization for Economic Development and Co-operation. Access Date: 13 February 2016. http://www.oecd.org/dac/aft/WhatfutureAFT.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>948</sup> Multi-Year Action Plan on Development, G20 Information Centre 12 November 2010. Access Date: 20 January 2015. http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2010/g20seoul-development.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>949</sup> Multi-Year Action Plan on Development, G20 Information Centre 12 November 2010. Access Date: 20 January 2015. http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2010/g20seoul-development.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>950</sup> Multi-Year Action Plan on Development, G20 Information Centre 12 November 2010. Access Date: 20 January 2015. http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2010/g20seoul-development.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>951</sup> Multi-Year Action Plan on Development, G20 Information Centre 12 November 2010. Access Date: 20 January 2015. http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2010/g20seoul-development.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>953</sup> G20 Leaders' Communiqué Antalya Summit, G20 Group. Access Date: 10 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>954</sup> Aid for Trade at a Glance 2015: Reducing Trade Costs for Inclusive, Sustainable Growth, World Trade Organization and Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development 2015. Access Date: 10 February 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/res\_e/booksp\_e/aid4trade15\_e.pdf

<sup>955</sup> Fifth Global Review of Aid for Trade 2015, Committee on Trade and Development, World Trade Organization. Access Date: 13 March 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/tratop\_e/devel\_e/a4t\_e/global\_review15\_e.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>956</sup> Aid-for-trade Statistical Queries, Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development. Access Date: 20 January 2015. http://www.oecd.org/trade/aft/aid-for-tradestatisticalqueries.htm

- Technical assistance for trade policy and regulations (e.g. assisting national governments to develop trade policy and planning regulations, to develop regional trade strategies, negotiate multilateral trade agreements, and implement their outcomes);
- Trade-related infrastructure (e.g. building roads, ports, and telecommunications networks to connect domestic markets to the global economy);
- Productive capacity building, including trade development (e.g. supporting the private sector to exploit their comparative advantages and diversify their exports);
- Trade-related adjustment (e.g. helping developing countries with the costs associated with trade liberalization, such as tariff reductions, preference erosion, or declining terms of trade);
- Other trade-related needs, if the action is identified as a trade-related development priority in partner countries' national development strategy.

# **Scoring Guidelines**

-1	Member NEITHER provides support NOR investment for Aid for Trade to developing countries.
0	Member provides support OR investment in the above-mentioned categories.
+1	Member provides support AND investment in the above-mentioned categories.

Lead Analyst: Yashwinie Shivanand

## Argentina: +1

Argentina has fully complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

On 19 November 2015, the General Directorate of International Cooperation released "Argentina Cooperates — National Public Administration capacities to know and share," presenting national capacity and potential for new mechanisms for south-south joint development initiatives.<sup>958</sup> The Minister of Foreign Affairs and Worship Hector Marcos Timmerman stated the report reaffirms Argentina's commitment to social inclusion and multilateral efforts in Asia, African, and Caribbean countries.<sup>959</sup> The document states Argentina covers the cost of technocrats for South-South travel on projects, outlines the proposal process, and lists previous successful projects in areas such as sustainable fishing in Nicaragua and livestock production in Cambodia and Laos.<sup>960</sup>

On 16 December 2015, Ambassador Alberto Pedro D'Alotta, Permanent Representative of Argentina to the United Nations, attended the 10th Ministerial Conference of the World Trade Organization in Nairobi, Kenya.<sup>961</sup> In his address, Mr. D'Alotta reaffirmed Argentina's commitment to multilateral rules in the WTO and promoting a fair, transparent system of agricultural trade for the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development.<sup>962</sup>

<sup>960</sup> Argentina Cooperates: National Public Administration Capacities to Know and Share, Cooperacion Argentina 19 November 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://cooperacionarg.gob.ar/userfiles/catalogo-eng.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>957</sup> General Council Supports Suspension of Trade Talks; Task Force Submits "Aid for Trade" Recommendations, World Trade Organization. Access Date: 20 January 2015.

https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/news06\_e/gc\_27july06\_e.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>958</sup> Presentation of Argentina Cooperates: Argentina Capacities for the World, Cooperacion Argentina 19 November 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://cooperacionarg.gob.ar/en/presentation-argentina-cooperates-argentinecapacities-world

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>959</sup> Argentina Cooperates: National Public Administration Capacities to Know and Share, Cooperacion Argentina 19 November 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://cooperacionarg.gob.ar/userfiles/catalogo-eng.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>961</sup> Declaracion De La Republica Argentina, World Trade Organization 16 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/thewto\_e/minist\_e/mc10\_e/statements\_e/arg\_s.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>962</sup> Declaracion De La Republica Argentina, World Trade Organization 16 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/thewto\_e/minist\_e/mc10\_e/statements\_e/arg\_s.pdf

On the 12 February 2016, Minister of Foreign Affairs of Argentina Susana Malcorra and Minister of Foreign Affairs of Paraguay Eladio Loizaga published a joint statement.<sup>963</sup> The statement committed to increasing bilateral trade links between the two states as well as emphasizing their support for progressing dialogue on bi-regional trade partnerships such as the MERCOSUR-Pacific Partnership dialogue.<sup>964</sup>

Argentina has taken significant action in supporting south-south capacity building projects and in reaffirming its commitment to develop transparent bilateral and multilateral trade agreements.

Thus, Argentina has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Alessandra Jenkins

## Australia: +1

Australia has fully complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

On 1 December 2015, at the Australian Council for International Development's Board Meeting, the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT) released a new framework outlining the approach of the government to working with non-government organisations (NGOs) to support development and the country's aid programs.<sup>965</sup> The report entitled "DFAT and NGOs: Effective Development Partners" recognises the role NGOs play in the delivery of foreign aid and the value they bring to Australia's development priorities.<sup>966</sup> One of the reports' six investment priorities is "Infrastructure, trade facilitation and international competitiveness."<sup>967</sup>

On 14 December 2015, at the World Trade Organization's (WTO) 10th Ministerial Conference, Australia, along with other donors, "pledged USD90 million for Phase Two of the Enhanced Integrated Framework (EIF), which is dedicated to helping least-developed countries (LDCs) use trade as a vehicle for economic growth and poverty reduction."<sup>968</sup> The country announced its strong support for this Aid for Trade programme.

On 16 December 2015, Australia announced an AUD6 million contribution to "help developing countries make the most of opportunities in the global economy."<sup>969</sup> Julie Bishop, Minister of Foreign Affairs expressed the capacity of their "[Aid for Trade] investment [in helping] boost trade

<sup>968</sup> Donors Confirm Strong Support to the EIF Phase Two as WTO 10th Ministerial Conference opens in Nairobi,

Enhanced Integrated Framework. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://www.enhancedif.org/en/publication/2015-12/donors-confirm-strong-support-eif-phase-two-wto-10th-ministerial-conference

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>963</sup> Comunicado Conjuncto Reunion de Cancilleres de Argentina y Paraguay, Ministerio de Relaciones Exteriores y Culto de la República Argentina 12 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://www.cancilleria.gov.ar/comunicado-conjunto-reunion-de-cancilleres-de-argentina-y-paraguay

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>964</sup> Comunicado Conjuncto Reunion de Cancilleres de Argentina y Paraguay, Ministerio de Relaciones Exteriores y Culto de la República Argentina 12 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://www.cancilleria.gov.ar/comunicado-conjunto-reunion-de-cancilleres-de-argentina-y-paraguay

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>965</sup> Partnering with Non-Government Organizations for Development, Minister for Foreign Affairs 1 December 2015. Access Date: 6 March 2016.

http://foreignminister.gov.au/releases/Pages/2015/jb\_mr\_151201a.aspx?w=tb1CaGpkPX%2FlS0K%2Bg9ZKEg%3D%3D <sup>966</sup> Partnering with Non-Government Organizations for Development, Minister for Foreign Affairs 1 December 2015. Access Date: 6 March 2016.

http://foreignminister.gov.au/releases/Pages/2015/jb\_mr\_151201a.aspx?w=tb1CaGpkPX%2FlS0K%2Bg9ZKEg%3D%3D <sup>967</sup> DFAT and NGOs: Effective Development Partners, DFAT 1 December 2015. Access Date: 10 March 2016.

http://dfat.gov.au/about-us/publications/Documents/dfat-and-ngos-effective-development-partners.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>969</sup> Aid for Trade Driving Growth in our Region, Minister for Foreign Affairs 16 December 2015. Access Date: 6 March 2016.

http://foreignminister.gov.au/releases/Pages/2015/jb\_mr\_151216.aspx?w=tb1CaGpkPX%2FlS0K%2Bg9ZKEg%3D%3D

and encourage economic growth among [their] development partners."<sup>970</sup> The Australian government announced that it would contribute AUD3 million to the Enhanced Integrated Framework (EIF) of the WTO in addition to an AUD3 million investment in the Global Alliance for Trade Facilitation.<sup>971</sup>

On 3 March 2016, Australia announced the expansion of its diplomatic presence in Papua New Guinea (PNG) by establishing an Australian Consulate-General in Lae. As an extension of Australia's AUD19 billion investment in PNG, "the Consulate-General will strengthen Australia's presence in PNG's commercial capital and bolster the growing trade and investment relationship between the two countries."<sup>972</sup>

Australia has taken action toward advancing trade-related infrastructure in developing countries.

Thus, Australia has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Hivda Ates

## Brazil: 0

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to support Aid for Trade and other mechanisms in developing countries in need of trade capacity building assistance.

On 16 December 2015, Minister of Foreign Affairs Mauro Vieira spoke at the opening session of the 10th Ministerial Conference of the World Trade Organization in Nairobi, Kenya.<sup>973</sup> Minister Vieira reconfirmed Brazil's commitment to liberalizing trade through the Doha Development agenda and eliminating agricultural export subsidies.<sup>974</sup>

On 25-29 January 2016, Brazilian embassies in African Countries of Portuguese Official Language (PALOP) and East Timor ran a training initiative for South-South technical cooperation.<sup>975</sup> The training standardized the South-South Technical Cooperation Management Manual, providing training on negotiating with partner institutions, monitoring and evaluation mechanisms, and administrative procedures for bilateral agreements between Brazil and countries across Africa.<sup>976</sup>

Brazil has implemented some of the measures pertaining to Aid for Trade and other mechanisms in support for trade capacity building assistance in developing countries, and has displayed some action and investment in capacity building initiatives.

http://foreignminister.gov.au/releases/Pages/2015/jb\_mr\_151216.aspx?w=tb1CaGpkPX%2FIS0K%2Bg9ZKEg%3D%3D <sup>972</sup> Australia to open Consulate-General in Lae, PNG, Minister for Foreign Affairs 3 March 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016.

BR/?option=com\_content&view=article&id=12730&lang=pt-BRx

<sup>975</sup> Focal points of cooperation from Brazil Embassies in PALOP and East Timor are trained in Brasilia management of South-South technical cooperation, Brazilian Cooperation Agency - Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil 5 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.abc.gov.br/imprensa/mostrarnoticia/661

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>970</sup> Aid for Trade Driving Growth in our Region, Minister for Foreign Affairs 16 December 2015. Access Date: 6 March 2016.

http://foreignminister.gov.au/releases/Pages/2015/jb\_mr\_151216.aspx?w=tb1CaGpkPX%2FlS0K%2Bg9ZKEg%3D%3D <sup>971</sup> Aid for Trade Driving Growth in our Region, Minister for Foreign Affairs 16 December 2015. Access Date: 6 March 2016.

http://foreignminister.gov.au/releases/Pages/2015/jb\_mr\_151216.aspx?w=tb1CaGpkPX%2FlS0K%2Bg9ZKEg%3D%3D <sup>973</sup> Speech by the Minister Mauro Vieira during the Tenth WTO Ministerial Conference, Ministro de Estado das Relações Exteriores 16 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.itamaraty.gov.br/pt-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>974</sup> Speech by the Minister Mauro Vieira during the Tenth WTO Ministerial Conference, Ministro de Estado das Relações Exteriores 16 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.itamaraty.gov.br/pt-BR/?option=com\_content&view=article&id=12730&lang=pt-BRx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>976</sup> Focal points of cooperation from Brazil Embassies in PALOP and East Timor are trained in Brasilia management of South-South technical cooperation, Brazilian Cooperation Agency - Government of the Federative Republic of Brazil 5 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.abc.gov.br/imprensa/mostrarnoticia/661

Thus, Brazil has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Alessandra Jenkins

# Canada: +1

Canada has fully complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

On 9 December 2015, Canada donated CAD50,000 to help least-developed countries (LDCs) participate in the World Trade Organization's Tenth Ministerial Conference, in Nairobi, Kenya.<sup>977</sup>

On 17 December 2015, Minister of International Trade Chrystia Freeland and Minister of International Development, Marie-Claude Bibeau, pledged funding to help developing countries implement the WTO Trade Facilitation Agreement (TFA).<sup>978</sup> The TFA will reduce trade costs and create conditions that will help move the poorest and vulnerable people out of poverty.<sup>979</sup> Global Alliance for Trade Facilitation (GATF), which Canada is the founding donor of, will contribute CAD10 million to the initiative between 2015 and 2022.<sup>980</sup>

On 19 December 2015, Minister of International Trade Chrystia Freeland "supported WTO's adoption of an expanded Information Technology Agreement that will eliminate tariffs on 201 information technology products that account for 10 per cent of global trade."<sup>981</sup> Canada also supported a package to help least-developed countries better integrate into the global trading system.<sup>982</sup>

Canada has provided investment to a number of initiatives that reduce the barriers to trade facing developing countries.

Thus, Canada has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Nabiha Chowdhury

# China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>977</sup> Canada donates CAD 50,000 for LDC's participation in Tenth Ministerial Conference, World Trade Organization 9 December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/pres15\_e/pr764\_e.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>978</sup> Canada announces funding for developing countries implementing global trade reforms, Global Affairs Canada 17 December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://www.international.gc.ca/media/comm/newscommuniques/2015/12/17c.aspx?lang=eng

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>979</sup> Canada announces funding for developing countries implementing global trade reforms, Global Affairs Canada 17 December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://www.international.gc.ca/media/comm/newscommuniques/2015/12/17c.aspx?lang=eng

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>980</sup> Canada announces funding for developing countries implementing global trade reforms, Global Affairs Canada 17 December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. http://www.international.gc.ca/media/comm/newscommuniques/2015/12/17c.aspx?lang=eng

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>981</sup> Minister Freeland welcomes progress on multilateral trade negotiations at 10<sup>th</sup> Ministerial Conference, Global Affairs Canada 19 December 2015. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://www.international.gc.ca/media/comm/news-communiques/2015/12/19b.aspx?lang=eng

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>982</sup> Minister Freeland welcomes progress on multilateral trade negotiations at 10<sup>th</sup> Ministerial Conference, Global Affairs Canada 19 December 2015. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://www.international.gc.ca/media/comm/news-communiques/2015/12/19b.aspx?lang=eng

On 21-22 November 2015, Chinese Premier Li Keqiang attended the 18<sup>th</sup> China-Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) Summit.<sup>983</sup> During the Summit, the Premier promoted upgrading the China-ASEAN free trade area protocol, announced the provision of a RMB3.6 Billion gratis to less developed ASEAN members and the establishment of a USD10 Billion loan for the second phase of China-ASEAN infrastructure constructions.<sup>984</sup>

On 4 December 2015, China chaired the China-Africa Summit and pledged USD60 Billion in development to assistance to Africa, tripling the amount pledged at the previous summit three years ago.<sup>985</sup> China also pledged to implement 10 cooperation plans on African development in the next three years.<sup>986</sup> The plans address the three major bottlenecks that are limiting the development of Africa: inadequate infrastructure, lack of professional personnel and funding shortage.<sup>987</sup>

On 4 December 2015, Chinese President Xi Jinping visited Zimbabwe and South Africa.<sup>988</sup> The trip promoted further collaborations and enhanced mutual trust between the trading partners.<sup>989</sup> He also met with the President of Somalia and pledged to increase aid to Somalia for national reconstruction and encourage Chinese entrepreneurs to engage in more mutually beneficial cooperation.<sup>990</sup>

On 17 December 2015 at the World Trade Organization's (WTO) 10th ministerial conference, China coauthored two proposals on the special safeguard mechanism (SSM) from the Doha negotiations.<sup>991</sup> The proposal specifies "developing country members shall have the right to have to recourse to [an] [SSM] based on import quantity and price triggers" and "the negotiations on this subject shall be held in committee on agriculture special sessions, in dedicated sessions and in an accelerated time-frame, distinct from the agriculture negotiations under the Doha Development Agenda (DDA)."<sup>992</sup>

http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\_eng/zxxx\_662805/t1321614.shtml

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>983</sup> Vice Foreign Minister Liu Zhenmin Introduces Outcomes of Premier Li Keqiang's Attendance at Leaders' Meetings on East Asia Cooperation, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China 22 November 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\_eng/topics\_665678/lkqcxdyhzldrxlhybdmlxyjxzsfw/t1317773.shtml

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>984</sup> Vice Foreign Minister Liu Zhenmin Introduces Outcomes of Premier Li Keqiang's Attendance at Leaders' Meetings on East Asia Cooperation, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China 22 November 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\_eng/topics\_665678/lkqcxdyhzldrxlhybdmlxyjxzsfw/t1317773.shtml
 <sup>985</sup> China Pledges \$60 Billion to Aid Africa's Development, New York Times 4 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February

<sup>2016.</sup> http://www.nytimes.com/2015/12/05/world/africa/china-pledges-60-billion-to-aid-africasdevelopment.html? r=2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>986</sup> Open a New Era of China-Africa Win-Win Cooperation and Common Development, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China 4 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\_eng/zxxx\_662805/t1321614.shtml

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>987</sup> Open a New Era of China-Africa Win-Win Cooperation and Common Development, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China 4 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\_eng/zxxx\_662805/t1321614.shtml

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>988</sup> Work Together to Meet Challenges and Join Hands to Promote Development, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China 6 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\_eng/zxxx\_662805/t1321614.shtml

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>989</sup> Work Together to Meet Challenges and Join Hands to Promote Development, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China 6 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>990</sup> Xi Jinping Meets with President Hassan Sheikh Mohamoud of Somalia, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of the People's Republic of China 5 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

http://www.fmprc.gov.cn/mfa\_eng/topics\_665678/xjpffgcxqhbhbldhdjbbwnfjxgsfwbfnfyhnsbzczfhzltfh/t1322267.shtm |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>991</sup> WTO Nairobi meet: Deadlock unresolved, talks go to the wire, Livemint 18 December 2015. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://www.livemint.com/Politics/ZvT416JRBjZBCV7gGia6uO/WTO-Nairobi-meet-Deadlock-unresolved-talks-go-to-the-wire.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>992</sup> WTO Nairobi meet: Deadlock unresolved, talks go to the wire, Livemint 18 December 2015. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://www.livemint.com/Politics/ZvT416JRBjZBCV7gGia6uO/WTO-Nairobi-meet-Deadlock-unresolved-talks-go-to-the-wire.html

On 5 January 2016, China became a member of the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development, which is an actor collaborating with the World Trade Organization for the Aid for Trade Initiative.<sup>993</sup>

On 6 January 2016, China EXIM bank, Korea EXIM bank and World Bank co-financed the Express Development Support Program in Ethiopia, building a 57-kilometre road to the country's main trading outlet.<sup>994</sup>

In January 2016, Chinese President Xi Jinping also visited Saudi Arabia and Egypt and promised continued foreign-aid loans, exports credits and overseas investment insurance.<sup>995</sup>

In January 2016, China joined the International Trade Center (ITC), which aims to enhance the competitiveness of African small business and connect them to global value chains.<sup>996</sup> According to the Executive Director of the ITC, Arancha Gonzalez, the relocation of Chinese industries in East and Central Africa "offer opportunities for Africa to increase its participation in global trade."<sup>997</sup>

China has implemented and pledged to continue to implement multiple categories of Aid for Trade and other mechanisms persistently in many countries.

Thus, China has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Eileen (Yijia) Liu

## France: 0

France has partially complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

On 8 December 2015, the World Trade Organization (WTO) announced that France has pledged a further EUR6 million to WTO trade-related programmes for developing countries and in particular least-developed countries (LDCs) over a period of 3 years.<sup>998</sup> France's new contributions will focus on two main programs the Doha Development Agenda Global Trust Fund and to the Enhanced Integrated Framework dedicated to trade related capacity-building in least-developed countries LDCs.<sup>999</sup> These programs provide technical assistance programs and training activities for developing countries and to improve the technical capacities of developing countries and less developed countries through training.<sup>1000</sup>

On 7 February 2016, the Ethiopian Airlines (EAL) inaugurated the new Aerospace Academy campus near Bole International Airport in Addis Ababa.<sup>1001</sup> The EUR50 million project was funded in part

http://europe.chinadaily.com.cn/world/2016-01/22/content\_23206599.htm

997 Holding up half the African sky, China Daily 22 January 2016. Access date: 22 February 2016.

http://europe.chinadaily.com.cn/world/2016-01/22/content\_23206599.htm

998 Press Release, World Trade Organization 8 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016.

https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/pres15\_e/pr763\_e.htm

999 Press Release, World Trade Organization 8 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016.

https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/pres15\_e/pr763\_e.htm

https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/pres15\_e/pr763\_e.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>993</sup> China Becomes a Member of the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development, The People's Bank of China 15 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.pbc.gov.cn/english/130721/3005527/index.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>994</sup> New Partnerships Help to Expand Ethiopia's Road Network, World Bank 6 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.worldbank.org/en/news/feature/2016/01/06/new-partnerships-help-to-expand-ethiopias-road-network

<sup>995</sup> China's first Arab Policy Paper sets out development strategies, China Daily 14 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/china/2016-01/14/content 23078899.htm

<sup>996</sup> Holding up half the African sky, China Daily 22 January 2016. Access date: 22 February 2016.

<sup>1000</sup> Press Release, World Trade Organization 8 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016.

<sup>1001</sup> Formation: http://www.afd.fr/home/projets\_afd/education

by the French Development Agency (AFD) to provide training for pilots, cabin crews, and maintenance workers and support the continued growth of the African aviation sector.<sup>1002</sup>

France has supported mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance through its increased support at the WTO.

Thus, France has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Katrina Y.K. Li

#### Germany: +1

Germany has fully complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

On 4 December 2015, Minister for Economic Cooperation and Development Gerd Müller met with Afghan President Ashraf Ghani and announced that Germany will contribute EUR25 million to support a national employment programme in Afghanistan specifically targeting young people.<sup>1003</sup>

On 14 December 2015, Minister Müller embarked on a three-day trip to Egypt and Eritrea to discuss the current refugee crisis.<sup>1004</sup> In Egypt, the Minister discussed openings for closer cooperation on school and company-based vocational training in Egyptian enterprises.<sup>1005</sup> In Eritrea, the Minister offered a dialogue and exploration of openings for assistance in the field of vocational training on the condition that the Eritrean government first introduce economic and political reforms and improve its human rights situation.<sup>1006</sup>

On 2 — 5 January 2016, Minister Müller travelled to Benin and Togo to support the creation of economic opportunities in those countries.<sup>1007</sup> The Minister announced that Benin would receive EUR20 million to support innovation in agriculture.<sup>1008</sup> The German government will also be investing an additional EUR6.5 million in measures to innovate agricultural methods and fight

<sup>1002</sup> Formation: http://www.afd.fr/home/projets\_afd/education

<sup>1003</sup> Federal Minister Müller meets Afghan President Ghani and announces support for employment programme, Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (Berlin) 4 December 2015. Access Date: 11 March 2016. http://www.bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2015/dezember/20151204\_pm\_097\_Federal-Minister-Muellermeets-Afghan-President-Ghani-and-announces-support-for-employment-programme/index.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1004</sup> Tackling the root causes of displacement, giving people new opportunities for the future, Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (Cairo) 14 December 2015. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://www.bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2015/dezember/20151214\_pm\_102\_Tackling-the-root-causes-of-displacement-giving-people-new\_opportunities-for-the-future/index.html

<sup>1005</sup> Tackling the root causes of displacement, giving people new opportunities for the future, Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (Cairo) 14 December 2015. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://www.bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2015/dezember/20151214\_pm\_102\_Tackling-the-root-causes-of-displacement-giving-people-new\_opportunities-for-the-future/index.html

<sup>1006</sup> Tackling the root causes of displacement, giving people new opportunities for the future, Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (Cairo) 14 December 2015. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://www.bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2015/dezember/20151214\_pm\_102\_Tackling-the-root-causes-of-displacement-giving-people-new\_opportunities-for-the-future/index.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1007</sup> Federal Minister Müller pledges greater German support for development in Togo, Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (Lomé) 4 January 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://www.bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2016/januar/160104\_pm\_001\_Federal-Minister-Mueller-pledges-greater-German-support-for-development-in-Togo/index.html.

<sup>1008</sup> Federal Minister Müller pledges greater German support for development in Togo, Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (Lomé) 4 January 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://www.bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2016/januar/160104\_pm\_001\_Federal-Minister-Mueller-pledges-greater-German-support-for-development-in-Togo/index.html.

hunger.<sup>1009</sup> The Minister also travelled to Togo to inaugurate the first vocational training course for motorcycle mechanics based on the dual-system of advancing food security and providing job prospects under the German development cooperation.<sup>1010</sup>

On 26 January 2016, Minister Müller travelled to Jordan to discuss German investments in economic development, crafts, trades, and infrastructure in Jordan.<sup>1011</sup> In 2016, the Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (BMZ) will be launching a programme aimed at creating legal options for Syrian refugees to find work in Jordan.<sup>1012</sup> The programme will also encourage the creation of new businesses, and development of education and training programmes specifically for this purpose.<sup>1013</sup>

On 2 February 2016, Minister Müller attended a European Union members' meeting on development cooperation in Amsterdam, where he called for a significant increase of European commitment to fighting the root causes of displacement.<sup>1014</sup> The Minister recognized that an investment for the Middle East would immediately create economic opportunities for those displaced as a result of the crisis in Syria.<sup>1015</sup>

On 11 February 2016, German Chancellor Angela Merkel announced a USD566 million loan to Iraq to aid the country's economy and help build infrastructure.<sup>1016</sup>

<sup>1009</sup> Federal Minister Müller pledges greater German support for development in Togo, Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (Lomé) 4 January 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://www.bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2016/januar/160104\_pm\_001\_Federal-Minister-Mueller-pledges-greater-German-support-for-development-in-Togo/index.html.

<sup>1010</sup> Federal Minister Müller travels to Benin and Togo from 2 to 5 January 2016, Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (Cotonou) 3 January 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://www.bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2016/januar/160104\_pm\_001\_Federal-Minister-Mueller-pledges-greater-German-support-for-development-in-Togo/index.html.

<sup>1011</sup> Minister Müller in talks with Jordanian government regarding investments in economic development, crafts and trades, and infrastructure, Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (Amman) 26 January 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://www.bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2016/januar/160126\_pm\_006\_Marshall-Plan-for-the-Middle-East-Minister-Mueller-in-talks-with-Jordanian-government-regarding-investments-in-economic-development-crafts-and-trades-and-infrastructure/index.html.

<sup>1012</sup> Minister Müller in talks with Jordanian government regarding investments in economic development, crafts and trades, and infrastructure, Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (Amman) 26 January 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://www.bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2016/januar/160126\_pm\_006\_Marshall-Plan-for-the-Middle-East-Minister-Mueller-in-talks-with-Jordanian-government-regarding-investments-in-economic-development-crafts-and-trades-and-infrastructure/index.html.

<sup>1013</sup> Minister Müller in talks with Jordanian government regarding investments in economic development, crafts and trades, and infrastructure, Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (Amman) 26 January 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://www.bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2016/januar/160126\_pm\_006\_Marshall-Plan-for-the-Middle-East-Minister-Mueller-in-talks-with-Jordanian-government-regarding-investments-in-economic-development-crafts-and-trades-and-infrastructure/index.html.

<sup>1014</sup> Call for greater EU commitment – Minister Müller attends meeting of EU ministers for development cooperation, Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (Amsterdam) 2 February 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016. http://www.bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2016/februar/160202\_pm\_010\_Call-for-greater-EUcommitment-Minister-Mueller-attends-meeting-of-EU-ministers-for-development-cooperation/index.html. 1015 Call for greater EU commitment – Minister Müller attends meeting of EU ministers for development cooperation, Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (Amsterdam) 2 February 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016. http://www.bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2016/februar/160202\_pm\_010\_Call-for-greater-EUcommitment-Minister-Mueller-attends-meeting-of-EU-ministers-for-development-cooperation/index.html. 1016 Germany offers 500 million euro credit to Iraq to aid reconstruction, Deutsche Welle 11 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

On 29 February 2016, Minister Müller concluded a four-day trip to North Africa in which he focused his talks on a new trading partnership with Northern Africa.<sup>1017</sup> In Tunisia, the Minister notified Tunisian Prime Minister Habib Essid that the German government is working on a new trade and business partnership, and encouraged more German companies to spur investment and economic development in the region.<sup>1018</sup> In Morocco, Algeria, and Tunisia, the Minister promised education, training, and business partnerships and agreed to enhance German support in innovative areas such as renewable energies and academic education.<sup>1019</sup> In Algeria, the Minister visited the University of Tlemcen, where he opened a new institution to offer professional qualifications in renewable energy purposes.<sup>1020</sup>

On 3 March 2016, State Minister for Economic Development and International Cooperation Thomas Mahorn and Sudanese Minister of International Cooperation Dr. Kamal Hassan Ali agreed to provide EUR51 million total to support development projects such as vocational training in eastern Sudan and Darfur.<sup>1021</sup>

Germany has provided support and investment to developing countries as a means of strengthening their capacity to engage in global trade flows.

Thus, Germany has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Nabiha Chowdhury

#### India: 0

India has partially complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

On 26 November 2015, at the Commonwealth Heads of Government Meeting (CHOGM) in Valletta, Malta, India and the Governments of Mauritius, Sri Lanka and Malta announced a new trade financing fund to help boost trade and investment flows, particularly for small and developing countries.<sup>1022</sup>

On 17 December 2015 at the World Trade Organization's (WTO) 10th ministerial conference, India coauthored two proposals on the special safeguard mechanism (SSM) from the Doha

<sup>1017</sup> Boosting Mediterranean cooperation, fostering investment in North Africa, Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (Tunis) 29 February 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://www.dw.com/en/germany-offers-500-million-euro-credit-to-iraq-to-aid-reconstruction/a-19043556.

http://www.bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2016/februar/160229\_pm\_017\_Boosting-Mediterranean-cooperation-fostering-investment-in-North-Africa/index.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1018</sup> Boosting Mediterranean cooperation, fostering investment in North Africa, Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (Tunis) 29 February 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://www.bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2016/februar/160229\_pm\_017\_Boosting-Mediterranean-cooperation-fostering-investment-in-North-Africa/index.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1019</sup> Boosting Mediterranean cooperation, fostering investment in North Africa, Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (Tunis) 29 February 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://www.bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2016/februar/160229\_pm\_017\_Boosting-Mediterranean-cooperation-fostering-investment-in-North-Africa/index.html.

<sup>1020</sup> Boosting Mediterranean cooperation, fostering investment in North Africa, Federal Ministry of Economic Cooperation and Development (Tunis) 29 February 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://www.bmz.de/en/press/aktuelleMeldungen/2016/februar/160229\_pm\_017\_Boosting-Mediterranean-cooperation-fostering-investment-in-North-Africa/index.html.

<sup>1021</sup> Sudan and Germany Sign Agreement On Development of Cooperation Between Them At 51 Million Euros, All Africa (Khartoum) 3 March 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016. http://allafrica.com/stories/201603040407.html.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1022</sup> CHOGM 2015 Press Release, The Commonwealth 26 November 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://thecommonwealth.org/media/press-release/new-fund-set-boost-trade-commonwealth-countries

negotiations.<sup>1023</sup> The proposal specifies "developing country members shall have the right to have to recourse to [an] [SSM] based on import quantity and price triggers" and "the negotiations on this subject shall be held in committee on agriculture special sessions, in dedicated sessions and in an accelerated time-frame, distinct from the agriculture negotiations under the Doha Development Agenda (DDA]."<sup>1024</sup>

On 25 December 2015, the Indian government announced its decision to ease procedures for Afghan businesspersons for trade and investment in India.<sup>1025</sup>

In December 2015, as part of its "Central Asia Policy," which aims to create an economic corridor that could better facilitate trade in the region, India took part in the ceremony initiating the development of a Turkmenistan-Afghanistan-Pakistan-India (TAPI) oil pipeline.<sup>1026</sup> The project, which will be completed in four years, will support economic integration within the region, especially for developing countries such as Afghanistan.<sup>1027</sup>

India has implemented and maintained measures pertaining to Aid for Trade and other mechanisms to support the trade capacity of developing countries. India's compliance includes both investments and renewed support in the infrastructure of other countries.

Thus, India has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Anah Mirza

## Indonesia: 0

Indonesia has partially complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

On 11 December 2015, in a joint statement at the World Trade Organization Ministerial Conference in Nairobi, Indonesia reaffirmed their commitment to the Doha Development Agenda of 2004.<sup>1028</sup> Indonesia pledged to resolve the outstanding issues in bringing a developmental dimension to global trade.<sup>1029</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1023</sup> WTO Nairobi meet: Deadlock unresolved, talks go to the wire, Livemint 18 December 2015. Access Date: 6 March 2016.

http://www.livemint.com/Politics/ZvT416JRBjZBCV7gGia6uO/WTO-Nairobi-meet-Deadlock-unresolved-talks-go-to-the-wire.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1024</sup> WTO Nairobi meet: Deadlock unresolved, talks go to the wire, Livemint 18 December 2015. Access Date: 6 March 2016.

http://www.livemint.com/Politics/ZvT416JRBjZBCV7gGia6uO/WTO-Nairobi-meet-Deadlock-unresolved-talks-go-to-the-wire.html

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1025</sup> Joint Statement between India and Afghanistan, Indian Ministry of External Affairs 25 December 2015. Access Date:
 22 February 2016. http://www.mea.gov.in/bilateral-

documents.htm?dtl/26247/Joint+Statement+between+India+and+Afghanistan+December+25+2015

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1026</sup> TAPI gas pipeline may become game changer in South Asian geopolitics, Hindustan Times, 20 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://www.hindustantimes.com/analysis/tapi-gas-pipeline-may-become-game-changerin-south-asian-geopolitics/story-4UZTC6YhcKPghx9sVQNgsL.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1027</sup> TAPI gas pipeline may become game changer in South Asian geopolitics, Hindustan Times, 20 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://www.hindustantimes.com/analysis/tapi-gas-pipeline-may-become-game-changerin-south-asian-geopolitics/story-4UZTC6YhcKPghx9sVQNgsL.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1028</sup> Deadlock over Doha negotiations threatens to derail Nairobi meet, Hindustan Times 11 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

http://www.livemint.com/Politics/o2ZEVBrytY80KP86TpqVIL/Deadlock-over-Doha-negotiations-threatens-to-derail-Nairobi.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1029</sup> Deadlock over Doha negotiations threatens to derail Nairobi meet, Hindustan Times 11 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

On 18 December 2015, as per a published report by the Organization of Economic Co-operation and Development, Indonesia remained as one of the top ten recipients of Aid for Trade disbursements in the 2015 fiscal year.<sup>1030</sup>

On 18 December 2015, Indonesia attended the WTO Ministerial Conference in Nairobi, Kenya. Indonesia stated its budget for trade-related assistance would increase another 10 per cent in the next five years <sup>1031</sup>

While Indonesia has increased their financial commitment to trade-related assistance, it has no other demonstrable measures of trade facilitation.

Thus, Indonesia has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Tanzim Rashid

#### Italy: +1

Italy has fully complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

On 23 December 2015, the Italian Development Cooperation allocated EUR2.5 million towards the Fund for the Stabilization of Iraq.<sup>1032</sup> This fund, set up by the United Nations Development Programme, works for the "rehabilitation of civil infrastructure, the revival of economic activities of the local community and the strengthening of government capacity in Iraq.<sup>\*1033</sup> These economic activities include training for young workers, building hydro grids and water systems to establish the foundations for business development, and creating transport networks for goods.<sup>1034</sup> These investments will help reconstruct crucial pillars of economic infrastructure necessary to facilitate trade and investment capacity in Iraq.<sup>1035</sup>

https://www.wto.org/english/res\_e/booksp\_e/aid4trade15\_e.pdf

<sup>1031</sup> Annex: Aid for trade at a glance 2015, WTO Ministerial Conference in Nairobi, Kenya 18 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/res\_e/booksp\_e/aid4trade15\_e.pdf

http://www.livemint.com/Politics/o2ZEVBrytY80KP86TpqVIL/Deadlock-over-Doha-negotiations-threatens-to-derail-Nairobi.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1030</sup> Annex: Aid for trade at a glance 2015, WTO Ministerial Conference in Nairobi, Kenya 18 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1032</sup> Press Release: Iraq: Italy 2.5 million euro in favor of UNDP for the stabilization of the country, Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation 23 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

http://www.cooperazioneallosviluppo.esteri.it/pdgcs/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=13192:23-12-2015-irag-dall-italia-2-5-milioni-di-euro-in-favore-di-undp-per-la-stabilizzazione-del-paese&catid=8&Itemid=515

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1033</sup> Press Release: Iraq: Italy 2.5 million euro in favor of UNDP for the stabilization of the country, Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation 23 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

http://www.cooperazioneallosviluppo.esteri.it/pdgcs/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=13192:23-12-2015-iraq-dall-italia-2-5-milioni-di-euro-in-favore-di-undp-per-la-stabilizzazione-del-paese&catid=8&Itemid=515

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1034</sup> Press Release: Iraq: Italy 2.5 million euro in favor of UNDP for the stabilization of the country, Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation 23 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

http://www.cooperazioneallosviluppo.esteri.it/pdgcs/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=13270:12-02-2016-tunisia-delegazione-italiana-in-visita-alle-scuole-beneficiarie-del-programma-di-aiuto-alla-bilancia-dei-pagamenti&catid=8&Itemid=

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1035</sup> Press Release: Iraq: Italy 2.5 million euro in favor of UNDP for the stabilization of the country, Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation 23 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

http://www.cooperazioneallosviluppo.esteri.it/pdgcs/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=13270:12-02-2016-tunisia-delegazione-italiana-in-visita-alle-scuole-beneficiarie-del-programma-di-aiuto-alla-bilancia-dei-pagamenti&catid=8&Itemid=

On 28 January 2016, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation allocated EUR1 million towards food security development in Ethiopia.<sup>1036</sup> The aid will fund the tools needed for agro-pastoral communities, to enhance technical abilities and further economic restructuring in Ethiopia.<sup>1037</sup>

On 12 February 2016, the Italian Development Cooperation added an additional EUR 50 million of funding towards the Balance of Payments assistance program in Tunisia.<sup>1038</sup> The funding follows an initial pledge of EUR95 million, to bring the total amount of funding up to EUR145 million.<sup>1039</sup> The Balance of Payments assistance program "aims to contribute to sustainable growth of the Tunisian economy in terms of gross domestic product and employment."<sup>1040</sup>

Italy has supported the development of trade infrastructure in least-developed countries by funding balance of payment assistance programs, developing technical abilities of businesses and producers, and providing aid to the reconstruction of economic infrastructure in developing countries.

Thus, Italy has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Tanzim Rashid

## Japan: +1

Japan has fully complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

On 31 January 2016, Katsuyuki Kawei, special advisor to Prime Minister Shinzo Abe, and President Uhuru Ken-yatta of Kenya jointly announced the Sixth Tokyo International Conference on African

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1036</sup> Press Release: Iraq: Italy 2.5 million euro in favor of UNDP for the stabilization of the country, Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation 23 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

http://www.cooperazioneallosviluppo.esteri.it/pdgcs/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=13270:12-02-2016-tunisia-delegazione-italiana-in-visita-alle-scuole-beneficiarie-del-programma-di-aiuto-alla-bilancia-dei-pagamenti&catid=8&Itemid=

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1037</sup> Press Release: Ethiopia: food emergency, earmarked contributions from 1 million euro to WFP and FAO, Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation 28 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.cooperazioneallosviluppo.esteri.it/pdgcs/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=13270:12-02-2016-tunisia-delegazione-italiana-in-visita-alle-scuole-beneficiarie-del-programma-di-aiuto-alla-bilancia-deipagamenti&catid=8&Itemid= <sup>1038</sup> Press Release: Tunisia: Italian delegation on a visit to the beneficiary schools for aid under the Balance of Payments

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1038</sup> Press Release: Tunisia: Italian delegation on a visit to the beneficiary schools for aid under the Balance of Payments Program, Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation 12 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016

http://www.cooperazioneallosviluppo.esteri.it/pdgcs/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=13270:12-02-2016-tunisia-delegazione-italiana-in-visita-alle-scuole-beneficiarie-del-programma-di-aiuto-alla-bilancia-deipagamenti&catid=8&Itemid=

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1039</sup> Press Release: Tunisia: Italian delegation on a visit to the beneficiary schools for aid under the Balance of Payments Program, Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation 12 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016

http://www.cooperazioneallosviluppo.esteri.it/pdgcs/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=13270:12-02-2016-tunisia-delegazione-italiana-in-visita-alle-scuole-beneficiarie-del-programma-di-aiuto-alla-bilancia-dei-pagamenti&catid=8&Itemid=

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1040</sup> Press Release: Tunisia: Italian delegation on a visit to the beneficiary schools for aid under the Balance of Payments Program, Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Cooperation 12 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016

http://www.cooperazioneallosviluppo.esteri.it/pdgcs/index.php?option=com\_content&view=article&id=13270:12-02-2016-tunisia-delegazione-italiana-in-visita-alle-scuole-beneficiarie-del-programma-di-aiuto-alla-bilancia-deipagamenti&catid=8&Itemid=

Development that will be hosted in Kenya for the first time on 27 August 2016.<sup>1041</sup> The Japanese cosponsored conference will focus on investment and partnership opportunities between African countries and Japan.<sup>1042</sup>

On 4 February 2016, State Minister of the Cabinet Office Shuichi Takatori signed the Trans-Pacific Partnership Agreement (TPP).<sup>1043</sup> The Japanese government stated the TPP promotes trade liberalization in the Asia-Pacific region.<sup>1044</sup> The TPP includes information sharing initiatives, the creation of capacity building initiatives amongst member states, and facilitates public-private sector partnerships to further cooperative development ventures.<sup>1045</sup>

On 16 February 2016, the Japan External Trade Organization released application information for the Subsidy Program for Global Innovation Centers.<sup>1046</sup> The program will finance collaborative innovation centers abroad between foreign companies and Japanese companies to promote high value add to global value chains.<sup>1047</sup>

Japan has implemented and maintained multiple measures pertaining to Aid for Trade and other mechanisms in support for trade capacity building assistance in developing countries.

Thus, Japan has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Alessandra Jenkins

#### Korea: 0

Korea has partially complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

On 30 November 2015, Korea contributed USD350,000 towards the World Trade Organization's Doha Development Agenda Global Trust Fund.<sup>1048</sup> The programme is aimed to help developing countries and least-developed countries participate more effectively in WTO negotiations and activities.<sup>1049</sup> The programme helps countries to meet their WTO obligation and fully benefit from their WTO membership.<sup>1050</sup>

30 November 2015. Access Date: 24 February 2016.

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1041</sup> Kenya to host Tokyo-led Africa development summit in August, The Japan Times (Tokyo) 31 January 2016. Access
 Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2016/01/31/national/kenya-host-tokyo-led-africa-development-summit-august/#.VtETTZMrJo5
 <sup>1042</sup> Kenya to host Tokyo-led Africa development summit in August, The Japan Times (Tokyo) 31 January 2016. Access

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1042</sup> Kenya to host Tokyo-led Africa development summit in August, The Japan Times (Tokyo) 31 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.japantimes.co.jp/news/2016/01/31/national/kenya-host-tokyo-led-africa-development-summit-august/#.VtETTZMrJo5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1043</sup> Signing of the Trans-Pacific Partnership (TPP) Agreement (Tokyo), Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Japan, 4 February 2016. Access Date: February 24 2016. http://www.mofa.go.jp/press/release/press4e\_001013.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1044</sup> Signing of the Trans-Pacific Partnership (TPP) Agreement (Tokyo) 4 February 2016. Access Date: February 24 2016. http://www.mofa.go.jp/press/release/press4e\_001013.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1045</sup> Development, Cooperation & Capacity Building Chapters, Global Affairs Canada 4 October 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.international.gc.ca/trade-agreements-accords-commerciaux/agr-acc/tppptp/understanding-comprendre/20-development.aspx?lang=eng

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1046</sup> Subsidy Program for Global Innovation Centers, Japan External Trade Organization 16 February 2016. Access Date:
 23 February 2016. https://www.jetro.go.jp/en/invest/incentive\_programs/info/

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1047</sup> Subsidy Program for Global Innovation Centers, Japan External Trade Organization 16 February 2016. Access date:
 23 February 2016. https://www.jetro.go.jp/en/invest/incentive\_programs/info/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1048</sup> Korea donates USD 350,000 to support training programmes for developing countries, World Trade Organization 30 November 2015. Access Date: 24 February 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/pres15\_e/pr762\_e.htm <sup>1049</sup> Korea donates USD 350,000 to support training programmes for developing countries, World Trade Organization

https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/pres15\_e/pr762\_e.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1050</sup> Korea donates USD 350,000 to support training programmes for developing countries, World Trade Organization 30 November 2015. Access Date: 24 February 2016.

Korea has provided support to developing countries in need of capacity building mechanisms, but has not provided specific investment to aid trade capacity.

Thus, Korea has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Nabiha Chowdhury

### Mexico: -1

Mexico has not complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

In February 2016, Mexico became a signatory to the Trans-Pacific Partnership (TPP), which includes a commitment to reducing barriers to trade among members and improving trade facilitation.<sup>1051</sup> Under this agreement, Mexico has improved economic relations with countries such as Vietnam and Malaysia, facilitating greater trade engagement.<sup>1052</sup>

While Mexico intends to facilitate global trade through membership in organizations such as the TPP, no demonstrable or concrete examples of trade facilitation are evident during the compliance period.

Thus, Mexico has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Eileen (Yijia) Liu

## Russia: +1

Russia has fully complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

On 19 November 2015, Trade Representative of Russia in Bulgaria Igor Ilingin spoke of prospects for Russian business on Bulgarian markets with Director of Department of Internationalization of Activity of Small and Medium Enterprises of the Executive Agency on Support of Small and Medium Enterprises of the Republic of Bulgaria Borislav Dimitrachkov, Head of Department of the Agency Boryana Mincheva, Bulgarian-Russian Chamber of Commerce and Trade board member Peter Kisyov, former advisor on economic issues at the Bulgarian Embassy in Russia Yanko Yanakiev, and various heads of Bulgarian industry associations and companies.<sup>1053</sup> At the meeting, Deputy General Director of the Russian Agency on Support of Small and Medium Business in Russia Evgeniy Zhivoglazov invited the Bulgarian Agency to participate in the International Economic Activity as a Factor of Efficient Development of Subjects of Russian Federation conference on 10-11 December 2015. Following the meeting, Deputy General Director Zhivoglazov and Director Dimitrachkov signed the Program of Common Actions between Russian and Bulgarian Agencies on Support of Small and Medium Business in 2016 to promote economic development and collaboration between the two countries.<sup>1054</sup>

http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015191105.

https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/pres15\_e/pr762\_e.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1051</sup> What the TPP means for Latin America and the Caribbean, Brookings Doha Center 9 March 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://www.brookings.edu/research/opinions/2016/03/09-tpp-latin-america-caribbean-estevadeordal

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1052</sup> What the TPP means for Latin America and the Caribbean, Brookings Doha Center 9 March 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://www.brookings.edu/research/opinions/2016/03/09-tpp-latin-america-caribbean-estevadeordal <sup>1053</sup> Small and Medium Business Ensures stable collaboration between Russia and Bulgaria, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 18 November 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1054</sup> Small and Medium Business Ensures stable collaboration between Russia and Bulgaria, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 18 November 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015191105.

On 19 November 2015, President Vladimir Putin attended the Asia-Pacific Economic Cooperation meeting in Manilla, the theme of which was "building inclusive economies, building a better world."<sup>1055</sup>

On 25 November 2015, First Deputy Minister of Economic Development Alexey Likhachev and Cambodian Secretary General for Development Sok Chenda Sophea signed a Memorandum of Understanding and Partnership on investment promotion.<sup>1056</sup> The Memorandum was signed to strengthen and expand investments between the two states, aid in the improvement of policies to attract investment, and support business and investment initiatives.<sup>1057</sup> The First Deputy Minister and Cambodian Minister of Commerce Sun Chanthol also signed a regulation on the activities of the Russian-Cambodian Working Group to promote joint investment projects.<sup>1058</sup>

On 25 November 2015, President Putin signed the 2010 International Cocoa Agreement Ratification Act.<sup>1059</sup> The agreement "contributes to development of strategic partnership between the member countries that export or import cocoa and provides means for carrying out intergovernmental consultations and negotiations."<sup>1060</sup> Signatories of the Agreement include several developing countries, such as Cote d'Ivoire, Ecuador, Gabon, Ghana, Guinea, Indonesia, Liberia, Malaysia, Nicaragua, Peru, and Togo.<sup>1061</sup>

On 25 November 2015, First Deputy Minister Likhachev and Malaysian Minister for Foreign Affairs Anifah Aman signed an agreement establishing a joint Russian-Malaysian Committee for economic, scientific, technological, and cultural cooperation.<sup>1062</sup> The Committee will provide "momentum"<sup>1063</sup> for bilateral relations and intergovernmental trade and economic investment, among others.<sup>1064</sup>

On 26 November 2015, Chairman Dmitry Medvedev agreed to set up a Russian Federation trade representation office in Mongolia, to be prepared by the Ministry of Economic Development.<sup>1065</sup> Among other objectives of the office, the Russian government hopes to enhance intergovernmental

http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015251104

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1055</sup> APEC Leaders Issue Declaration in Manila, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Manila) 19 November 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015191105.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1056</sup> APEC Leaders Issue Declaration in Manila, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Manila) 19 November 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015191105.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1057</sup> APEC Leaders Issue Declaration in Manila, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Manila) 19 November 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015191105.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1058</sup> APEC Leaders Issue Declaration in Manila, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Manila) 19 November 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015191105.

<sup>1059</sup> International Cocoa Agreement 10 Ratification Act signed, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 25 November 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016.

<sup>1060</sup> International Cocoa Agreement 10 Ratification Act signed, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 25 November 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016.

http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015251104

<sup>1061</sup> Status of International Cocoa Agreement, 2010, United Nations Treaty Collection (New York) n.d. Access Date: 13 March 2016. https://treaties.un.org/Pages/ViewDetails.aspx?src=TREATY&mtdsg\_no=XIX-47&chapter=19&lang=en. 1062 Russia and Malaysia appointed a committee on economic, scientific-technological and cultural cooperation, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 25 November 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015251103.

<sup>1063</sup> Russia and Malaysia appointed a committee on economic, scientific-technological and cultural cooperation, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 25 November 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015251103.

<sup>1064</sup> Russia and Malaysia appointed a committee on economic, scientific-technological and cultural cooperation, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 25 November 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015251103.

<sup>1065</sup> Russia opens trade representation office in Mongolia, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 26 November 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016.

http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015251103.

trade and economic agreements as well as the assistance in implementation of business contacts and development of new forms of cooperation between the two countries.<sup>1066</sup>

On 26 November 2015, Deputy Minister on the Development of the Far East Maxim Shereikin and Chinese Director of the Ministry of Commerce Zi Lin met at the Secretariat of the Cooperation Council to discuss the implementation of agreement reached at a prior meeting on trade and investment.<sup>1067</sup>

On 3 December 2015, at the 18th Session of the Intergovernmental Russian-Kyrgz Commission on Trade, Economic, Science, Technical, and Humanitarian Operations, Director of the Department for the Cooperation with Customs Union and Economic Cooperation bodies with Commonwealth of Independent States countries of the Ministry of Economic Development Oleg Mizerkov noted that "accession of Kyrgyzstan to Eurasian Economic Union will create additional features for development of double-sided trade and economic cooperation."<sup>1068</sup> To that effect, an activity plan was confirmed between the two countries under the realization of economic cooperation from now until 2017.<sup>1069</sup>

On 7 December 2015, at the fourth conference on the International Cooperation of Russia and Tajikistan, Deputy Minister of Economic Development Alexander Tsybulskiy stated the Russian government's commitment to increasing economic cooperation volumes.<sup>1070</sup> Areas suggested included engineering, agriculture, infrastructure, information, and technology.<sup>1071</sup> To that effect, a memorandum was signed between the two countries.<sup>1072</sup>

On 17 December 2015, First Deputy Minister Likhachev signed a Memorandum of Understanding with the Chinese Commerce Minister Gao Hucheng on promoting bilateral trade.<sup>1073</sup> Under the agreement, mutual trade and economic cooperation as well as development cooperation mechanisms will be enhanced.<sup>1074</sup>

<sup>1066</sup> Russia opens trade representation office in Mongolia, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 26 November 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016.

http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015251103.

<sup>1067</sup> Maxim Shereikin discussed with Chinese partners the practical steps for the development of regions of the Far East of Russia and Northeast Russia, Ministry for Development of the Russian Far East (Moscow) 26 November 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://minvostokrazvitia.ru/press-center/news\_minvostok/?ELEMENT\_ID=3918. 1068 Accession of Kyrgyzstan to EEU will create additional features for development of trade and economic

cooperation, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 3 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015071203.

<sup>1069</sup> Accession of Kyrgyzstan to EEU will create additional features for development of trade and economic cooperation, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 3 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015071203.

<sup>1070</sup> Russian and Tajikistan are intent to increase volumes of economic cooperation, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Dushbane City) 7 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015071201.

<sup>1071</sup> Russian and Tajikistan are intent to increase volumes of economic cooperation, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Dushbane City) 7 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015071201.

<sup>1072</sup> Russian and Tajikistan are intent to increase volumes of economic cooperation, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Dushbane City) 7 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015071201.

<sup>1073</sup> Russia and China are developing measures to strengthen trade and economic cooperation, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Beijing) 18 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015181202.

<sup>1074</sup> Russia and China are developing measures to strengthen trade and economic cooperation, Ministry of Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Beijing) 18 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015181202.

On 17 December 2015, Minister on the Development of the Far East Alexander Galushka and Chinese Head of State Committee for Development and Reform Commission Xu Shaoshi signed a Memorandum of Understanding to strengthen Russian-Chinese regional, industrial, and investment cooperation in the Far East.<sup>1075</sup> The Memorandum includes agreements on the development of the Northern Sea Route for the transportation of goods and the development of international transport corridors.<sup>1076</sup>

On 20 December 2015, at the WTO Ministerial Conference in Nairobi, Minister of Economic Development Alexey Ulkyukaev reaffirmed a commitment to support the multilateral trading system in place and the achievement of "real results"<sup>1077</sup> in Nairobi, referring to the fact that export subsidies in agriculture were abolished at the meeting.<sup>1078</sup>

On 28 December 2015, Deputy Minister of Economic Development Stanislav Voskresensky met with Chinese Deputy Chairman of National Development and Reform Commission Ning Jizhe to discuss intergovernmental investment cooperation and common investment projects.<sup>1079</sup> The participants agreed to integrate the Silk Road Economic Belt with the EEU to allow for the strengthening of bilateral investment cooperation.<sup>1080</sup>

On 1 February 2016, at the 26<sup>th</sup> Session of the Assembly of Heads of State and Government of the African Union in Addis Ababa, the Russian government discussed strengthening trade relationships across the region and the potential for Russian companies to be involved in the Africa 2063 strategy.<sup>1081</sup> In a bilateral meeting with Zambia, Russian delegates offered military cooperation and personnel training as first steps to strengthening training, trade, and economic relations between the two countries.<sup>1082</sup>

On 23-25 February 2016, Thai Deputy Prime Ministers Prawit Wongsuwon and Somkid Jatusripitak visited Moscow, where the Russian government offered to build an armaments plants in Thailand to manufacture weapons in order to meet local demand as well as to invest in a variety of Thai projects, related to railways, energy, information technology, and air transport.<sup>1083</sup>

1075 Minvostokrazvitiya and the State Committee of China Development and Reform Commission signed a Memorandum of cooperation in the Far East, Ministry for Development of Russian Far East (Moscow) 17 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://minvostokrazvitia.ru/press-center/news\_minvostok/?ELEMENT\_ID=3949. 1076 Minvostokrazvitiya and the State Committee of China Development and Reform Commission signed a Memorandum of cooperation in the Far East, Ministry for Development of Russian Far East (Moscow) 17 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://minvostokrazvitia.ru/press-center/news\_minvostok/?ELEMENT\_ID=3949.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1077</sup> WTO Conference took a landmark decision abolishing export subsidies in agriculture, Ministry for Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Nairobi) 20 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015221201.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1078</sup> WTO Conference took a landmark decision abolishing export subsidies in agriculture, Ministry for Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Nairobi) 20 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015221201.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1079</sup> The Silk Road Will Strengthen Investment Cooperation between Russia and China, Ministry for Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 28 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015281210.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1080</sup> The Silk Road Will Strengthen Investment Cooperation between Russia and China, Ministry for Economic Development of the Russian Federation (Moscow) 28 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://economy.gov.ru/en/home/press/news/2015281210.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1081</sup> The participation of the Special Representative of the President of the Russian Federation for the Middle East and Africa, Russian Deputy Minister of Foreign Affairs, ML Bogdanov in the summit of the African Union 1 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://www.mid.ru/foreign\_policy/news/-/asset\_publisher/cKNonkJE02Bw/content/id/2043703.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1082</sup> Russia offers Zambia military training, Daily Mail, 1 February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. https://www.daily-mail.co.zm/?p=57851.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1083</sup> Russia offers to build armaments plant in Thailand, Bangkok Post (Bangkok) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://www.bangkokpost.com/news/security/878136/russia-offers-to-build-armaments-plant-in-thailand.

On 26 February 2016, Minister Galushka attended an Intergovernmental Russian-Kuwaiti Commission meeting in which he identified promising areas of Russian-Kuwaiti cooperation today to be investment, energy, transport, science, and education.<sup>1084</sup> The Minister stated that Russian companies were keen to supply the market and that Russia was ready to implement large development projects in the region.<sup>1085</sup>

On 28 February 2016, Minister of Economic Development Andrey Moga met with Bahraini Undersecretary for Agriculture and Marine Resources Shakh Khalifa bin Isa Al-Khalifa to review bilateral relations and cooperation to develop agricultural production and enable the Bahraini market to sell entrepreneurs' products.<sup>1086</sup>

Russia has implemented and maintained multiple measures pertaining to Aid for Trade and other mechanisms in support for trade capacity building assistance in developing countries.

Thus, Russia has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Alessandra Jenkins

# Saudi Arabia: +1

Saudi Arabia has fully complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

On 14 December 2015, Saudi Arabia reaffirmed their support of the Enhanced Integrated Framework (EIF), which seeks to provide technical and financial support in building the trade capacity of 48 least-developed countries (LDCs).<sup>1087</sup> Through the second phase of this project, Saudi Arabia and 14 other donor countries will provide USD90 million to assist LDCs in using trade as a driver in economic growth and the reduction of poverty.<sup>1088</sup>

On 6 February 2016, Saudi Arabia announced USD10.5 billion investment in Ukraine's agricultural sector over the next three years.<sup>1085</sup>

Saudi Arabia has implemented and maintained measures pertaining to Aid for Trade and other mechanisms to support developing countries build trade capacity. Saudi Arabia's compliance includes both direct bilateral investments along with broader support through the EIF.

Saudi Arabia has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Anah Mirza

#### South Africa: 0

South Africa has partially complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

<sup>1086</sup> Bahrain, Russia discuss agricultural cooperation, Bahrain News Agency (Manama) 28 February 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://www.bna.bh/portal/en/news/713494.

<sup>1089</sup> Saudi Arabia to invest in Ukraine, Euromaidan Press 6 February 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://euromaidanpress.com/2016/02/06/saudi-arabia-to-invest-in-ukraine/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1084</sup> Alexander Galushka: trade turnover between Russia and Kuwait in 2015 increased by 8.3 times, Ministry for Development of Russian Far East (Moscow) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://minvostokrazvitia.ru/press-center/news minvostok/?ELEMENT ID=4057.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1085</sup> Alexander Galushka: trade turnover between Russia and Kuwait in 2015 increased by 8.3 times, Ministry for Development of Russian Far East (Moscow) 26 February 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://minvostokrazvitia.ru/press-center/news minvostok/?ELEMENT ID=4057.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1087</sup> Donors confirm strong support for Phase Two of EIF on eve of ministerial conference, World Trade Organization 14 December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/news e/news15 e/if 14dec15 e.htm <sup>1088</sup> Donors confirm strong support for Phase Two of EIF on eve of ministerial conference, World Trade Organization 14

December 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/news e/news15 e/if 14dec15 e.htm

On 4-5 December 2015, South Africa hosted the Johannesburg Summit of the Forum on China-Africa Cooperation.<sup>1090</sup> Minister of International Relations and Cooperation, Maite Nkoana-Mashabane announced the joint ten-phase plan between China and African states, the "Comprehensive Strategic and Cooperative Partnership."<sup>1091</sup>

South Africa has implemented some of the measures pertaining to Aid for Trade and other mechanisms for trade capacity building assistance in developing countries. South Africa has displayed some action in investment in capacity building initiatives.

Thus, South Africa has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Angela Hou

## Turkey: +1

Turkey has fully complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

On 17 December 2015 at the World Trade Organization's (WTO) 10th ministerial conference, Turkey, along with China and India, drafted two proposals on the special safeguard mechanism (SSM) from the Doha negotiation.<sup>1092</sup> The proposal specifies "developing country members shall have the right to have to recourse to [an] [SSM] based on import quantity and price triggers" and "the negotiations on this subject shall be held in committee on agriculture special sessions, in dedicated sessions and in an accelerated time-frame, distinct from the agriculture negotiations under the Doha Development Agenda."<sup>1093</sup>

On 1 February 2016, Turkey and Chile pledged to increase economic cooperation following their free trade agreement of 2011.<sup>1094</sup>

On 22 February 2016, an economic and trade cooperation agreement was signed with Somalia.<sup>1095</sup>

From 28 February to 3 March 2016, Turkish President Erdogan visited several developing countries in Africa to expand trade relations. President Erdogan signed bilateral free trade agreements with Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana, Nigeria and Guinea.<sup>1096</sup> On 29 February 2016, during President Erdogan's

http://aa.com.tr/en/politics/turkey-chile-vow-to-boost-trade/513834

somalia.aspx?pageID=238&nID=95577&NewsCatID=510

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1090</sup> Media Statement by Minister of International Relations and Cooperation upon the closing of the Johannesburg Summit of the Forum on China-Africa Cooperation (Johannesburg) 5 December 2015. Access Date: March 10, 2016. http://www.dfa.gov.za/docs/speeches/2015/mash1205.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1091</sup> Media Statement by Minister of International Relations and Cooperation upon the closing of the Johannesburg Summit of the Forum on China-Africa Cooperation (Johannesburg) 5 December 2015. Access Date: March 10, 2016. http://www.dfa.gov.za/docs/speeches/2015/mash1205.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1092</sup> WTO Nairobi meet: Deadlock unresolved, talks go to the wire, Livemint 18 December 2015. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://www.livemint.com/Politics/ZvT416JRBjZBCV7gGia6uO/WTO-Nairobi-meet-Deadlock-unresolved-talks-go-to-the-wire.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1093</sup> WTO Nairobi meet: Deadlock unresolved, talks go to the wire, Livemint 18 December 2015. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://www.livemint.com/Politics/ZvT416JRBjZBCV7gGia6uO/WTO-Nairobi-meet-Deadlock-unresolved-talks-go-to-the-wire.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1094</sup>Turkey, Chile vow to boost trade, AA 2 March 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1095</sup> Turkey plans to enhance investments in Somalia, Hurriyet Daily News 23 February 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://www.hurriyetdailynews.com/turkey-plans-to-enhance-investments-in-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1096</sup> Foreign Minister Çavuşoğlu accompanied President Erdoğan during his visits to Côte d'Ivoire, Ghana, Nigeria and Guinea, Republic of Turkey Ministry of Foreign Affairs Access date: 6 March 2016. http://www.mfa.gov.tr/foreign-minister-cavusoglu-accompanied-president-erdogan-during-his-visit.en.mfa

visit to Côte d'Ivoire, Turkey announced its aims to increase trade with the country to USD1 billion by 2020.<sup>1097</sup>

On 2 March 2016, during Erdogan's visit to Nigeria Turkey signed a Memorandum of Understanding with the country in "key areas of economic activities, including trade and investment."<sup>1098</sup>

On 3 March 2016, during Erdogan's visit to Guinea Turkey signed nine bilateral agreements with the country in the fields of "tourism, aviation, medicine, military, electricity, hydrocarbons, mining, environmental control and works council."<sup>1099</sup>

Turkey has provided support to developing countries that contribute to the building of trade capacity.

Thus, Turkey has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Hivda Ates

# United Kingdom: +1

The United Kingdom has fully complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

On 7 December 2015, UK International Development Minister Nick Hurd announced a Memorandum of Understanding between the UK's Energy Africa and USAID's Power Africa Initiative.<sup>1100</sup> The initiative will enhance the capacities of the energy sector across the continent including clean technology initiatives, increasing workforce participation in the sector, and developing networks for cross-border energy sharing.<sup>1101</sup>

On 17 December 2015, at the Trade and Development Symposium in Nairobi, the British High Commissioner Nic Hailey announced the TradeMark East Africa initiative would finish revitalizing the port in Mombasa this year, increasing the port's exports by 10per cent.<sup>1102</sup> In the same announcement, Nic Hailey announced the UK would provide over USD250 million annually to support trade facilitation in developing countries along with USD22 million to help implement the Bali Agreement.<sup>1103</sup>

On 4 February 2016, Prime Minister David Cameron pledged UK1.2 billion in international aid for Syria and the region.<sup>1104</sup> Part of the funding will be allocated to economic opportunities, education, and infrastructure.<sup>1105</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1097</sup> Turkey, Cote D'Ivoire to boost bilateral relations, Daily Sabah 29 February 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://www.dailysabah.com/diplomacy/2016/02/29/turkey-cote-divoire-to-boost-bilateral-relations

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1098</sup> Nigeria, Turkey sign trade, investment deals, The Guardian 3 March 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://guardian.ng/news/nigeria-turkey-sign-trade-investment-deals/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1099</sup>Turkey, Guinea sign nine bilateral agreements, Anadolu Agency 3 March 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://aa.com.tr/en/todays-headlines/turkey-guinea-sign-nine-bilateral-agreements/531236

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1100</sup>Launch of the new partnership between the UK's Energy Africa and the US's Power Africa Initiative. 7 December 2015. Access Date: 10 March 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/britain-and-us-unite-to-power-up-africa <sup>1101</sup>Launch of the new partnership between the UK's Energy Africa and the US's Power Africa Initiative. 7 December

<sup>2015.</sup> Access Date: 10 March 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/britain-and-us-unite-to-power-up-africa <sup>1102</sup> Integrating East Africa: progress, challenges and future prospects, Government of UK 15 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/integrating-east-africa-progress-challenges-and-

Date: 25 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/integrating-east-africa-progress-challenges-andfuture-prospects

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1103</sup> Integrating East Africa: progress, challenges and future prospects, Government of UK 15 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/speeches/integrating-east-africa-progress-challenges-and-future-prospects

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1104</sup> UK to invest an extra 1.2 billion supporting Syria and the Region (London) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/uk-to-invest-an-extra-12-billion-supporting-syria-and-the-region

The UK has contributed to the Aid for Trade program through directly financing developing countries and integrating its projects with a variety of international actors.

Thus, the United Kingdom has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Angela Hou

## United States: +1

The United States has fully complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

During the compliance period, the US continued to support developing countries build trade capacity through Trade Africa, a division of the United States Agency for International Development (USAID).<sup>1106</sup> Trade Africa is a partnership between the United States and sub-Saharan Africa to increase internal and regional trade within Africa, and expand trade and economic ties among Africa, the United States, and other global markets.<sup>1107</sup>

During the compliance period, the US continued to implement USAID's Afghanistan Trade and Revenue Project (ATAR) to improve the integration of regional trade by developing cross border transit agreements and improving economic growth and stability in the regions.<sup>1108</sup>

During the compliance period, the US continued to implement USAID's Business Enabling Project in partnership with the government of Serbia to increase the competitiveness of the Serbian economy and its private sector by streamlining the business enabling environment, improving public financial management, and strengthening financial markets.<sup>1109</sup>Project activities are based on priorities identified by the private sector and the government of Serbia.<sup>1110</sup>

During the compliance period, the US continued to boost trade and investment with and within East Africa through the USAID East Africa Trade and Investment Hub.<sup>1111</sup>

During the compliance period, the US continued to support private enterprises in developing countries through the Global Engagement Initiative, the Development Credit Authority, the Entrepreneurship Initiative and the Private Enterprise Promotion.<sup>1112</sup>

On December 7 2015, a delegation from the US participated in a Policy Dialogue on Trade Facilitation hosted by the Inter-American Development Bank called "Narrowing the Borders: Trade Facilitation in Latin America and the Caribbean."<sup>1113</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1105</sup> UK to invest an extra 1.2 billion supporting Syria and the Region (London) 4 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/uk-to-invest-an-extra-12-billion-supporting-syria-and-the-region

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1106</sup> Trade Africa, United States Agency for International Development (Washington) 6 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. https://www.usaid.gov/tradeafrica

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1107</sup>Trade Africa, United States Agency for International Development (Washington) 6 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. https://www.usaid.gov/tradeafrica

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1108</sup> Trade Africa, United States Agency for International Development (Washington) 6 January 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. https://www.usaid.gov/tradeafrica

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1109</sup> USAID Business Enabling Project Information, United States Agency for International Development (Washington). Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.bep.rs/english/index\_en.php

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1110</sup>USAID Business Enabling Project Information, United States Agency for International Development (Washington). Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.bep.rs/english/index\_en.php

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1111</sup>About USAID East Africa Trade and Investment Hub, United States Agency for International Development (Washington). Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.eatradehub.org/about

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1112</sup>Support Private Enterprise, United States Agency for International Development (Washington). Access Date: 10 March 2016. https://www.usaid.gov/what-we-do/economic-growth-and-trade/supporting-private-enterprise

On 17 December 2015, the US joined the Global Alliance for Trade Facilitation as a founding donor member.<sup>1114</sup> The Global Alliance for Trade Facilitation is a public-private partnership to support the implementation of the World Trade Organization's Trade Facilitation Agreement.<sup>1115</sup> The Alliance "supports the implementation efforts of a number of developing countries by leveraging private sector expertise, leadership and resources to achieve commercially meaningful reforms measured by real world business metrics."<sup>1116</sup>

On 27 January 2016, a delegation from the United States attended the Powering Africa Summit that focused on advancing access to electricity and connecting 60 million homes and businesses to electricity in sub-Saharan Africa.<sup>1117</sup>

On 3 February 2016, the United States awarded a grant to Ethiopian Electric Power, Ethiopia's national power generation and transmission company, to support sustainable infrastructure development, increase access to energy and enhance economic growth in Ethiopia.<sup>1118</sup>

On 9 February 2016, the US Federal Government announced the 2017 fiscal year budget.<sup>1119</sup> The budget dedicates USD29.3 million to continuing to support the Power Africa Initiative, which encourages investment in sub-Saharan Africa and assists in building greater economic and institutional capacity among pan-African partners.<sup>1120</sup> USD75 million is devoted to trade capacity building which enables developing countries to implement and negotiate market-opening and reform-oriented trade agreements and to improve their capacity to benefit from increased trade.<sup>1121</sup>

On February 11 2016, Elizabeth Hogan, the acting Assistant Administrator for Latin America and the Caribbean stated that the US will continue to support El Salvador in its efforts to grow its economy at the municipal and national levels through USAID.<sup>1122</sup> She also stated that the United

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1113</sup> Narrowing the Borders: Trade Facilitation in Latin America and the Caribbean Agenda, Inter-American Development Bank (Washington). Access Date: 10 March 2016. http://www.iadb.org/en/topics/trade/narrowing-the-borders-tradefacilitation-in-latin-america-and-the-caribbean,19810.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1114</sup> About the Alliance, Global Alliance for Trade Facilitation (Geneva). Access Date: 11 March 2016. http://www.tradefacilitation.org/about-the-alliance.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1115</sup> About the Alliance, Global Alliance for Trade Facilitation (Geneva). Access Date: 11 March 2016. http://www.tradefacilitation.org/about-the-alliance.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1116</sup> About the Alliance, Global Alliance for Trade Facilitation (Geneva). Access Date: 11 March 2016. http://www.tradefacilitation.org/about-the-alliance.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1117</sup> Power Africa to Showcase Roadmap and Tracking Tool At Powering Africa Summit, United States Agency for International Development (Washington) 27 January 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. https://www.usaid.gov/newsinformation/press-releases/jan-27-2016-power-africa-showcase-roadmap-and-tracking-tool-powering-africa <sup>1118</sup> USTDA Strengthens Efforts to Promote Value-Based Procurement in Ethiopia, The United States Trade and

Development Agency (Washington) 3 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. https://www.ustda.gov/news/pressreleases/2016/ustda-strengthens-efforts-promote-value-based-procurement-ethiopia

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1119</sup>The President's Budget for Fiscal Year 2017, Office of Management and Budget (Washington) 9 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. https://www.whitehouse.gov/omb/budget

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1120</sup> The President's Budget for Fiscal Year 2017, Office of Management and Budget (Washington) 9 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. https://www.whitehouse.gov/omb/budget

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1121</sup>The President's Budget for Fiscal Year 2017, Office of Management and Budget (Washington) 9 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. https://www.whitehouse.gov/omb/budget

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1122</sup> Testimony of Elizabeth Hogan, Acting Assistant Administrator for Latin America and the Caribbean Before the House Subcommittee on State, Foreign Operations and Related Programs, United States Agency for International Development (Washington) 11 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. https://www.usaid.gov/newsinformation/congressional-testimony/feb-11-2016-elizabeth-hogan-acting-aa-lac-usaid-efforts-central-america

States will invest in trade facilitation programs in Guatemala, El Salvador and Honduras to promote regional integration and improve the competitiveness of the business sector.<sup>1123</sup>

On 3 March 2016, the US published its Regional Development Cooperation Strategy (RDCS) for Central America and Mexico (CAM).<sup>1124</sup> It will continue to address slow economic growth and integration by serving as a regional convener to facilitate the sharing of ideas, successes, and lessons learned throughout the region.<sup>1125</sup> The Regional Development Cooperation Strategy (RDCS) for Central America and Mexico (CAM) also developed a new regional trade facilitation program to reduce the time and transportation costs of moving goods across the border and to make it easier for businesses to capitalize on market opportunities. The regional trade facilitation program plans to promote the regional trade and market alliance with the Inter-American Development Bank.<sup>1126</sup>

The US has continued to provide support and investment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

Thus, the United States has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Katrina Y.K. Li

# European Union: +1

The European Union has fully complied with its commitment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

On 26 November 2015, the EU signed an agreement to provide EUR734 million to Mozambique under the National Indicative Programme for Mozambique to support sustainable economic growth while maintaining political stability.<sup>1127</sup>

On 26 November 2015, the EU pledged EUR3.6 billion to support private sector development in addition to human and social development, environment and climate change, and peace and security across African, Caribbean and Pacific countries.<sup>1128</sup>

On 11 December 2015, the European Investment Bank pledged EUR110 million to support investment by entrepreneurs and small business in East Africa.<sup>1129</sup> This new program will also provide

<sup>1124</sup> Testimony of Elizabeth Hogan, Acting Assistant Administrator for Latin America and the Caribbean Before the House Subcommittee on State, Foreign Operations and Related Programs, United States Agency for International Development (Washington) 11 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. https://www.usaid.gov/news-

information/congressional-testimony/feb-11-2016-elizabeth-hogan-acting-aa-lac-usaid-efforts-central-america <sup>1125</sup>Testimony of Elizabeth Hogan, Acting Assistant Administrator for Latin America and the Caribbean Before the House Subcommittee on State, Foreign Operations and Related Programs, United States Agency for International Development (Washington) 11 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. https://www.usaid.gov/news-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1123</sup> Testimony of Elizabeth Hogan, Acting Assistant Administrator for Latin America and the Caribbean Before the House Subcommittee on State, Foreign Operations and Related Programs, United States Agency for International Development (Washington) 11 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. https://www.usaid.gov/newsinformation/congressional-testimony/feb-11-2016-elizabeth-hogan-acting-aa-lac-usaid-efforts-central-america

information/congressional-testimony/feb-11-2016-elizabeth-hogan-acting-aa-lac-usaid-efforts-central-america <sup>1126</sup> Testimony of Elizabeth Hogan, Acting Assistant Administrator for Latin America and the Caribbean Before the House Subcommittee on State, Foreign Operations and Related Programs, United States Agency for International Development (Washington) 11 February 2016. Access Date: 10 March 2016. https://www.usaid.gov/newsinformation/congressional-testimony/feb-11-2016-elizabeth-hogan-acting-aa-lac-usaid-efforts-central-america

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1127</sup> EU announces new support for Mozambique, European Commission Press Release Database (Brussels) 26
 November 2015. Access Date: 11 March 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-15-6174\_en.htm
 <sup>1128</sup> EU signs program worth €3.6 billion with Africa, Caribbean and Pacific (ACP) Group of States, European Commission
 Press Release Database (Brussels) 26 November 2015. Access Date: 11 March 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release IP-15-6173 en.htm

long-term local and foreign currency loans to support economic growth in Kenya, Tanzania, Uganda and Burundi.<sup>1130</sup>

On 17 February 2016, the EU agreed to further promote and expand the development cooperation with the Southern African Development Community (SADC) by continuing to implement the 10<sup>th</sup> European Development Fund (EDF) SADC-EU,<sup>1131</sup> a response strategy that aims to promote regional economic integration in the South African region by enhancing cooperation and trade between SADC Member States,<sup>1132</sup> and the Trade-related Facility,<sup>1133</sup> a mechanism for financial and technical support for SADC Member States to promote the participation of SADC Member States in regional and international trade.<sup>1134</sup>

On 18 February 2016, the EU signed an agreement with the Common Market of Eastern and Southern Africa to provide a EUR4.5 million technical cooperation facility to support regional integration programs for Eastern Africa, Southern Africa and the Indian Ocean region.<sup>1135</sup>

On 29 February 2016, the EU pledged EUR447 million to help Swaziland implement the Economic Partnership Agreement, a free trade agreement with the EU that aims to increase trade and investment.<sup>1136</sup>The EU will also establish "an investment portal so that investors, consumers, retailers and all other stakeholders would be able to access information on this preferential trade agreement."<sup>1137</sup>

On 11 March 2016, the European Union Commissioner for International Development pledged an additional EUR10 million in development funding to Cuba as part of the overall EUR50 million in development funds that the EU will provide to Cuba from 2014-2020.<sup>1138</sup>

<sup>1131</sup>The Executive Secretary and the EU Ambassador to Further Boost SADC-EU Cooperation through EDF10 and EDF11, Southern African Development Community (Gaborone) 18 February 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016. https://www.sadc.int/news-events/news/executive-secretary-and-eu-ambassador-further-boost-sadc-eu/

<sup>1132</sup> EU relations with the Southern African Development Community, European Union External Action (Brussels). Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://eeas.europa.eu/africa/sadc/index\_en.htm

<sup>1133</sup> EU avails €85m funding to Comesa, Brussels Office Weblog (Brussels) 4 March 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016. http://brussels.cta.int/index.php?option=com\_k2&view=item&id=12723:eu-avails-85m-funding-to-comesa

<sup>1134</sup> SADC Trade Related Facility, Southern African Development Community (Gaborone). Access Date: 11 March 2016. https://www.sadc.int/sadc-secretariat/directorates/office-deputy-executive-secretary-regional-integration/tradeindustry-finance-investment/sadc-trade-related-facility-trf/

<sup>1135</sup> EU signs €4.5m technical cooperation facility for regional integration in Africa, Star Africa (Nairobi) 20 February 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016. http://en.starafrica.com/news/eu-signs-e4-5m-technical-cooperation-facility-for-regional-integration-in-africa.html

<sup>1136</sup> EU injects E447 million for EPAs implementation, Swazi Observer (Mbabane) 29 February 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016. http://www.observer.org.sz/business/79126-eu-injects-e447-million-for-epas-implementation.html

<sup>1137</sup> EU injects E447 million for EPAs implementation, Swazi Observer (Mbabane) 29 February 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016. http://www.observer.org.sz/business/79126-eu-injects-e447-million-for-epas-implementation.html

<sup>1138</sup> European Commission announces additional €10 million of support to Cuba, European Commission Press Release Database (Brussels) 11 March 2016. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://brussels.cta.int/index.php?option=com\_k2&id=12849:ec-additional-10-million-of-support-to-cuba&view=item&Itemid=54

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1129</sup> EIB backs KSh 12 billion of new private sector investment across East Africa, European Investment Bank (Luxembourg) 11 December 2015. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://www.eib.org/infocentre/press/releases/all/2015/2015-303-european-investment-bank-backs-ksh-12-billion-of-new-private-sector-investment-across-east-africa.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1130</sup> EIB backs KSh 12 billion of new private sector investment across East Africa, European Investment Bank (Luxembourg) 11 December 2015. Access Date: 11 March 2016.

http://www.eib.org/infocentre/press/releases/all/2015/2015-303-european-investment-bank-backs-ksh-12-billion-of-new-private-sector-investment-across-east-africa.htm

On 3 May 2016, the EU contributed EUR600,000 to the WTO's Trade Facilitation Agreement Facility (TFAF) to help developing countries and least-developed countries implement the Trade Facilitation Agreement, the WTO's first multilateral trade deal in 20 years. This contribution complements other EU programmes in support of the Trade Facilitation Agreement.<sup>1139</sup>

The EU has continued to provide support and investment to support mechanisms such as Aid for Trade in developing countries in need of capacity building assistance.

Thus, the European Union has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Angela Hou

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1139</sup> EU donates EUR 600,000 to Trade Facilitation Agreement Facility, WTO 3 May 2016. Access Date: 11 May 2016. https://www.wto.org/english/news\_e/pres16\_e/pr771\_e.htm

# 8. Development: Remittances

"Our G20 National Remittance Plans developed this year include concrete actions towards our commitment to reduce the global average cost of transferring remittances to five per cent with a view to align with the SDGs and Addis Ababa Action Agenda."

G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Argentina	-1		
Australia			+1
Brazil	-1		
Canada	-1		
China		0	
France	-1		
Germany	-1		
India		0	
Indonesia		0	
Italy		0	
Japan	-1		
Korea		0	
Mexico	-1		
Russia	-1		
Saudi Arabia	-1		
South Africa		0	
Turkey	-1		
United Kingdom		0	
United States		0	
European Union		0	
Average		-0.45	

## Assessment

# Background

Remittance payments are defined as transfers of money from migrant workers to individuals back in his or her home country. Remittance payments count as one of the largest forms of financial flows to developing countries, estimated to be at a sum of USD4.54 billion in 2015.<sup>1140</sup> In previous years global remittance payments have significantly exceeded global payments in official development assistance (ODA), such as in 2013 when remittance payments were three times larger than the annual ODA.<sup>1141</sup> Notably, remittances to and from G20 countries account for nearly 80 per cent of world's total remittance flows.<sup>1142</sup>

Although the transaction costs on remittance payments are falling, the global average cost remains high. The global average cost is calculated as the average total cost for sending USD200.<sup>1143</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1140</sup> Migration and Remittances: Recent Developments and Outlook, The World Bank (Washington) 6 October 2014. Access Date: 6 February 2015. https://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTPROSPECTS/Resources/334934-1288990760745/MigrationandDevelopmentBrief24.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1141</sup> Migration and Remittances: Recent Developments and Outlook, The World Bank (Washington) 6 October 2014. Access Date: 6 February 2015. https://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTPROSPECTS/Resources/334934-1288990760745/MigrationandDevelopmentBrief24.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1142</sup>G20 Plan to Facilitate Remittance Flows, Group of 20 November 2014. Access Date: 6 February 2015. http://www.international.gc.ca/g20/assets/pdfs/G20-PlantoFacilitateRemittanceFlows.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1143</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) January 2015. Access Date: 12 February 2015. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_january\_2015.pdf

According to the World Bank, in the last quarter of 2015, the global average cost of sending remittances was 7.37 per cent of the aggregate value sent.<sup>1144</sup> This is a decrease of from 7.99 per cent in Q4 2014 and 8.58 in Q4 2013.<sup>1145</sup>

During the same quarter, the cost of sending remittances from G20 countries was 7.46 per cent, a decrease from 7.99 per cent in Q4 2014 and 8.58 per cent in Q4 2013.<sup>1146</sup> The average cost of sending remittances to the G20 countries that are classified by the World Bank as receiving markets decreased from 8.86 per cent in Q4 2013, to 7.99 per cent in Q4 2014, and 7.10 per cent in Q4 2015.<sup>1147</sup>

The main factors driving remittance costs include migration costs, passport costs, exchange rates and the fees associated with sending remittances.<sup>1148</sup> However, with the increase in electronic and mobile remittance systems, transaction costs continue to fall.<sup>1149</sup> Though, these services are greatly limited in many regions of the world and furthermore come with a number of reliability and institutional problems.

More recently, concerns have surfaced regarding the impact that regulatory compliance has on the availability and cost of remittances. According to preliminary World Bank surveys, the sustainability of many Money-Transfer Operators (MTOs) has been threatened by de-risking on the part of banks. The survey on MTO account access reported that account closures have become more pronounced over the last couple years in some countries as banks fear increased scrutiny by supervisory authorities; the profitability of providing these services have fallen; and banks perceive MTOs as high risk since not all have a strong system of risk management.

Since the 2004 G8 Sea Island Summit, which created the Global Remittances Initiative in partnership with the World Bank, countries have begun taking measures to reduce the high average cost of remittance transactions.<sup>1150</sup>

The G20 has made several commitments throughout the years to reduce the global average costs of remittance payments. Beginning in 2010 at the Seoul Summit, G20 members agreed, through the Seoul Development Consensus for Shared Growth, to lower the average costs of remittance payments.<sup>1151</sup>At the Cannes Summit in 2011, the G20 members committed to "work to reduce the average cost of transferring remittances from 10 to 5 per cent by 2014, contributing to release an additional USD15 billion per year for recipient families."<sup>1152</sup>In 2012 at the Los Cabos Summit, these

www.g20.utoronto.ca/2010/g20seoul-consensus.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1144</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 10 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1145</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 10 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1146</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 10 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1147</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 10 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1148</sup> Migration and Remittances: Recent Developments and Outlook, The World Bank (Washington) 6 October 2014. Access Date: 6 February 2015. http://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTPROSPECTS/Resources/334934-

<sup>1288990760745/</sup>MigrationandDevelopmentBrief23.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1149</sup> Migration and Remittances: Recent Developments and Outlook, The World Bank (Washington) 6 October 2014. Access Date: 6 February 2015. https://siteresources.worldbank.org/INTPROSPECTS/Resources/334934-1288990760745/MigrationandDevelopmentBrief24.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1150</sup> Fact Sheet: Applying the Power of Entrepreneurship to the Eradication of Poverty, G8 Information Centre (Toronto) 9 June 2004. Access Date: 6 February 2015. http://www.g8.utoronto.ca/summit/2004seaisland/fact\_poverty.html <sup>1151</sup> Seoul Development Consensus for Shared Growth, 27 June 2010. Access Date: 6 February 2015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1152</sup> Cannes Summit Final Declaration – Building Our Common Future: Renewed Collective Action for the Benefit of All, 4 November 2011. Access Date: 6 February 2015. http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2011/2011-cannes-declaration-111104en.html

sentiments were reiterated alongside a request to the World Bank to report every six months on remittance cost progress.<sup>1153</sup>

In 2013 at the St. Petersburg Summit, the G20 members pledged to "consider in 2014 innovative results-based mechanisms to further reduce the cost of transferring remittances to developing countries."<sup>1154</sup>

At the 2014 G20 Summit in Brisbane, G20 members stated their commitment to "take strong practical measures to reduce the global average cost of transferring remittances to 5 per cent and to enhance financial inclusion as a priority."<sup>1155</sup>

In July 2015, at the United Nation (UN) Third International Conference on Financing for Development, countries agreed on the Addis Ababa Action Agenda, a foundation for implementing the Sustainable Development Goals. This agreement included a commitment "work to ensure that no remittance corridor requires charges higher than 5 per cent by 2030, mindful of the need to maintain adequate service coverage, especially for those most in need."<sup>1156</sup>

In September 2015, the UN Development Summit adopted the final document on the Sustainable Development Goals, "Transforming our world: the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development." These goals include an aim to "reduce to less than 3 per cent the transaction costs of migrant remittances and eliminate remittance corridors with costs higher than 5 per cent" by 2030.<sup>1157</sup>

These developments were taken into account at the 2015 G20 Summit in Antalya, where leaders committed "to reduce the global average cost of transferring remittances to 5 per cent with a view to align with the SDGs and Addis Ababa Action Agenda."<sup>1158</sup>

Notably, global average costs have dropped over 1 per cent, from 9.02 per cent in Q1 2011, to 7.37 per cent in the last quarter of 2015.<sup>1159</sup>

# **Commitment Features**

G20 members have made significant progress in reducing remittance costs and are recommitting to a 5 per cent reduction target. Members realize that remittance payments play an integral role in long-term social and economic development and financial inclusion. Accordingly, they have committed to, both domestically and internationally, take strong practical measures to meet their targets.

Both the G20 Development Working Group and the G20 Global Partnership for Financial Inclusion vis-à- vis the Financial Inclusion Action Plan have proposed a number of recommendations to the G20 Plan to Facilitate Remittance Flows on how to take strong practical measures. Collectively, these groups seek innovative methods and networks to improve their current policies.

content/uploads/sites/2/2015/07/Addis-Ababa-Action-Agenda-Draft-Outcome-Document-7-July-2015.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1153</sup> 2012 Progress Report of the Development Working Group, 19 June 2012. Access Date: 6 February 2015. http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2012/2012-0619-dwg.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1154</sup>G20 Research Group: Final 2013 St. Petersburg G20 Final Compliance Report, 15 November 2014. Access Date: 6 February 2014. http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/compliance/2013stpetersburg-final/index.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1155</sup>G20 Leaders' Communique, G20 Research Group (Toronto) 16 November 2014. Access Date: 10 February 2016. http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/2014/2014-1116-communique.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1156</sup> The Addis Ababa Action Agenda of the Third International Conference on Financing for Development, United Nations (Geneva) 7 July 2015. Access Date: 10 February 2015. http://www.un.org/esa/ffd/ffd3/wp-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1157</sup> Sustainable Development Goals, United Nations (Geneva) Access Date: 10 February 2016. https://sustainabledevelopment.un.org/?menu=1300

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1158</sup> The 2015 G20 Antalya Summit Commitments, G20 Research Group (Toronto) 19 November 2015. Access Date: 10 February 2016. http://www.g20.utoronto.ca/analysis/commitments-15-antalya.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1159</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 10 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

Accordingly, the G20 Plan to Facilitate Remittance Flows outlines, in their Country Plans for Reducing Remittance Transfer Costs, a number of methods in which countries can take to meet their reduction target. It proposes four "strong practical measures" for reducing remittance costs and increasing access to affordable remittances.

- 10.1. "Increase remittance market competitiveness" by means of facilitating the entrance of more retail payment systems (RPSs) and improving the supervision of RPSs in order to undermine anti-competitive practices.<sup>1160</sup>
- 10.2. "Improve financial system infrastructure and technology" by supporting the innovation and widespread usage of these new RSP technology.<sup>1161</sup>
- 10.3. "Improve transparency and consumer protection of remittance transfers." This can be done by boosting transparency of RSPs, bulwarking consumer legal protection, and increasing RSP regulation."<sup>1162</sup>
- 10.4. "Improving financial inclusion and development impact of remittances." This can be done by enhancing the financial literacy of consumers, offering remittance price databases for customers to compare costs, and discouraging taxes on migrant remittance transfers.<sup>1163</sup>

These four methods proposed in the Country Plans for Reducing Remittance Transfer Costs outline the various methods of compliance for G20 members to take.

As remittances to and from G20 members account for nearly 80 per cent of the world's total remittance flows, this report will also highlight the current costs of remittance in each G20 member.<sup>1164</sup> Remittance transaction prices however, can increase or decrease for a variety of factors. For this reason, compliance evaluations will only be based on whether countries take action on the above measures. Full compliance will awarded to members that take action on all four measures outlined above to enhance access to affordable remittances.

## **Scoring Guidelines**

0 Member takes some measures to enhance access to more affordable remittances.	nhance access to more affordable remittances.	-1
	access to more affordable remittances.	0
+1 Member takes all measures to enhance access to more affordable remittances.	cess to more affordable remittances.	+1

Lead Analyst: Natalia Valencia

# Argentina: -1

Argentina has failed to comply with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

http://www.international.gc.ca/g20/assets/pdfs/G20-PlantoFacilitateRemittanceFlows.pdf <sup>1164</sup>G20 Plan to Facilitate Remittance Flows, Group of 20 November 2014. Access Date: 6 February 2015.

http://www.international.gc.ca/g20/assets/pdfs/G20-PlantoFacilitateRemittanceFlows.pdf

# G20 Research Group: 2015 G20 Antalya Summit Interim Compliance Report, 17 July 2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1160</sup>G20 Plan to Facilitate Remittance Flows, Group of 20 November 2014. Access Date: 6 February 2015. http://www.international.gc.ca/g20/assets/pdfs/G20-PlantoFacilitateRemittanceFlows.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1161</sup>G20 Plan to Facilitate Remittance Flows, Group of 20 November 2014. Access Date: 6 February 2015. http://www.international.gc.ca/g20/assets/pdfs/G20-PlantoFacilitateRemittanceFlows.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1162</sup>G20 Plan to Facilitate Remittance Flows, Group of 20 November 2014. Access Date: 6 February 2015.

http://www.international.gc.ca/g20/assets/pdfs/G20-PlantoFacilitateRemittanceFlows.pdf <sup>1163</sup>G20 Plan to Facilitate Remittance Flows, Group of 20 November 2014. Access Date: 6 February 2015.

The Government of Argentina has not released any information about the current cost of remittances. According to World Bank estimates, the average cost of remittances in Latin America was 6.04 per cent in Q4 2015, down from 6.29 per cent in Q3 2015 and 6.78 per cent in Q2 2015.<sup>1165</sup>

On 17 December 2015, currency controls in Argentina were lifted and the peso was floated resulting in a one day loss of one quarter of the peso's value.<sup>1166</sup> The removal of foreign exchange restrictions should decrease the cost of sending remittances.

On 22 December 2015, Western Union imposed a USD150 limit on remittance transfers in response to the weakened peso.<sup>1167</sup> The value of the peso has declined so rapidly that it has been almost impossible to sell the currency to exchanges at proper value. The previous limit was USD2000.<sup>1168</sup>

Argentina has not taken any actions to enhance access to affordable remittances or decrease the average cost of remittance.

Thus, Argentina has received a score of -1.

Analysts: George Mason

## Australia: +1

Australia has fully complied with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

On 17 November 2015, the Development Policy Centre concluded that in spite of the fact that lowering money transfer costs has been a long-held objective of the Australian government, there has been no progress on reducing the cost of sending remittances from Australia.<sup>1169</sup>

On 15 December 2015, two Western Union affiliates providing remittance transfer services were suspended, making the transfer of remittances more difficult.<sup>1170</sup> On 12 January 2016, Australian Transaction Reports and Analysis Centre (AUSTRAC) announced that Estefa Milka Honores, an independent remittance provider was re-registered, after their adoption of an AML/CTF-compliant program.<sup>1171</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1165</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1166</sup> Argentina's Peso Sinks After Currency Controls Lifted, The Wall Street Journal (New York) 17 December 2015. Access February 23 2016. http://www.wsj.com/articles/argentinas-peso-depreciates-sharply-after-currency-controlslifted-1450365003

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1167</sup> Argentine Peso Devaluation Imposes Remittance Limits- Perfect Opportunity For Bitcoin, The Merkle 22 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://themerkle.com/news/argentine-peso-devaluation-imposes-remittancelimits-perfect-opportunity-for-bitcoin/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1168</sup> Argentine Peso Devaluation Imposes Remittance Limits- Perfect Opportunity For Bitcoin, The Merkle 22 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://themerkle.com/news/argentine-peso-devaluation-imposes-remittancelimits-perfect-opportunity-for-bitcoin/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1169</sup> The Persistently High Cost of Pacific Remittances, The Development Policy Centre 17 November 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://devpolicy.org/the-persistently-high-cost-of-pacific-remittances-20151117/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1170</sup> Two Remitters Have Had Registration Suspended, Australian Transaction Reports and Analysis Centre (West Chatswood) 12 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2015. http://www.austrac.gov.au/news/two-remitters-have-had-registration-suspended

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1171</sup> Remitter re-registered with conditions, Australian Transaction Reports and Analysis Centre (West Chatswood) 12 January 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://www.austrac.gov.au/news/remitter-re-registered-conditions

On 6 January 2016, the Attorney General's Department released the outcome of the Working Group on Remittance Account Closures.<sup>1172</sup> The working group was formed following 2014 reports that financial institutions, in particular banks, were closing or declining to open bank accounts for registered non-bank remittance service providers.<sup>1173</sup> The working group agreed on several outcomes, including a government review of the Anti-Money Laundering and Counter-Terrorism Financing Act to re-evaluate the registration process for remittance providers.<sup>1174</sup>

On 22 March 2016, the Australian Taxation Office released a dataset detailing tax data for large Australian-owned private companies in order to facilitate corporate tax transparency.<sup>1175</sup>

On 1-3 March 2016, the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD), of which Australia is a part, hosted the Task Force on Tax and Development and the Global Forum on Transfer Pricing. The events addressed a new inclusive framework for developing-country participation in the Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) plan, and the Tax Inspectors Without Borders capacity-building initiative, in addition to the impact of revisions to OECD Transfer Pricing Guidelines.<sup>1176</sup>

On 22 March 2016, the OECD, of which Australia is a part, released its standardized electronic format for the exchange of country-by-country reports between jurisdictions.<sup>1177</sup>

Table 8 outlines the average cost of sending remittances in Australia.<sup>1178</sup>

#### **Table 8: Remittances Costs in Australia**

Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015
8.97 per cent	9.22 per cent	9.24 per cent	9.60 per cent

Australia has taken measures to reduce the average cost of remittances and enhance affordable access to remittances.

Thus, Australia has received a score of +1.

Analyst: George Mason

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1172</sup> Working Group on Remittance Account Closures Outcomes Statement, Attorney-General's Department (Barton) 6 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

https://www.ag.gov.au/CrimeAndCorruption/AntiLaunderingCounterTerrorismFinancing/Documents/FCS-Outcomesreport-Working-Group-on-Remittance-Account-Closures-Nov-2015.pdf <sup>1173</sup> Working Group on Remittance Account Closures Outcomes Statement, Attorney-General's Department (Barton) 6

January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

https://www.ag.gov.au/CrimeAndCorruption/AntiLaunderingCounterTerrorismFinancing/Documents/FCS-Outcomesreport-Working-Group-on-Remittance-Account-Closures-Nov-2015.pdf <sup>1174</sup> Working Group on Remittance Account Closures Outcomes Statement, Attorney-General's Department (Barton) 6

January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

https://www.ag.gov.au/CrimeAndCorruption/AntiLaunderingCounterTerrorismFinancing/Documents/FCS-Outcomesreport-Working-Group-on-Remittance-Account-Closures-Nov-2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1175</sup> Australian Taxation Office launches mandatory public reporting of large Australian-owned private companies tax data, 22 March 2016. Ernst and Young Global Tax Alert. Accessed 22 April 2016

http://www.ev.com/GL/en/Services/Tax/International-Tax/Alert--Australian-Taxation-Office-launches-mandatorypublic-reporting-of-large-Australian-owned-private-companies-tax-data

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1176</sup> Developed and Developing countries gather at OECD to deepen their engagement to implement BEPS package, 4 March 2016. Accessed 25 April 2016. http://www.oecd.org/tax/tax-global/developed-and-developing-countries-gatherat-oecd-to-deepen-their-engagement-to-implement-beps-package.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1177</sup> OECD releases standardised electronic format for the exchange of BEPS Country-by-Country Reports, 22 March 2016. Accessed 25 April 2016. http://www.oecd.org/tax/oecd-releases-standardised-electronic-format-for-theexchange-of-beps-country-by-country-reports.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1178</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw report december 2015.pdf

# Brazil: -1

Brazil has failed to comply with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

No evidence was found suggesting that Brazil has taken measures to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

Table 9 outlines the average costs of sending remittances in Brazil.<sup>1179</sup>

#### Table 9: Remittance costs in Brazil

Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015
5.02 per cent	5.72 per cent	7.40 per cent	6.81 per cent

Despite the slight drop in the cost of remittances, Brazil has not taken any actions to enhance access to affordable remittances or decrease the average cost of remittances.

Thus, Brazil has received a score of -1.

## Analyst: George Mason

# Canada: –1

Canada has failed to comply with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

On 21 April 2015, the Canadian federal budget announced that the Government of Canada would provide CAD6 million over five years, starting in 2015-16, to introduce measures to help ensure that Canadians will have access to lower cost remittance services.<sup>1180</sup>

As of 22 February 2016, the Government of Canada has not publicized more information on this budget proposal. The new Canadian federal budget is expected to be released on 22 March 2016.<sup>1181</sup>

Table 10 outlines the costs of sending remittances in Canada.<sup>1182</sup>

## Table 10: Remittance Costs in Canada

Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015	
9.34 per cent	9.31 per cent	9.08 per cent	8.05 per cent	

Canada has not taken any actions to enhance access to affordable remittances or decrease the average cost of remittances.

Thus, Canada has received a score of -1.

## Analyst: Sarah Bear

# China: 0

China has partially complied with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1179</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1180</sup> Press release: National Remittance Plan 2015: Canada, 2015 Turkey G20 November 2015. Access date: 19 February 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Canada.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1181</sup> Deficit has soared ahead of March 22 budget, Bill Morneau says, CBC News 22 February 22. Access date: 22 February 2016. http://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/morneau-fiscal-update-deficit-budget-1.3458207

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1182</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

On 17 December 2015, the Postal Savings Bank of China published an online article with information explaining how to send and receive remittances using Western Union.<sup>1183</sup>

Table 6 outlines the costs of sending remittances in China.<sup>1184</sup>

## Table 6: Remittance Costs in China

Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015
10.54 per cent	10.38 per cent	10.18 per cent	9.72 per cent

China has taken some measures to reduce the average cost of remittances and enhance affordable access to remittances.

Thus, China has received a score of 0.

Analysts: Richard Turcsanyi

## France: -1

France has failed to comply with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

No evidence was found suggesting that France has taken measures to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

Table 11 outlines the costs of sending remittances in France.<sup>1185</sup>

## Table 11: Remittance Costs in France

Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015
7.45 per cent	7.22 per cent	7.56 per cent	6.91 per cent

France has not taken any measures to enhance access to more affordable remittances and reduce the average cost of remittances.

Thus, France has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Sarah Bear

## Germany: -1

Germany has failed to comply with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

No evidence was found suggesting that Germany has taken measures to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

Table 8 outlines the costs of sending remittances in Germany.<sup>1186</sup>

## Table 8: Remittance Costs in Germany

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1183</sup> Western Union Money Transfer, Postal Savings Bank of China 17 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.psbc.com/portal/zh\_CN/ForeignExchange/ForeignExchangeServices/crossRemit/8019.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1184</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1185</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1186</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015	
7.43 per cent	7.48 per cent	7.32 per cent	7.64 per cent	

Germany has not taken any actions to enhance access to affordable remittances or decrease the average cost of remittances.

Thus, Germany has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Richard Turcsanyi

## India: 0

India has partially complied with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

On 22 December 2015, the State Bank of India (SBI) announced the launch of the mobile application "State Bank Samadhaan" which will be available on the Google Play Store for mobile devices.<sup>1187</sup> The application will provide information about deposits, advances, Internet banking, mobile banking, equated monthly installment calculation, SBI Branch and Automatic Teller Machine Locations, SBI holidays and give direct access to various other mobile apps such as SBI Freedom, SBI Anywhere, SBI Buddy and SBI Quick.<sup>1188</sup>

On 22 December 2015, the Reserve Bank of India (RBI) announced the "Payment System Innovation Awards" program.<sup>1189</sup> Through the RBI's subsidiary, the Institute for Development and Research in Banking Technology, they have created a contest to encourage innovation in the fields of payment security including fraud prevention, customer convenience and cost reduction, mobile payments, acceptance/electronic payment infrastructure and the usage of emerging technologies for payments.<sup>1190</sup>

Table 12 outlines the average receiving cost of remittances in India.<sup>1191</sup>

## Table 12: Remittance Costs in India

Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015
6.78 per cent	6.88 per cent	6.50 per cent	6.00 per cent

India has taken some measures to reduce the average cost of remittances and enhance affordable access to remittances.

Thus, India has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Thomas Kariunas

https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

# G20 Research Group: 2015 G20 Antalya Summit Interim Compliance Report, 17 July 2016

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1187</sup> SBI Launches "State Bank Samadhaan"- A Self Service Mobile App, State Bank of India (Mumbai) 22 December
 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.sbi.co.in/portal/documents/44978/156388/Press+Release SBI-launches+State+Bank+Samadhaan-A+self+Service+Mobile+App.pdf/c6df66f8-9f03-4e4d-a8fb-94d54f182c78
 <sup>1188</sup> SBI Launches "State Bank Samadhaan"- A Self Service Mobile App, State Bank of India (Mumbai) 22 December
 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.sbi.co.in/portal/documents/44978/156388/Press+Release 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.sbi.co.in/portal/documents/44978/156388/Press+Release SBI+launches+State+Bank+Samadhaan-A+self+Service+Mobile+App.pdf/c6df66f8-9f03-4e4d-a8fb-94d54f182c78

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1189</sup> To encourage innovations, RBI institutes "Payment System Innovation Awards", Reserve Bank of India (Mumbai) 22 December 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. https://rbi.org.in/Scripts/BS PressReleaseDisplay.aspx?prid=35786

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1190</sup> To encourage innovations, RBI institutes "Payment System Innovation Awards", Reserve Bank of India (Mumbai) 22
 December 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. https://rbi.org.in/Scripts/BS\_PressReleaseDisplay.aspx?prid=35786
 <sup>1191</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016.

## Indonesia: 0

Indonesia has partially complied with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

On 14 December 2015, Bank Indonesia, Indonesia's central bank, reaffirmed its commitment to the delayed master plan for an integrated payment system, the National Payment Gateway (NPG), which aims to reduce cash transactions and boost efficiency.<sup>1192</sup> The NPG will would serve to streamline the payment and transfer process among the different banks in Indonesia, especially with regards to e-commerce.<sup>1193</sup>

On 17 November 2015, state-owned Bank Mandiri announced that it had entered into a collaboration with a Korean payment company with the aim of refining its payment and financial settlement systems.<sup>1194</sup> Bank Mandiri also said that they planned to improve the quality of their cellular service that allows for small transfers of funds by way of cell phone number.<sup>1195</sup> In the long term, Bank Mandiri hopes that the joint venture will allow other banks to use its payment and settlement services.<sup>1196</sup>

Table 13 outlines the average receiving cost of remittances in Indonesia.<sup>1197</sup>

## Table 13: Remittance Costs in Indonesia

Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015
6.74 per cent	6.69 per cent	6.90 per cent	6.77 per cent

Indonesia has taken some measures to reduce the average cost of remittances and enhance affordable access to remittances.

Thus, Indonesia has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Thomas Kariunas

# Italy: 0

Italy has partially complied with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

On 16 January 2016, Italy entered the revised EU Directive on Payment Services (PSD2) in the internal market entered into force.<sup>1198</sup> The directive is intended to stimulate "the development of an efficient, secure and competitive retail payments market by enhancing payment service users'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1192</sup> BI working on integrated national payment system, Jakarta Post (Jakarta) 14 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2015/12/14/bi-working-integrated-national-payment-system.html

system.html <sup>1193</sup> BI working on integrated national payment system, Jakarta Post (Jakarta) 14 December 2015. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2015/12/14/bi-working-integrated-national-paymentsystem.html

system.html <sup>1194</sup> Mandiri to team up with South Korean Payment firm, Jakarta Post (Jakarta) 17 November 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2015/11/17/mandiri-team-with-south-korean-paymentfirm.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1195</sup> Mandiri to team up with South Korean Payment firm, Jakarta Post (Jakarta) 17 November 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2015/11/17/mandiri-team-with-south-korean-paymentfirm.html

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1196</sup> Mandiri to team up with South Korean Payment firm, Jakarta Post (Jakarta) 17 November 2015. Access Date: 13
 March 2016. http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2015/11/17/mandiri-team-with-south-korean-payment-firm.html
 <sup>1197</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016.

https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1198</sup> EU Directive on Payment Services in the Internal Market (PSD2) Enters into Force, Banca D'Italia 13 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. https://www.bancaditalia.it/media/notizia/eu-directive-on-payment-services-in-theinternal-market-psd2-enters-into-force

protection, promoting innovation and improving the level of security of electronic payments," contributing to the advocacy for harmonization of different regulatory standards.<sup>1199</sup>

Table 14 outlines the average cost of sending remittances from Italy.<sup>1200</sup>

	•		
Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015
6.49 per cent	6.49 per cent	6.05 per cent	6.02 per cent

#### Table 14: Remittance Costs in Italy

Italy has taken some measures to reduce the average cost of remittances and enhance affordable access to remittances; however, it has not met all the required measures.

Thus, Italy has received a compliance score of 0.

Analyst: Reema Gill

## Japan: -1

Japan has failed to comply with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

No evidence was found suggesting that Japan has taken measures to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

Table 15 outlines the average cost of sending remittances from Japan.<sup>1201</sup>

#### Table 15: Remittance Costs in Japan

Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015
13.43 per cent	13.55 per cent	12.97 per cent	11.95 per cent

Japan has not taken any actions to enhance access to affordable remittances or decrease the average cost of remittances.

Thus, Japan has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Reema Gill

#### Korea: 0

Korea has partially complied with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

On 10 December 2015, the Ministry of Strategy and Finance announced new enforcement ordinances and regulations of the Foreign Exchange Transaction Act to permit foreign currency exchanges for non-bank financial institutions, effective February 2016.<sup>1202</sup> Foreign currency transfers

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1199</sup> EU Directive on Payment Services in the Internal Market (PSD2) Enters into Force, Banca D'Italia 13 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. https://www.bancaditalia.it/media/notizia/eu-directive-on-payment-services-in-theinternal-market-psd2-enters-into-force

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1200</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1201</sup>Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1202</sup> Mobile Messenger-based Foreign Currency Remittances to be Available Next Year, Business Korea (Seoul) 11 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.businesskorea.co.kr/english/news/money/13272-mobilemessenger-remittances-mobile-messenger-based-foreign-currency-remittances-be

were previously available only at banks. The size of a remittance will be limited to USD3,000 per case and USD20,000 per person.<sup>1203</sup>

Table 16 outlines the average cost of sending remittances from Korea.<sup>1204</sup>

Table 10. Remittance Costs in Kolea						
Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015			
6.19 per cent	6.09 per cent	5.43 per cent	5.54 per cent			

# Table 16: Remittance Costs in Korea

Korea has taken some measures to reduce the average cost of remittances and enhance affordable access to remittances.

Thus, Korea has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Alison Dillman

#### Mexico: -1

Mexico has failed to comply with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

No evidence was found suggesting that Mexico has taken measures to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

Table 17 outlines the average receiving cost of remittances in Mexico.<sup>1205</sup>

#### Table 17: Remittance Costs in Mexico

Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015
4.62 per cent	5.30 per cent	5.59 per cent	4.75 per cent

Mexico has not taken any actions to enhance access to affordable remittances or decrease the average cost of remittances.

Thus, Mexico has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Alison Dillman

## Russia: –1

Russia has failed to comply with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

No evidence was found suggesting that Russia has taken measures to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

Table 18 outlines the average cost of sending remittances in Russia.<sup>1206</sup>

```
<sup>1206</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016.
https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw_report_december_2015.pdf
```

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1203</sup>Mobile Messenger-based Foreign Currency Remittances to be Available Next Year, Business Korea (Seoul) 11 December 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.businesskorea.co.kr/english/news/money/13272-mobilemessenger-remittances-mobile-messenger-based-foreign-currency-remittances-be

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1204</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1205</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

#### Table 18: Remittance Costs in Russia

Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015
2.82 per cent	2.51 per cent	1.92 per cent	1.95 per cent

Russia has not taken any actions to enhance access to affordable remittances or decrease the average cost of remittances.

Thus, Russia has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Bushra Ebadi

## Saudi Arabia: –1

Saudi Arabia has failed to comply with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

No evidence was found suggesting that Saudi Arabia has taken measures to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

Table 19 outlines the average costs of sending remittances from Saudi Arabia in 2015.<sup>1207</sup>

## Table 19: Remittance Costs in Saudi Arabia

Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015	
4.68 per cent	4.06 per cent	4.13 per cent	5.05 per cent	

Saudi Arabia has not taken any actions to enhance access to affordable remittances or decrease the average cost of remittances.

Thus, Saudi Arabia has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Reema Gill

# South Africa: 0

South Africa has partially complied with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

On December 2015, the South African Reserve Bank (SARB) updated the list of Authorized Dealers in foreign exchange with limited authority.<sup>1208</sup> Categories two and three of Authorised Dealer with Limited Authority (ADLA) involve remittance payments.<sup>1209</sup> The SARB increased licenses to ADLAs to "help foster competition and thereby reduce the costs of remittances in South Africa."<sup>1210</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1207</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1208</sup> Authorized Dealers in foreign exchange with limited authority, South African Reserve Bank (Pretoria) December 2015. Access Date: 24 February 2016.

https://www.resbank.co.za/RegulationAndSupervision/FinancialSurveillanceAndExchangeControl/ExconAdmin/Docume nts/Authorised%20Dealers%20in%20foreign%20exchange%20with%20limited%20authority.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1209</sup> Terms and conditions for the submission of an application for authorisation to conduct the business of an Authorised Dealer in foreign exchange with limited authority, South African Reserve Bank (Pretoria) October 2014. Access Date: 24 February 2016.

https://www.resbank.co.za/RegulationAndSupervision/FinancialSurveillanceAndExchangeControl/Guidelines/Guideline s%20and%20public%20awareness/ADLA%20guidelines%20October%202014.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1210</sup> National remittance plan 2015 South Africa, G20 National Remittance Plans (Antalya) November 2015. Access Date: 21 February 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/SouthAfrica.pdf

On 25-29 January 2016, the SARB hosted a five day seminar on "Cross-Border Banking Supervision in Africa."<sup>1211</sup> The seminar, co-organized by Making Finance Work for Africa Partnership (MFW4A) and the Association of the African Central Banks (AACB), aimed to train senior officials from 22 African central banks in leadership skills and a practical approach to the surveillance of cross-border banking.<sup>1212</sup>

On 18 February 2016, the SARB and Barclays Africa hosted the G30 forum on Banking Conduct and Culture.<sup>1213</sup> In his opening speech, Mr. Daniel Mminele, deputy governor of the SARB, stressed the importance of bank transparency and financial literacy.<sup>1214</sup>

Table 20 outlines the average cost of sending remittances to South Africa.<sup>1215</sup>

## Table 20: Remittance Costs in South Africa

Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015
18.00 per cent	16.79 per cent	15.19 per cent	16.59 per cent

South Africa has taken some measures to reduce the average cost of remittances and enhance affordable access to remittances.

Thus, South Africa has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Alejandra Bellatin

# Turkey: -1

Turkey has failed to comply with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

No evidence was found suggesting that Turkey has taken measures to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

Table 21 outlines the average cost of receiving remittances in Turkey.<sup>1216</sup>

## Table 21: Remittance Costs in Turkey

Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015	
6.72 per cent	6.79 per cent	6.95 per cent	6.89 per cent	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1211</sup> Making Finance Work for Africa and the Association of African Central Banks Organize a Training Seminar on Cross-Border Banking Supervision in Africa, Making Finance Work for Africa (Cape Town) January 2016. Access Date: 23 February. https://www.mfw4a.org/news/news-details/article/7/south-africa-making-finance-work-for-africa-and-theassociation-of-african-central-banks-organize-a.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1212</sup> Making Finance Work for Africa and the Association of African Central Banks Organize a Training Seminar on Cross-Border Banking Supervision in Africa, Making Finance Work for Africa (Cape Town) January 2016. Access Date: 23 February. https://www.mfw4a.org/news/news-details/article/7/south-africa-making-finance-work-for-africa-and-theassociation-of-african-central-banks-organize-a.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1213</sup> Forum for Banking Conduct and Culture, South African Reserve Bank (Pretoria) February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. https://www.resbank.co.za/Publications/Detail-Item-

View/Pages/Publications.aspx?sarbweb=3b6aa07d-92ab-441f-b7bf-bb7dfb1bedb4&sarblist=21b5222e-7125-4e55-bb65-56fd3333371e&sarbitem=7172

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1214</sup> Deputy Governor Daniel Mminele: G-30 Forum on Banking Conduct and Culture, South African Reserve Bank (Pretoria) February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016.

https://www.resbank.co.za/Lists/Speeches/Attachments/463/DG%20Mminele%20G30%20Forum%2018%20Feb%2020 16.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1215</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1216</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

Turkey has not taken any actions to enhance access to affordable remittances or decrease the average cost of remittances.

Thus, Turkey has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Bushra Ebadi

## United Kingdom: 0

The United Kingdom has partially complied with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

On 23 February 2016, International Development Minister Nick Hurd announced a mobile technology partnership with Groupe Speciale Mobile Association GSMA, the organization that represents mobile operators worldwide.<sup>1217</sup> The project, which is funded by the UK's Department for International Development, has several aims, including rolling out new technologies that will help women obtain financial services.

Table 22 outlines the average cost of sending remittances from the UK.<sup>1218</sup>

## Table 22: Remittance Costs in the United Kingdom

Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015
7.49 per cent	7.20 per cent	7.41 per cent	7.25 per cent

The UK has taken some measures to reduce the average cost of remittances and enhance affordable access to remittances.

Thus, the United Kingdom has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Shruti Anandan

## **United States: 0**

The United States has partially complied with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

On 2 February 2016, the US Faster Payments Task force, a group established by the US Federal Reserve, released their report with recommendations for improving the speed, safety and efficiency of the US payment system.<sup>1219</sup> The task force identified thirty-six effectiveness criteria, which fall under six categories: ubiquity, efficiency, safety and security, speed, legal and governance.<sup>1220</sup>

Table 23 outlines the average cost of sending remittances from the United States.<sup>1221</sup>

#### Table 23: Remittance costs in the United States

Q1 2015	Q2 2015	Q3 2015	Q4 2015	
5.92 per cent	6.30 per cent	6.04 per cent	5.93 per cent	

 <sup>1217</sup> UK and GSMA partner on mobile technology to fight global poverty, Department for International Development (London) 23 February 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://www.gsma.com/newsroom/press-release/uk-and-gsma-partner-on-mobile-technology-to-fight-global-poverty/
 <sup>1218</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016.

<sup>1218</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

<sup>1219</sup> A Year of Progress: Celebrating the Anniversary of Strategies for Improving the U.S. Payment System, Faster Payments Task Force, 2 February 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016. https://fedpaymentsimprovement.org/

<sup>1220</sup> A Year of Progress: Celebrating the Anniversary of Strategies for Improving the U.S. Payment System, Faster Payments Task Force, 2 February 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016. https://fedpaymentsimprovement.org/

<sup>1221</sup> Remittance Prices Worldwide, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 20 February 2016. https://remittanceprices.worldbank.org/sites/default/files/rpw\_report\_december\_2015.pdf

## G20 Research Group: 2015 G20 Antalya Summit Interim Compliance Report, 17 July 2016

The US has taken some measures to reduce the average cost of remittances and enhance affordable access to remittances.

Thus, the United States has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Shruti Anandan

## **European Union: 0**

The European Union has partially complied with its commitment to reduce the average cost of remittances and increase access to affordable remittances.

Notably, the average remittance cost per cent age could not be calculated because average remittance costs vary across EU members.

On 9 December 2015, the EU and the World Bank hosted the Conference on Migration and the Global Development Agenda.<sup>1222</sup> The topic of the fifth session was "Leveraging remittances and diaspora resources for financing development."<sup>1223</sup> The three subtopics were: "Diaspora bonds," "Financial inclusion and the use of new technologies" and "Reducing remittance costs."<sup>1224</sup>

On 12 January 2016, the EU's revised Payment Services Directive was entered into force.<sup>1225</sup> The new law, which was first proposed by the European Commission in 2013, enhances consumer protection, promotes innovation and improves the security of payment services. Member states have two years to transpose the PSD2 into their national laws.<sup>1226</sup>

On 26-29 January 2016, the European Commission and the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD) launched a training seminar "to facilitate the use of remittance services in rural areas of Africa."<sup>1227</sup> Representative of postal banks came from Benin, Ghana, Madagascar, Senegal and Tanzania.<sup>1228</sup>

On February 2016, the EU investigated Western Union (WU) for alleged anti-competitive behaviour in the money transfer market.<sup>1229</sup> The preliminary antitrust inquiry centers on claims that WU closed accounts of money-transfer operators.<sup>1230</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1222</sup> EU-WB Conference on Migration and the Global Development Agenda, The World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.worldbank.org/en/events/2015/12/09/conference-on-migrationand-the-global-development-agenda

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1223</sup> The EU Presidency of Luxembourg and the World Bank cordially invite you to a conference on Migration and the Global Development Agenda, Blogs World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Date of Access: 24 February 2016. http://blogs.worldbank.org/peoplemove/files/wb-lu migration and development conference december 9 1.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1224</sup> The EU Presidency of Luxembourg and the World Bank cordially invite you to a conference on Migration and the Global Development Agenda, Blogs World Bank (Washington) December 2015. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://blogs.worldbank.org/peoplemove/files/wb-lu migration and development conference\_december\_9\_1.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1225</sup> PSD2 published in OJ, Regulation Tomorrow (London) 4 January 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://www.regulationtomorrow.com/eu/psd2-published-in-oj/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1226</sup> European Parliament adopts European Commission proposal to create safer and more innovative European payments, European Commission (Brussels) 8 October 2015. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://europa.eu/rapid/press-release\_IP-15-5792\_en.htm?locale=en

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1227</sup> African Postal Banks explore Remittances, WSBI and ESBG (Brussels) February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.savings-banks.com/press/latest-news/Pages/African-Postal-Banks-explore-remittances.aspx <sup>1228</sup> African Postal Banks explore Remittances, WSBI and ESBG (Brussels) February 2016. Access Date: 23 February

<sup>2016.</sup> http://www.savings-banks.com/press/latest-news/Pages/African-Postal-Banks-explore-remittances.aspx <sup>1229</sup> Western Union Under Watch As EU Eyes Money Transfer Market, PYMNTS.com February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.pymnts.com/news/security-and-risk/2016/western-union-under-watch-as-eu-eyes-moneytransfer-market

Thus, the European Union has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Alejandra Bellatin

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1230</sup>Cash-Transfer Market Probed as Western Union Quizzed by EU, Bloomberg February 2016. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://www.bloomberg.com/news/articles/2016-02-23/western-union-questioned-by-eu-in-moneytransfer-antitrust-probe

# 9. Development: Tax

"We support the efforts for strengthening developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda."

G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Argentina		0	
Australia			+1
Brazil		0	
Canada			+1
China			+1
France			+1
Germany			+1
India			+1
Indonesia		0	
Italy			+1
Japan		0	
Korea		0	
Mexico		0	
Russia		0	
Saudi Arabia		0	
South Africa			+1
Turkey			+1
United Kingdom			+1
United States			+1
European Union			+1
Average		+0.60	

# Assessment

# Background

Following the 2008 financial crisis, the G20 recognized that narrowing the development gap and reducing poverty were essential to fulfilling its core objective of strong, sustainable and balanced growth.<sup>1231</sup>

During the 2010 Seoul Summit, the G20 launched its development agenda with the Multi-Year Action Plan on Development (MYAP).<sup>1232</sup> The MYAP established nine pillars in which G20 actions were identified as necessary to resolving the largest obstacles to inclusive, sustainable and resilient growth in developing countries. The eighth pillar, domestic resource mobilization, stressed the importance of strengthening "tax regimes and fiscal policies in developing countries to provide a sustainable revenue base for inclusive growth and social equity, as well as to enhance the transparency and accountability of public finances."<sup>1233</sup> As a framework for fulfilling the eighth pillar, the MYAP

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1231</sup> About group, G20 Development Working Group Information Exchange Facility. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://www.g20dwg.org

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1232</sup> Annex 2: Multi-Year Action Plan on Development, The Seoul Summit Document (Seoul) 12 November 2010. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://www.g20dwg.org/documents/pdf/view/323/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1233</sup> Annex 2: Multi-Year Action Plan on Development, The Seoul Summit Document (Seoul) 12 November 2010. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://www.g20dwg.org/documents/pdf/view/323/

recommended two actions: support the development of more effective tax systems and support work to prevent erosion of domestic task revenues. $^{1234}$ 

The Action Plan calls for the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) Task Force on Tax and Development, United Nations, International Monetary Fund (IMF), World Bank and regional organizations to support the development of more effective tax systems.<sup>1235</sup>

According to a report published by the OECD, IMF, UN and World Bank for the G20 Development Working Group (DWG), taxation provides governments with the necessary funds needed to invest in development, relieve poverty, and deliver public services. It also allows developing countries to reduce their dependency on foreign aid. Moreover, according to the report, tax system design is closely linked to domestic and international investment decisions, including in terms of transparency and fairness. Thus, a strong tax administration is essential to strengthening domestic resource mobilization. Despite this, half of the Sub Saharan African countries still mobilize less than 17 per cent of their gross domestic product (GDP) in tax revenues, which is well below the 20 per cent minimum level considered by the UN as necessary to achieve the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). Therefore, the G20 needs to take greater action in assisting developing countries in building capacity with respect to their tax administrations.<sup>1236</sup>

## **Commitment Features**

The report by the IMF, OECD, UN and World Bank to the G20 Development Working Group titled Supporting the Development of More Effective Tax Systems identified two broad ways in which G20 countries can work with developing countries to support the efforts for strengthening developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda: leading by example in addressing common issues and furthering common interests, and as shareholders or members of the international organisations most closely concerned with taxation and development.<sup>1237</sup>

## Common issues, common interests — leading by example and developing partnerships

- 1. Estimate and publish tax expenditures, and the cost of special provisions, in regular tax expenditure and budgets. G20 members could lead and encourage a more rigorous assessment of the costs and benefits of such provisions.
- 2. Develop analytical frameworks, suitable to the varying needs and circumstances of different countries, to assess the costs and benefits of preferential tax treatments, including in particular tax incentives aimed at foreign direct investment (FDI), and provide guidelines for members which use such incentives.
- 3. Disclose and consider reducing the scope of tax exemptions required by G20 members from country recipients of aid-funded projects.
- 4. Undertake "spillover" analyses of proposed changes to tax law in G20 members, for example in trade and international taxation which could have effects on the fiscal circumstances of developing countries.

# Acting as shareholders or members in international organizations

1. Encourage international organizations to more thoroughly assess and act upon linkages of tax and expenditure policies in their technical assistance to developing countries.

http://www.imf.org/external/np/g20/pdf/110311.pdf

http://www.imf.org/external/np/g20/pdf/110311.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1234</sup> Annex 2: Multi-Year Action Plan on Development, The Seoul Summit Document (Seoul) 12 November 2010. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://www.g20dwg.org/documents/pdf/view/323/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1235</sup> Annex 2: Multi-Year Action Plan on Development, The Seoul Summit Document (Seoul) 12 November 2010. Access Date: 28 February 2016. http://www.g20dwg.org/documents/pdf/view/323/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1236</sup> Supporting the Development of More Effective Tax System, A Report to the G20 Development Working Group by the IMF, OECD, UN, and World Bank 2011. Access Date: 19 February 2014.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1237</sup> Supporting the Development of More Effective Tax System, A Report to the G20 Development Working Group by the IMF, OECD, UN, and World Bank 2011. Access Date: 28 February 2016.

- 2. Encourage the IMF and World Bank, working with other international and regional organizations as appropriate, to further develop and make publicly available consistent and detailed revenue data sets for the developing countries.
- 3. Encourage the international organizations, including the Forum on Tax Administrations, to develop a tool kit of measures to counter tax evasion and avoidance, based on best practices and guidelines adapted to the needs of developing countries.
- 4. Promote the Multilateral Convention on Administrative Assistance in Tax Matters.

## **Scoring Guidelines**

-1	Member does not support efforts for strengthening developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda through national actions that address common issues and common interests or as stakeholders or members of international organizations.
0	Member supports efforts for strengthening developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda through national actions that address common issues and common interests OR as stakeholders or members of international organizations, but not both.
+1	Member supports efforts for strengthening developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda through national actions that address common issues and common interests AND as stakeholders or members of international organizations, but not both.

Lead Analyst: Hélène Emorine

# Argentina: 0

Argentina has partially complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

From 26 to 27 February 2016, Argentina participated in discussions regarding implementation of proposals to curb Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) at the G20 Finance Ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1238</sup>

Argentina has partially supported efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda as a member of an international organization however, has not implemented national actions that address common issues and common interests.

Thus, Argentina has received a score of 0.

Analysts: Jiyoon Han

# Australia: +1

Australia has fully complied with its commitment to support efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

On 8 December 2015, the Australian Taxation Office worked to increase transparency by reaffirming its commitment to work with other tax administrations to share intelligence on advisers operating globally.<sup>1239</sup>

On 17 December 2015, the Australian Taxation Office published the Corporate Tax Transparency Report for the 2013-2014 income year.<sup>1240</sup> The report aimed to lead by example and to form part of a "much wider domestic and global push for improved corporate transparency."<sup>1241</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1238</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd-

<sup>06</sup>d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Ljd7NFk

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1239</sup> Tax- Office Chasing Up Advisers Who Facilitate Offshore Tax Evasion, Australian Taxation Office (Sydney) 8 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

https://www.ato.gov.au/Media-centre/Media-releases/Tax-Office-chasing-up-advisers-who-facilitate-offshore-tax-evasion/

On 27 January 2016, as a member of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), Australia signed the Multilateral Competent Authority Agreement (MCAA) for the automatic exchange of Country-by-Country reports in an effort to boost the transparency of multinational enterprises.<sup>1242</sup>

From 26 to 27 February 2016, Australia participated in discussions regarding implementation of proposals to curb Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) at the G20 Finance Ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1243</sup>

Australia supported efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda through national actions that address common issues and common concerns and as a member of an international organizations.

Thus, Australia has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Jiyoon Han

## Brazil: 0

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

From 26-27 February 2016, Brazil participated in discussions regarding implementation of proposals to curb Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) at the G20 Finance Ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1244</sup>

Brazil has partially supported efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda as a member of an international organization however, has not implemented national actions that address common issues and common interests..

Thus, Brazil has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Elena Lifshits Carrera

# Canada: +1

Canada has fully complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

06d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Ljd7NFk

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1240</sup> Corporate Tax Transparency Report for the 2013 – 2014 Income Year, Australian Taxation Office (Sydney) 17
 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

https://www.ato.gov.au/uploadedFiles/Content/CR/downloads/Media\_centre/Corporateper cent20taxper cent20transparencyper cent20reportper cent20forper cent20theper cent202013-14per cent20incomeper cent20yearper cent20-per cent20Guidanceper cent20Partper cent203.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1241</sup> Corporate Tax Transparency Report for the 2013 – 2014 Income Year, Australian Taxation Office (Sydney) 17 December 2015. Access Date: 22 February 2016.

https://www.ato.gov.au/uploadedFiles/Content/CR/downloads/Media\_centre/Corporateper cent20taxper cent20transparencyper cent20reportper cent20forper cent20theper cent202013-14per cent20incomeper cent20yearper cent20-per cent20Guidanceper cent20Partper cent203.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1242</sup> A boost to transparency in international tax matters, OECD (Paris) 27 January 16. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.oecd.org/tax/a-boost-to-transparency-in-international-tax-matters-31-countries-sign-tax-co-operationagreement.htm#note

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1243</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd-

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1244</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24
 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd 06d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Ljd7NFk

On 5 February 2016, the Government of Canada announced that it had signed a Joint Declaration with Switzerland expressing intent for the two countries to engage in the automatic exchange of financial account information in accordance with the with standard developed by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD).<sup>1245</sup>

On 23 February 2016, the Department of Finance released its annual report on federal tax expenditures. One of the reasons the Government of Canada releases this report is to "foster government budgetary and fiscal transparency."<sup>1246</sup>

From 26-27 February 2016, Canada participated in discussions regarding implementation of proposals to curb Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) at the G20 finance ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1247</sup>

On 22 March 2016, the Government of Canada released the Federal Budget 2016, which confirmed that Canada will implement country-by-country reporting for multinationals in accordance with BEPS Action 13. The Budget also outlined the Government's intention to implement a minimum standard for the spontaneous exchange of tax rulings as outlined in the BEPS Report released in October 2015. Lastly the Budget confirmed the Government of Canada's commitment to counter treaty abuse by including either a Limitation on Benefits clause or a Principal Purpose Test.<sup>1248</sup>

Canada has supported the efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda through national actions that address common issues and common concerns and as stakeholders or members of international organizations.

Thus, Canada has received a score of +1.

Analysts: Elena Lifshits and Keshini Mahesan

## China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

From 24 to 26 November 2015, China sent a taxation delegation to the 45<sup>th</sup> annual meeting of the Study Group on Asian Tax Administration and Research (SGATAR) in Singapore.<sup>1249</sup> This annual conference included a task force meeting where delegates discussed three main issues: tax compliance of small and medium enterprises, increased efficiency and efficacy when executing tax administration policies and the implementation of country-by-country reporting.<sup>1250</sup> Furthermore, delegates

06d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Ljd7NFk

<sup>1248</sup> The Latest on BEPS – 28 March 2016, Ernst and Young Tax Insights. Accessed 22 April 2016.

http://taxinsights.ey.com/archive/archive-news/the-latest-on-beps-28-march-2016.aspx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1245</sup> Government Moving Forward to Address Tax Evasion Through the Automatic Exchange of Tax Information, Department of Finance (Ottawa), 5 February 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://www.fin.gc.ca/n16/16-020eng.asp

eng.asp <sup>1246</sup> Department of Finance releases annual report on federal tax expenditures, Department of Finance (Ottawa), 23 February 2016. Access Date: 13 March 2016. http://www.fin.gc.ca/n16/16-026-eng.asp

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1247</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24
 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1249</sup> Sun Ruibiao Attends 45th SGATAR Annual Meeting, State Administration of Taxation of The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 2 December 2015. Access Date: 8 March 2016.

http://www.chinatax.gov.cn/2013/n2925/n2957/c2010214/content.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1250</sup> Sun Ruibiao Attends 45th SGATAR Annual Meeting, State Administration of Taxation of The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 2 December 2015. Access Date: 8 March 2016.

http://www.chinatax.gov.cn/2013/n2925/n2957/c2010214/content.html

discussed an overhaul to the structure of SGATAR to improve training resources for member nations. China has committed to actively participate in the reformative measures proposed by SGATAR.<sup>1251</sup>

On 1 December 2015, Chinese President Xi Jinping and Zimbabwe President Mugabe signed an agreement on avoiding double taxation and preventing tax evasion.<sup>1252</sup> The treaty promoted technical and economic exchange between China and Zimbabwe by reducing tax burdens for cross-border investors of both countries.<sup>1253</sup>

On 4 December 2015, Administrator of the State Administration of Taxation Wang Jun, visited the Tax and Customs Administration of Ethiopia. During his visit, he signed the Sino-Ethiopian memorandum of understanding on strengthening China and Ethiopia's tax administration and tax collection capacities.<sup>1254</sup> The memorandum stressed the importance of exchanging tax related information between the two countries.<sup>1255</sup>

On 16 December 2015, China signed a memorandum of understanding with the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) to set up a joint multilateral taxation centre in China. This centre will provide taxation training to tax representatives from developing countries and Asia, as well as help developing countries build a platform for enhancing tax collection and administration capabilities.<sup>1256</sup>

From 26-27 February 2016, China participated in discussions regarding implementation of proposals to curb Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) at the G20 Finance Ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1257</sup>

China engaged developing economies' in the international tax agenda through national actions that addressed common issues and common concerns and as stakeholders of international organizations.

Thus, China has received a score of +1.

Analysts: Jiyoon Han

# France: +1

France has fully complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

On 30 December 2015, France enacted the 2016 Finance Act and the Amended 2015 Finance Act.<sup>1258</sup> This act included a provision obliging large companies to carry out country-by-country

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1251</sup>Sun Ruibiao Attends 45th SGATAR Annual Meeting, State Administration of Taxation of The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 2 December 2015. Access Date: 8 March 2016.

http://www.chinatax.gov.cn/2013/n2925/n2957/c2010214/content.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1252</sup> China and Zimbabwe Sign Tax Treaty, State Administration of Taxation of The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 4 December 2015. Access Date: 8 March 2016. http://www.chinatax.gov.cn/2013/n2925/n2957/c2010298/content.html <sup>1253</sup>China and Zimbabwe Sign Tax Treaty, State Administration of Taxation of The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 4

December 2015. Access Date: 8 March 2016. http://www.chinatax.gov.cn/2013/n2925/n2957/c2010298/content.html <sup>1254</sup> Wang Jun visits Taxation and Customs Administration of Ethiopia, State Administration of Taxation of The People's

Republic of China (Beijing) 7 December 2015. Access Date: 8 March 2016.

http://www.chinatax.gov.cn/2013/n2925/n2957/c2010336/content.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1255</sup>Wang Jun visits Taxation and Customs Administration of Ethiopia, State Administration of Taxation of The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 7 December 2015. Access Date: 8 March 2016.

http://www.chinatax.gov.cn/2013/n2925/n2957/c2010336/content.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1256</sup> Wang Jun Meets With OECD Delegates, State Administration of Taxation of The People's Republic of China (Beijing) 16 December 2015. Access Date: 8 March 2016.

http://www.chinatax.gov.cn/2013/n2925/n2957/n2958/c2010391/content.html

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1257</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24
 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd-

<sup>06</sup>d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Ljd7NFk

reporting in line with the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) recommendations on Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) Action Plan.<sup>1259</sup>

On 27 January 2016, as a member of the OECD, France signed the Multilateral Competent Authority Agreement (MCAA) for the automatic exchange of Country-by-Country reports as part of the OECD G20 BEPS Project. 1260,1261

On 9 February 2016, France and Germany participated in the 48th Franco-German Financial and Economic Council. During the council, "both countries continuously stressed the urgent need to advance efforts in the fight against tax avoidance and aggressive tax planning, both at the global and EU levels, to ensure transparency and the implementation of the principle of a minimum effective level of taxation."1262 During the conference, France and Germany strongly welcomed the conclusions of the OECD BEPS Action Plan and called for its swift and efficient implementation.<sup>1263</sup> On the topic of automatic exchange of information (AEOI), France and Germany encouraged "the Global Forum to monitor its implementation, ask to report on it before the end of 2016 and establish a review mechanism, and further the work on tougher incentives for countries failing to respect international standards of AEOI on request."1264

From 26-27 February 2016, France participated in discussions regarding implementation of proposals to curb Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) at the G20 Finance Ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1265</sup>

France has supported the efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda through national actions that address common issues and common concerns and as stakeholders or members of international organizations.

Thus, France has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Sonja Dobson

<sup>1258</sup> France enacts distribution rules and BEPS-inspired measures, Tax Insights from International Tax Services (New York) 8 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. https://www.pwc.com/us/en/tax-

<sup>1259</sup> France enacts distribution rules and BEPS-inspired measures, Tax Insights from International Tax Services (New York) 8 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. https://www.pwc.com/us/en/tax-

services/publications/insights/assets/pwc-france-enacts-distribution-rules-and-beps-inspired-measures.pdf

services/publications/insights/assets/pwc-france-enacts-distribution-rules-and-beps-inspired-measures.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1260</sup> Signature de l'accord multilatéral prévoyant les modalités de mise en œuvre du reporting pays par pays, Le portail de l'Économie et des Finances (Paris) 27 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://www.economie.gouv.fr/accord-multilateral-de-mise-en-oeuvre-du-reporting-pays-par-pays

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1261</sup> Signature de l'accord multilatéral prévoyant les modalités de mise en œuvre du reporting pays par pays, Le portail de l'Économie et des Finances (Paris) 27 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

http://www.economie.gouv.fr/accord-multilateral-de-mise-en-oeuvre-du-reporting-pays-par-pays

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1262</sup> Leading Effective TADAT Assessments. The Tax Administration Diagnostic Assessment Tool (TADAT). Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.tadat.org/news\_events/NewsAndEvents.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1263</sup> 48th Franco-German Financial and Economic Council. Federal Ministry of Finance (Berlin) 9 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016.

http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/Content/EN/Standardartikel/Topics/Europe/Articles/2016-02-09-48thfranco-german-financial-and-economic-council.html#Start

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1264</sup> 48th Franco-German Financial and Economic Council. Federal Ministry of Finance (Berlin) 9 February 2016. Acess Date: February 24 2016.

http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/Content/EN/Standardartikel/Topics/Europe/Articles/2016-02-09-48thfranco-german-financial-and-economic-council.html#Start

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1265</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight. Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd-

<sup>06</sup>d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Lid7NFk

## Germany: +1

Germany has fully complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

From 23 to 27 November 2015, the Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit (GIZ), an international development organization owned by the German government, held a workshop in Panama in conjunction with the Inter-American Center of Tax Administrations (CIAT). The main topic of the workshop was the effective implementation of transfer pricing in tax administrations faced with the challenge of a globalizing world.<sup>1266</sup>

On 27 January 2016, as a member of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), Germany signed the Multilateral Competent Authority Agreement (MCAA) for the automatic exchange of Country-by-Country reports in an effort to boost transparency by multinational enterprises.<sup>1267</sup>

On 9 February 2016, France and Germany participated in the 48th Franco-German Financial and Economic Council during which ministers from both states met to speak about critical financial issues. During the council "both countries continuously stressed the urgent need to advance efforts in the fight against tax avoidance and aggressive tax planning, both at the global and EU levels, to ensure transparency and the implementation of the principle of a minimum effective level of taxation."<sup>1268</sup> France and Germany also called for the quick implementation of the Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) Action Plan. Finally, France and Germany called for the Global Forum to monitor the implementation of automatic exchange of information, establish a review mechanism, and provide tougher incentives for countries failing to respect standards for the exchange of information.<sup>1269</sup>

From 18 to 21 January 2016, the Tax Administration Diagnostic Assessment Tool (TADAT) Organization, ran a TADAT Assessment Leadership course in conjunction with the Center for Excellence in Finance in Ljubljana, Slovenia.<sup>1270</sup> Assessors from, a GIZ-funded project and the Ministry of Finance were part of the German delegation that attended the course.<sup>1271</sup>

From 26 to 27 February 2016, Germany participated in discussions regarding implementation of proposals to curb BEPS at the G20 Finance Ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1272</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1266</sup> Seminario - Taller sobre Análisis de Casos de Precios de Transferencia GIZ-CIAT, Inter-American Center of Tax Administrations (Panama City) 10 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016.

http://www.ciat.org/index.php/en/news/the-executive-secretary-in-the-press.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1267</sup> A boost to transparency in international tax matters, OECD (Paris) 27 January 16. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.oecd.org/tax/a-boost-to-transparency-in-international-tax-matters-31-countries-sign-tax-co-operationagreement.htm#note

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1268</sup> Leading Effective TADAT Assessments. The Tax Administration Diagnostic Assessment Tool (TADAT). Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.tadat.org/news\_events/NewsAndEvents.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1269</sup> 48th Franco-German Financial and Economic Council. Federal Ministry of Finance (Berlin) 9 February 2016. Access Date: February 24 2016.

http://www.bundesfinanzministerium.de/Content/EN/Standardartikel/Topics/Europe/Articles/2016-02-09-48th-franco-german-financial-and-economic-council.html#Start

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1270</sup> Overview. The Tax Administration Diagnostic Assessment Tool (TADAT). Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.tadat.org/overview/overview.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1271</sup> Leading Effective TADAT Assessments. The Tax Administration Diagnostic Assessment Tool (TADAT). Access Date: 24 February 2016.http://www.tadat.org/news\_events/NewsAndEvents.html

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1272</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24
 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd 06d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Ljd7NFk

Germany has supported the efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda through national actions that address common issues and common concerns and as stakeholders or members of international organizations.

Thus, Germany has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Michael Warchol

## India: +1

India has fully complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

On 31 December 2015, the Government of India published an updated Guidance Note for implementation of Foreign Account Tax Compliance Act (FATCA) and Common Reporting Standard (CRS) as per Multilateral Competent Authority Agreement (MCAA) for Automatic Exchange of Information.<sup>1273</sup>

On 28 January 2016, the Central Board of Direct Taxes announced that it resolved over 100 transfer pricing disputes under the Mutual Agreement Procedure (MAP) provision contained in the provision contained in the India-USA Double Taxation Avoidance Convention (DTAC) signed in 2015.<sup>1274</sup>

On 2 February 2016, the Ministry of Finance of the Government of India established the "Tax Policy Research Unit and Tax Policy Council to bring consistency, multidisciplinary inputs, and coherence in tax policy making."<sup>1275</sup>

On 26-27 February 2016, India participated in discussions on implementing a proposal to curb Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) at the G20 finance ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1276</sup>

India has supported the efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda through national actions that address common issues and common concerns and as stakeholders or members of international organizations.

Thus, India has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Fatima Saya

## Indonesia: 0

Indonesia has partially complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

From 26-27 February 2016, the Indonesian Ministry of Finance urged G20 members to implement international tax agreements by the deadline at the G20 Finance Ministerial and Central Bank Meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1277</sup>

<sup>1276</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd-06d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Ljd7NFk

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1273</sup> Clarification for implementation of FATCA and CRS –regarding, Income Tax Department (New Delhi) 19 February2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

http://www.incometaxindia.gov.in/Lists/Press Releases/Attachments/443/Press-Release-Clarification-for-implementation-of-FATCA-19-02-2016.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1274</sup> Resolution of more than 100 cases of transfer pricing disputes with USA under MAP-regarding, Income Tax Department (New Delhi) 28 January 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016.

http://www.incometaxindia.gov.in/Lists/Pressper cent20Releases/Attachments/439/PressRelease\_28-1-16.pdf <sup>1275</sup> Government sets-up Tax Policy Research Unit and Tax Policy Council to bring consistency, multidisciplinary inputs, and coherence in Tax Policy, Press Information Bureau (New Delhi) 2 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016 http://pib.nic.in/newsite/PrintRelease.aspx?relid=136014

At the same meeting, Indonesian Finance Minister Bambang Brodjonegoro highlighted the challenges faced in the implementation of the international taxation cooperation, particularly the Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) initiative and the Automatic Exchange of Information (AEOI) on taxation.<sup>1278</sup>

Indonesia has partially supported efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda as a member of an international organization however, has not implemented national actions that address common issues and common interests.

Thus, Indonesia has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Michael Warchol

## Italy: +1

Italy has fully complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

On 22 December 2015, Italy implemented rules requiring multinational entities to report, by country, the amounts of gross profit, taxes paid, and other indicators of economic activities in its 2016 budget law.<sup>1279</sup> These reporting requirements are in line with the recommendations made in the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) project.<sup>1280</sup>

On 27 January 2016, as a member of the OECD, Italy signed the Multilateral Competent Authority Agreement (MCAA) for the automatic exchange of country-by-country reports in an effort to boost transparency by multinational enterprises.<sup>1281</sup>

From 26 to 27 February 2016, Argentina participated in discussions regarding implementation of proposals to curb BEPS at the G20 Finance Ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1282</sup>

Italy has supported the efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda through national actions that address common issues and common concerns and as stakeholders or members of international organizations.

Thus, Italy has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Michael Warchol

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1277</sup> Indonesia asks G20 to implement taxation cooperation, Antara News (Jakarta) 28 February 2016. Access Date: 1 March 2016. http://www.antaranews.com/en/news/103388/indonesia-asks-g20-to-implement-taxation-cooperation <sup>1278</sup> Indonesia asks G20 to implement taxation cooperation, Antara News (Jakarta) 28 February 2016. Access Date: 1

March 2016. http://www.antaranews.com/en/news/103388/indonesia-asks-g20-to-implement-taxation-cooperation <sup>1279</sup> Italy: Country-by-country reporting approved in 2016 budget law, KPMG 23 December 2015. Access Date: 1 March 2016. https://home.kpmg.com/xx/en/home/insights/2015/12/tnf-italy-country-by-country-reporting-approved-in-2016-budget-law.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1280</sup> Italy: Country-by-country reporting approved in 2016 budget law, KPMG 23 December 2015. Access Date: 1 March 2016. https://home.kpmg.com/xx/en/home/insights/2015/12/tnf-italy-country-by-country-reporting-approved-in-2016-budget-law.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1281</sup> A boost to transparency in international tax matters, OECD (Paris) 27 January 2016. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.oecd.org/tax/a-boost-to-transparency-in-international-tax-matters-31-countries-sign-tax-co-operation-agreement.htm#note

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1282</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24
 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd 06d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Ljd7NFk

## Japan: 0

Japan has partially complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

On 27 January 2016, as a member of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), Japan signed the Multilateral Competent Authority Agreement (MCAA) for the automatic exchange of Country-by-Country reports in an effort to boost the transparency of multinational enterprises.<sup>1283</sup>

On 26-27 February 2016, Japan participated in discussions regarding implementation of proposals to curb Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) at the G20 Finance Ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1284</sup>

Japan has partially supported efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda as a member of an international organization however, has not implemented national actions that address common issues and common interests.

Thus, Japan has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Fatima Saya

## Korea: 0

Korea has partially complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

From 26 to 27 February 2016, Argentina participated in discussions regarding implementation of proposals to curb Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) at the G20 Finance Ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1285</sup>

Korea has partially supported efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda as a member of an international organization however, has not implemented national actions that address common issues and common interests.

Thus, Korea has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Jiyoon Han

## Mexico: 0

Mexico has partially complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

On 12 February 2016, as a member of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), Mexico signed the Multilateral Competent Authority Agreement (MCAA)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1283</sup> A boost to transparency in international tax matters, OECD (Paris) 27 January 16. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.oecd.org/tax/a-boost-to-transparency-in-international-tax-matters-31-countries-sign-tax-co-operationagreement.htm#note

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1284</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd-

<sup>06</sup>d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Ljd7NFk

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1285</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24
 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd 06d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Ljd7NFk

for the automatic exchange of Country-by-Country reports in an effort to boost transparency by multinational enterprises.<sup>1286</sup>

From 26 to 27 February 2016, Mexico participated in discussions regarding implementation of proposals to curb Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) at the G20 Finance Ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1287</sup>

Mexico has partially supported efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda as a member of an international organization however, has not implemented national actions that address common issues and common interests.

Thus, Mexico has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Coral Cripps

#### Russia: 0

Russia has partially complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

From 26 to 27 February 2016, Russia participated in discussions regarding implementation of proposals to curb Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) at the G20 Finance Ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1288</sup>

Russia has partially supported efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda as a member of an international organization however, has not implemented national actions that address common issues and common interests.

Thus, Russia has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Elena Lifshits Carrera

## Saudi Arabia: 0

Saudi Arabia has partially complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

On 26 to 27 February 2016, Saudi Arabia participated in discussions regarding the implementation of proposals to curb Base Erosion and Profit Shifting at the G20 Finance Ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1289</sup>

Saudi Arabia has partially supported efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda as a member of an international organization however, has not implemented national actions that address common issues and common interests.

06d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Ljd7NFk

06d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Ljd7NFk

http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd-06d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Ljd7NFk

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1286</sup> A boost to transparency in international tax matters, OECD (Paris) 27 January 16. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.oecd.org/tax/a-boost-to-transparency-in-international-tax-matters-31-countries-sign-tax-co-operationagreement.htm#note

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1287</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1288</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1289</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24February 2016.

Thus, Saudi Arabia has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Fatima Saya

## South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

On 12 February 2016, as a member of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), South Africa signed the Multilateral Competent Authority Agreement (MCAA) for the automatic exchange of Country-by-Country reports in an effort to boost transparency by multinational enterprises.<sup>1290</sup>

On 25 February 2016, South Africa began work on a report on tax administration, which evaluating the country's use of institutions and infrastructure to implement recommendations on tax policy.<sup>1291</sup> In particular, the report will review the South African Revenue Service (SARS) to determine whether the institution is capable of implementing the recommendations of a governmental tax committee formed in 2013.<sup>1292</sup>

From 26 to 27 February 2016, South Africa participated in discussions regarding implementation of proposals to curb Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) at the G20 Finance Ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1293</sup>

South Africa has supported the efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda through national actions that address common issues and common concerns and as stakeholders or members of international organizations.

Thus, South Africa has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Coral Cripps

## Turkey: +1

Turkey has fully complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

On 15 December 2015, the Ministry of Finance introduced amendments to tax audit regulations, including provisions to facilitate regulations outlined by Automatic Exchange of Information (AEOI).<sup>1294</sup>

On 24 December 2015, the Ministry of Finance issued new disclosure regulations for organizations and taxpayers in the e-commerce sector, including the introduction of new obligatory e-archiving requirements.<sup>1295</sup>

06d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Ljd7NFk

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1290</sup> A boost to transparency in international tax matters, OECD (Paris) 27 January 16. Access Date: 22 February 2016. http://www.oecd.org/tax/a-boost-to-transparency-in-international-tax-matters-31-countries-sign-tax-co-operationagreement.htm#note

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1291</sup> TAX COMMITTEE: Review aiming for in depth look into tax system, Business Day (Cape Town) 25 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.bdlive.co.za/economy/2016/02/25/tax-committee-review-aiming-forindepth-look-into-tax-system

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1292</sup> TAX COMMITTEE: Review aiming for in depth look into tax system, Business Day (Cape Town) 25 February 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://www.bdlive.co.za/economy/2016/02/25/tax-committee-review-aiming-forindepth-look-into-tax-system

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1293</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1294</sup> Vergi incelemelerinde uyulacak usul ve esaslar hakkinda, Revenue Administration (Ankara) 15 December 2015. Access Date: 3 March 2016. http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/eskiler/2015/11/20151106-5.htm

On 22 February 2016, the Turkish Revenue Administration launched an annual *Tax Week* to "develop tax awareness in all sectors of society and in order to increase voluntary tax payment habits."<sup>1296</sup>

On 26-27 February 2016, Turkey participated in discussions regarding the implementation of proposals to curb Base Erosion and Profit Shifting at the G20 Finance Ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1297</sup>

Turkey has supported the efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda through national actions that address common issues and common concerns and as stakeholders or members of international organizations.

Thus, Turkey has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Fatima Saya

## United Kingdom: +1

The United Kingdom has fully complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

On 23 November 2015, the Department for International Development (DFID) updated its aid strategy, reaffirming its commitment to spend 0.7 per cent of national income on Official Development Assistance (ODA).<sup>1298</sup> In support of the government's aim towards progressive tax policy, the ODA states that it will double the amount it invests for improving developing countries tax systems by 2020 to GBP40 million.<sup>1299</sup> The government will invest more in combatting tax evasion and avoidance; strengthen and expand government partnerships to defeat bribery and corruption; and return stolen assets.<sup>1300</sup>

In December 2015, DFID updated its Tax Modernisation Programme in Tanzania which aims to improve Tanzania's tax administration system.<sup>1301</sup>

On 27 January 2016, as a member of the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), the UK signed the Multilateral Competent Authority Agreement (MCAA)

06d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Ljd7NFk

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1295</sup> Vergi usul kanunu genel tebliği (sira no: 464), Revenue Administration (Ankara) 24 December 2015. Access Date: 3 March 2016. http://www.resmigazete.gov.tr/eskiler/2015/12/20151224-7.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1296</sup> Turkish Revenue Administration Announcement, Revenue Administration (Ankara) 22 February 2016. Access Date: 3 March 2016

http://www.gib.gov.tr/sites/default/files/fileadmin/user\_upload/BasinBultenleri/22022016basinbulteni.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1297</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1298</sup> Development spending will meet UK's promises to world's poor while serving national interest, Department for International Development (London) 23 November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

https://www.gov.uk/government/news/development-spending-will-meet-uks-promises-to-worlds-poor-while-serving-national-interest

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1299</sup> UK aid: tackling global challenges in the national interest, Department for International Development (London) November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\_data/file/478834/ODA\_strategy\_final\_web\_09 05.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1300</sup> UK aid: tackling global challenges in the national interest, Department for International Development (London) November 2015. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\_data/file/478834/ODA\_strategy\_final\_web\_09 05.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1301</sup> Tax Modernisation Programme Grant – Corporate Plan 4, Department for International Development (London) 29 January 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. https://devtracker.dfid.gov.uk/projects/GB-1-204334

for the automatic exchange of Country-by-Country reports in an effort to boost transparency by multinational enterprises.<sup>1302</sup>

From 26-27 February 2016, the UK participated in discussions regarding implementation of proposals to curb Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) at the G20 Finance Ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1303</sup>

On 16 March 2016, the UK Treasury introduced the Business Tax Roadmap, which included next steps on the implementation of BEPS in the United Kingdom to 2020.<sup>1304</sup>

On 24 March 2016, the Government of the United Kingdom released its Finance Bill for 2016. This bill introduces new rules to address hybrid mismatch arrangements and increase transparency for payments on intellectual property made overseas, ensuring they are subject to tax.<sup>1305</sup>

UK has supported the efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda through national actions that address common issues and common concerns and as stakeholders or members of international organizations.

Thus, the United Kingdom has received a score of +1.

Analysts: Anna Roach and Keshini Mahesan

## United States: +1

The United States has fully complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

On 22 December 2015, the Internal Revenue Service (IRS) and the US Department of Treasury issued regulations for US multinational enterprise organizations regarding country-by-country reporting requirements established by the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development's (OECD) Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) project.<sup>1306</sup>

On 9 February 2016, the US Department of Treasury released the 2017 Fiscal Year Budget Proposal to the US Congress which included significant reform proposals to the US International Tax System, including limits on shifting income through intangible property transfers and restrictions on the use of hybrid arrangements that create stateless income.<sup>1307</sup>

On 17 February 2016, the US Department of Treasury issued a revised US Model Income Tax Convention that reflect improvements based in bilateral tax treaty negotiations to reduce double

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1302</sup> A boost to transparency in international tax matters, OECD (Paris) 27 January 16. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.oecd.org/tax/a-boost-to-transparency-in-international-tax-matters-31-countries-sign-tax-co-operationagreement.htm#note

agreement.htm#note <sup>1303</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd-06d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Lid7NFk

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1304</sup> The Latest on BEPS – 28 March 2016, Ernst and Young Tax Insights. Accessed 23 April 2016. http://taxinsights.ey.com/archive/archive-news/the-latest-on-beps-28-march-2016.aspx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1305</sup> Finance Bill 2016 legislates new tax changes, 24 March 2016. HM Treasury, HM Revenue & Customs. Accessed 22 April 2016. https://www.gov.uk/government/news/finance-bill-2016-legislates-new-tax-changes

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1306</sup> Country-by-Country Reporting, Federal Register (Washington) 23 December 2015. Access Date: 1 March 2016. https://www.federalregister.gov/articles/2015/12/23/2015-32145/country-by-country-reporting

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1307</sup> General Explanations of the Administration's Fiscal Year 2017 Revenue Proposals, Department of the Treasury (Washington) 9 February 2016. Access Date: 1 March 2016. https://www.treasury.gov/resource-center/taxpolicy/Documents/General-Explanations-FY2017.pdf

taxation.<sup>1308</sup> In particular, it will deny "reduced withholding taxes on U.S. source payments made by companies that engage in inversions related to foreign persons."<sup>1309</sup>

On 26-27 February 2016, the US participated in discussions regarding implementation of proposals to curb BEPS at the G20 Finance Ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1310</sup>

The US has supported the efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda through national actions that address common issues and common concerns and as stakeholders or members of international organizations.

Thus, the United States has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Fatima Saya

#### European Union: +1

The European Union has fully complied with its commitment to help strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda.

On 1 December 2015, the European Commission updated and published its country-by-country and corporate tax transparency report, thus furthering transparency.<sup>1311</sup>

On 28 January 2016, the European Commission presented a reform agenda, which included a section on assisting developing countries in meeting good tax governance standards.<sup>1312</sup> This agenda upholds the EU140 million annual donation to developing countries, as well as the Addis Tax Initiative, launched in July 2015, wherein the EU and other international partners committed to doubling the support to developing countries for domestic revenue mobilization.<sup>1313</sup>

On 28 January 2016, the European Commission presented a Communication on an External Strategy for Effective Taxation as part of its reform agenda.<sup>1314</sup> The External Strategy outlines measures to promote good tax governance internationally.<sup>1315</sup>

06d75973fe09.html?siteedition=intl#axzz41Ljd7NFk

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1308</sup> Treasury Announces Release of 2016 U.S. Model Income Tax Treaty, Department of the Treasury (Washington) 17 February 2016. Access Date: 1 March 2016.

https://www.treasury.gov/press-center/press-releases/Pages/jl0356.aspx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1309</sup> Treasury Announces Release of 2016 U.S. Model Income Tax Treaty, Department of the Treasury (Washington) 17 February 2016. Access Date: 1 March 2016.

<sup>.</sup> https://www.treasury.gov/press-center/press-releases/Pages/jl0356.aspx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1310</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1311</sup> Country-by-Country Reporting / Corporate Tax Transparency, European Commission (Brussels) 1 December 2015. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

http://ec.europa.eu/finance/company-reporting/country-by-country-reporting/index\_en.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1312</sup> Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament and the Council on an External Strategy for

Effective Taxation, European Commission (Brussels) 28 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

http://eur-lex.europa.eu/resource.html?uri=cellar:b5aef3db-c5a7-11e5-a4b5-

<sup>01</sup>aa75ed71a1.0018.03/DOC\_1&format=HTML&lang=EN&parentUrn=COM:2016:24:FIN

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1313</sup> Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament and the Council on an External Strategy for Effective Taxation, European Commission (Brussels) 28 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016.

http://eur-lex.europa.eu/resource.html?uri=cellar:b5aef3db-c5a7-11e5-a4b5-

<sup>01</sup>aa75ed71a1.0018.03/DOC\_1&format=HTML&lang=EN&parentUrn=COM:2016:24:FIN

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1314</sup> Platform for Tax Good Governance, European Commission (Brussels) 28 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/taxation\_customs/taxation/gen\_info/good\_governance\_matters/platform/index\_en.htm <sup>1315</sup> Platform for Tax Good Governance, European Commission (Brussels) 28 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/taxation customs/taxation/gen\_info/good\_governance\_matters/platform/index\_en.htm

On 28 January 2016, the European Commission included the continued promotion of the Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative in its reform agenda.<sup>1316</sup>

On 28 January 2016, the European Commission presented a reform agenda which includes "continuing to promote developing countries' contribution to international tax standard setting and pushing for more inclusive international coordination, among others through the G20-Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development's (OECD) Base Erosion and Profit Shifting (BEPS) project and Automatic Exchange of Information Initiatives (AEOI), the United Nations Committee of Experts on International Cooperation in Tax Matters and regional bodies like African Tax Administration Forum (ATAF), Centre de rencontres et d'études des dirigeants des administrations fiscales (CREDAF) or the Inter-American Center of Tax Administrations (CIAT)."<sup>1317</sup>

From 26-27 February 2016, the EU participated in discussions regarding implementation of proposals to curb BEPS at the G20 Finance Ministers' meeting in Shanghai, China.<sup>1318</sup>

The EU has supported the efforts to strengthen developing economies' engagement in the international tax agenda through national actions that address common issues and common concerns and as stakeholders or members of international organizations.

Thus, the European Union has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Anna Roach

01aa75ed71a1.0018.03/DOC 1&format=HTML&lang=EN&parentUrn=COM:2016:24:FIN

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1316</sup> Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament and the Council on an External Strategy for Effective Taxation, European Commission (Brussels) 28 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://eur-lex.europa.eu/resource.html?uri=cellar:b5aef3db-c5a7-11e5-a4b5-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1317</sup> Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament and the Council on an External Strategy for Effective Taxation, European Commission (Brussels) 28 January 2016. Access Date: 25 February 2016. http://eur-lex.europa.eu/resource.html?uri=cellar:b5aef3db-c5a7-11e5-a4b5-

<sup>01</sup>aa75ed71a1.0018.03/DOC 1&format=HTML&lang=EN&parentUrn=COM:2016:24:FIN

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1318</sup> Poorer countries handed role in tax evasion fight, Financial Times (London) 24 February 2016. Access Date: 24 February 2016. http://www.ft.com/intl/cms/s/0/72b2736e-dad2-11e5-98fd-

<sup>06</sup>d75973 fe09.html?sitee dition=intl#axzz41 Ljd7 NFk

# **10. Labour and Employment: Gender**

"We will continue monitoring the implementation of our Employment Plans as well as our goals to reduce gender participation gap."

G20 Antalya Leaders' Communiqué

	No Compliance	Partial Compliance	Full Compliance
Argentina		0	
Australia			+1
Brazil		0	
Canada			+1
China			+1
France			+1
Germany			+1
India			+1
Indonesia			+1
Italy			+1
Japan			+1
Korea			+1
Mexico	-1		
Russia	-1		
Saudi Arabia		0	
South Africa			+1
Turkey			+1
United Kingdom		0	
United States			+1
European Union			+1
Average		+0.60	

# Assessment

# Background

Around the world, the labour force continues to grow faster than the number of jobs created. The International Labour Organisation (ILO), in World Employment and Social Outlook: Trends 2015, notes that "by 2019, more than 212 million people will be out of work, up from 201 million now." Reversing these trends and creating quality jobs remains the G20's highest priority and comprehensive growth strategies will assist with this. At the 2014 Brisbane Summit, the G20 members developed country-specific Employment Plans to address individual employment challenges and future strategies to combat them.

In addition to the Employment Plans, the G20 during the Brisbane Summit for the first time declared a goal with a specific timeline to reduce the inequality in the labour force between men and women. G20 members specifically stated, "We agree to the goal of reducing the gap in labour force participation rates between men and women in our countries by 25 per cent by 2025, taking into account national circumstances. This will bring more than 100 million women into the labour force [and] significantly increase global growth." Individual actions to lift employment and participation are outlined in each G20 member's Employment Plans. All G20 members are taking action to raise female participation and tackle youth unemployment.

At the 2016 G20 Antalya Summit, leaders re-committed to the country-specific Employment Plans and to reduce the gender participation gap, as well as to monitor the implementation of theses goals. G20 members also published individual reports detailing country-specific growth strategies and the status of the implementation of Employment Plan strategies. As of 18 October 2015, all G20 members albeit Indonesia submitted self-reports regarding the implementation status of country-specific Employment Plans.<sup>1319</sup> Reports were based on a template developed by the G20 Employment Working Group (EWG) consisting of five sections: employment and labour market trends; checklist of implementation; short notes reporting on key policy commitments in the Employment Plan; reporting on multi-year collective commitments; any new policy commitments.<sup>1320</sup> On 16 November 2015, the Synthesis Paper of Self-Reports on the Implementation of G20 Country Employment Plans was published alongside the 2015 G20 Antalya Summit communiqué, summarizing the findings of those reports.<sup>1321</sup> The Synthesis Report is available to the public. However, the country-specific reports are not.

# **Commitment Features**

G20 members committed to continue monitoring the implementation of individual Employment Plans as well as goals to reduce the gender participation gap.

Monitoring can include, but is not limited to, issuing reports, collecting data, and conducting surveys. Monitoring can also include public consultation and/or an internal bureaucratic assessment in which staff are assigned to an oversight body. Monitoring can be done directly by the government and its agencies or in partnership with other actors such as international organizations.

Implementation is taken to mean any actions which advance, move forward or strengthen the goals and strategies of the country-specific Employment Plan. While the commitment is part of a longerterm initiative and actions on it may continue into the prolonged future, steps need to be taken during the compliance period to be considered implementation. This should not, therefore, be interpreted to mean only prolonged or delayed action.

Each G20 member has a distinct and individual Employment Plan outlining policy commitments, plans and strategies for improvement. The monitoring of any implementation of the goals and strategies of the member's plan will be assessed for compliance.

Each G20 member has committed to the goal of reducing the gap in labour force participation rates between men and women in G20 countries by 25 per cent by 2025. The monitoring of this goal, in addition to the monitoring of country-specific Employment Plans, is also necessary for full compliance.

Monitoring of actions or inaction surrounding the advancement of the goal to reduce the gender participation gap will count towards compliance. Monitoring of previously implemented policies, policy reviews and consultations, collecting of gender employment data, and reports relating to the status of women's employment and are some examples.

# **Scoring Guidelines**

-1	Member country does not monitor the Employment Plan or goals to reduce the gender labour gap
0	Member country monitors the Employment Plan OR goals to reduce the gender labour gap
+1	Member country monitors BOTH the Employment Plan AND goals to reduce the gender labour gap

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1319</sup> Synthesis Paper of Self-Reports on the Implementation of G20 Country Employment Plans, G20 16 November 2015. Access Date: 7 March 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Synthesis-Paper-of-Self-Reports-on-the-Implementation-of-G20-Country-Employment-Plans-2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1320</sup> G20 National Employment Plans: Proposed Self-Reporting Template, OECD Access Date: 7 March 2016. http://www.oecd.org/g20/topics/employment-and-social-policy/G20-National-Employment-Plan-proposed-selfreporting-template.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1321</sup> Synthesis Paper of Self-Reports on the Implementation of G20 Country Employment Plans, G20 16 November 2015. Access Date: 7 March 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/11/Synthesis-Paper-of-Self-Reports-on-the-Implementation-of-G20-Country-Employment-Plans-2015.pdf

# Argentina: 0

Argentina has partially complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

In February 2016, The Institute for the Study of Labor in Bonn, in cooperation with Argentina's Ministry of Labor and other relevant parties published research on long term effects of youth training programs on employment in Argentina, within which differences between male and female was studied and compared.<sup>1322</sup>

On 3 February 2016, Secretary of Labor Ezequiel Sabor announced the results of labor inspections on passenger transport to the summer season, noting that "it is a priority of this administration make every effort to ensure every employee a quality employment, ensuring compliance with the laws and punishing those who do not comply with current regulations."<sup>1323</sup>

Argentina has complied with its commitment to monitor its Employment Plan. However, no evidence has been found suggesting Argentina has monitored its gender goal.

Thus, Argentina has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Jini Wang

## Australia: +1

Australia has fully complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

On 8 February 2016, the Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT) issued the "Annual Performance of Australian Aid" report.<sup>1324</sup> This report assesses the performance and results of the Australian aid program in 2014-15.<sup>1325</sup> The report publishes the results of aid allocated to gender participation equality.<sup>1326</sup> It stated that Australia is committed to investing in three priority areas where there are persistent challenges to gender equality and where progress has been slow: enhancing women's voice in decision-making, leadership and peacebuilding; promoting women's economic empowerment; and ending violence against women and girls.<sup>1327</sup> In 2014-15, Australia spent AUD2.44 billion on investments that targeted gender equality as a principal or significant objective.<sup>1328</sup> The performance assessments in the report were quality assured by the Office of Development Effectiveness, overseen by the department's Independent Evaluation Committee.<sup>1329</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1322</sup> Long Run Effects of Youth Training Programs: Experimental Evidence from Argentina, The Institute for the Study of Labor (IZA) Feb 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://ftp.iza.org/dp9784.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1323</sup> Sabor: "Los trabajadores de todo el país tienen que saber que estamos para ayudarlos", Ministerio de Trabajo 3 February 2016. Access Date: 16 March 2016. http://www.trabajo.gov.ar/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1324</sup> Performance of Australian Aid 2014-15, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, February 2016. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://dfat.gov.au/about-us/publications/Documents/performance-of-australian-aid-2014-15.pdf

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1325</sup> Performance of Australian Aid 2014-15, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, February 2016. Access Date: 2
 March 2016. http://dfat.gov.au/about-us/publications/Documents/performance-of-australian-aid-2014-15.pdf
 <sup>1326</sup> Performance of Australian Aid 2014-15, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, February 2016. Access Date: 2

March 2016. http://dfat.gov.au/about-us/publications/Documents/performance-of-australian-aid-2014-15.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1327</sup> Performance of Australian Aid 2014-15, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, February 2016. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://dfat.gov.au/about-us/publications/Documents/performance-of-australian-aid-2014-15.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1328</sup> Performance of Australian Aid 2014-15, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, February 2016. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://dfat.gov.au/about-us/publications/Documents/performance-of-australian-aid-2014-15.pdf <sup>1329</sup> Performance of Australian Aid 2014-15, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, February 2016. Access Date: 2

Performance of Australian Aid 2014-15, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade, February 2016. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://dfat.gov.au/about-us/publications/Documents/performance-of-australian-aid-2014-15.pdf

On 29 February 2016, the DFAT released the report "Gender Equality and Women's Empowerment Strategy."<sup>1330</sup> This report outlines why and how the government works on gender equality and women's empowerment in foreign policy, economic diplomacy, aid for trade, and in corporate and human resource policies.<sup>1331</sup> The Australian government has appointed an Ambassador for Women and Girls to advocate on these issues.<sup>1332</sup>

Furthermore the report details how the government will monitor its goals to reduce the gender participation gap.<sup>1333</sup> The report mandates that gender equality and women's empowerment must be explicitly built into monitoring, evaluation and learning processes.<sup>1334</sup> It states, "We must therefore: build gender equality into performance assessment frameworks in aid investment plans and include gender equality results in annual program performance reviews; include adequate targets and indicators for gender equality in all monitoring, evaluation and learning frameworks; at a minimum, ensure all data about people is sex disaggregated so we can assess whether women and men are benefiting equally; make gender equality an explicit focus of investigation in all our reviews and evaluations; make sure we deliberately capture and report on gender equality results and learning."<sup>1335</sup>

Australia has continued to monitor the implementation of its Employment Plan and gender goal.

Thus, Australia has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Julia Tops

#### Brazil: 0

Brazil has partially complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

On 23-25 February 2016, the 4th State Conference on Policies for Women of Santa Catarina was held to discuss the strengthening of state and local mechanisms for increased participation of women in politics.<sup>1336</sup> The 4th National Conference on Policies for Women (4th CNPM) will be held from 10-13 May in Brasilia.<sup>1337</sup>

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1330</sup> Gender equality and women's empowerment strategy, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade. 29 February 2016.
 Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://dfat.gov.au/about-us/publications/Pages/gender-equality-and-womens empowerment-strategy.aspx
 <sup>1331</sup> Gender equality and women's empowerment strategy, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade. 29 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1331</sup> Gender equality and women's empowerment strategy, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade. 29 February 2016. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://dfat.gov.au/about-us/publications/Pages/gender-equality-and-womensempowerment-strategy.aspx

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1332</sup>Gender Initiatives, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade. Access date: 2 March 2016.

http://dfat.gov.au/aid/topics/investment-priorities/gender-equality-empowering-women-girls/genderequality/Pages/gender-initiatives.aspx <sup>1333</sup> Gender equality and women's empowerment strategy, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade. 29 February 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1333</sup> Gender equality and women's empowerment strategy, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade. 29 February 2016. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://dfat.gov.au/about-us/publications/Documents/gender-equality-and-womensempowerment-strategy.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1334</sup> Gender equality and women's empowerment strategy, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade. 29 February 2016. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://dfat.gov.au/about-us/publications/Documents/gender-equality-and-womensempowerment-strategy.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1335</sup> Gender equality and women's empowerment strategy, Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade. 29 February 2016. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://dfat.gov.au/about-us/publications/Documents/gender-equality-and-womensempowerment-strategy.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1336</sup> Participation in Politics and Women's Empowerment are Discussed in Florianopolis 25 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.spm.gov.br/noticias/aviso-de-pauta-florianopolis-sediara-a-4a-conferencia-estadual-de-politicas-para-as-mulheres-de-santa-catarina

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1337</sup> Tariff Notice – Florianopolis will host the 4th State Conference on Policies for Women of Santa Catarina 22 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.spm.gov.br/noticias/aviso-de-pauta-florianopolis-sediaraa-4a-conferencia-estadual-de-politicas-para-as-mulheres-de-santa-catarina

On 4 March 2016, the Secretariat of Policies for Women of the Ministry of Women, Racial Equality and Human Rights held the 5th Meeting with Women Unionists called "Dialogues on the World of Work." This marked the beginning of a series of meetings to discuss improving public policies to promote the economic empowerment of women.<sup>1338</sup>

Brazil has continued to monitor the implementation of its gender goal. However, it has not monitored the implementation of its Employment Plan.

Thus, Brazil has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Sydney Anderson

# Canada: +1

Canada has fully complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

On 18 December 2015, the Canadian government released a report from the Employer Panel for caregivers titled "When Work and Caregiving Collide: How Employers Can Support Their Employees Who Are Caregivers."<sup>1339</sup> The report highlights best practices that many employers offer to their employees who provide care, offers some practical suggestions on how to become a more caregiver-friendly workplace and provides a toolbox of valuable information and resources for employers and employees.<sup>1340</sup> The report monitors aspects of the Canadian Employers for Caregivers Plan (CECP), committed to in Canada's Employment Plan, which aims to help maximize the labour force participation of caregivers and maintain workplace productivity.<sup>1341,1342</sup>

From 14 to 15 January 2016, Canada's Minister of Employment, Workforce Development and Labour Mihychuk, at the headquarters for the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development reaffirmed Canada's commitment to increasing workers' access to good quality job training, which opens up more opportunities for Canadians in the workforce.<sup>1343</sup> Likewise, Minister Mihychuk met with several other representatives from different countries such as Thomas E. Perez, United States Secretary of Labor, the Right Honourable Priti Patel, Minister of State for Employment, United Kingdom.<sup>1344</sup> This opportunity was used to discuss ways in which Canada exchanges ideas regarding the improvement of labor with other countries.<sup>1345</sup>

On 22 January 2016, Prime Minister Trudeau also participated in a panel discussion on gender parity, where he said, "I have made clear Canada's commitment to gender parity — it remains a

<sup>1341</sup> Employment Plan 2014 Canada, G20 16 Novemeber 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016.

<sup>1344</sup> Minister Mihychuk talks youth, jobs and global best practices, Employment and Social Development Canada (Ottawa) 15 January 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://news.gc.ca/web/article-en.do?nid=1027929

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1338</sup> SPM Promotes 5<sup>th</sup> Meeting with Women Unionists. 22 February 2016. Access Date: 27 February 2016. http://www.spm.gov.br/noticias/spm-promove-50-encontro-com-mulheres-sindicalistas.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1339</sup> Canadian Employers for Caregivers Plan, Employment and Social Development Canada 18 December 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.esdc.gc.ca/eng/seniors/cecp/index.shtml

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1340</sup> Canadian Employers for Caregivers Plan, Employment and Social Development Canada 18 December 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.esdc.gc.ca/eng/seniors/cecp/index.shtml

http://www.g20australia.org/sites/default/files/g20\_resources/library/g20\_employment\_plan\_canada.pdf <sup>1342</sup> Canadian Employers for Caregivers Plan, Employment and Social Development Canada 18 December 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.esdc.gc.ca/eng/seniors/cecp/index.shtml

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1343</sup> Minister Mihychuk talks youth, jobs and global best practices, Employment and Social Development Canada (Ottawa) 15 January 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://news.gc.ca/web/article-en.do?nid=1027929

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1345</sup> Minister Mihychuk talks youth, jobs and global best practices, Employment and Social Development Canada (Ottawa) 15 January 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://news.gc.ca/web/article-en.do?nid=1027929

priority for our government domestically, as well as internationally."<sup>1346</sup> The discussion at this panel focused on how public policies can be changed to create more equal opportunities for men and women, thereby demonstrating that the Trudeau administration is constantly monitoring the gender labor gap alongside the Employment Plan.<sup>1347</sup>

On 12 February 2016, Prime Minister Justin Trudeau announced that the Government of Canada plans to double the resources behind Canada Summer Jobs Program during a visit to Toronto's Dovercourt Boys and Girls Club.<sup>1348</sup> The federal government spent CAD106 million on the program last year to help create more than 34,000 summer jobs.<sup>1349</sup> New funding of up to CAD113 million each year for the next three years will allow the program to offer nearly 70,000 summer jobs to students from now until 2018.<sup>1350</sup> He stated that "how we're investing in young people will be even more apparent in the budget as we look at ensuring access to postsecondary education, as we look at improving job and skills training for young people just out of school."<sup>1351</sup> This statement demonstrates that the Canadian government is monitoring its previously enacted youth employment policies and expanding said policies where needed. It is in line with its employment plan goal to upgrade skills with an emphasis on education and training, decrease youth unemployment and increasing social supports.<sup>1352</sup>

On 8 March 2016, Statistics Canada released a report titled "The Health of Girls and Women in Canada," in the seventh edition of "Women in Canada: A Gender-based Statistical Report."<sup>1353</sup> The report presents a summary of the physical and mental health of girls and women in Canada.<sup>1354</sup> Statistics Canada, formed in 1971, is a Canadian federal government agency commissioned with producing statistics to help better understand Canada, its population, resources, economy, society, and culture. The report fulfills Canada's commitment to monitor its gender goal, as well as monitor the implementation of its employment plan as the report provides data on women's health, social benefits and skills training.<sup>1355</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1346</sup> Prime Minister Trudeau underlines Canada's commitment to gender parity at World Economic Forum, Office of the Prime Minister of Canada (Ottawa) 22 January 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016.

http://pm.gc.ca/eng/news/2016/01/22/prime-minister-trudeau-underlines-canadas-commitment-gender-parity-world-

economic <sup>1347</sup> Prime Minister Trudeau underlines Canada's commitment to gender parity at World Economic Forum, Office of the Prime Minister of Canada (Ottawa) 22 January 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016.

http://pm.gc.ca/eng/news/2016/01/22/prime-minister-trudeau-underlines-canadas-commitment-gender-parity-worldeconomic

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1348</sup> Justin Trudeau marks 100 days with boost to summer jobs program, CBC News (Ottawa) 12 February 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/justin-trudeau-summer-jobs-100-days-1.3445378

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1349</sup> Justin Trudeau marks 100 days with boost to summer jobs program, CBC News (Ottawa) 12 February 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/justin-trudeau-summer-jobs-100-days-1.3445378

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1350</sup> Justin Trudeau marks 100 days with boost to summer jobs program, CBC News (Ottawa) 12 February 2016, Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/justin-trudeau-summer-jobs-100-days-1.3445378

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1351</sup> Justin Trudeau marks 100 days with boost to summer jobs program, CBC News (Ottawa) 12 February 2016. Access Date: 6 March 2016. http://www.cbc.ca/news/politics/justin-trudeau-summer-jobs-100-days-1.3445378

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1352</sup> Employment Plan 2014 Canada, G20 16 November 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016.

http://www.g20australia.org/sites/default/files/g20 resources/library/g20 employment plan canada.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1353</sup> Women in Canada: Women and health, Statistics Canada 8 March 2016. Access date: 9 March 2016.

http://www.statcan.gc.ca/daily-quotidien/160308/dq160308b-eng.htm?HPA

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1354</sup> Women in Canada: Women and health, Statistics Canada 8 March 2016. Access date: 9 March 2016. http://www.statcan.gc.ca/daily-quotidien/160308/dq160308b-eng.htm?HPA

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1355</sup> Women in Canada: Women and health, Statistics Canada 8 March 2016. Access date: 9 March 2016. http://www.statcan.gc.ca/daily-quotidien/160308/dq160308b-eng.htm?HPA

On 9 March 2016, Statistics Canada released a report titled "The Contribution of Immigration to the Size and Ethnocultural Diversity of Future Cohorts of Seniors."<sup>1356</sup> The study focused on several cohorts of current and future seniors and the effects of Canada's aging population.<sup>1357</sup> The monitoring of the effects of immigration and of the aging population in Canada, relates to its employment plan goal to provide social benefits, cater to underrepresented groups and to gather data surrounding the rising care needs of an aging society, to better the employment caregivers and eventually launch the Canadian Employers for Caregivers Plan.<sup>1358</sup>

Canada continued to monitor the Employment Plan and the gender labour gap.

Thus, Canada has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Tina Vulevic

#### China: +1

China has fully complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

China has listed women empowerment as a key policy issue for its G20 2016 presidency, however no evidence was found suggesting that it has established any specific monitoring programs related to its gender goal for its G20 presidency.

On 19 January 2016, the National Bureau of Statistics of China released the report titled "China's Economy Realized a Moderate but Stable and Sound Growth in 2015."<sup>1359</sup> The report details monitoring of several aspects of its Employment Plan such as labour rates, industry upgrading and household income.<sup>1360</sup> Furthermore, the report details data on gender participation rates across China.<sup>1361</sup>

On 5 March 2016, the Report on the work of the government was delivered by Premier Li Keqiang at the Fourth Session of the Twelfth National People's Congress and was adopted on 16 March 2016.<sup>1362</sup> The report relayed various information related to several aspects of China's Employment Plan including innovation, standards of living, urbanization and development of social programs.<sup>1363</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1356</sup> Study: The contribution of immigration to the size and ethnocultural diversity of future cohorts of seniors, Statistics Canada 9 March 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.statcan.gc.ca/daily-quotidien/160309/dq160309aeng.htm?HPA

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1357</sup> Study: The contribution of immigration to the size and ethnocultural diversity of future cohorts of seniors, Statistics Canada 9 March 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.statcan.gc.ca/daily-quotidien/160309/dq160309a-eng.htm?HPA

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1358</sup> Employment Plan 2014 Canada, G20 16 November 2015. Access Date: 9 March 2016.

http://www.g20australia.org/sites/default/files/g20\_resources/library/g20\_employment\_plan\_canada.pdf <sup>1359</sup> China's Economy Realized a Moderate but Stable and Sound Growth in 2015, National Bureau of Statistics of China

<sup>19</sup> January 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016.

http://www.stats.gov.cn/english/PressRelease/201601/t20160119\_1306072.html

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1360</sup> China's Economy Realized a Moderate but Stable and Sound Growth in 2015, National Bureau of Statistics of China
 19 January 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016.

http://www.stats.gov.cn/english/PressRelease/201601/t20160119\_1306072.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1361</sup> China's Economy Realized a Moderate but Stable and Sound Growth in 2015, National Bureau of Statistics of China 19 January 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016.

http://www.stats.gov.cn/english/PressRelease/201601/t20160119\_1306072.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1362</sup> Full Text: Report on the Work of the Government, The State Council 17 march 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://english.gov.cn/archive/publications/2016/03/17/content\_281475309417987.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1363</sup> Full Text: Report on the Work of the Government, The State Council 17 march 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://english.gov.cn/archive/publications/2016/03/17/content\_281475309417987.htm

Premier Li Keqiang invited comments on the report from the members of the National Committee of the Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference (CPPCC).<sup>1364</sup>

Furthermore, the report announced monitoring mechanisms for environmental inspection, for food and pharmaceuticals enterprises, workplace and public safety, improve safety infrastructure and monitoring to build capacity to prevent and mitigate disasters.<sup>1365</sup> All these monitoring initiatives are in line with goals set out in China's Employment Plan.<sup>1366</sup>

China has continued to monitor the implementation of its Employment Plan and gender goal.

Thus, China has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Mojann Zibapour

#### France: +1

France has fully complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

On 11 February 2016, State Secretary for Women's Rights Pascale Boistard gave a speech at the Symposium of Sexism at work: between denial and awareness.<sup>1367</sup> She stated her intention to devote a day of awareness to this topic.<sup>1368</sup> The day would provide an opportunity for employees, organizations and networks to coordinate policies and review women's role in the workplace, their barriers and grievances.<sup>1369</sup>

On 24 February 2016, the Ministry of Labour in a press release announced that the amount of unemployed persons without any activity in January decreased by 27,900 compared to December, or -0.8 per cent.<sup>1370</sup> The ministry also made announcements relating to youth employment trends, small and medium-sized enterprises and new skill upgrading initiatives that will be implemented in lieu of these statistics.<sup>1371</sup> The data was collected from employment centres around France.<sup>1372</sup> The press release demonstrates that France is monitoring several aspects of its Employment Plan, such as youth unemployment, by coordinating with employment centres.<sup>1373</sup>

On 25 February 2016, the Minister for Finance and Public Accounts Michel Sapin and Minister for Labour, Employment, Professional Training and Social Dialogue Myriam El Khomri, alongside employer organizations in the construction and civil engineering sector, have signed the "National

<sup>1372</sup> Les demandeurs d'emploi en janvier 2016 (Paris) 24 February 2016. Access Date: March 9, 2016. http://travail-

emploi.gouv.fr/actualites/presse/communiques-de-presse/article/les-demandeurs-d-emploi-en-janvier-2016 <sup>1373</sup> Les demandeurs d'emploi en janvier 2016 (Paris) 24 February 2016. Access Date: March 9, 2016. http://travail-emploi.gouv.fr/actualites/presse/communiques-de-presse/article/les-demandeurs-d-emploi-en-janvier-2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1364</sup> Full Text: Report on the Work of the Government, The State Council 17 march 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://english.gov.cn/archive/publications/2016/03/17/content\_281475309417987.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1365</sup> Full Text: Report on the Work of the Government, The State Council 17 march 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://english.gov.cn/archive/publications/2016/03/17/content\_281475309417987.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1366</sup> Employment Plan China, G20 (2014) Access date: 17 March 2016.

http://www.g20australia.org/sites/default/files/g20\_resources/library/g20\_employment\_plan\_china.pdf <sup>1367</sup> Intervention de Pascale Boistard : colloque « Le sexisme au travail : entre déni et prise de conscience » (Paris)

February 11, 2016. Access Date: February 26, 2016. http://femmes.gouv.fr/category/egalite/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1368</sup> Intervention de Pascale Boistard : colloque « Le sexisme au travail : entre déni et prise de conscience » (Paris) February 11, 2016. Access Date: February 26, 2016. http://femmes.gouv.fr/category/egalite/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1369</sup> Intervention de Pascale Boistard : colloque « Le sexisme au travail : entre déni et prise de conscience » (Paris) February 11, 2016. Access Date: February 26, 2016. http://femmes.gouv.fr/category/egalite/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1370</sup> Les demandeurs d'emploi en janvier 2016 (Paris) February 24, 2016. Access Date : March 9, 2016. http://travailemploi.gouv.fr/actualites/presse/communiques-de-presse/article/les-demandeurs-d-emploi-en-janvier-2016

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1371</sup> Les demandeurs d'emploi en janvier 2016 (Paris) 24 February 2016. Access Date : March 9, 2016. http://travailemploi.gouv.fr/actualites/presse/communiques-de-presse/article/les-demandeurs-d-emploi-en-janvier-2016

Convention on the Fight against Illegal Employment and Fraudulent Secondment" in this sector.<sup>1374</sup> The bill will strengthen the existing tools available in the fight against unlawful posting.<sup>1375</sup> This bill, to be presented at the Council of Ministers in early March, will include several measures, such as the suspension of construction sites that fail to declare a posted employee, the introduction of a stamp duty, and the option for an inspector to ask to be accompanied by an interpreter.<sup>1376</sup> Monitoring teams have also been deployed en masse in the field, resulting in a significant increase in both inspections and sanctions.<sup>1377</sup> The enhanced monitoring of workplaces as well as the enhanced repercussions for companies which fail to report workplace status monitors the implementation of France's Employment Plan goal to "further improve occupational health and safety."<sup>1378</sup>

On 2 March 2016, Minister of Family, Children and Women's Rights Laurence Rossignol announced a study on appointments in senior management.<sup>1379</sup> This study will allow the government to identify the causes of consistent career inequalities between women and men and to build a plan of action.1380

On 2 March 2016, the Ministre de la Famille, de l'Enfance et des Droits des femmes, held "Women and State Civil Service," a symposium focusing on women's role in civil service and women's employment more generally.<sup>1381</sup> It launched a series of meetings, events to raise awareness about women's employment and what is and is not being done to advance women's employment participation in the workforce.<sup>1382</sup>

France has continued to monitor the implementation of both its Employment Plan and gender goal.

Thus, France has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Mojann Zibapour

droitsdesfemmes.gouv.fr/collogue-femmes-et-fonction-publique-detat-intervention-de-madame-laurence-rossignol/ <sup>1382</sup>Colloque Femmes et fonction publique d'Etat Intervention de Madame Laurence Rossignol, Ministre de la Famille, de l'Enfance et des Droits des femmes. 2 March 2016. Access Date: 7 March 2016. http://www.famille-enfance-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1374</sup> National convention on the fight against illegal employment and fraudulent secondment in the construction and civil engineering sector, Government.fr 25 February 2016. Access Date: 7 March 2016.

http://www.gouvernement.fr/en/national-convention-on-the-fight-against-illegal-employment-and-fraudulentsecondment-in-the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1375</sup> National convention on the fight against illegal employment and fraudulent secondment in the construction and civil engineering sector, Government.fr 25 February 2016. Access Date: 7 March 2016.

http://www.gouvernement.fr/en/national-convention-on-the-fight-against-illegal-employment-and-fraudulent-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1376</sup> National convention on the fight against illegal employment and fraudulent secondment in the construction and civil engineering sector, Government.fr 25 February 2016. Access Date: 7 March 2016.

http://www.gouvernement.fr/en/national-convention-on-the-fight-against-illegal-employment-and-fraudulentsecondment-in-the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1377</sup> National convention on the fight against illegal employment and fraudulent secondment in the construction and civil engineering sector, Government.fr 25 February 2016. Access Date: 7 March 2016.

http://www.gouvernement.fr/en/national-convention-on-the-fight-against-illegal-employment-and-fraudulentsecondment-in-the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1378</sup> Employment Plan 2014 France, G20, 2014, Access Date: 7 March 2016, http://g20.org.tr/wpcontent/uploads/2014/12/g20 employment plan france.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1379</sup> Colloque « Femmes et fonction publique d'Etat » – Intervention de Madame Laurence Rossignol (Paris) March 2, 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.familles-enfance-droitsdesfemmes.gouv.fr/category/egalite/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1380</sup> Colloque « Femmes et fonction publique d'Etat » – Intervention de Madame Laurence Rossignol (Paris) March 2, 2016. Access Date: 9 March 2016. http://www.familles-enfance-droitsdesfemmes.gouv.fr/category/egalite/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1381</sup> Colloque Femmes et fonction publique d'Etat Intervention de Madame Laurence Rossignol, Ministre de la Famille, de l'Enfance et des Droits des femmes. 2 March 2016. Access Date: 7 March 2016. http://www.famille-enfance-

droitsdesfemmes.gouv.fr/colloque-femmes-et-fonction-publique-detat-intervention-de-madame-laurence-rossignol/

## Germany: +1

Germany has fully complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

Throughout the compliance period the Institute for Employment Research (IAB) has continued to monitor the implementation of several aspects of Germany's Employment Plan.<sup>1383</sup> IAB is the official research institute of the Federal Employment Agency and conducts research on the labour market in order to advise political actors at all levels in a competent manner.<sup>1384</sup> On 12 February 2016, it published Replacement migration from a labour market perspective. On 22 February 2016, it published Regional age structure and young workers' wages. On 17 March 2016, the IAB published Employment effects of the new German minimum wage. All of these publications represent monitoring of goals outlined in Germany's Employment Plan.<sup>1385</sup>

On 7 March 2016 to coincide with the International Women's Day, the Federal Statistical Office of Germany published a report on the proportion of women in executive positions.<sup>1386</sup> The report indicated that in 2014, 29 per cent of the executive positions in Germany were held by women, and in 2016 the proportion remained nearly unchanged.<sup>1387</sup>

Germany has continued to monitor the implementation of its Employment Plan and gender goal.

Thus, Germany has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Jini Wang

#### India: +1

India has fully complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

On 7 December 2015, the Ministry of Women and Child Development released a draft National Plan for Action for Children 2016.<sup>1388</sup> The plan details the government's strategy to protect the rights of children in the four priority areas of survival, health and nutrition, education and development as well as protection and participation.<sup>1389</sup> The report has a strong emphasis on monitoring the implementation of policies, practices and youth skill development which is in line with India's Employment Plan.<sup>1390</sup>

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1383</sup> IAB News, Institute for Employment Research. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.iab.de/en/iab-aktuell.aspx
 <sup>1384</sup> IAB News, Institute for Employment Research. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.iab.de/en/iab-aktuell.aspx
 <sup>1385</sup> Employment Plan Germany, G20 (2014). Access Date:17 March 2016.

http://www.bmas.de/SharedDocs/Downloads/DE/Thema-Internationales/g20-employmentplangermany.pdf?\_\_blob=publicationFile

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1386</sup> Press Release 075: Proportion of women in executive positions unchanged at 29%, Federal Statistical Office (Destatis) 2016. Access Date: 7 March 2016.

https://www.destatis.de/EN/PressServices/Press/pr/2016/03/PE16\_075\_122.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1387</sup> Press Release 075: Proportion of women in executive positions unchanged at 29%, Federal Statistical Office (Destatis) 2016. Access Date: 7 March 2016.

https://www.destatis.de/EN/PressServices/Press/pr/2016/03/PE16\_075\_122.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1388</sup> Smt Maneka Sanjay Gandhi releases 'Handbook on Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (Prevention, Prohibition and Redressal) Act, 2013, Ministry of Women and Child Development. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://pib.nic.in/newsite/pmreleases.aspx?mincode=64

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1389</sup> National Plan of Action, Goverment of India 7 December 2015. Access Date: 16 March 2016. http://wcd.nic.in/sites/default/files/National%20Plan%20of%20Action\_0.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1390</sup> Employment Plan Inida, G20 15 November 2015. Access date: 16 March, 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-content/uploads/2014/12/g20\_employment\_plan\_india.pdf

On 7 December 2015, the Ministry of Women and Child Development made a copy of the draft National Plan for Action for Children 2016 available on its website.<sup>1391</sup> The Ministry is calling for comments and suggestions from Governments of States, Ministries, civil society organizations, media and individuals to review the action plan and send their comments to Ministry.<sup>1392</sup> The collaboration with other actors and the continued surveillance of its policies represents further monitoring of the implementation of its Employment Plan.

On 10 December 2015, Office of the Registrar General and Census Commissioner and Ministry of Statistics and Program Implementation published a report titled "Women and Men in India 2015," in which the Government of India highlights the status of women covering health, education, work and decision making along with social obstacles in women's empowerment.<sup>1393</sup>

The Ministry of Women and Child Development continues to administer different schemes for empowerment of women, the encouragement of women into the working force and monitoring women's participation. For example, on 23 December 2015, the Support to Training and Employment Program for Women approved 5 new project proposals under the scheme.<sup>1394</sup>

India has continued to monitor the implementation of its Employment Plan and gender goal.

Thus, India has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Jini Wang

### Indonesia: +1

Indonesia has fully complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

On 22 January 2015, the Indonesia Investment Coordinating Board issued a press release reporting on the official launch of phase III of President Joko Widodo's Employment Investment Program.<sup>1395</sup> The implementation of phase III was a follow up of phase I and II which were reported as successful in absorbing over 29,000 workers.<sup>1396</sup> Details of the outcomes of government investments from phase I and II were also in the report.<sup>1397</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1391</sup> Smt Maneka Sanjay Gandhi releases 'Handbook on Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (Prevention, Prohibition and Redressal) Act, 2013, Ministry of Women and Child Development. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://pib.nic.in/newsite/pmreleases.aspx?mincode=64

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1392</sup> Smt Maneka Sanjay Gandhi releases 'Handbook on Sexual Harassment of Women at Workplace (Prevention, Prohibition and Redressal) Act, 2013, Ministry of Women and Child Development. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://pib.nic.in/newsite/pmreleases.aspx?mincode=64

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1393</sup> Measures taken by the Government for gender equality / socio-economic development / empowerment of women, Ministry of Women and Child Development. Access Date: 26 February 2016.

http://pib.nic.in/newsite/pmreleases.aspx?mincode=64

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1394</sup> 10th Project Appraisal Committee (PAG) Meeting of STEP Scheme of Ministry of Women & Child Development during the year 2015-16, STEP Division, Ministry of Women and Child Development. Access Date: 26 February 2016. http://wcd.nic.in/sites/default/files/minutes\_0.PDF

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1395</sup>President Jokowi Launches Program to Absorb 11,727 Labour, Indonesia Investment Coordinating Board 22 January 2016. Access Date: 16 March 2016. http://www.bkpm.go.id/images/uploads/file\_siaran\_pers/Press\_Release\_-\_EN\_-\_President\_Jokowi\_Launch\_Program\_to\_Absorb\_11,727\_Labour.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1396</sup>President Jokowi Launches Program to Absorb 11,727 Labour, Indonesia Investment Coordinating Board 22 January 2016. Access Date: 16 March 2016. http://www.bkpm.go.id/images/uploads/file\_siaran\_pers/Press\_Release\_-\_EN\_-\_\_President\_Jokowi\_Launch\_Program\_to\_Absorb\_11,727\_Labour.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1397</sup>President Jokowi Launches Program to Absorb 11,727 Labour, Indonesia Investment Coordinating Board 22 January 2016. Access Date: 16 March 2016. http://www.bkpm.go.id/images/uploads/file\_siaran\_pers/Press\_Release\_-\_EN\_-\_\_President\_Jokowi\_Launch\_Program\_to\_Absorb\_11,727\_Labour.pdf

On 17 February 2016, a report detailing women's employment rates, pay and obstacles to employment in Indonesia was released.<sup>1398</sup> The report was produced by Monash University, Australia's Department of Foreign Affairs and Trade (DFAT) and the Australia Indonesia Partnership for Economic Governance (AIPEG), a joint Government of Indonesia and Government of Australia program with the goal of strengthening economic governance in Indonesia.<sup>1399</sup> The article stated the Indonesian government has identified improvement of female participation in markets as a key development priority.<sup>1400</sup>

On 20 February 2016, the Youth Development Summit was held in Jakarta as part of the commitment of Youth Corps Indonesia to empower the young and rising generations of Indonesia.<sup>1401</sup> The event aimed to facilitate panel discussions and seminars on how to incorporate youth into Indonesian development efforts.<sup>1402</sup>

Indonesia has continued to monitor the implementation of its Employment Plan and its gender goal.

Thus, Indonesia has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Kaylee Mak

# Italy: +1

Italy has fully complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

On 5 February 2016, the National Equality Councilor of the Italian Ministry of Labour and Social Politics, Francesca Bagni Cipriani, conducted a workshop entitled "Motherhood, paternity and work — resignation, reconciliation, and new regulations."<sup>1403</sup> The workshop entailed an audit of social and work-related policies that deal with gender discrimination, maternity, and paternity in legislation and amended fines for non-compliance and/or violations of various elements.<sup>1404</sup> Fines were increased for a variety of prohibitory legislation in the workplace. For example, the fine for the violation of the prohibition of gender discrimination was increased from EUR250 to EUR1500.<sup>1405</sup> Other changes included increases in fines and/or prison sentences for individuals and companies seen to be in violation of legislation that protects the safety of women in the workplace.

Italy monitors their employment plan through their national statistics organization, Italian Statistics Office (ISTAT). ISTAT monitors employment, employment based on age, unemployment, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1398</sup> Gender inequality in Indonesia's labour market, Monash University 17 February 2016. Access Date: 16 March 2016. http://monash.edu/news/show/gender-inequality-in-indonesias-labour-market

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1399</sup>Gender inequality in Indonesia's labour market, Monash University 17 February 2016. Access Date: 16 March 2016. http://monash.edu/news/show/gender-inequality-in-indonesias-labour-market

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1400</sup> Gender inequality in Indonesia's labour market, Monash University 17 February 2016. Access Date: 16 March 2016. http://monash.edu/news/show/gender-inequality-in-indonesias-labour-market

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1401</sup> Youth Development Summit calls Indonesian Youth to Take Part in Sustainable Development, 20 February 2016 (Jakarta). Access Date: 19 March 2016. http://unic-jakarta.org/2016/02/22/youthdev-summit-2016-calls-indonesianyouth-to-take-part-in-sustainable-development/?lang=en

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1402</sup>http://unic-jakarta.org/2016/02/22/youthdev-summit-2016-calls-indonesian-youth-to-take-part-in-sustainabledevelopment/?lang=en

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1403</sup> Maternity, Paternity and Work, Ministry of Work and Social Politics (Bologna), 5 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.lavoro.gov.it/ConsiglieraNazionale/In\_Evidenza/Documents/2016-02-05%20BOLOGNA%20Slide%20Fabrizi.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1404</sup> Maternity, Paternity and Work, Ministry of Work and Social Politics (Bologna), 5 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.lavoro.gov.it/ConsiglieraNazionale/In\_Evidenza/Documents/2016-02-05%20BOLOGNA%20Slide%20Fabrizi.pdf.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1405</sup> Maternity, Paternity and Work, Ministry of Work and Social Politics (Bologna), 5 February 2016. Access Date: 23 February 2016. http://www.lavoro.gov.it/ConsiglieraNazionale/In\_Evidenza/Documents/2016-02-05%20BOLOGNA%20Slide%20Fabrizi.pdf.

sectorial employment on a monthly basis. During the compliance period no new reports were published.

Italy has complied with its commitment to continue to monitor its gender goal and the implementation of its Employment Plan.

Thus, Italy has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Julia Tops

### Japan: +1

Japan has fully complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

On 24 February 2016, the Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare released the report "Outline of Health, Labour and Welfare Statistics." <sup>1406</sup> The report details monitoring of aging, youth employment and development, employment and retirement.<sup>1407</sup> The monitoring of these areas directly relates to goals laid out in Japan's Employment Plan, such as the promise of the Government of Japan to promote youth employment.<sup>1408</sup>

During the compliance period the Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare published several reports monitoring areas related to the goals set out in Japan's Employment Plan.<sup>1409</sup> On 25 December 2015, it published "Report of Employment Insurance Working Group, Employment Security Committee, Labour Policy Council," report of the survey on the local governments measures in support of employment of single-parent families, a monthly report on Employment Insurance Services, a summary of the results of the Survey on the Insured of National Pension in 2014 and several other reports all monitoring implementation of Japan's Employment Plan.<sup>1410</sup>

On 2 March 2016, the Government of Japan released a report detailing the treatment of women in the workplace.<sup>1411</sup> The report was the first of its kind and surveyed more than 9,600 women aged 25-44 who are currently working or were previously employed.<sup>1412</sup> It found that 40 per cent had been touched in an unpleasant way while 17 per cent had been "asked or pressed to have a sexual relationship."<sup>1413</sup> The Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare said 30 per cent of respondents in full-and part-time employment reported being sexually harassed at work and among full-time workers, the figure rose to 35 per cent.<sup>1414</sup>

Japan has continued to monitor the implementation of its Employment Plan and gender goal.

<sup>1413</sup> Nearly a third of Japan's women 'sexually harassed at work', The Guardian 2 March 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/mar/02/japan-women-sexually-harassed-at-work-report-finds

<sup>1414</sup> Nearly a third of Japan's women 'sexually harassed at work', The Guardian 2 March 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/mar/02/japan-women-sexually-harassed-at-work-report-finds

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1406</sup> Outline of Health, Labour and Welfare Statistics, Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare 24 February 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.mhlw.go.jp/english/database/db-oh/index.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1407</sup> Outline of Health, Labour and Welfare Statistics, Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare 24 February 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.mhlw.go.jp/english/database/db-oh/index.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1408</sup> Employment Plan Japan, G20 (2014). Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-

content/uploads/2014/12/g20\_employment\_plan\_japan.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1409</sup> What's New 2015, Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare (2015). Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.mhlw.go.jp/english/new-info/2015.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1410</sup> What's New 2015, Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare (2015). Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.mhlw.go.jp/english/new-info/2015.html

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1411</sup> Nearly a third of Japan's women 'sexually harassed at work', The Guardian 2 March 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/mar/02/japan-women-sexually-harassed-at-work-report-finds

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1412</sup> Nearly a third of Japan's women 'sexually harassed at work', The Guardian 2 March 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.theguardian.com/world/2016/mar/02/japan-women-sexually-harassed-at-work-report-finds

Thus, Japan has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Sydney Anderson

### Korea: +1

Korea has fully complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

On 21 January 2016, the National Assembly Budget Office published the report "Pending Issues of Local Finance in Line with the Expansion of Welfare Programs."<sup>1415</sup> The report monitors the fourth strategy of the Employment Plan: Social Solidarity and Increased Accountability for Job Creation, which states that job creation requires cost-sharing and the government will make sure that the tripartite social partners share the burden and become more accountable for their roles.<sup>1416</sup> The report analyzed the impact of the recent expansion of welfare programs on local finance and presented key initiatives that the central government and local entities should carry out to ensure the sound functioning of local finance in response to such impact.<sup>1417</sup>

On 19 February 2016, the Ministry of Gender Equality and Family published "Report of 2016 Business Plan," which outlined numerous plans to be implemented in 2016 by the Government of Korea.<sup>1418</sup> Among them, the report called for the formation and implementation of private-public monitoring team on the blind fields vulnerable to the coexistence of work and family having high women employment ratio.<sup>1419</sup>

During the compliance period the Ministry of Gender Equality and Family continued to monitor the impact of policies on gender, plan and coordinate women's policy as well as forge partnerships with women's civil groups and international organizations, which is part of its core objectives.<sup>1420</sup>

Korea has continued to monitor the implementation of its Employment Plan and gender goal.

Thus, Korea has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Tina Vulevic

#### Mexico: -1

Mexico has failed to comply with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

No evidence was found suggesting Mexico is continuing to monitor the implementation of its Employment Plan or gender goal.

<sup>1420</sup>About the Ministry, Ministry of Gender Equality. Access Date: 2 March 2016.

http://www.mogef.go.kr/eng/sub01/sub1\_1.jsp

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1415</sup> Pending issues of local finance in line with the expansion of welfare programs, National Assembly Budget Office. 21 January 2016. Access Date: 2 March 2016.

http://korea.nabo.go.kr/eng/publications.do?psStep=view&psPage=1&shSearch=&shKeyword=&shDivisionCD=&shPub Year=&shPubCD=pubRecent&pubSID=799

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1416</sup> Employment Plan 2014 Korea, G20. 2014. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://g20.org.tr/wp-

content/uploads/2014/12/g20\_employment\_plan\_korea-1.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1417</sup> Pending issues of local finance in line with the expansion of welfare programs, National Assembly Budget Office. 21 January 2016. Access Date: 2 March 2016.

http://korea.nabo.go.kr/eng/publications.do?psStep=view&psPage=1&shSearch=&shKeyword=&shDivisionCD=&shPub Year=&shPubCD=pubRecent&pubSID=799

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1418</sup> Report of 2016 Business Plan, The Ministry of Gender Equality and Family (Seoul) 19 February 2016. Access Date:
 24 February 2016. http://www.mogef.go.kr/eng/press/index04.jsp?id=eup0300&mode=view&idx=7237

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1419</sup> Report of 2016 Business Plan, The Ministry of Gender Equality and Family (Seoul) 19 February 2016. Access Date:
 24 February 2016. http://www.mogef.go.kr/eng/press/index04.jsp?id=eup0300&mode=view&idx=7237

Thus, Mexico has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Tina Vulevic

### Russia: –1

Russia has failed to comply with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

No evidence was found suggesting Mexico is continuing to monitor the implementation of its Employment Plan or gender goal.

Thus, Russia has received a score of -1.

Analyst: Miranda A. Bocci

# Saudi Arabia: 0

Saudi Arabia has partially complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

On 23 December 2015, the Saudi Gazette reported the Ministry of Labour will officially launch the "work from a distance" program for female employees in seven cities, including Hail, Qassim, Jazan, Najran, Al Ahsa, Madinah and Arar. Business centers have been prepared under the supervision of the Human Resources Development Fund. Female employees will work for private sector companies and will receive contracts. An electronic system will be used to effectively monitor the contractual relationship in order to make sure employers do not evade responsibilities.<sup>1421</sup> The monitoring relationship affirms the Saudi commitment to increasing female participation in the labour force.

Saudi Arabia has continued to monitor its gender goal. However, no evidence was found suggesting it has continued to monitor the implementation of its Employment Plan.

Thus, Saudi Arabia has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Mojann Zibapour

# South Africa: +1

South Africa has fully complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

On 1 December 2015, Statistics South Africa published the report "Gender Series Volume II: Education analyzing trends over a 10 year period."<sup>1422</sup> The purpose of the report was to "assess the country's progress towards achieving improved access to equality of education through a gender lens."<sup>1423</sup> The report confirmed South Africa has made significant progress in gender access and equality in education as a prerequisite to employment and moreover identified key challenges yet to be addressed.<sup>1424</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1421</sup>Women can work from home from next month, Saudi Gazette 23 December 2015. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://saudigazette.com.sa/saudi-arabia/women-can-work-from-home-from-next-month/

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1422</sup> Gender Series Volume II: Education, 2004-2014, South African Government 1 December 2015. 17 March 2016. http://www.statssa.gov.za/?p=5933

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1423</sup> Gender Series Volume II: Education, 2004-2014, South African Government 1 December 2015. 17 March 2016. http://www.statssa.gov.za/?p=5933

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1424</sup> Gender Series Volume II: Education, 2004-2014, South African Government 1 December 2015. 17 March 2016. http://www.statssa.gov.za/?p=5933

On 25 February 2016, Statistics South Africa published their Quarterly Labour Force Survey.<sup>1425</sup> The report covers labour market activities of persons 15-24 years old and in particular highlighted unemployment decreases in the fourth quarter of 2015 in six key industries.<sup>1426</sup> The report also identified industries with significant job losses and asserted the importance of engaging youth and education in increasing employment levels.<sup>1427</sup>

On 10 March 2016, the National Youth Development Agency (NYDA) and the University Of Johannesburg (UJ) launched the Youth Development Institute of South Africa (YDISA).<sup>1428</sup> YDISA is in line with the partnership entered into by the NYDA and UJ to register mea Non Profit Company focusing on research and knowledge management aimed at improving youth development.<sup>1429</sup> Dr Linda Mtwisha, Chairperson UJ-NYDA Institute Board and Senior Director: Strategic Initiatives and Administration, Research & Innovation Division at UJ said, "What the Institute seeks to do is provide research based solution and proposals to challenges facing the youth. This will be done in partnership with other institutions working in the field of youth development."<sup>1430</sup> The monitoring of youth employment is in line with South Africa's goal to increase youth employment, as laid out in its Employment Plan.<sup>1431</sup>

South Africa has continued to monitor the implementation of its Employment Plan and gender goal.

Thus, South Africa has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Maria Zelenova

# Turkey: +1

Turkey has fully complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

On 18-19 November 2015, a joint workshop was organized by the Ministry of Labour and Social Security of Turkey in cooperation with the European Training Foundation.<sup>1432</sup> The workshop discussed school-to-work transitions of young people in Turkey, with a focus on those not in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1425</sup> Statistical release P0211 Quarterly Labour Force Survey, Statistics South Africa (2015). Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.statssa.gov.za/publications/P0211/P02114thQuarter2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1426</sup> Statistical release P0211 Quarterly Labour Force Survey, Statistics South Africa (2015). Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.statssa.gov.za/publications/P0211/P02114thQuarter2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1427</sup> Statistical release P0211 Quarterly Labour Force Survey, Statistics South Africa (2015). Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.statssa.gov.za/publications/P0211/Press\_statement\_QLFS\_Q4\_2015.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1428</sup> Youth Development Agency and University of Johannesburg launch Institute for improved research on Youth Development in SA, South African Government 9 March 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016.

http://www.gov.za/speeches/uj-nyda-launch-institute-improved-research-youth-development-sa-9-mar-2016-0000 <sup>1429</sup> Youth Development Agency and University of Johannesburg launch Institute for improved research on Youth Development in SA, South African Government 9 March 2016. Access Date: 17 March

<sup>2016.</sup>http://www.gov.za/speeches/uj-nyda-launch-institute-improved-research-youth-development-sa-9-mar-2016-0000

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1430</sup> Youth Development Agency and University of Johannesburg launch Institute for improved research on Youth Development in SA, South African Government 9 March 2016. Access Date: 17 March

<sup>2016.</sup>http://www.gov.za/speeches/uj-nyda-launch-institute-improved-research-youth-development-sa-9-mar-2016-0000

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1431</sup> Employment Plan South Africa, G20 (2014). Access Date: 17 March 2016.

http://www.g20australia.org/sites/default/files/g20\_resources/library/g20\_employment\_plan\_south\_africa.pdf <sup>1432</sup> Building Pathways To Skills And Jobs For Youth In Turkey, With Focus On Youth Not In Employment, Education Or

Training (NEET), EFT 18 November 2015. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.etf.europa.eu/web.nsf/pages/EV\_2015\_Building\_pathways\_to\_skills\_and\_jobs\_for\_youth\_in\_Turkey\_with focus on youth not in employment education or training (NEET) EN

education, training or employment (NEET)<sup>1433</sup>. Their aims included, but were not limited to, reflecting on future initiatives closing the gaps in school-to-work transitions through education, employment, and social inclusion, and involved over 100 national and international experts and researchers.<sup>1434</sup>

On 17 December 2015, the Turkish Statistical Institute published the survey "Structure of Earnings Survey for 2014."<sup>1435</sup> The purpose of the survey is to give information on the level, structure and development of wage and earnings.<sup>1436</sup> This all-encompassing survey reports on several aspects of Turkey's Employment Plan, including statistics related to educational attainment and earnings, and moreover addresses the gender pay gap.<sup>1437</sup>

On 15 February 2016, the Turkish Statistical Institute published its most recent report on labour force statistics.<sup>1438</sup> The report highlighted labour force participation, including statistics on the youth unemployment.<sup>1439</sup>

On 7 March 2016, the Turkish Statistical Institute published "Women in Statistics for 2015," compiled from censuses and surveys of TurkStat as well as administrative records, and the surveys of related governmental organizations and universities.<sup>1440</sup> In particular, the report highlights female literacy, unemployment, income, and education and notes that "work has to be done by all sides who have the responsibility to upgrade the social and economic position of women."<sup>1441</sup> The report concludes by pressing the implementation of policies aimed at reducing the gender inequality gap.<sup>1442</sup>

Turkey has continued to monitor the implementation of its Employment Plan and gender goal.

Thus, Turkey has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Mojann Zibapour

### United Kingdom: 0

The United Kingdom has partially complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1433</sup> Building Pathways To Skills And Jobs For Youth In Turkey, With Focus On Youth Not In Employment, Education Or Training (NEET), EFT 18 November 2015. Access Date: 17 March 2016.

http://www.etf.europa.eu/web.nsf/pages/EV\_2015\_Building\_pathways\_to\_skills\_and\_jobs\_for\_youth\_in\_Turkey\_with \_focus\_on\_youth\_not\_in\_employment\_education\_or\_training\_(NEET)\_EN <sup>1434</sup> Building Pathways To Skills And Jobs For Youth In Turkey, With Focus On Youth Not In Employment, Education Or

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1434</sup> Building Pathways To Skills And Jobs For Youth In Turkey, With Focus On Youth Not In Employment, Education Or Training (NEET), EFT 18 November 2015. Access Date: 17 March 2016.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1435</sup> Structure of Earnings Survey 2014, Turkish Statistical Institute 17 December 2015. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.turkstat.gov.tr/PreHaberBultenleri.do?id=18861

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1436</sup> Structure of Earnings Survey 2014, Turkish Statistical Institute 17 December 2015. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.turkstat.gov.tr/PreHaberBultenleri.do?id=18861

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1437</sup> Structure of Earnings Survey 2014, Turkish Statistical Institute 17 December 2015. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.turkstat.gov.tr/PreHaberBultenleri.do?id=18861

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1438</sup> Labour Force Statistics November 2015, Turkish Statistical Institute 15 February 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.turkstat.gov.tr/PreHaberBultenleri.do?id=21576

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1439</sup> Labour Force Statistics November 2015, Turkish Statistical Institute 15 February 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.turkstat.gov.tr/PreHaberBultenleri.do?id=21576

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1440</sup> Women in Statistics 2015, Turkish Statistical Institute 7 March 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016.

http://www.turkstat.gov.tr/PreHaberBultenleri.do?id=21519

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1441</sup> Women in Statistics 2015, Turkish Statistical Institute 7 March 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.turkstat.gov.tr/PreHaberBultenleri.do?id=21519

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1442</sup> Women in Statistics 2015, Turkish Statistical Institute 7 March 2016. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://www.turkstat.gov.tr/PreHaberBultenleri.do?id=21519

On 12 February 2016, the Government Equalities Office published the final report of the consultation on Closing the Gender Pay Gap.<sup>1443</sup> The consultation was issued in July 2015 and collected data as well as sought views on how best to increase transparency around gender pay differences, alongside wider questions about girls' aspirations, women returning to work and older working women.<sup>1444</sup> It received nearly 700 responses from over 200 employers and business organisations. The report concluded the consultation and published its results and recommendations.<sup>1445</sup>

On 12 February 2016, the Government Equalities Office issued Mandatory Gender Pay Gap Reporting.<sup>1446</sup> This new consultation is a follow up to the report on Closing the Gender Gap which focuses on the UK government's commitment that large employers should publish the differences between the average pay and bonuses of their male and female employees.<sup>1447</sup> This follow-up consultation invites feedback on the details of the draft regulations that will apply to those employers with at least 250 employees.<sup>1448</sup> The consultation especially aims to hear from employers, business organisations, the voluntary and charity sector, women's civil society organisations, expert human rights practitioners, trade unions, employment lawyers and think tanks<sup>1449</sup>. Once completed, will lay the draft regulations in Parliament.<sup>1450</sup> The Right Honorable Nicky Morgan Secretary of State for Education and Minister for Women and Equalities stated in the report that "to maintain momentum and drive real changes in workplaces across Great Britain, we want to commence the regulations at the earliest opportunity."1451

The UK has continued to monitor its gender goal. However, no evidence was found suggesting it has monitored the implementation of its Employment Plan.

Thus, the United Kingdom has received a score of 0.

Analyst: Miranda A. Bocci

# United States: +1

The United States has fully complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1443</sup> Closing the Gender Gap, Government Equalities Office, 12 February 2016. Access date: 2 March 2016.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment data/file/500087/Government response -\_Closing\_the\_Gender\_Pay\_Gap.pdf <sup>1444</sup> Closing the Gender Gap, Government Equalities Office, 12 February 2016. Access date: 2 March 2016.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment data/file/500087/Government response -\_Closing\_the\_Gender\_Pay\_Gap.pdf <sup>1445</sup> Closing the Gender Gap, Government Equalities Office, 12 February 2016. Access date: 2 March 2016.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\_data/file/500087/Government\_response -Closing the Gender Pay Gap.pdf

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1446</sup> Mandatory Gender Gap Pay Reporting, Government Equalities Office, 12 February 2016. Access Date: 2 March 2016

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\_data/file/504398/GPG\_consultation\_v8.pdf <sup>1447</sup> Mandatory Gender Gap Pay Reporting, Government Equalities Office, 12 February 2016. Access Date: 2 March 2016

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\_data/file/504398/GPG\_consultation\_v8.pdf <sup>1448</sup>Mandatory Gender Gap Pay Reporting. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment data/file/501331/GPG consultation v2.pdf <sup>1449</sup>Mandatory Gender Gap Pay Reporting. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\_data/file/501331/GPG\_consultation\_v2.pdf <sup>1450</sup>Mandatory Gender Gap Pay Reporting. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\_data/file/501331/GPG\_consultation\_v2.pdf <sup>1451</sup>Mandatory Gender Gap Pay Reporting. Access Date: 23 February 2016.

https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment data/file/501331/GPG consultation v2.pdf

On 9 January 2016, President Barack Obama unveiled new legislation that will compel companies with more than 100 workers to provide the federal government annual data for how much they pay employees based on gender, race and ethnicity.<sup>1452</sup>

Throughout the compliance cycle, the Bureau of Labour Statistics of the US Department of Labor has continued reporting, monitoring and assessing both unemployment and gender participation gap.<sup>1453</sup> The Bureau is the principal federal agency responsible for measuring labor market activity, working conditions and price changes in the economy.<sup>1454</sup> Its mission is to collect, analyze, and disseminate essential economic information to support public and private decision-making.<sup>1455</sup>

The US has continued to monitor the implementation of its Employment Plan and gender goal.

Thus, the United States has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Julia Tops

#### European Union: +1

The European Union has fully complied with its commitment to continue monitoring the implementation of its Employment Plan and its goal to reduce the gender participation gap.

On 3 December 2015, the European Commission released the report "Strategic Engagement for Gender Equality 2016-2019."<sup>1456</sup> The report aims to guide the way forward for the European Union. The European Commission gathered views from across Europe on gender equality — via a Eurobarometer survey, a Forum on the future of gender equality and an online public consultation and evaluated the strengths and weaknesses of the Strategy for equality between women and men 2010-2015.<sup>1457</sup> European Commissioner for Justice, Consumers and Gender Equality V ra Jourová said, "This Strategic engagement to gender equality 2016-2019 marks a new phase in our efforts to promote equality between women and men while continuing to focus on priority areas for action of particular relevance. It identifies more than thirty key actions to be implemented in five priority areas, with timelines and indicators for monitoring."<sup>1458</sup>

As of January 2016, the implementation of the Youth Guarantee has started in all EU countries. The Youth Guarantee is a new approach to tackling youth unemployment which ensures that all young people under 25 – whether registered with employment services or not – get a good-quality, concrete offer within 4 months of them leaving formal education or becoming unemployed. The good-quality offer should be for a job, apprenticeship, traineeship, or continued education and be adapted to each individual need and situation. The European Commission regularly assesses country progress and has produced several reports throughout the compliance period.<sup>1459</sup>

During the compliance period, Eurostat has continued to publish reports related to several aspects of the EU's Employment Plan and gender goal such as a report on gender pay gap statistics published in

http://ec.europa.eu/social/main.jsp?catId=1079&langId=en

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1452</sup> President Obama Announces Rules for Closing Gender Pay Gap, NBC News. 29 January 2016. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://www.nbcnews.com/news/us-news/obama-announce-new-rules-closing-gender-pay-gap-n506941

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1453</sup> BLS Information, Bureau of Labour Statistics. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://www.bls.gov/bls/infohome.htm
 <sup>1454</sup> BLS Information, Bureau of Labour Statistics. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://www.bls.gov/bls/infohome.htm
 <sup>1455</sup> BLS Information, Bureau of Labour Statistics. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://www.bls.gov/bls/infohome.htm
 <sup>1456</sup> Is Information, Bureau of Labour Statistics. Access Date: 2 March 2016. http://www.bls.gov/bls/infohome.htm

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1456</sup> Strategic engagement for gender equality 2016-2019, European Commission 3 December 2015. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/justice/gender-equality/files/documents/160111\_strategic\_engagement\_en.pdf

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1457</sup> Strategic engagement for gender equality 2016-2019, European Commission 3 December 2015. Access Date: 17
 March 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/justice/gender-equality/files/documents/160111\_strategic\_engagement\_en.pdf
 <sup>1458</sup> Strategic engagement for gender equality 2016-2019, European Commission 3 December 2015. Access Date: 17

March 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/justice/gender-equality/files/documents/160111\_strategic\_engagement\_en.pdf <sup>1459</sup> Youth Guarantee, European Commission Access Date: 13 July 2016.

March 2016.<sup>1460</sup> Eurostat is the statistical office of the European Union, based in Luxembourg.<sup>1461</sup> It publishes official, harmonized statistics on the European Union and the euro area, offering a comparable, reliable and objective portrayal of Europe's society and economy.<sup>1462</sup> A vast range of data is available for the EU as a whole, for Member States and in many cases also for candidate countries and other European countries, down to the level of regions and cities.<sup>1463</sup> All users may consult or download data and publications free of charge.<sup>1464</sup>

The EU has continued to monitor the implementation of its Employment Plan and gender goal.

Thus, the European Union has received a score of +1.

Analyst: Julia Top

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1460</sup> Gender Pay Gap Statistics, European Commission March 2016. Access Date: 8 February 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php/Gender\_pay\_gap\_statistics.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1461</sup> Glossary: Eurostat, EuroStat. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statisticsexplained/index.php/Glossary:Eurostat

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1462</sup> Glossary: Eurostat, EuroStat. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php/Glossary:Eurostat

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1463</sup> Glossary: Eurostat, EuroStat. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-explained/index.php/Glossary:Eurostat
 <sup>1464</sup> Glossary: Eurostat, EuroStat. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statistics-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1464</sup> Glossary: Eurostat, EuroStat. Access Date: 17 March 2016. http://ec.europa.eu/eurostat/statisticsexplained/index.php/Glossary:Eurostat